

Decision No. 33473

BEFORE THE RAILROAD COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

CITY OF FRESNO, a municipal
corporation,

Complainant,

-vs-

FRESNO CITY LINES, INC., a
corporation,

Defendant.

ORIGINAL

Case No. 4508

C. M. OZIAS, City Attorney, JEAN L. VINCENZ, City
Engineer and Commissioner of Public Works,
Mayor FRANK A. HOMAN, Commissioners A. L.
HILDEBRAND, GEORGE H. BALL and JAMES S. RANKIN
for the City Commission, for Complainant.

T. J. MANNING, STEWART MOORE and E. A. DEVEREUX for
Defendant.

AL BRAVERMAN, for himself and other residents of the
City of Fresno.

RILEY, COMMISSIONER:

The City of Fresno filed the above-numbered complaint on
April 10, 1940, alleging that the bus service within the City of
Fresno, performed by Fresno City Lines, Inc., is inadequate and in-
sufficient. Specifically the complaint alleges that:

1. Some of the buses have inadequate seating capacity
resulting in an excessive number of standees during
rush hours, with occasional personal injuries to
passengers owing to the inability of drivers to see
the exits.
2. Service is too infrequent in some sections of the
city, particularly in the Sierra Vista district.
3. Certain routes are unbalanced, leading to insuf-
ficient service over segments serving areas of
high-population density.
4. Sunday service is inadequate on certain lines.

A public hearing was held in this matter in Fresno on
August 28, 1940, at which time the matter was submitted.

Immediately after the filing of this complaint, and as requested by both the City and the Company, the Engineering Division of this Commission proceeded with a study of the entire service and operations of the Fresno City Lines, Inc. The results of this investigation were incorporated in a report which was introduced as Exhibit 1, in the record. (1)

For many years the local transportation service in Fresno was performed by electric street cars of the Fresno Traction Company and later supplemented by the bus service performed by Harm and Ritchie, both of which operations were independent of each other. On February 14, 1939, the Commission in Decision No. 31739, Applications Nos. 22228 and 22255, authorized the Fresno Traction Company to abandon its street car service and substitute therefor automotive passenger service, and furthermore authorized Harm and Ritchie to sell its bus line to the Fresno Traction Company. By this action all the local service in Fresno was consolidated into a single operating unit. Soon thereafter the ownership of the stock of the Fresno Traction Company was sold by Southern Pacific Company to the Pacific City Lines, and the name of the company changed to Fresno City Lines, Inc.

DISCUSSION OF EXHIBIT 1.

PRESENT SERVICE

The present operations of the Fresno City Lines, Inc., serve generally all the area within the confines of the City of Fresno and certain outlying districts adjacent thereto, all of which are shown in Figure "A" in Exhibit 1.

The present motor coach service of the Fresno City Lines,

(1) This report was prepared by Homer H. Grant, Transportation Economist of the Engineering Division of the Commission.

Inc., consists of ten different routes which, for operating convenience, have been joined together, as follows:

- Route 1. Wishon-Recreation Park
- Route 2. Blackstone-McKenzie, Sierra Vista
- Route 3. Olive Avenue and "D" Street
- Route 4. Harvey Avenue-Hazelwood
- Route 5. East-West Fresno

All of these routes traverse the business district on Fulton Street, with the exception of the East-West Fresno line (Route 5) and reach out into the residential areas of the city and adjacent territory.

In order to ascertain the characteristics of the riding habits of the people of Fresno a traffic check was made with the assistance of personnel supplied by the City of Fresno, covering both weekday and Sunday operations. Also a map of the distribution of population in Fresno and the surrounding territory, shown on Figures "A" and "C" in Exhibit 1, was prepared based upon the 1940 census.

PROPOSED SERVICE

A study of these traffic checks, population data, economic characteristics of the City of Fresno, and accounts of the Fresno City Lines, indicates that certain modifications of routes should be made. These modifications will be discussed by routes.

