

**ORIGINAL**

Decision No. 57419

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Application of )	
KEY SYSTEM TRANSIT LINES, a corporation, )	
for authority to abandon operation of )	Application No. 32870
its No. 47 Cutting Boulevard-San Rafael )	
Ferry Passenger Stage Line in the City )	
of Richmond, State of California. )	

Donahue, Richards, Rowell and Gallagher, by George E. Thomas, for applicant.  
 T. M. Carlson, City Attorney for the City of Richmond, by Frederick Bold, Jr., and Wayne E. Thompson, City Manager, by C. A. Pitchford, Assistant City Manager, for the City of Richmond; Lieutenant V. B. Peeler, for the U. S. Naval Supply Depot, protestants.

O P I N I O N

In this proceeding Key System Transit Lines requests authority to discontinue operation of its No. 47 Cutting Boulevard-San Rafael Ferry motor coach line in the City of Richmond. Public hearing was had thereon before Examiner Paul, at which evidence was adduced and the matter submitted.

The principal operation of the No. 47 motor coach line is from the intersection of MacDonald Avenue and 10th Street, Richmond; thence over 10th Street, Cutting Boulevard, Oil Street, Standard Avenue, Scofield Avenue, Western Drive and San Rafael Road, terminating at the Richmond-San Rafael Ferry at Castro Point, a distance of 4.2 miles. Service over this line is conducted Monday through Friday on a basis of 15 round-trip schedules between 5:24 a.m. and approximately 6 p.m. On Saturdays 11 round trips are conducted between 9:40 a.m. and approximately 6 p.m. No Sunday service is provided. Another leg of this line extends from 10th Street and MacDonald Avenue, Richmond, thence over 10th

Street, Ohio Street, 14th Street and Hall Avenue, a distance of 2.1 miles, terminating at the plant of Ford Motor Company. The only service operated over this route is a schedule which leaves 10th Street and MacDonald Avenue at 7:22 a.m. and another schedule which leaves the Ford plant at 4:10 p.m. on weekdays only. Still another leg of operation of the No. 47 motor coach line branches off the main route of operation on Western Drive approximately five-tenths of a mile southeasterly of Castro Point and proceeds 1.9 miles to Point Molate, a U. S. Naval Supply Depot. Only two daily schedules, Monday through Friday, serve Point Molate, one leaving 10th Street and MacDonald Avenue at 7:20 a.m. and the other at 4:18 p.m., in order to provide an on-shift and an off-shift service to and from Point Molate.

From the intersection of 10th Street and MacDonald Avenue to the intersection of 10th Street and Cutting Boulevard, a distance of eight-tenths of a mile, and between the latter intersection and the intersection of Cutting Boulevard and Central Drive, a distance of one mile, which are portions of the No. 47 bus line route, service is also provided by applicant's No. 78 Panhandle Boulevard-13th Street and No. 72-C Cutting Boulevard lines, respectively. The No. 92 Richmond housing line also operates over the latter portion of the route just described. From the intersection of Carrard Boulevard and Standard Avenue to the intersection of Scofield Avenue and Standard Avenue, a distance of one mile, being another part of the No. 47 motor coach line, applicant also operates its No. 72-M Oakland-Richmond motor coach line. The total length of the route of the No. 47 motor coach line over which other lines are operated as just described is 2.8 miles, or approximately two-thirds of the entire length of the No. 47 motor coach line regular

service route between 10th Street and MacDonald Avenue and Castro Point, the location of the ferry terminal. The only portion of the route of the regular line of the No. 47 motor coach line between 10th Street and MacDonald Avenue and Castro Point which is not used by applicant for operation of other lines is a distance of five blocks (approximately 1,500 feet) between the intersection of Central Avenue and Cutting Boulevard and the intersection of Oil Street and Garrard Boulevard, as well as between the intersection of Standard and Scofield Avenues and Castro Point, a distance of about one and one-tenth miles.

Applicant asserts that due to a drop in patronage of its No. 93 San Rafael Ferry line prior to November 15, 1948, it combined that line with its No. 47 Richmond Shipyard line, which was thereafter conducted as the No. 47 Cutting Boulevard-San Rafael Ferry line and operated over the present route. This consolidation, it is stated, was made in an effort to justify continuation of service to the ferry terminal.

