

ORIGINAL

Dec No 5192-

Decision No. _____

BEFORE THE RAILROAD COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA.

In the matter of the application of the Pacific Electric Railway Company for authority to construct and maintain at grade tracks across certain public highways in the County of Orange, and at grade across the railroad of The Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe Railway Company, and the railroad of the Southern Pacific Railroad Company, in connection with the construction of its proposed railroad from a point in its present railroad line in the City of Santa Ana through Tustin to Irvine in Orange County, and for Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity therefor.

Application No. 3337

In the matter of the application of the Pacific Electric Railway Company for authority to construct and maintain at grade tracks across certain public highways in Los Angeles County, and at grade across the railroads of the Southern Pacific Railroad Company and The Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe Railway Company in connection with the construction of its proposed railroad from a point in its present railroad line in the City of Glendora, thence in a general easterly and southerly direction to a connection with its Los Angeles-San Bernardino line at Lone Hill in said County of Los Angeles.

Application No. 3383

Frank Kerr for Applicant.
M.W.Reed for The Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe Railway Company.
G.B. Gordon for City of Glendora.

GORDON, Commissioner.

O P I N I O N.

In these two applications the Pacific Electric Railway Company asks the Commission for a certificate of public necessity and convenience under Section 50 of the Public Utilities Act as amended in 1917, and for permission to construct

its tracks at grade, in the first case across some thirty-five public streets, highways and alleys in Santa Ana and unincorporated territory in Orange County, over the track of the Newport Branch of the Southern Pacific Company, and over the main line and a spur track of the Santa Fe, and in the second case, over twenty streets, highways and alleys in Glendora and Los Angeles County, a branch line of the Southern Pacific Company, and the main line and two spur tracks of the Santa Fe.

In the order which follows this opinion I shall recommend that both these applications be denied until after the war, because public convenience and necessity, at least during the time of the war, were not shown; and since I have based my conclusions on the same general considerations in both cases they can very well be decided together. It will of course not be necessary to discuss the proposed crossings.

The line applicant desires to construct in Application No. 3337 leaves an existing line of the Pacific Electric on Second Street, an east and west street, in the City of Santa Ana, swings south along and across Evergreen Street to a point about opposite Warren Street where, in an easterly direction, it crosses the main line of the Santa Fe. From this crossing the line continues in an easterly direction to the Southern Pacific's track at Tustin, a distance of about 1.8 miles. This track lies on private right of way parallel to the Newport Road. It was the original intention to make a connection with it and to run north along it for about 3500 feet, but since the hearing upon the application the Commission has been

advised by applicant that it now desires to acquire for the Southern Pacific Company an independent right of way for this distance, to build a new track for it, and to reconstruct and relocate the present track for its own use. Between the intersection of Irvine Boulevard and Holt Street with Newport Road the Southern Pacific's line swings to the north, while the proposed line of the Pacific Electric continues parallel with the road for some 1800 feet farther, when it turns to the east and continues in a southeasterly direction until about opposite Irvine, where it turns southwesterly and continues in this direction until just before the Santa Fe's tracks at the Town of Irvine are reached. There it turns again and parallels the Santa Fe for about one-half mile to the end.

From the junction of the proposed line with Lyons Street a spur track about 1200 feet long is proposed along that street to reach a packing house north of the proposed main track. A second proposed spur about one-half mile long is located in the Irvine Ranch, to the west of the Morris Road. This spur will cross a spur track of the Santa Fe and will end about 500 feet beyond that crossing.

The line, exclusive of spurs, is about 11.8 miles long, and the cost, including the spurs, was estimated to be about \$239,000; but this figure does not include the cost of additional right of way, a new line for the Southern Pacific, and the relocation of the present line of the Southern Pacific along the Newport Road for this distance of 3500 feet.

The Pacific Electric's proposed main line is about 700 feet from the Santa Fe's main line where it makes a connection with its own existing line in Santa Ana, and for the first 4000 feet of its length it is about that distance from

the Santa Fe until it turns to cross it. From the crossing the two lines diverge and are farthest apart where the Pacific Electric's line turns easterly from the Newport Road. The distance between the lines here is approximately two and a quarter miles and is maintained until the Pacific Electric's line turns at Irvine to run directly toward that station, where the two lines come together.