Wishon Route, Recreation Park Route

It is clear from the record that the No. 1 Wishon-Recreation Park route, as it is now run, is out of balance. In other words, the heavy travel on the Wishon end of this line tends to result either in too much service on the Recreation end, or in the necessity for trippers on the Wishon end, which in turn causes operating confusion. Therefore, our engineers concluded that these two lines should be separated, i.e., the Wishon route should run from the center of the city to its northerly limits, independently, and likewise the Recreation Park route should run from the congested

part of the city to its easterly terminus.

A study of the routing of the northerly end of the Wishon route clearly indicates that the territory is not properly covered. For this reason it is recommended that the Wishon route be modified as shown in Figure "C" of Exhibit 1, whereby buses on the main leg of the line, running along Wilson to Shields Avenue from Clinton, should be operated at all times in the direction of heaviest traffic flow, and buses on a second leg of the line, in the less densely populated district along College Avenue and Fountain Way, should operate in such a way as to run opposite to the direction of the flow of traffic into town in the morning and reverse its direction in mid-afternoon. In this way a majority of passengers on the main Wilson branch are assured of fast direct service to and from the city, yet it becomes possible to give service to a new district on College Avenue with only a few minutes' increase in riding time for these patrons and little additional cost to the company.

With respect to the Recreation Park route, our engineers have concluded that the eastern end should be extended two blocks farther east than at present to better serve the territory.

A study of the use of these two routes, taking into account the fact that larger buses are now used, indicates that the headways during the peak hours on the Wishon route need not be closer than $7\frac{1}{2}$ minutes, as against the present 5-minute headway; and not greater than 15 minutes for Recreation Park peak headways. However, as pointed out in Exhibit 1, 5-minute Wishon peak headways may be necessary if traffic increases as expected.

Blackstone-McKenzie, Sierra Vista Route

It is proposed to modify the north end of the Blackstone leg of this route by replacing the present moderate sized loop with an extension from Hedges along San Pablo Street to University Street

and looping around the block, thereby serving the College as well as a larger territory than at present. No change was proposed on the Sierra Vista end of this route.

It is further proposed to decrease the present 15-minute peak headways on this route to 20 minutes and the 20-minute base headways to 30 minutes, and to have all buses traverse the Sierra Vista loop rather than stop at 9th Street as at present. Exhibit 1 indicates the probable need of 10-minute peak headways on this route in the very near future if this line develops as expected. Actually, headways on the Blackstone route south of Belmont will be increased from the present 15-minute peak, 20-minute base headways to 10-minute peak, 15-minute base headways owing to rerouting of the Olive Avenue buses. Base headways on the Sierra Vista loop will be increased from 60 to 30 minutes.

East Fresno-"D" Street-West Fresno Route

No change is proposed for the East Fresno route which will be tied to the "D" Street and West Fresno routes with buses alternating on the latter. The loop on the "D" Street route is enlarged to return to Fresno Street via "B" Street, thus serving additional territory. The West Fresno route is ended at Irwin and Tulare Streets owing to the sparse population in this district. Headways on the "D" Street route north of Fresno Street will remain the same as at present during peak hours, but will drop from 40 to 60 minutes during base hours; while headways on West Fresno route beyond "B" Street will drop from 20-minute peak, 30-minute base to 40-minute peak, 60-minute base. It should be pointed out, however, that from "C" Street to Fulton Street, service will be 15 minutes or better at all times.

Olive-Harvey Route

No change is recommended for the Harvey route except to extend the loop two blocks farther north. Headways on this route

will be unchanged.

Considerable change is proposed for the Olive Avenue route in order to equalize the service on Blackstone south of Belmont Avenue with that on Fresno Street and on North Fulton, to provide service near the entrance to Roeding Park, and bring service to areas not now within reasonable walking distance of a bus route. This change is proposed after giving careful consideration to the fact that some persons in the vicinity of Ferger and Wilson Avenues will have to walk increased distances. Briefly, our engineers propose to run the Olive route on the Blackstone route to Belmont, thence east to Harrison and north around a loop bounded by Harrison, McKinley, Adoline and Olive avenues. On Sundays, except during periods of winter weather, the route is also to operate to the entrance to Roeding Park via Belmont Avenue.

The traffic survey reveals that headways on this route are too frequent, therefore it is proposed to reduce them to 20 minutes for peak trips and 30 minutes for base trips, to conform to headways in other sections of the city having similar population characteristics.

