Decision No. 20270

L

BEFORE THE RAILROAD COLLEGION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Application of THE ATCHISON, TOPEKA & SAWTA FE RAILWAY COMPANY, a corporation, for authority to discontinue the operation of certain of its trains on the Valley Division, in the State of California.

) Application) No.15025

- E. T. Lucey, for The Atchison, Topeka & Santa Fe Railway Company, Applicant.
- C. S. Reed, for American Railway Empress Company, Interested party.
- D. I. Castile, Postmaster, Le Grand, Protestant.
- E. C. Harvey, for Chamber of Commerce of Denair.
- A. J. Grodsmoen, for Chamber of Commerce of Le Grand.

Perry D. Stickles, for Chamber of Commerce of Escalon.

S. J. Irwin, Escalon.

BY THE COMMISSION -

OPINION

The Atchison, Topeka and Santa Te Reilway Company has petitioned the Railroad Commission for an order authorizing the discontinuance of the operation of its passenger trains Nos.41 and 42 on.its Valley Division between Calwa and Stockton, said trains now operating between Ferry Point-San Francisco and Calwa, and for an order authorizing a change in the leaving times of said trains from Stockton and Ferry Point-San Francisco, respectively.

A public hearing on this application was conducted by Examiner Handford at Fresno, the matter was duly submitted and is now ready for decision.

Applicant's trains Nos.41 and 42 operate daily on its
Valley Division between San Francisco-Ferry Point and Calwa,
a distance of approximately one hundred and ninety-six (196)
miles. Applicant proposes to discontinue the operation of
said trains between Calwa and Stockton, a distance of one
hundred and twenty-six (126) miles, but will continue to
operate same between Stockton and Ferry Point-San Francisco.

The rail service herein proposed to be discontinued between Calwa and Stockton is as follows:

	Train No.41
Leave Calwa	8:45 A.M.
Leage Stockton	9:55 A.M.
Arrive Ferry Point	11:57 A.M.
Arrive San Francisco	12:45 P.M.
	Train No.42
Leave San Francisco	Train No.42 5:15 P.M.
Leave San Francisco Leave Ferry Point	
	5:15 P.M.

The total revenue derived from the trains proposed to be discontinued between Calwa and Stockton, for the yearly period ending July 31st, 1928, is as follows:

	Tra	Train 41		Train 42	
Month_	Revonue	Rovenue per train mile	Revenue	movenuo per train mile	
Aug. 1927	\$ 797.56	\$ -2042	§ 999 .5 7	₹ - 2559	
Sept. "	~ 733 -19	-1940	983.84	-2603	
Oct. "	753.60	.1929	870.87	.2230	
Nov. "	872.92	-2309	995.28	-2633	
Doc. "	1080.16	-2765	969.54	-2482	
Jan : 1928	1055-04	.2701	839.41	2149	
Feb. "	976.54	.2673	755.04	-2066	
Mar: "	794.42	.2034	269.44	-2226	
Apr. "	770.87	. 2039	206.52	-2134	
May. "	865.07	.2215	235 . 12	.2138	
June I	819 - 54 927 - 87	.2168 .2575	920 - 92 1013 - 87	-2436 -2596	
Tota		J -2265	\$ 10859.42	Û . &&55	

The above revenue per train mile includes all earnings from passenger, baggage and mail traffic but does not include express revenue which applicant's witnesses allege to be very small.

The so-called out-of-pocket cost of operating trains
Nos.41 and 42 on the present schedule and the estimated out-ofpocket cost of operating same on the proposed schedule, as
shown by applicant's Exhibit No.2, filed at the hearing, are
as follows:

Cost of Operating trains Nos-41 and 42, for a 30-day month

Present Schedulo	Proposed Schedule	Saving
\$ 8,359 . 94	\$ 3,342.22	0 5,017.72

The above figures include train and engine crews, fuel oil, locomotive and car repairs, enginehouse expense and locomotive and train supplies but do not include any allowance for maintenance of way, taxes, depreciation or other indirect expenses.

of the operation of said trains between Calwa and Stockton may be stated to represent the present out-of-pocket costs of operating the trains between said points, which amount is in excess of \$20,000 per year. When this amount is compared with the annual revenue derived from said trains between Calwa and Stockton, which amounted to approximately \$21,000, for the year ending July 31st, 1928, it may be seen that the actual out-of-pocket loss for the operation of these trains between said points is approximately \$40,000 per year.

Applicant's Exhibit No.5 shows that the average number of revenue passengers per day, carried on train No.41, between

Calwa and Stockton, for a ten day period ending November 14, 1928, was 4.3, while the same for train No.42 was 11.9. Applicant's witnesses testified that the patronage of those trains has con - tinually decreased.

If the discontinuance of trains Nos.41 and 42 were authorized, the Santa Fe Railway would still operate three trains daily between Ferry Point-San Francisco, Stockton and Calwa.

Two potitions, one signed by two hundred and forty one (241) residents of Le Grand and vicinity and the other by sixteen (16) residents of Planada and vicinity, protesting the abandonment of said trains, were introduced as exhibits at the hearing. Apparently the main complaint, as set forth by these petitions, as well as that of other protestants was in regard to the delivery of mail. Protestants declared that rural delivery of mail would be delayed twenty four hours by the discontinuance of these trains. The mail now carried by train No.41, arriving at Le Grand and Planada at 7:56 A.M. and 8:03 A.M., respectively, would be carried by train No.9, arriving at Le Grand and Planada at 1:45 P.M. and 1:53 P.M., respectively, Train No.42 does not carry mail.

Testimony introduced at the hearing shows that Stockton would be more conveniently served if train No.41 would leave Stockton at 8:00 A.M. instead of 9:55 A.M., as at present, and train No.42 would leave San Francisco at 6:00 P.M. instead of 5:15 P.M. as at present. Applicant's witnesses stated that the request for authority to change the leaving times of trains Nos.41 and 42 from Stockton and San Francisco, respectively, is the result of numerous requests by residents of Stockton for such a change. This request appears to be reasonable and in the public interest.

The record herein shows that the operation of applicant's trains Nos.41 and 42 on its Valley Division between Calwa and Stockton has been conducted at a material out-of-pocket loss,

the revenue derived from said operation for the year ending July 31, 1928, being approximately 340,000 less than the out-of-pocket expense.

From the record herein, we are of the opinion and hereby conclude and find as a fact that the continued operation of the passenger train service herein proposed to be discontinued is not justified by the patronage offered by the traveling public, in that the continuing decreases in revenue, in comparison to operating costs, place an undue and unwarranted burden on applicant and its patrons in the continued maintenance of the unprofitable passenger train service herein proposed to be discontinued.

ORDER.

A public hearing having been held on the above entitled application, the matter being duly submitted, the Commission being now fully advised and basing its order on the conclusion and finding of fact as appearing in the opinion which precedes this order.

and it hereby is granted to The Atchison, Topoka & Santa Fo Railway Company to discontinue the operation of its passenger trains Nos.41 and 42 on its Valley Division between Calwa and Stockton and to change the leaving time of train No.41 from Stockton to 8:00 A.M. and the leaving time of train No.42 from San Francisco to 6:00 P.M., subject, however, to the condition that the public be given at least five (5) days' notice of such changes by posting notices of such changes at all stations affected; and by newspaper publicity.

The Commission expressly reserves the right to issue such other and further orders in this proceeding as to it may appear just and proper or as may be required by the public convenience and necessity.

The effective date of this order is hereby fixed as twenty (20) days from the date hereof.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this // day of Dacacules, 1928:

Those to Louted

My lan

COMMISSIONERS.