From the intersection of the two lines in Santa Ana to Irvine the track of the Santa Fe is nearly straight. It forms one side of a rectangle $2\frac{1}{2} \times 5\frac{1}{2}$ miles in dimensions, and the other three sides are formed by this proposed extension of the Pacific Electric. The Southern Pacific's branch previously referred to is parallel and adjacent to one of the short sides for 3500 feet and the Santa Fe has some spur tracks inside the rectangle. One track leaves the main line, about $2\frac{1}{2}$ miles south of the Pacific Electric's intersection, and runs at right angles to it until within about a thousand feet of the Pacific Electric's location. Two spurs branch from this, one in each direction, parallel to that location and the Santa Fe's main line, and are probably nowhere farther than 3000 feet from the former. One spur ends at the Newport Road, within a hundred feet of the Southern Pacific's present track and the Pacific Electric's proposed track, while the other ends about a mile from the Pacific Electric's line after it makes the turn to reach Irvine. It is the latter spur track which is to be crossed by the proposed spur from the Pacific Electric.

Applicant introduced the testimony of five witnesses to show the public necessity and convenience to be served by this line. The first witness, Mr. E. C. Johnson, Assistant Chief Engineer of the Company, stated that it runs through a

very thickly settled district to and into the Town of Irvine and up to the foothills to the east, a territory without passenger transportation, and opens up a portion of the Irvine Ranch, and that the territory adjacent to the portion of the line nearest Tustin is very thickly settled by farmers who raise citrus fruits and beans and who have many young citrus orchards just coming into bearing. The spur on Lyon Street is to serve the Burge Packing House, an industry without railroad service.

Mr. Paul Shoup, President of the Pacific Electric, followed Mr. Johnson. He testified that this line would serve a new territory, in the sense that only part of it is now given over to its ultimate use, the growing of citrus fruits, walnuts, etc., and subdivision into small holdings. It is his opinion that there is a marked need for passenger transportation in this territory. He stated that he had been visited several times by committees from the neighborhood, Tustin particularly, and that he had previously endeavored to secure this extension. At one time the Pacific Electric had an appropriation to build through Santa Ana to the east Santa Ana limits, and intended to extend to Tustin and beyond, but this construction necessitated the installation of an interlocking plant with the tracks of the Santa Fe at a cost of some \$75,000. so the project was abandoned. It was Mr. Shoup's opinion that the steam roads were not able to satisfactorily care for the passenger business, because where such business was light the nature of steam operation made passenger service much more expensive. Mr. Shoup thought that the passenger business here would be light compared with other points but that in addition to the need of the service at Irvine, the ranchers between Irvine and Tustin should have it to bring

their working forces into and out of Santa Ana. When asked as to the necessity for this track through the Irvine Ranch where the Santa Fe has already considerable trackage, Mr. Shoup replied that passenger service was necessary in order that the ranch could be subdivided and that the residents of this vicinity were handicapped because there was no convenient method of getting people back and forth to Santa Ana, while with the proposed service they could be taken from Santa Ana in the morning and returned at night.

Speaking of the freight business, Mr. Shoup said that his company proposed to serve one orange packing house on the Irvine Ranch, one lemon packing house, a bean packing house at Irvine and, as the business develops, to serve some further packing houses to be constructed. It is his opinion that this line would serve the foothill territory through the Irvine Ranch, while the Santa Fe line would serve the lower part. A portion of the territory along the line from Irvine northerly is unimproved and is devoted to the growing of beans. When asked if the Santa Fe does not satisfy the needs of shippers at Irvine, Mr. Shoup replied that he knew nothing about the service of the Santa Fe but that the people in the vicinity were anxious to get the Pacific Electric to build in.

It would not, in Mr. Shoup's opinion, be wise or businesslike to construct a part of the line without completing the entire project, as the freight business is largely beyond Tustin. The original intention was to build the line only as far as the country had been developed for fruit growing, which is about opposite the end of the Santa Fe's spur, but his belief and also that of Mr. Irvine, who owns the Irvine Ranch of about 7000 acres, was that it would not be desirable to stop

at this point. Mr. Irvine has given the company the right of way through the Irvine Ranch.

