

Decision No. 35896

BEFORE THE RAILROAD COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Application of KEY SYSTEM,
a corporation, for a certificate of public con-) Application
venience and necessity to establish a route for) No. 20582
motor coach service in the Counties of Alameda) (14th Supplemental)
and Contra Costa, State of California.)

DONAHUE, RICHARDS AND HAMLIN, By Frank S. Richards,
for Key System

GIRARD W. RICHARDSON, City Attorney, for City of Piedmont

C. R. BOSSO, Associate Bridge Engineer for San Francisco-
Oakland Bay Bridge

DELGER TROWERIDGE, in propria persona, and for certain other
passengers on "S" Piedmont motor coach line

THOMAS A. STRONG, in propria persona

BY THE COMMISSION:

O P I N I O N

In this proceeding Key System seeks authority to (a) abandon its "S" Piedmont transbay motor coach line in its entirety, and (b) to discontinue its "V" Montclair line as a through service to San Francisco, operating it exclusively as a local shuttle feeder service connecting with the "C" Piedmont transbay rail line at 41st Street and Piedmont Avenue. (1)

Public hearings were held in this matter before Examiner Hunter in San Francisco on September 18, 29, and 30, 1942. On the latter date the matter was taken under submission and it is now ready for decision.

(1) Hereinafter these lines will be referred to as the "S," "V," and "C" lines respectively.

Service on the "S" line⁽²⁾ is restricted to the area between the intersection of Highland and Moraga Avenues and the end of the line, as no passengers are picked up or discharged between Moraga and Highland Avenues and the San Francisco Terminal. All service on the line is conducted between Piedmont and San Francisco via the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge.

Under the proposed revised plan of operation this motor coach service will be discontinued, and substitute service to the Piedmont area will be provided by the No. 10 local street car line with a connection to the "C" line at 41st Street and Piedmont Avenue.

In support of the granting of this application applicant introduced testimony to show that the traffic carried on this line was comparatively light, averaging approximately 0.9 passengers per mile. It is applicant's position that the area served by this motor coach line is afforded a substitute service through the operation of its No. 10 local street car line connecting with its "C" line, admitting, however, that the proposed substitute service is not as convenient to the passengers as that now offered.

(2) Service on the "S" line is now provided on the following basis:

Daily except Sundays and holidays, coaches leave LaSalle and Crocker Avenues, westbound, at 7:25 a.m. and every 20 minutes to 8:45 a.m., then 9:45 a.m. and hourly thereafter until 11:45 p.m. Eastbound, coaches leave San Francisco at 7:25*, 7:57*, 8:09, 9:12 a.m., and hourly thereafter until 4:12 p.m., then at 5:00*, 5:15, 5:35*, 6:10, and 7:12 p.m., then hourly until 12:12 a.m. On Saturdays an extra schedule leaves San Francisco at 12:32 p.m.

* Means coach operates Monday through Friday.

On Sundays and holidays coaches leave LaSalle Avenue Westbound at 7:45 a.m., and hourly thereafter until 11:45 p.m. Eastbound, coaches leave San Francisco at 8:12 a.m. and hourly thereafter until 12:12 midnight.

Applicant's witnesses stated that the proposed change is in conformity with the Directive of the Office of Defense Transportation, dated April 17, 1942, particularly those portions which require:

- (a) All carriers to make full use of all street car lines. (3)
- (b) Diversion of traffic to street railway routes. (4)

It was pointed out that the fares are less for the proposed service than for the motor coach service sought to be abandoned, i.e., on the motor coach line the one way fare is 30 cents and the commute fare \$7.75 per month, whereas for the substitute rail service these fares will be 21 cents and \$6.50 respectively.

Applicant also showed that the proposed change would permit a saving of 216,000 motor coach miles per year and would release three motor coaches for other operation on the system.

The City of Piedmont, through its City Attorney, and certain residents in the district affected appeared in opposition to the granting of this application, contending that the proposed substitute street car service would not adequately serve the district; that the service was inferior; and furthermore, that if the carrier's plan is put into effect it will entail longer waits at the transfer point due to the fact that the No. 10 street car line traverses a long route and the service is frequently not in conformity with the schedule of operation.

(3) "Full Use of all street railway lines

Transit companies and regulatory authorities should take immediate steps to obtain the fullest possible use of all operable rail lines and equipment. This will require discontinuance of bus and trolley coach services which are being provided over routes where street railway lines are or can be made operable as well as on street railway routes now being served part of the time by buses or trolley coaches."

(4) "Diversion of Traffic to street railway routes

Wherever it is practicable to alter schedules and routes so as to divert passengers from present bus lines to street railway routes, such alteration of schedules and routes should be made."

With respect to the reasonableness of the proposed service for the district, the record shows that the greater portion of the developed area served by the "S" line is within 2,000 feet of the No. 10 street car line. There are, however, many patrons whose residences are much closer to the motor coach line than the rail line, due to the fact that the motor coach line extends approximately 1,500 feet beyond the end of the rail line.

With respect to providing a closer connection between the local and interurban rail lines, applicant agreed to operate a shuttle service between the connecting point at 41st Street and Piedmont Avenue and the end of the line at Hampton Road and Crocker Avenue during the morning and evening peaks, and to endeavor to coordinate the regular schedules on the No. 10 line with those of the "C" line.