Hazelwood-"C" Street Route

Under the proposal the Hazelwood route will remain substantially as at present, with the exception of elimination of the dangerous intersection at Fulton and Hamilton Street, and lengthening of the loop from 8th to 10th Street to serve additional patronage. The Hazelwood route will be tied to a new "C" Street route which runs southwest on Fresno Street, thence southeast on "C" Street to California, thence around a loop bounded by California, Kirk, Belgravia and Holly streets. This route will bring service to numerous patrons at present beyond reasonable walking distance.

Headways, as revealed by the traffic check, may be dropped from the present 20-minute peak, 30-minute base to 30 minutes throughout the day.

For a detailed description of the various routes see Appendix "A."

OTHER PROPOSALS

Suggestions by various interested parties for further changes and improvements in the service were offered and are discussed below.

The representative of the City of Fresno concurred in most of the recommendations shown in Exhibit 1, but objected to that part of the proposed route of the Olive Avenue line north of Belmont and Ferger streets. It was suggested that the route should continue to operate north and south along Ferger Street as at present, between Belmont and Olive Avenue, instead of three blocks to the west on Harrison Street. It was further requested that the loop on the northerly end of the Olive Avenue route, between Olive Avenue and McKinley, be moved two blocks west, as this would, in his opinion, better serve the territory involved. By such a move, however, the distance between the Wishon route and the Olive Avenue route would be increased to more than one-half mile, and would leave considerable territory not as well served as by the route proposed in Exhibit 1. The city's representative also suggested that the peak hour service on the Wishon route be continued on a 5-minute headway instead of on a $7\frac{1}{2}$ -minute headway as proposed, since, in his opinion, a $7\frac{1}{2}$ -minute headway during peaks on the Wishon route, particularly around five o'clock, would be insufficient to properly take care of the traffic.

Furthermore, the city desired that no decreases be made on routes at present having 20-minute base service, whereas our engineers recommended 30-minute base headways on certain of these routes.

The residents of the area south and west of Roeding Park

are very desirous of having a daily service extended on Belmont Avenue westerly to a point in the vicinity of the west line of Roeding Park, as they now have no service into the city. The plan proposed in Exhibit 1 recommends Sunday service as far as the entrance to Roeding Park just west of the Southern Pacific tracks, and locates the regular daily route within walking distance of many of these residents.

A further extension was not recommended by the Commission's engineers as they felt that the amount of use of such an extension would by no means be remunerative, particularly at the present time.

The residents north of Tyler Street, at the northeast end of the Harvey Avenue route, desire that the Harvey Avenue loop be extended to Olive Avenue, two blocks farther north than proposed in Exhibit 1, in order to serve their territory.

A request was also made to extend the Wishon route northerly into the Fig Garden area. It was pointed out that students and household help had no means of public transportation. It was their desire that one or two trips in the morning and evening be run into the Fig Garden area.

Another request urged that the Sierra Vista route be extended along McKenzie Avenue from First Avenue to Fresno Avenue and thence into the business district along Fresno Street, instead of operating along McKenzie to First Avenue and thence along Tulare Street. It was alleged that the area along McKenzie Avenue between First Avenue and Fresno Street is entirely without transportation. In order to effect this routing it was suggested that the Recreation Park route on Huntington Boulevard should turn north on First Avenue to Tulare and follow that street into the business district, instead of the present route via First Avenue and Ventura Street.

CONCLUSIONS

In arriving at a conclusion in this matter we are mindful of the fact that a reasonable service should be performed to take care of the needs of the community, and also that sufficient revenue should be produced to make the service enduring.

We have carefully considered the proposal of the city in regard to the route of the Olive Avenue line, but it appears to us that the route as outlined in Figure "C" of Exhibit 1 gives better coverage of the territory. It not only serves the present territory reasonably well, but also reaches a considerable additional population both east and west of the Southern Pacific tracks and north of Belmont Avenue.

A careful study has been made of the suggested headways on the Wishon route, particularly during peak periods. Based on conditions existing at the time of the traffic check we are convinced that the $7\frac{1}{2}$ -minute headway could take care of the peak travel; nevertheless, during the afternoon peak it appears to us the present 5-minute headway should be maintained, especially from about 4:30 to 6:00 p.m., because of the probability of increased customers owing to the change in route.