Mr. James S. Rice, a resident of Tustin of forty years standing, testified that the first efforts of the residents of Tustin to get an electric line were made eight or ten years ago. Since that time they have been working assiduously when an opportunity presented itself, and for the last year have been working at the proposition to the best of their ability. He believes that if Tustin can secure an electric railroad with freight service it will not only advertise the town but will be an unusual convenience to the community, as it will afford direct transportation to the county seat at Santa Ana. He said that a great many children go back and forth every day and that there is no transportation between Tustin and Santa Ana, except jitney service. The Southern Pacific reaches Santa Ana by way of Anaheim, running a mixed train which no one travels on. It is his opinion that the construction of the line would add greatly to the growth of the town, the population of which is now about 2000, and that an electric road would bring tourists and newcomers to buy places and subdivide as there are a great many 20-acre ranches around Tustin that will ultimately go into 5-acre tracts. It is Mr. Rice's opinion that freight prospects for this line are specially good and that there will be ample business for two roads. One of the reasons he advances for advocating the construction of two roads is that with two roads the people could get accommodations which could not be secured from one.

Mr. C. E. Utt, a resident of Tustin engaged in the raising of oranges, lemons, walnuts and lima beans on a ranch of 1000 acres, testified that he thought the Pacific Electric's

line would get much traffic in Tustin and that after the coming of a railroad which gave passenger service the town itself would grow considerably. He stated that the Pacific Electric had promised eight passenger trains daily, and it was his hope that with the new line he would get a little better service at the three or four packing houses in which he is interested. He also stated that freight traffic in this territory is continually developing and that every bit of the territory served would be benefited. The Santa Fe now runs alongside the packing house on Mr. Utt's ranch. He employs from seventy-five to one hundred and fifty men and is greatly interested in seeing that proper transportation is secured between Santa Ana and his ranch; this line would give this transportation as it runs through it. It is his opinion that the operation of two roads through this territory would make his property more valuable.

Mr. S. Stevens, who is engaged in fruit growing and who has resided in Tustin for about thirty-six years, testified that at the present time he had two packing houses on his land and was perfectly equipped as far as freight is concerned, provided he could get cars. It was his opinion that with two railroads the chances of getting cars would be better than with one. Like the other witnesses, he felt that the lack of transportation for employes to use in going back and forth between the ranches and Santa Ana was the greatest drawback to that section of the country, and that this would be removed by the construction of the proposed line.

The line from Glendora to Lone Hill, covered by Application No. 3383, will leave the end of the existing Glendora line near North Santa Avenue in Glendora, use this street

southerly to a crossing of the main line of the Santa Fe, then on the southerly side of the Santa Fe follow this right of way, parallel and adjacent to it, to a point north of Allen Avenue. Here the tracks of the Santa Fe turn to the east, while the proposed line of the Pacific Electric continues almost due south to Lone Hill, where a connection is made with its San Bernardino line. From the Santa Fe's main line a spur track running westerly, parallel and adjacent to the Santa Fe, has been located for a distance of 2800 feet to reach a packing house of the Glendora Citrus Fruit Association. The main line crosses two spur tracks of the Santa Fe north of Allen Avenue and a branch line of the Southern Pacific Company immediately before it makes its connection with the San Bernardino line at Lone Hill. The total length of this line, including the spur track of .5 miles, is about 4.6 miles and its cost is estimated to be about \$202,000. For about two miles it is parallel and adjacent to the main line of the Santa Fe and throughout its length is nowhere more than 2800 feet from that track.

Mr. Johnson, Assistant Chief Engineer of the Pacific Electric, testified that the construction of this line would give the company a through line from San Bernardino to Glendora; that the Santa Fe at present serves the packing house at Glendora which his company's spur track is designed to reach, and that his company intended to serve several packing houses between Glendora and Lone Hill. He was unable to say whether or not the Santa Fe could reach these packing houses equally as well. It is his belief that this line would open up a territory that is now entirely without passenger transportation.

Mr. J. McMillan, General Manager of the Pacific Electric, testified that it was the original intention to build the San Bernardino line about along the route of the line now

proposed, and since there is a great deal of travel from the vicinity of Riverside, San Bernardino, Uplands and Rialto, all on or tributary to the San Bernardino line, that goes to Glendora and Azusa, it has always been the intention of the company to complete this gap. The people in this section who desire to go to the east have to go across the gap in an automobile or go back to Los Angeles. This line, Mr. McMillan testified, will be of considerable convenience to the inhabitants of the territory east of Los Angeles, and from the viewpoint of the company it would be a great convenience. Several owners of rock crushers have occasion to send rock to eastern points. This rock is now hauled into Los Angeles and from there sent back to San Bernardino over the main line. The same movement in the reverse direction is made with cement from Riverside and Colton. It appears that a physical connection ^{with the Santa Fe} in this neighborhood would largely obviate the necessity for back haul.

