

BEFORE THE RAILROAD COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Campbell & Coffey,
 Complainant,
 -vs-
 Southern Pacific Company,
 Defendant.

Case No. 364

G. R. Campbell, for Complainant
 George D. Squires, for Defendant

O P I N I O N

GORDON, Commissioner

The complainant in this case is engaged in shipping rough and dimension stone from Rocklin, Calif., to Santa Rosa, Calif., where it manufactures the same for various purposes. The distance from Rocklin to Santa Rosa is 112 miles and the rate now published by the defendant for the movement of stone or granite is \$3.50 per ton, which the complainant alleges is excessive and discriminatory.

The complainant in support of its charge of discrimination calls attention to the fact that the defendant maintains a rate of \$2.50 per ton on stone and granite from Penryn and Rocklin to San Jose,- the distance from Penryn to San Jose being 149 miles.

The defendant entered a general denial that the rate of \$3.50 per ton on stone or granite between Rocklin and Santa Rosa was either excessive or discriminatory.

At the hearing, witness for complainant gave testimony as to the volume of stone moving between Rocklin

and Santa Rosa; also to the effect that because of the lower rate to San Jose it was placed at a decided disadvantage in competing for monumental work for use in cemeteries adjacent to San Francisco.

The defendant in justification of the present rate between Rocklin and Santa Rosa relies principally on the fact that the rate from Rocklin to San Jose is indirectly influenced by water competition from Sacramento to San Francisco; and the further fact that Santa Rosa is located on a branch line and that the service over this branch line is considerably more expensive than on the main line.

It appears that there was handled between Rocklin and Santa Rosa during the year ending August 31, 1912, 171 tons of granite.

The defendant maintains rate on rough or dressed building stone from Placerville to San Francisco - 148.7 miles - of \$3.00 per ton. This involves a branch line haul of 60 miles from Placerville to Sacramento.

The defendant also maintains rate of \$3.00 per ton from Raymond and Knowles to Suisun - 202 miles, San Francisco 188 miles, and Sacramento 162 miles. This also involves a branch line haul from Raymond to Berenda, which branch we do not believe produces as much tonnage per mile as the Santa Rosa branch.

The defendant also maintains rate from Ione to Richmond of \$2.50 per ton - distance 128 miles - which involves a branch line movement from Ione to Galt and also the absorption of the charges of the Richmond Belt Railroad for delivery to the city of Richmond.

From the records of the movements of the various commodities over the lines of the defendant within the State of California which are on file with this Commission it appears

that ~~xx~~ but three high grade commodities for distances approximately the same as between Rocklin and Santa Rosa produce an average rate to the defendant of any where near \$3.50 per ton. Many commodities of much higher grade than granite or stone average less than \$2.50 per ton on all the traffic handled by the defendant in the State of California. While in individual cases the rates may be higher, the average revenue on each commodity, particularly on low grade commodities, considered separately, will not average \$2.50 per ton for the total volume handled. It must be taken into consideration that these average rates which the defendant receives on the various commodities moved approximately the same distance as between Rocklin and Santa Rosa include all kinds of conditions, competitive and non-competitive, branch line and mountain service.

It is difficult to understand, therefore, on what ground the defendant expects a rate in excess of \$2.50 per ton on a low grade commodity such as stone or granite.

The defendant, it appears, voluntarily offered to reduce the rate from \$3.50 per ton to \$3.00 per ton, which was not acceptable to the complainant.

I find as a fact from the evidence in this case that the rate of \$3.50 per ton on rough and dimensioned stone and granite from Rocklin to Santa Rosa ^{is} excessive and unreasonable and that a rate of \$2.50 per ton is a just and reasonable rate for this service.

I recommend the following order:

O R D E R

Complaint having been made that the rate on granite and stone, rough and dimensioned, from Rocklin to Santa Rosa is excessive, unjust and discriminatory and a regular

hearing having been held and the Commission being fully appraised in the premises and basing its findings and conclusions upon findings set out in the opinion hereto and finding as a fact that a rate of \$2.50 per ton is a reasonable rate for the transportation of stone and granite, rough or dimensioned, in carload lots, between Rocklin and Santa Rosa, such rate of \$2.50 per ton is hereby established as the lawful rate to be so charged by the defendant.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Southern Pacific Company publish and file with this Commission within twenty (20) days from the date of service upon it of this order tariff containing rate of \$2.50 per ton for the transportation of granite and stone, rough or dimensioned, carload lots, between Rocklin and Santa Rosa.

The foregoing opinion and order are hereby approved and ordered filed as the opinion and order of the Railroad Commission of the State of California.

Dated at San Francisco this 15th day of April, 1913.

John M. Ashleman
W. H. Lovelaid
W. G. ...
Max Thelein

Commissioners.