On the Sierra Vista route a 20-minute headway is proposed during peak hours with the proviso that a 10-minute headway may be needed in the near future. Because of the probability of increased usage of the Sierra Vista loop, it appears that particularly between 5:00 and 5:30, a 10-minute headway should be instituted at once.

With respect to the base headways as proposed in the engineers' report, it is clear that at least for the present

these base headways will amply take care of the traffic offered. The company should, however, maintain all schedules as nearly as possible on an on-time basis so that its patrons can secure transportation by schedule rather than by haphazardly waiting on a street corner for a bus to come along. We are convinced that if the company maintains definite schedules for its buses, and the patrons will use these schedules, much valuable time will be saved. However, it is to be definitely understood that these time schedules are not necessarily fixed. In the event traffic increases materially the carrier must of course augment its service accordingly.

With respect to the district south and west of Roeding Park, these people could of course use a service if provided. However, we are convinced that prospective patronage in this area at the present time is insufficient to justify such an extension. The same thing is true of the Fig Garden area.

Careful consideration has been given to the request for changing the loop, proposed in Exhibit 1, at the end of the Harvey Avenue route from Tyler Street to Olive Avenue, but at present such a change appears unwarranted owing to the relatively small population density in the area north and east of the loop.

The request that bus service should run along McKenzie Avenue between First Avenue and Fresno Street has been given thorough consideration. If such a change were made, it would also be necessary to modify not only the Recreation route but all of the routes in the easterly portion of the city. The routes as now run through that area, and as proposed in Exhibit 1, leave no one at a greater distance than about one-quarter mile from a route.

It was urged that a route along McKenzie Avenue was necessary so that the people in that district could pass by the free markets and thus avoid a walk from Tulare Street on market days. Clearly it would be impossible to have all routes pass all points

of interest in the downtown area, therefore, it is necessary to route the lines to reasonably well serve the population as a whole rather than for a particular district.

The record shows that the small buses in use in Fresno are being gradually withdrawn from service and replaced by buses of greater seating capacity which will relieve to a large extent any overcrowded conditions.

It appears that if the modified recommendations contained in Exhibit 1 are placed in effect, the inequalities of service enumerated in the complaint will be removed.

During the year ended April 30, 1940, as shown by Exhibit 1, the company earned no return upon its investment and lacked \$2,879.60 of earning its operating expenses.

A 5-cent fare with a 1-cent transfer charge is now in effect in the City of Fresno. It is our desire to maintain this fare and, if possible, in the near future have the finances of the company in good condition so that the one-cent transfer charge can be eliminated. In order to do this we cannot require the establishment of unnecessary service or headways.

As discussed on pages 89 and 90 of Exhibit 1, it cannot be too strongly emphasized that continued excessive service inevitably means unprofitable operation and inability of a company to conform to proper maintenance and depreciation schedules, resulting in inadequate service, old equipment, and general public dissatisfaction in the future. The line between adequacy and inadequacy is narrow, and must therefore be determined with considerable exactness if the public is to be assured of modern, efficient service at all times.

We are convinced that the operations, as recommended in Exhibit 1 and modified herein, will give the City of Fresno and its immediate surroundings a good transportation service; the following recommended order will so provide. The company will of course

be expected to augment its service from time to time as conditions warrant.

ORDER

A public hearing having been held and the matter being under submission,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the Fresno City Lines, Inc., shall reroute portions of its motor coach service as authorized in Decision No. 31739, as amended. The total routes, as amended, are described in Appendix "A" attached hereto and made a part hereof, subject, however, to the condition that headways shall not be less frequent than those shown in Appendix "B" attached hereto and made a part hereof.

Fresno City Lines, Inc., shall place said rerouted service in effect on not more than thirty days from the date hereof and on not less than five days' notice to the public and the Commission.

In all other respects Decision No. 31739, as amended, shall remain in full force and effect.

The foregoing Opinion and Order are hereby approved and ordered filed as the Opinion and Order of the Railroad Commission of the State of California.

The effective date of this order shall be five (5) days from the date hereof.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 10th day of September, 1940.

