

ORIGINAL

Decision No. 24227.

BEFORE THE RAILROAD COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the application of
 SAN DIEGO ELECTRIC RAILWAY COMPANY, a
 corporation, for authority and per-
 mission to adopt and put into effect
 certain recommendations for changes
 in the service of said applicant,
 made by the Transportation Engineer
 and Assistant Engineer of the above
 styled Commission in a report dated
 April 14, 1931, and transmitted to
 the City of San Diego, California,
 and to this applicant by the Chief
 Engineer of the above styled Commis-
 sion.

Application No. 17627.

Morrison, Hohfeld, Foerster, Shuman & Clark,
by Herbert W. Clark, for Applicant.

Johnson W. Puterbaugh, City Attorney, for the
Cities of Coronado and National City, in-
terested parties.

O. C. Ludwig, City Attorney, for the City of
Chula Vista, interested party.

P. R. Fellows, for Lemon Grove Chamber of Com-
merce, interested party.

H. C. Gardiner, for the Pacific Beach Chamber
of Commerce, interested party.

W. L. Van Schaick, for the La Jolla Chamber of
Commerce, interested party.

O. E. Darnell and E. Wolff, representing business
houses of Lower Fifth Street, San Diego, inter-
ested parties.

O. C. Heitman, for Chollis Heights Improvement
Club, interested party.

F. V. McAlbee, for Ocean Beach Chamber of Commerce,
interested party.

F. B. Merriam, for the Community of Encanto, in-
terested party.

John G. Kean, for North Shore Civic Federation,
interested party.

J. W. Kyle, for South La Jolla Community Club,
interested party.

Mrs. M. Ladd, for the San Diego Women's Civic
Center, interested party.

Mrs. Bessie Rosser, for Parent Teachers'
Association of Encanto, interested party.

WHITSELL, COMMISSIONER:

O P I N I O N

The San Diego Electric Railway Company, on August 27th, 1931, filed the above entitled application with this Commission, asking authority to put into effect the following changes in routing and operation of its combined street railway and bus system operated in and about the City of San Diego, California:

1. Re-route car lines 1 and 3 south on Fifth Street to Market Street, west on Market to Third Street, north on Third Street to Broadway, thence east on Broadway along present route.
2. Re-route "E" bus line along El Cajon Avenue from Euclid Avenue to Park Boulevard and extend same so as to serve Spring Valley and Lemon Grove.
3. Consolidate bus lines "D" and "G" and operate the consolidated line along Market Street to 32nd Street, along 32nd Street to Imperial Avenue and thence along present route of "G" line to a terminus at 69th and Imperial.
4. Discontinue operation of "C" bus line.
5. Extend "A" bus line to a point near Morena Boulevard and Elinor Street.
6. Operate a bus line in Pacific Beach along Garnet Avenue from Noyes Street to a connection with the No. 16 car line.
7. During off-peak periods, discontinue through service to San Diego upon the No. 14 car line and, in lieu thereof, operate a shuttle car in Ocean Beach connecting with No. 16 car line.
8. Cut back service upon the "K" bus line to 39th and National Avenue.

A public hearing was held in San Diego on September 30th, 1931, at which time the matter was submitted, and it is now ready

for decision.

As its Exhibit No. 1, the railway presented a report¹ upon an "Investigation of Service and Physical and Financial Results of Operation of San Diego Electric Railway Company," prepared by the Commission's Engineering Department. The request of the railway in this application, with few exceptions, includes the recommendations presented in this report. Exhibit No. 2 brings forward, in more detail to date of hearing, certain data and estimates contained in Exhibit No. 1.