Mr. McMillan, when asked if he thought this was the time to spend over \$200,000 in building railroad extensions, replied that if this gap had not proved to be an enormous inconvenience and expense to operate, if the company did not have the rails and ties on hand, and if the money had not already been appropriated, his answer would be "no." It is his opinion that inasmuch as the company is paying interest on the investment in material on hand it should be put into tracks where some return could be secured on it. This line, once constructed, could be operated for a comparatively trifling amount, as the crews which lay over at Glendora thirty-eight minutes on the present schedule would have ample time to make this run, so the additional cost to handle this traffic would be that of the power used.

Mr. C. C. Warren, who lives near Glendora, testified

that in San Dimas and Glendora there are several packing houses which could readily transfer fruit to fill up cars if the gap were built; a great improvement over doing the transferring by the more expensive motor truck. He is interested in the packing house at Glendora and was instrumental in securing the consent of the company to run a spur there. He believes that in times of car shortage two railroads would be of great benefit to him.

Mr. W. L. Wiley, of Glendora, believes it would be a great convenience to the people to have an outlet to the east, especially to the people in the eastern end of San Bernardino County. This witness stated that he personally was not inconvenienced by lack of the railroad, but thought some of his neighbors were.

G. B. Gordon, manager of one of the packing houses in Glendora, a member of the city council and a resident of Glendora since 1894, believes that this line would be a great convenience in taking care of passenger business to the east. Most of the packing house machinery is made in Riverside, and to secure repair parts it is necessary to take an automobile to reach Riverside, as the train service does not permit them to use the Santa Fe. At the present time he has access, in Glendora, to both the Santa Fe and the Pacific Electric. He expended \$500. to get a spur track from the Pacific Electric, but all freight going out on this line has to be hauled to Los Angeles and then back to Colton; as it is not iced until it returns to Colton and is packed dead ripe, he has been subjected to criticism by his officials for using this route. It is his opinion that the greatest benefit the shippers would secure from this line would be in being able to get cars in times of car shortage.

Mr. W. A. S. Johnston, fruit grower of San Dimas, believes, from the standpoint of the citrus grower and the citrus interests, that there should be all the connected service possible through the foothill region in order to facilitate handling and loading cars during the shipping season, which is practically the year around. He estimates that 80 to 90 per cent of the citrus shipments are made from the region east of the Los Angeles line along the Santa Fe Railroad in the foothill region, and the principal objection of the shippers to the Pacific Electric's service, at the present time, is that it comes along the lower part of the valley and does not touch the foothills, so that freight must be taken down to Covina Junction. He believes that this line would serve the convenience of everyone living between Pasadena and Riverside, and says that the steam line passenger service has disappeared since the electric service came in, but that the people living in this gap are without proper electric line connections.

Mr. W. B. Ames purchased his property near San Dimas some ten years ago on the assurance that the Pacific Electric was going to build this line. He is engaged in fruit raising and packs it at the Stewart Fruit Company's house, about one and one-half or two miles from his land. He has a barn on his property which he proposes to convert into a packing house when this line is constructed, which will make a difference of about two cents a field box in the handling of his crop and that of his neighbors. He believes that for inbound shipments of fertilizer the line would be a convenience to him, and that the line would add \$150 to \$200 per acre to the value of his land.

Mr. E. F. Underhill, a rancher who resides at Glendora, desires the line and thinks it would be beneficial to him and

to his neighbors, but testified that he will suffer no financial loss if it is not built.

Mr. E. N. Wheeler, manager of a packing house at San Dimas, believes that this line would be a great convenience for people who live in Pomona or San Dimas and who desire to go to Glendora. It would not be of any particular convenience to him from a freight standpoint, because he now receives freight through and across the Covina Branch.

Mr. F. H. Howard, rancher of San Dimas and President of the Lemon Association, believes there is a reasonable necessity for this line; that it would be a great convenience in connection with mixed shipments, that is, in consolidating shipments between packing houses. He has a packing house at San Dimas with a branch house at Glendora, and makes nearly all shipments for southern territory over the Pacific Electric, and for the northern territory, over the Santa Fe. He stated that if he ships a partly loaded car on the Santa Fe and unloads it on the Santa Fe he secures a lower rate, while on the Pacific Electric at the present time it has to be hauled by truck; whereas if they had a connecting line it could be brought from Glendora to San Dimas. The Pacific Electric, he says, puts in spur tracks close together, while the Santa Fe constructs them only at towns. He has suffered no loss and knows of no property that has been injured because the line has not been built.