Applicant also proposes herein to discontinue the operation of its "V" line⁽⁵⁾ and to substitute therefor a shuttle motor coach service to operate between the Montclair area and a connection with the "C" line at 41st Street and Piedmont Avenue. Service on the "V" line is restricted to the area between the intersection of Broadway and Broadway Terrace and the end of the line at Moraga and LaSalle Avenues, as no passengers are picked up or discharged in either direction between the intersection of Broadway and Broadway Terrace and the terminal in San Francisco.⁽⁶⁾

(5) The "V" line operates between Moraga and LaSalle Avenues, in the Montclair section of Oakland, and San Francisco.

(6) Service on the "V" line is now provided on the following basis:

Daily, except Sundays and holidays, coaches leave LaSalle and Moraga Avenues, westbound, at 6:03 a.m., 7:03, 7:33, 8:03, 8:33, 9:33, and then hourly until 11:33 p.m. Eastbound, coaches leave San Francisco at 6:45, 7:23, 7:59, 8:52, 9:52 a.m., and hourly thereafter until 4:52 p.m., then 5:06*, 5:12*, 5:23*, 5:30**, 5:38*, 5:52**, 5:58* and 6:52 p.m., and hourly thereafter until 11:52 p.m.

* Coach operates Monday through Friday.

** Coach operates Saturday only. There is an added eastbound schedule on Saturday leaving San Francisco at 12:22 p.m.

Sundays and holidays coaches leave LaSalle and Moraga Avenues, westbound, at 7:33 a.m. and hourly thereafter until 11:33 p.m. Eastbound, coaches leave San Francisco at 7:52 a.m., and hourly thereafter until 11:52 p.m.

Applicant shows that its revised plan of operation will permit a saving of 132,000 motor coach miles per year and release three motor coaches for other service during times of peak traffic in the morning and evening; also that passengers will pay a fare of 21 cents one way between San Francisco and the Montclair area and \$6.50 per month for commute tickets, in lieu of the present fare of 30 cents and \$7.75 respectively. It is applicant's contention that this proposed change is in conformity with the Directive of the Office of Defense Transportation, particularly those portions which require:

- (a) All carriers to make full use of all street car lines. (3)
- (b) Diversion of traffic to street railway routes. (4)
- (c) Turn back service. (7)

No opposition developed to the granting of this application.

Upon full consideration of this record the Commission finds that this application should be granted with the definite understanding that following the present National Emergency it will again review the situation to determine whether or not motor coach service should be restored or some change made in the service to the areas affected. In reaching this conclusion we are mindful of the fact that the proposed service is somewhat inferior to that now offered, but the public must accept an inferior service (in this instance at a lower fare), where a better service cannot be justified in the light of the congested condition of mass transportation agencies.

(7) "Turn Back Service

On transit routes to outlying districts much capacity is wasted by sending too many vehicles to the outer ends of such routes. This waste should be eliminated by turning back some vehicles at intermediate points, or by operating shuttle vehicles over the outer portions of such routes at less frequent intervals. In other cases, waste should be eliminated by operating shuttle services over branch lines which are presently through operated."

In view of the fact that the support for the granting of this application is based almost entirely upon war conditions, it appears appropriate to authorize applicant to suspend operations on the routes as applied for, until further order of this Commission.

O R D E R

Public hearings having been held in the above entitled matter, the Commission being apprised of the facts, and the matter being under submission and ready for decision;

IT IS ORDERED that Key System be, and it is hereby granted authority to suspend operation on its "S" Piedmont bridge motor coach line in its entirety, and to cancel all schedules applicable to this line.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Key System be, and it is hereby granted authority to suspend operation on its "V" Montclair motor coach line as a through service to San Francisco, and to operate it as a shuttle service, from the present terminus of the line at LaSalle and Moraga Avenues to 41st Street and Piedmont Avenue in the City of Oakland.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Key System be, and it is hereby authorized to revise its Passenger Tariff No. 125 (C.R.C. No. 130) in such manner as to eliminate therefrom any and all reference to the "S" Piedmont motor coach line and the "V" Montclair motor coach line.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that if applicant elects to inaugurate the proposed service on any day other than the first day of the calendar month, holders of bridge motor coach monthly commutation books, purchased at \$7.75, may exchange said books for the regular railway and motor coach lines monthly commutation books purchasable at \$6.50, and said patron or patrons shall receive cash rebate based on the difference in cost of the two books and the proportionate part of the books remaining at the time of said exchange, but on or after the inauguration of the proposed service.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that said service shall commence within a period not to exceed thirty (30) days from the effective date of this order and upon not less than ten (10) days' notice to the Commission and the public, the latter being in the form of cards placed conspicuously in all motor coaches involved.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that jurisdiction herein shall be and it is hereby reserved by the Commission to make such further order or orders in this proceeding as the Commission in its discretion may deem just and proper.

The effective date of this order shall be the date hereof.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 27th day of

October, 1942.

H. J. Baker
Francis D. Haveman
Richard S. Baker
Commissioners