Proposed change No. 1 is the re-routing of certain car lines to lower Fifth Street. In this regard, the record indicates that a more direct and convenient service is needed on lower Fifth Street, between Broadway and Market Street. Inasmuch as a number of car lines are routed along lower Broadway to a loop at the Union Depot, resulting in a frequency of service in excess of traffic needs, it was suggested in the report of the Commission's engineers that car lines Nos. 1 and 11 be discontinued from the lower end of this route, operated along Fifth Street to Market Street and thence looped back via Market Street, Third Street and Broadway to Fifth Street and along the present respective routes. The railway, in its application, substitutes line No. 3 for line No. 11, inasmuch as line No. 11 recently has been routed through Balboa Park and, at this time, cannot conveniently be re-routed along lower Fifth Street. Opposition to change No. 1 was expressed, upon the basis that the re-routing would result in the traffic, now moving direct to lower

1 This report was prepared pursuant to a request made jointly by the City of San Diego and the San Diego Electric Railway Company on September 2nd, 1930, that the Commission instruct its staff to make a survey and investigation of the system and the operations of the railway and to report thereon with recommendations to the city, the railway and the Commission. Such a survey was made and report prepared and, on April 14th, 1931, it was delivered to the parties above referred to.

Broadway, having to transfer; however, it appears that only a small proportion of the traffic is destined to points on Broadway west of Third Street. On the other hand, the City Hall and a number of business establishments are located along Fifth Street between Broadway and Market Street and pedestrian traffic in this area is quite heavy, resulting in a need for a more direct and convenient service than that now operated. If such a change is made, a service more frequent than is probably justified from a traffic standpoint will still remain along lower Broadway. It is concluded that the proposed change No. 1 is in public interest and should be put into effect.

Proposed changes Nos. 2 and 3 involve the re-routing of the "E" bus line along El Cajon Avenue and the bus service to Encanto, Lemon Grove and Spring Valley. The "D" and "G" bus lines are routed along Market Street and Imperial Avenue, respectively, and serve jointly Encanto and Lemon Grove. At Lemon Grove the "D" line loops through Spring Valley and the "G" line continues to La Mesa, which community is also served by the "E" bus line. It is recommended that the "D" and "G" lines be consolidated and stopped at Encanto and that the Spring Valley and Lemon Grove districts be served by an extension of the "E" line.

Some objection was expressed to the proposal to serve the Spring Valley District by the extension of the "E" line, on the basis that the distance to San Diego would be increased by such a re-routing; however, the proposed routing would furnish a service to San Diego on approximately the same running time as that provided over the present route and would enable the company to use its equipment more efficiently. No objection was expressed to the re-routing of the "E" line along El Cajon Avenue between Euclid Avenue and Park Boulevard. It is concluded that these two changes should be made.

The record indicates that the traffic upon the "D" and "G" bus lines is so light as, under ordinary conditions, to justify complete abandonment of service. The bus lines, however, furnish the only service to and from the communities and it is recognized that their abandonment very seriously would inconvenience the people who now depend upon them. The railway's proposal would permit a considerable saving in car mileage along those portions of the routes now traveled by the "D" and "G" lines, originating practically no traffic.

Representatives of the territory served by the "D" line, at Encanto and at 37th and Market Streets, pointed out that the "D" line furnished them a more convenient service than would be furnished by the proposed consolidated line. The proposed consolidated route would by-pass 37th and Market Streets and would not pass as near to the traffic center of Encanto as does the "D" line. It was suggested that service along the route, as applied for, be split and that a portion of it be run along the present route of the "D" line to Encanto and the remaining portion along the proposed consolidated route. The railway has approved of this suggestion. It is concluded that, in lieu of the operation of a service along the route as proposed in the application, approximately the same amount of service be divided between that route and the present route of the "D" line, terminating at 69th Street and Imperial Avenue in Encanto.

Proposed changes Nos. 4, 5 and 6 center around the abandonment of the "C" bus line, now operated by the company between San Diego and La Jolla. This line follows along the shorter route of the "A" bus line, which carries all the local traffic in San Diego proper, and terminates at Old Town. The important communities served by the "C" line are Pacific Beach and La Jolla, both of which also are served by the No. 16 car line. It is proposed to abandon the

"C" bus line, to extend the "A" bus line about one mile to the north, to include the district known as Hardy's and, in addition, to operate a shuttle bus serving Pacific Beach and connecting with the No. 16 car line.