Mr. L. W. Spaulding, rancher and merchant of Glendora, testified that this line would be convenient to him in his fertilizer and hay and grain business. He has occasion to buy hay from China and could get it delivered directly from the Pacific Electric if this spur were built, whereas it now has to be hauled from Charter Oak, a distance of 2.5 miles, at an expense of \$2.50 to \$3.00 a ton.

Mr. H. C. Foster, Manager of the San Dimas Fruit

Exchange, thinks the projected extension would be a great convenience to the citrus packing houses at Glendora and to the west, as their fruit shipped on the Pacific Electric would get to Colton six hours earlier than it now does and would be able to connect more promptly with trains for the east. He stated that he had suffered no financial loss by the lack of this railroad.

Mr. Shoup testified that this line had been under consideration for several years; that the company is in the middle of the stream on this project and that whatever investment has been made which can not be utilized elsewhere would of course lie dead; that before the question was finally settled as to whether or not they would build they went into the matter of increased earnings very carefully and concluded with reference to the Pacific Electric alone that it would earn at least 10 per cent on the investment.

In addition to the testimony of the officials of the company bearing directly on the public necessity of the two lines, Mr. Shoup and Mr. McMillan testified regarding the attitude of the company toward projects of this kind and made several general statements which are applicable to both lines. The position of the company is briefly this: Pacific Electric extensions are planned primarily to increase net revenues. Both of these lines were considered and approved some time ago with that end in view and definite plans were made to construct them. Materials and rights of way have been purchased and the money secured to finance the purchase of additional material and rights of way and to carry on construction. Mr. Shoup sees no reason why this work should be postponed during the war as it is his

understanding the policy of the Government is to interfere as little as possible with normal activities, and to give all business possible to the electric roads in order to relieve the steam roads, as the former can operate at less expense, consume no oil, are more favorably located at passenger terminals, and can switch with greater facility. Speaking in general of electric railroads Mr. Shoup said:

"The electric line can give a service profitable to itself, and with a frequency that would be impossible for the steam lines, except at a very great operating loss; and in the same way we get around into various sections and develop the freight traffic that we can deliver to these steam lines; and while they might not like altogether our freight activities, where it takes any business from one steam road and gives it to another, I believe you will find all the steam lines unanimous in their conclusion that the electric roads are great developers of the country, and afford them additional freight by that agency."

I have described the lines sought to be constructed and have in considerable length reviewed the testimony taken because I realize that in refusing to authorize this construction and in denying these two applications - the first to be made under Section 50 of the Public Utilities Act since its amendment to include electric railways - the Commission is taking a step of considerable importance, and because I believe the Railroad Company, the people who are directly interested and the public are entitled to be fully advised of the reasons which have influenced it in so doing.

I do not believe that public necessity and convenience can be measured by the need of that portion of the public which is to be directly affected. The whole public must be considered at all times, and it must be given special consideration now when all activities are subordinated to the needs of the Nation.

The fact that the country is at war and is husbanding for war purposes its resources in men, money and materials is a factor too powerful to be ignored. It was to assist in making the best of its railroad resources that the larger railroads of the country were taken over by the Government, and the railroad managers themselves had previously attempted to operate the railroads as a unified system. The Pacific Electric, it is true, was not included in those railroads taken by the Government, but the Southern Pacific, which owns all the capital stock and controls it, was included, and so of course was the Santa Fe.

There is nothing to indicate that either of these lines is more needed now than before the war; and I do not at all agree with Mr. Shoup that it is the policy of the Government to turn business from the steam to the electric lines if the electric lines are first to be constructed. One of the first announcements of Director General McAdoo was to the effect that electric lines were to be co-ordinated with the steam roads, and parallel construction can hardly be called co-ordination. The policy of the Government toward new construction, it seems to me, has been set forth in the recent bulletin urging even individuals to refrain from building houses so men, materials and capital may be conserved.