Applicant's traffic manager testified that an on and off check of the use made of the No. 47 line shows that on a selected typical date a total of 67 passengers westbound and a total of 76 passengers eastbound patronized the 15 round-trip schedules operated on that date between 10th Street and MacDonald Avenue and the ferry at Castro Point. These schedules included the two schedules serving Point Molate on which four passengers were transported westbound and four passengers eastbound. The witness stated that 22 of the 67 westbound passengers and 17 of the 76 eastbound passengers utilized that portion of the No. 47 motor coach line in the area between Castro Point and Point Molate, on the one hand, and the intersection of Scofield and Standard Avenues,

on the other hand. It was stated that 54 passengers boarded the eastbound bus on the line in the area between the intersection of Castro Street and Standard Avenue and the intersection of 10th Street and Cutting Boulevard, 43 of which boarded the schedule leaving the ferry at 7:52 a.m. The witness stated these 43 passengers were school children, most of whom were destined to the Bissel School, near 10th Street and MacDonald Avenue, and the remainder were destined to other schools in Richmond. According to the witness, these school children would have ample transportation facilities on paralleling lines of applicant. The witness further stated that there are also two special school coaches that provide service between the intersection of Standard Avenue and Castro Street and certain of the Richmond public schools.

Applicant's witness further testified that the gross revenue from the No. 47 motor coach line for the years 1949, 1950 and 1951 amounted to \$4,762.03, \$4,470.17 and \$4,228 for those years, respectively, as compared with \$6,6767.06 wages paid to the drivers on that line for the year 1951 (Exhibit 3). The witness further testified that the net loss from the operation of the No. 47 line for the calendar year 1951, based upon direct costs, amounted to \$9,911. In establishing the direct costs, which were determined on a mileage basis, consideration was given to the following items and the corresponding cost per mile:

Maintenance of equipment	\$0.0528
Fuel, lubricants and transportation supervision	.0379
Insurance and claims expense	.0309
Taxes	.0304
Total	<u>\$0.1520</u>

Based upon those direct charges, the cost of operation of the No. 47 line during 1951 covering 40,796 miles at \$0.152 per mile, amounted to \$6,200.99. Adding drivers' wages of \$6,767.06 and

\$1,171 depreciation of the equipment used, results in a total cost of \$14,139.05 for the year 1951, which equals 34.66 cents direct cost per bus mile.

Applicant's traffic manager stated that service to and from the Ford plant was over a route 2.1 miles long, all of which is paralleled by other service except the portion between Cutting Boulevard and the Ford plant, a distance of approximately 4,000 feet. The witness stated that on the day of the traffic study, above referred to, 12 passengers used the morning schedule to the plant and seven passengers used it on the evening return trip.

An assistant transportation engineer of the Commission's staff made a study of the on and off traffic of the service provided by the No. 47 motor coach line except that portion serving the Ford plant. This study was made on two days in November, 1951, the results of which compared quite closely with the on and off study made by the applicant in January, 1952. Where the study made by applicant (Exhibit No. 2) showed inbound and outbound traffic on one day amounting to 76 passengers and 67 passengers, respectively, the study made by the Commission witness showed comparable figures of 77 passengers inbound and 88 outbound (Exhibit No. 5). The latter exhibit showed only one trip on which all of the seats of the bus were occupied. This was the schedule leaving Castro Point at 7:52 a.m. on which 42 school children were transported. The origin points of these school children were as follows: five at Point Molate, 17 at the intersection of Castro Street and Standard Avenue, one at Standard Avenue and Garrard Boulevard, nine at Washington Street and 10 at Central Drive. On the outbound trip only five of these school children were recorded as using the service, which was a schedule leaving 10th Street and MacDonald

Avenue at 3:40 p.m. Other lines of applicant are available to all of these students except those originating at or destined to Point Molate. Use of some of the other lines will require some of the students to walk an additional block.