Representatives of La Jolla and Pacific Beach stated that, while they appreciated the financial problems of the street railway and were in sympathy with its effort to reduce expenses, they were of the opinion that the abandonment of the "C" bus line would work a great hardship on the people dependent upon it. They pointed to the fact that the bus line was routed in a manner that more conveniently served the people of Pacific Beach and La Jolla than did the car line and that some dependence was placed upon the bus line for local service within the two communities. It was suggested that the line be not entirely abolished at the present time. They indicated that bus service, consisting of approximately twenty-two round trips a day, was in excess of the needs at this time, considering the traffic carried. Having this in mind, it was felt that the service could be reduced to approximately eight or ten round trips a day during the present period of reduced traffic and that such a service would be far more satisfactory to the people of this district than the proposed changes. A very material reduction in expenses would result if such a reduced service were put into effect.

The people of La Jolla and Pacific Beach were of the opinion that the lack of traffic upon this line was a temporary affair, brought about by the present depressed business conditions, and that in the near future traffic which would more nearly pay a return might be expected. If the curtailed service were placed in effect, a present saving might be effected and the company would be in a position to take care of additional traffic if and when presented. It is concluded that the proposal to first try the plan of

operating reduced service on the line, rather than complete abandonment at this time, is reasonable and should be undertaken, this plan to be a substitute for the one originally proposed by applicant.

The suggested extension of the "A" bus line for a distance of approximately one mile, in order to serve the community at that location, should be put into effect with schedules which would fit into the operations along the "C" line at reduced schedules.

Proposed change No. 7 refers to the discontinuance of through service on the No. 14 line during off-peak periods. The railway now operates a two-car train between San Diego and Ocean Beach Junction, a distance of 6-3/4 miles, where the cars are disconnected, one, No. 14, continuing for a distance of one mile to Ocean Beach and the other, No. 16, to La Jolla, a distance of seven miles. The proposal to serve Ocean Beach by means of shuttle operation during off-peak periods would greatly reduce the daily car miles operated and yet not change the frequency of the service. The only inconvenience to the patrons on the line would result from a transfer at Ocean Beach Junction during the off-peak period; however, as the greater portion of the traffic on this line moves during the peak periods, when no change is contemplated, this inconvenience would be felt by a small percentage of the patrons on the line. Representatives of Ocean Beach objected to shuttle service per se and expressed a fear that, given a shuttle service, the next step might be no service at all.

It would appear that the move which this railway is now taking is one to avert this very step. It does not seem reasonable that it can continue to operate cars unless a need for them, expressed in traffic, exists. The greater the economy of operation, the more assured is service. The importance of Ocean Beach, it is believed, is fully appreciated by the railway, as witnessed by the high type of service rendered this community. The transfer neces-

sitated by the proposed change will be limited to a few passengers, while it will result in a material saving to the railway and thereby have a beneficial effect toward the maintenance of a high standard of service. Under the conditions, the proposed change No. 7 appears reasonable.

Proposed change No. 8 deals with cutting the "K" bus line back to 39th Street. This line now operates beyond this point a distance of one mile. Not only does the traffic not justify this mileage, but by terminating the line at 39th Street the company would be enabled to combine the two legs of this route in a manner that will result in further economies. It is apparent that this change should be made.

The following form of order is recommended.

O R D E R

A public hearing having been held on the above entitled proceeding, the matter having been submitted and being now ready for decision,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that authority is hereby granted to San Diego Electric Railway Company to:

1. Re-route its Nos. 1 and 3 car lines along Fifth Street from Broadway to Market Street, along Market Street to Third Street, along Third Street to Broadway and along Broadway to Fifth Street, in lieu of the present routing of this line along Broadway from Fifth Street to the Union Depot.
2. Discontinue the operation of the No. 14 car line between San Diego and Ocean Beach during the off-peak period of the day and substitute therefor a shuttle car line operating in Ocean Beach between Ocean Beach Junction and the terminus of the No. 14 car line.