Ray & Riley
Ray & Riley
Justin F. Casner
(COMMISSIONERS)

APPENDIX "A"

DESCRIPTION OF LINES

FRESNO CITY LINES, INC.

REGULAR SERVICE

1. WISHON AVENUE LINE: Starting at Fresno and Fulton streets, thence north on Fulton Street to Olive Avenue, west on Olive to Wishon, thence north on Wishon to Clinton, west on Clinton to Wilson, and north on Wilson to Shields.

Starting at Wishon and Clinton, east on Clinton to Del Mar, north on Del Mar to Brown, west on Brown to College, north on College to Fountain Way, west on Fountain Way to Wishon, south on Wishon to Shields, west on Shields to Wilson.

Starting at Fresno and Fulton Streets, southeasterly to Inyo Street, northeasterly on Inyo to Van Ness, northwesterly on Van Ness to Kern, southwesterly on Kern to Fulton Street.

2. RECREATION PARK: Starting at the intersection of Fulton and Fresno Street, southeasterly to Ventura Avenue, thence north-easterly and east on Ventura Avenue to First Street, thence north on First Street to Huntington Boulevard, thence east on Huntington Boulevard to 12th Street, thence south on 12th Street to Ventura Avenue, thence east on Ventura Avenue to Woodrow, north on Woodrow to Huntington Boulevard, west on Huntington Boulevard to 12th Street and return.

Starting at Fresno and Fulton streets, thence northwesterly to Tuolumne, thence northeasterly to Van Ness, thence south-easterly to Merced, thence southwesterly to Fulton Street.

3. BLACKSTONE: Starting at Fresno and Fulton Streets, thence north on Fulton to Stanislaus, northeast on Stanislaus to Blackstone, north on Blackstone to Hedges, thence west on Hedges to San Pablo, north on San Pablo to University, west on University to Del Mar, south on Del Mar to McKinley, east on McKinley to San Pablo and return.
4. MC KENZIE: Starting at Fresno and Fulton streets, thence south on Fulton to Tulare Street, northeast and east on Tulare Street to First Street, north on First Street to McKenzie, thence east on McKenzie to 12th Street, south on 12th Street to Illinois, thence east on Illinois to Sierra, thence north on Sierra to Grant, west on Grant to 12th Street, south on 12th Street to McKenzie.
5. OLIVE AVENUE: Commencing at the Intersection of Fresno and Fulton streets, northwest to Stanislaus, thence northeast on Stanislaus to Blackstone, north on Blackstone to Belmont, west on Belmont to Harrison, north on Harrison to McKinley, west on McKinley to Adoline, south on Adoline to Olive, and east on Olive to Harrison.

APPENDIX "A" (Continued)

6. HARVEY AVENUE: Starting at Fresno and Fulton streets, thence east on Fresno Street to Fresno Avenue, north on Fresno Avenue to Belmont, east on Belmont to Millbrook, north on Millbrook to Tyler, west on Tyler to First, south on First to Harvey.
7. HAZELWOOD: Starting at Fresno and Fulton streets, thence south on Fulton Street to Los Angeles Street, thence northwesterly on Los Angeles to Van Ness, thence southwesterly on Van Ness to Hamilton, east on Hamilton to 3rd Street, thence north on 3rd Street to Butler, east on Butler to 10th Street, north on 10th Street to Lowe, east on Lowe to 3rd Street, and south on 3rd Street to Butler.
8. EAST FRESNO: Starting at Fresno and Fulton streets, thence east on Fresno Street to Fresno Avenue, north on Fresno Avenue to Hedges, thence west on Hedges to Thesta, south on Thesta to Hammond, and east on Hammond to Fresno Street.
9. WEST FRESNO: Starting at the intersection of Fresno and Fulton streets, thence southwesterly on Fresno Street to Irwin, thence southeast on Irwin to Tulare, northeast on Tulare to Jones, and northwest on Jones to Fresno.
10. "D" STREET: Commencing at the intersection of Fresno and Fulton streets, southwesterly on Fresno Street to "D" Street, northwest on "D" Street to Dunn Avenue, west on Dunn Avenue to Modoc Street, south on Modoc Street to Whites Bridge Avenue, east on Whites Bridge to "B" Street, thence southeast on "B" Street to Fresno.
11. "C" STREET: Starting at the intersection of Fulton and Fresno streets, thence southwest on Fresno to "C" Street, southeast on "C" Street to California, east on California to Kirk, south on Kirk to Belgravia, west on Belgravia to Holly, and north on Holly to California.