Cross-examination of the applicant's witness showed that all of applicant's lines providing local service in Richmond converge at 10th Street and MacDonald Avenue. This arrangement provides for convenient transfer by passengers. In reply to suggestions by representatives of the City of Richmond that applicant extend one of its No. 72 lines from the intersection of Standard Avenue and Castro Street to Castro Point, the witness stated that to provide such service would require an additional unit of equipment and a driver. According to the witness the layover time of the No. 72 lines at Castro Street and Standard Avenue varies from 4 to 12 minutes. The present schedule of the No. 47 line between the intersection of Standard Avenue and Castro Avenue and the ferry at Castro Point requires about eight minutes for the one-way trip and a minimum of 16 or 17 minutes for the round trip with practically no layover time at the terminal. The various No. 72 lines now operate at 15, 20 or 30 minute intervals, which are some of the more desirable frequencies. The witness pointed out that an extension of one of the No. 72 lines would change the frequency of the operation of that line to time other than equal components of an hour. Thereby traffic on the line would be adversely affected. On cross-examination applicant's witness stated that approximately three years ago the No. 93 motor coach line was combined with its then No. 47 motor coach line in an attempt to retain the traffic and minimize the loss from its operation.

A representative of the Point Molate Naval Supply Depot voiced objection to the proposal of applicant and expressed the opinion that if service to and from Point Molate were improved and schedules added, more use of the service would be made by the 265 civilians employed at the depot. About 85 per cent of them work on the so-called day shift between the hours of 8 a.m. and 4:30 p.m. The remainder are distributed among three other shifts between 7 a.m. and 3 p.m., between 3 p.m. and 11 p.m., and between 11 p.m. and 7 a.m. Most of these employees, he asserted, provide their own transportation by private cars or on a car pool basis.

Two schedules serve the supply depot. They arrive there at 7:45 a.m. and 4:36 p.m. and are arranged particularly to serve the day shift (8 a.m. - 4:30 p.m.) on which approximately 225 civilians are employed. No explanation was offered as to the meager use made of the service furnished other than the statement that some of the transfer connections are inconvenient for some<sup>(1)</sup> of these employees.

The traffic analysis made by applicant reveals that on Mondays through Fridays the operation extends over a period of approximately 12 hours during which 30 one-way trips are operated on the main route of the No. 47 line and the branch serving Point Molate. On the check date 67 passengers westbound and 76 passengers eastbound were transported. The average was 4.7 passengers for each one-way trip. On one of the eastbound trips 46 passengers were transported, of which 43 were students. The number of passengers on the remaining 14 eastbound trips varied from none to seven, the

---

(1) Applicant's witness stated that, on the average, three passengers used the service to and from Point Molate.

average on these 14 trips being 2.1 passengers. Five of the eastbound trips transported no passengers. The 15 westbound trips transported a total of 67 passengers, the number on each trip varying from none to 14, or an average of 4.4 passengers per trip.

The analysis of the traffic on 11 round trips on a Saturday disclosed a total of 34 passengers transported on the eastbound trips, an average of 3.09, and 38 passengers on the westbound trips, an average of 3.45. The number of passengers transported per trip, eastbound and westbound, varied from one to six or an average of 3.27. Point Molate is not served on Saturdays.

The record also shows that applicant's traffic analysis disclosed that eight passengers inbound and twelve passengers outbound use applicant's service in the area between Point Castro and the intersection of Scofield Drive and Standard Avenue; of these passengers three were employees of Richmond-San Rafael Ferry line. Four passengers were transported to and four passengers from Point Molate.

The Commission finds from the evidence in this proceeding that public convenience and necessity no longer require operation of applicant's No. 47 Cutting Boulevard-San Rafael Ferry motor coach line. Therefore, applicant will be authorized to discontinue that service.

O R D E R

An application therefor having been filed, a public hearing had thereon, evidence adduced and based upon the findings set forth in the foregoing opinion,

IT IS ORDERED:

(1) That Key System Transit Lines is hereby authorized



to discontinue passenger stage service over its No. 47 Cutting Boulevard-San Rafael Ferry motor coach line in Richmond, and the operative rights therefor as created by Decisions Nos. 27183, 28838, 33784, 34622, 35104, 35578, 36301, 36377, 36837, 37065 and 37170, are hereby revoked and annulled.

(2) That at least on 15 consecutive days next prior to the discontinuance of the service as authorized in paragraph (1) of this order, applicant shall post a notice of such discontinuance in all of the equipment used on said line and at any and all terminals established in the City of Richmond.

The effective date of this order shall be twenty (20) days after the date hereof.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 30th day of June, 1952.

[Signature]  
President  
Harold P. Kula  
Bennett Patten  
Robert E. [Signature]  
Commissioners

Commissioner Justus F. Graemer, being necessarily absent, did not participate in the disposition of this proceeding.