IT IS HEREBY FURTHER ORDERED that authority is hereby granted to San Diego Electric Railway Company to:

1. Re-route its passenger stage service between La Mesa and Lemon Grove and operate over the following route: From Lookout Avenue and Palm Street, in La Mesa, along Palm Street to Imperial Avenue, along Imperial Avenue to Palm Avenue, in Lemon Grove, along Palm Avenue to Bancroft Street, along Bancroft Street to the State Highway, along the State Highway to Imperial Avenue and along Imperial Avenue and Palm Street to Lookout Avenue, said service over said route to be operated in connection with and as a part of the service now operated along El Cajon Avenue between San Diego and El Cajon.
2. Re-route passenger stage service now operated between San Diego and El Cajon, and intermediate points, from its present route along University Avenue from Park Boulevard to Euclid Avenue and along Euclid Avenue to El Cajon Avenue, to the following route: Along Park Boulevard from University Avenue to El Cajon Avenue and along El Cajon Avenue to Euclid Avenue.
3. Re-route its passenger stage service, between San Diego and Encanto via Imperial Avenue, from its present route along 18th Street from Market Street to Imperial Avenue, and along Imperial Avenue to 32nd Street, as follows: Along Market Street from 18th Street to 32nd Street and along 32nd Street to Imperial Avenue.

IT IS HEREBY FURTHER ORDERED that San Diego Electric Railway Company is hereby authorized to abandon automotive passenger stage service:

1. Between Encanto and Lemon Grove along the following routes:
 - (a) Along Central Avenue from Imperial Avenue to Massachusetts Avenue, along Massachusetts Avenue to Madera Street and along Madera Street to Market Street Extension.
 - (b) From Central Avenue along Imperial Avenue to 69th Street.
2. Upon its "K" Line from 39th Street along National Avenue to Highland Avenue, along Highland Avenue to Logan Avenue, along Logan Avenue to 47th Street.

The Railroad Commission of the State of California Hereby Declares that public convenience and necessity require the operation, by San Diego Electric Railway Company, as an extension of its San Diego-Encanto service via Market Street, of an automotive service for the transportation of passengers along Market Street Extension from Madera Street to 65th Street, along 65th Street to Imperial Avenue and along Imperial Avenue to 69th Street, and the consolidation of said extended right with said operating right between San Diego and Encanto via Market Street.

IT IS HEREBY FURTHER ORDERED that a certificate of public convenience and necessity for said extension is hereby granted to San Diego Electric Railway Company.

IT IS HEREBY FURTHER ORDERED that San Diego Electric Railway Company is hereby authorized to reduce service upon its "C" bus line, operating between San Diego and La Jolla, and to add the service upon its "A" bus line as herein described, in order to serve the community in the vicinity of Morena Boulevard and Elinor Street.

IT IS HEREBY FURTHER ORDERED that a certificate of public convenience and necessity for the extended service and the consolidation of the same with existing service, as above described, is hereby granted to San Diego Electric Railway Company, subject to the following conditions:

- (1) Applicant shall file its written acceptance of the certificate herein granted within a period of not to exceed ten (10) days from the date hereof.
- (2) The rights and privileges herein authorized may not be discontinued, sold, leased, transferred nor assigned unless the written consent of the Railroad Commission to such discontinuance, sale, lease, transfer or assignment has first been secured.
- (3) No vehicle may be operated by applicant herein unless such vehicle is owned by said applicant or is leased by him under contract or agreement on a basis satisfactory to the Railroad Commission.

IT IS HEREBY FURTHER ORDERED that San Diego Electric Railway Company is hereby authorized to file with the Railroad Commission time schedules covering the service as herein authorized, such time schedules to be subject to the approval of this Commission and in general conformity with the time schedules submitted by applicant in this proceeding.

For all other purposes the effective date of this order shall be twenty (20) days from the date hereof.

The foregoing Opinion and Order are hereby approved and ordered filed as the Opinion and Order of the Railroad Commission of the State of California.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 16th day of November, 1931.

C. J. [unclear]
Leon [unclear]

W. J. [unclear]
W. B. [unclear]

Fred G. [unclear]

Commissioners.