The Pacific Electric is undoubtedly "in the middle of the stream" on these lines, as Mr. Shoup says, but this will probably be the case with most of the proceedings under Section 50, as far as it applies to extension of electric lines, since they are inaugurated by filing an application - a public document - and it has been generally found desirable for a railroad to purchase its right of way before it makes its plans public. In any event, engineering expenditures must first be incurred. Since the hearing the Pacific Electric has furnished statements

showing the expenditures made on these two projects, which total \$335,562. Of this amount all but \$127,000 spent for right of way and engineering is for material which can be used elsewhere - ties, rails, rail fastenings, copper wire, etc. Since the estimated total cost of both lines is \$440,601, the abandonment of the project temporarily would result in permitting labor and material estimated to cost \$315,601, plus an amount not estimated to buy rights of way and build 3500 feet of line at the Newport Road in Tustin, to be diverted to other purposes.

There is another phase of the situation which should be mentioned. The Southern Pacific and the Santa Fe are competing with each other for business over the entire southern part of the state. Both roads have been taken by the Government, and probably neither of them could make extensions without the consent of the Government's Director General. However, the Pacific Electric, a subsidiary company of the Southern Pacific, which was not included in the Government's railroad orders, can make such extensions as it desires, as far as the Federal Government is concerned. Mr. Shoup has stated that although these lines would contribute toward the net income - one of them paying 10% on the investment - the passenger business would support neither of them. As they are so close to existing lines of the Santa Fe that they can hardly create much additional freight, the bulk of the earnings of both lines will come from freight diverted from the Santa Fe. If the railroads are eventually to be turned back to their private owners the present situation seems to me to be unfair, although this aspect of the matter is possibly one for the Federal Government rather than for this Commission to consider.

Turning now to the testimony of the outside witnesses.

Aside from its own investigation the only method the Commission has of determining the public necessity and convenience of an extension of a public utility is from the testimony of interested witnesses, where, as here, no one appeared in opposition to the project. It is probably a safe assumption that the witnesses for the applicant in these two cases were those men in each community who would be most closely affected by this proposed construction; so, although it is probably equally safe to assume that by no means all of those who desire these lines or would be glad to see them built were called to the witness stand, the need of the public for them can be determined from the testimony taken.

On the Tustin-Irvine line the proposed tracks would be nowhere farther than 3000 feet from existing tracks, except for one mile near Irvine where the country has not been developed, and the Santa Fe's main line is within $2\frac{1}{2}$ miles at all points. The Glendora line has been referred to as closing a gap; but a gap exists only as far as the Pacific Electric is concerned. The Santa Fe practically parallels it and reaches the same points east of San Dimas and west of Glendora. Its passenger service is not frequent at these two towns, but it has daily six passenger trains eastbound and five westbound. Two eastbound and three westbound stop at San Dimas and Glendora. At Azusa, west of Glendora, and at Claremont, east of San Dimas, three trains in both directions stop, and at Upland, east of Claremont, five eastbound and four westbound trains make daily stops.

Most of the testimony is to the effect that the advent

of an electric line into a community which has previously had only steam railroad service acts as a stimulus to business of all sorts. The reasons are obvious, but they were fully developed by the witnesses. The same testimony would to a large extent justify the construction of electric interurban lines into every district in the state which has only steam railroads.

Whether or not a showing along these lines constitutes public necessity and convenience is a matter I shall not go into at this time. Neither is it necessary to consider the effect of constructing fifty-five highway grade crossings and seven grade crossings with railroads' main lines and spur tracks, although due weight would have to be given to this in normal times. I have indicated throughout this opinion that the need of the Government for labor and materials is a factor which should be given great weight, and I am convinced that the convenience of these lines to the public which they would serve is not great enough to require the expenditure of well upwards of \$300,000 for these things during the duration of the war.

I recommend the following form of order:

O R D E R

PACIFIC ELECTRIC RAILWAY COMPANY having applied to

the Commission for certificates of public necessity and convenience and for permission to cross streets, highway and railroad tracks on the lines hereinbefore described; and public hearings having been held, and the Commission, for the reasons set forth in the foregoing opinion, believing that public necessity and convenience do not demand the construction of these lines at the present time:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, That these applications be and the same hereby are denied.

The foregoing opinion and order are hereby approved and ordered filed as the opinion and order of the Railroad Commission of the State of California.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 9th day
March
of February, 1918.

Max Thelen

H. H. Valance

Alex Gordon

Edwin O. Edgerton

Frank P. Miller

Commissioners.