

Decision No. 9454**ORIGINAL****BEFORE THE RAILROAD COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

In the Matter of the Application of)
 JAMES A. MURRAY, WILLIAM G. HENSEAW)
 and ED FLETCHER, co-partners, doing)
 business under the firm name and)
 style of the CUYAMACA WATER COMPANY,)
 for an order authorizing and estab-)
 lishing a surcharge to pay for the)
 cost of operation of pumping from)
 underground reservoirs.)

Application No. 6767

Charles C. Crouch, for applicant.

Ed Fletcher, for William G. Henshaw and Ed Fletcher.

W.C. Earle, for City of San Diego.

Jesse George and Clarence S. Preston, for J.C. Brewer
 et al. and Robert Ross et al., protestants.

George Russell and O.W. Cotton, for Fairmount
 Water Company.

Arthur T. French, for City of East San Diego.

J.H. Halley, for Lemon Grove Mutual Water Company.

J.M.C. Warren, for Helix Mutual Water Company.

John T. Scott, for La Mesa Mutual Water Company.

W.W. Clary, for Railroad Commission of California.

MARTIN, Commissioner:

O P I N I O N

Applicants herein ask, in effect, permission to collect a surcharge of two and one half (2-1/2) cents per one hundred cubic feet for all water delivered to their consumers, alleging that it is necessary to conserve the stored water by pumping.

and that the cost of this pumping is not provided for in the rates as now fixed.

A public hearing was held in this matter at San Diego, of which hearing all of applicants' consumers were notified and given an opportunity to appear and be heard.

Applicants' principal source of supply is the San Diego River and its tributaries, the summer flow of which is augmented by storing storm water in the Cuyamaca and Murray Reservoirs. The supply is further increased, when necessary, by pumping from wells sunk in the San Diego River bed at the El Monte Pumping Station, located near Lakeside. It is also possible to pump water from the Murray Reservoir to a higher elevation with the La Mesa Booster Plant. These two plants are operated only when there is a shortage of water in the Cuyamaca Reservoir. There are several other small pumping plants, which are used every year to pump the water to certain areas not reached by gravity. The service area is divided into three districts: the Flume Service, which can be supplied from Cuyamaca Reservoir or the El Monte Pump; the High Service, which can be supplied from Cuyamaca Reservoir, the El Monte Pump or the La Mesa Booster; the Low Service, which can be supplied from the higher sources, if necessary, but regularly supplied wholly from the Murray Reservoir. For a more detailed description of applicant's system, its history and other data relating to its operation, reference is made to Decision No. 8145, In the Matter of the Application of James A. Murray, Wm. G. Henshaw and Ed Fletcher, doing business under the firm name and style of the Cuyamaca Water Company, for an order authorizing and permitting an increase in the rentals, tolls, and charges for water furnished by them and service rendered by them in furnishing wa-

ter in the County of San Diego, Application No. 4515; In the Matter of the Application of James A. Murray, Wm. G. Henshaw and Ed Fletcher, doing business under the firm name and style of the Cuyamaca Water Company, for an order authorizing and permitting them to place a surcharge upon their present rentals, tolls and charges for water furnished by them, such surcharge being necessary on account of the increased cost of operation, Application No. 4670; Robert Ross et al. vs. James A. Murray et al., Case No. 1272, decided September 24, 1920.

The capacity of Cuyamaca Reservoir when full is 11,596 acre feet. On June 1, 1921, there were only 3,651 acre feet of water stored in Cuyamaca Reservoir, which is not a sufficient amount to supply the Flume Service and the High Service throughout the year. Applicants introduced evidence to show that the deficiency should be overcome by operating the El Monte Pumping Plant for a period of five months in 1921, at a total cost of approximately \$19,200. Commission's engineer, Mr. M. E. Ready, submitted a report in which he estimated that by exhausting the storage in Cuyamaca Reservoir the cost of pumping at the El Monte plant would be reduced to about \$7,326.

Evidence was also introduced to show that the La Mesa Booster pump can be operated at a much lower cost per acre foot than the El Monte plant. It was also shown that more than one half of the Lemon Grove consumers, who in previous years have been supplied from the High Service, can be supplied this year by gravity from Murray Reservoir.

It appears that the average pumping expense for the last five years has been \$2,072, exclusive of the operation of the El Monte Plant. However, this plant was operated only during the season of 1919 within this period, and then

for a total of only 40 days, at an operating cost of \$3,686. In that year the company was permitted to collect a surcharge, the total of which was much larger than the actual operating expense.

In the schedule of rates established in Decision No. 8145 supra, this Commission recognized the necessity of pumping operations on this system. It recognized the fact that past experience has shown that the operation of the El Monte plant was not necessary each year. However, there was included in the rates there established and still in effect, a sum which was anticipated to be ample to cover the whole cost of pumping over a series of years - an excess accumulating in a year of copious natural supply of water, offsetting a deficit in years of meager supply. It was not conclusively shown that this provision in the present rates is inadequate to meet the purpose for which it was intended.

After carefully considering all the evidence it would appear that the applicants can operate during the season of 1921 by drawing a portion of the water from Cuyamaca Reservoir, supply the deficiency by pumping from Murray Reservoir and at El Monte, and give adequate service to their consumers. It would appear that the cost of this necessary function is properly provided for in the rates already in effect, and the application should therefore be denied.

The following form of order is submitted:

O R D E R

James A. Murray, William G. Henshaw and Ed Fletcher, co-partners, doing business under the firm name and style of the Cuyamaca Water Company, having applied for an order authoriz-

ing and establishing a surcharge to pay for the cost of operation of pumping from underground reservoirs, a public hearing having been held and the matter having been submitted,

It Is Hereby Found as a Fact that the rates at present in effect are ample to cover the necessary costs of pumping on this system when considered over a period of years and that the necessity of adding a surcharge at this time to such established rates does not exist.

And basing its order upon the foregoing findings of fact and upon the statements of fact contained in the opinion preceding this order,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the above application be and it is hereby denied.

The foregoing opinion and order are hereby approved and ordered filed as the opinion and order of the Railroad Commission of the State of California.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 1st day of September 1921.

H. B. Dundee
H. D. Loveland
Living Maitland
Blair A. Rowan
H. S. Benedict
Commissioners.