

BEFORE THE RAILROAD COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

ORIGINAL

.....
CITY OF INGLEWOOD, a municipal
corporation,

Complainant,

vs.

Case No. 337

LOS ANGELES RAILWAY COMPANY, a
corporation; and
LOS ANGELES RAILWAY CORPORATION,
a corporation,

Defendants.
.....

Robert Young, Esq., for Complainant.

S. M. Haskins, Esq., for Defendants.

EDGERTON, Commissioner.

O P I N I O N

In this complaint the City of Inglewood, a municipal corporation, attacks the rates of the defendant corporations, the Los Angeles Railway Company and Los Angeles Railway Corporation, as being unjust, unreasonable and discriminatory in favor of other communities similarly situated, so far as distance is concerned, from the center of population of the City of Los Angeles.

The defendants operate the principal street railway system serving the City of Los Angeles and in some cases its lines have been extended to points without the corporate limits of the city. The municipal limits of Los Angeles are not at all regular, so that in many instances the service of the lines of the defendants extends beyond the city limits; and because of the irregular boundary lines of the city it will be found that some of the lines running beyond the boundaries of the city are of much shorter length between the terminus and the center of population than are other lines oper-

ating in other directions wholly within the city.

The one way fare of the defendants between Los Angeles and Eagle Rock is 10 cents, made up of a fare of 5 cents to Glassell Road and 5 cents from Glassell Road to Townsend Avenue.

The defendants maintain two family commutation rates between Los Angeles and Townsend Avenue, Eagle Rock, - one 30-ride family commutation ticket for \$1.50 or 5 cents per trip, and one 50-ride family commutation ticket for \$3.00 or 6 cents per trip.

Between Los Angeles and Inglewood the defendants maintain a one-way passenger fare of 15 cents, made up of 5 cents to 54th Street and 10 cents from 54th Street to Inglewood. Adult commutation rates maintained by the defendants between Los Angeles and Inglewood are as follows:

10-ride party ticket	\$1.00
30-ride family "	3.00
52-ride individual monthly.....	
commutation.....	4.00

The complaint of the City of Inglewood may be reduced to a question of discrimination in favor of Eagle Rock and as against Inglewood in violation of section 21, article 12, of the Constitution of California, reading as follows:

"No discrimination in charges or facilities for transportation shall be made by any railroad or other transportation company between places or persons, or in facilities for the transportation of the same classes of freight or passengers within this State".

The defendants have drawn a circle of 6.2 miles from 6th and Main Streets, Los Angeles, which latter point is claimed to be the center of population, and within this circle a fare of 5 cents is charged as a general proposition. The one exception to the rule that no fare of 5 cents extends beyond the circle drawn 6.2 miles from 6th and Main Streets, Los Angeles, is that line operating to a point beyond the city limits of Los Angeles known as Armandale, and between this point and the City of Los Angeles a fare of 5 cents

is charged without transfer privilege, which is practically equivalent to the commutation rates between Los Angeles and Eagle Rock.

According to the Official Transportation and City Map of Los Angeles it is interesting to note that 12th and Main Streets has been selected as the center of population and that a circle radiating around this assumed center a distance of eight miles therefrom goes through the City of Inglewood and crosses the line of the defendants at Arbor Vitae Avenue. This same line passes through Eagle Rock a short distance beyond the terminus of the Eagle Rock line of the defendants at Townsend Avenue and Eagle Rock Road, and also a short distance beyond Buena Vista Terrace and Eagle Rock Road, Annandale.

It is almost impossible to take a street car system and segregate the earnings of all of its different routes or lines so as to determine whether the rates on any particular route or line are yielding an excessive return on the capital invested. The defendants operate twenty-seven lines over various streets and along certain routes in Los Angeles, one of which operates from Eagle Rock to Hawthorne through the City of Inglewood. It also operates a line known as the "Main Street Line" to Eagle Rock Park through Annandale. From the records of earnings furnished by the defendants it would appear that the line operating from Eagle Rock to Hawthorne through the City of Inglewood is a very much better paying line than the one operating to Eagle Rock Park through Annandale.

On one end of the Eagle Rock-Hawthorne line, for approximately the same distance, one set of rates are charged lower than on the other end of the line for approximately the same distance, while the line through Annandale which appears to be less either per car mile or per car hour than the through line between Eagle Rock and Hawthorne is favored with a still lower rate. This lower rate, however, as before stated, is practically equivalent to the commutation rates in effect between Los Angeles and Eagle Rock. I believe the evidence clearly discloses the fact that discrimination exists in favor of Eagle Rock as against Inglewood. Whatever may have

been the reasons moving the defendants to establish a fare of 10 cents between Los Angeles and Eagle Rock they are of little consequence. The fact remains that passengers may travel to Eagle Rock for 10 cents, including transfer privileges within the City of Los Angeles, and for approximately the same distance to Inglewood a fare of 15 cents is exacted. It is also a fact that a person may travel from Buena Vista Avenue, Annandale, to all points in Los Angeles for 10 cents and I am at a loss to understand how the defendants expect to maintain the present rate adjustment as against the City of Inglewood.

When a carrier voluntarily establishes a scale of rates between two points the presumption must be entertained that such rates are prima facie reasonable, and entertaining such a presumption it is clearly apparent that the rates between Los Angeles and Inglewood are excessive.

Street car lines, such as are operated by the defendants, are in a position to place tremendous handicaps on the development of a particular section by placing in effect lower rates for approximately the same distance to one locality than to another. Under such circumstances carriers allege that the greater density of population justifies a lower rate to one section than to the other notwithstanding the distance may be about the same; and, while, to a certain extent, the density of traffic is a factor in making rates, the fact that one community being denied rates for an almost identical service is frequently the reason why the population does not increase. Population usually follows the lowest transportation rates and when one locality is denied rates equal to another for approximately the same service the result is generally the same: the community with the low rate prospers and that with the higher rate lies dormant.

I find as a fact that the rates of the defendants between Los Angeles and the City of Inglewood are excessive, unreasonable and discriminatory.

I find as a fact that just and reasonable passenger fares

between Los Angeles and the City of Inglewood to be as follows:

One-way fare including the usual transfer privileges
to points in the City of Los Angeles....10 cents.

30-ride family commutation ticket without transfer
privileges\$1.50

I recommend the following order:

O R D E R

City of Inglewood having complained that the rates of the Los Angeles Railway Company and Los Angeles Railway Corporation for the transportation of passengers between Los Angeles and the City of Inglewood are excessive and discriminatory and a regular hearing having been held and the Commission being fully advised in the premises and basing its conclusions on findings of fact contained in the opinion which precedes this order,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the Los Angeles Railway Company, a corporation, and Los Angeles Railway Corporation, a corporation, publish and file with this Commission within twenty (20) days from date hereof a fare of ten (10) cents between the City of Inglewood and Los Angeles with usual transfer privileges to points in the City of Los Angeles, and a fare of \$1.50 for a 30-ride family commutation ticket without transfer privileges which fares are hereby found to be just and reasonable fares for the service performed.

The foregoing opinion and order are hereby approved and ordered filed as the opinion and order of the Railroad Commission of the State of California.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 2nd day of July, 1913.

John M. Estleman

Edwin O. Edgerton

W. H. ...

Commissioners.