OCCASIONAL SERVICE

1. Between the intersection of McKinley and San Pablo avenues and the intersection of Wishon and Weldon avenues via McKinley, Blackstone and Weldon avenues.
2. Between the intersection of Weldon Avenue and Van Ness Boulevard, and the intersection of McKinley and Wishon avenues via Echo and McKinley avenues.
3. Between the intersection of Olive Avenue and Adoline Avenue and the intersection of North Fulton Street and Belmont Avenue, via Olive Avenue, West Avenue and Belmont Avenue, and thence to the Crematory.

APPENDIX "A"

(Concluded)

4. On Hammond Avenue between Thesta Avenue and Blackstone Avenue.
5. On Olive Avenue between Blackstone Avenue and Harrison Avenue.
6. On Blackstone Avenue between Hedges Avenue and McKinley Avenue.

OPERATING ROUTES

<u>No.</u>	<u>Name</u>
1-a.	Wishon-Wilson
1-b.	Wishon-College
2.	Blackstone-Sierra Vista
3.	Recreation Park
4.	Olive*-Harvey
5.	Hazelwood-"C" Street
6-a.	East Fresno-"D" Street
6-b.	East Fresno-West Fresno

* Includes Roeding Park Sunday Only.

APPENDIX "B"

HEADWAYS
FRESNO CITY LINES, INC.
(Approximate Times)

<u>WEEKDAYS</u>						<u>SUNDAYS</u>
1-a. <u>Wishon-Wilson</u>						
1-b. <u>Wishon-College</u>						
6:10AM	7:30AM	9:00AM	3:30PM	4:47PM	6:07PM	7:50AM
to	to	to	to	to	to	to
<u>7:30AM</u>	<u>9:00AM</u>	<u>3:30PM</u>	<u>4:47PM</u>	<u>6:07PM</u>	<u>12:07AM</u>	<u>12:07AM</u>
20	7½	15	7½	5	20	20
40	15	30	15	10	40	40
2. <u>Blackstone-Sierra Vista</u>						
6:02AM	7:00AM	9:00AM	3:00PM	5:00PM	5:30PM	6:20PM
to	to	to	to	to	to	to
<u>7:00AM</u>	<u>9:00AM</u>	<u>3:00PM</u>	<u>5:00PM</u>	<u>5:30PM</u>	<u>6:20PM</u>	<u>12:10AM</u>
30	20	30	20	10	20	30
3. <u>Recreation Park</u>						
6:20AM	7:00AM	9:00AM	3:00PM	6:15PM		7:30AM
to	to	to	to	to		to
<u>7:00AM</u>	<u>9:00AM</u>	<u>3:00PM</u>	<u>6:15PM</u>	<u>12:06AM</u>		<u>12:06AM</u>
30	15	20	15	30		20/30
4. <u>Olive-Harvey</u>						
6:10AM	7:20AM	9:00AM	3:00PM	6:20PM		8:15AM
to	to	to	to	to		to
<u>7:20AM</u>	<u>9:00AM</u>	<u>3:00PM</u>	<u>6:20PM</u>	<u>12:02AM</u>		<u>12:15AM</u>
30	20	30	20	30		30
5. <u>Hazelwood-"C" Street</u>						
6:20AM	6:40PM					7:40AM
to	to					to
<u>6:40PM</u>	<u>12:12AM</u>					<u>12:12AM</u>
30	40					40
6. <u>East Fresno-"D" Street-West Fresno</u>						
6:30AM	7:00AM	9:00AM	3:00PM	6:00PM		7:45AM
to	to	to	to	to		to
<u>7:00AM</u>	<u>9:00AM</u>	<u>3:00PM</u>	<u>6:00PM</u>	<u>12:08AM</u>		<u>12:08AM</u>
30	20	30	20	30		30