

ORIGINAL

Decision No. 48255

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Application of)
PACIFIC ELECTRIC RAILWAY COMPANY, a)
corporation, for authority to dis-)
continue Sunday and Holiday service)
on its Los Angeles-Hellman Avenue)
Line.)

Application No. 33832

E. D. Yeomans, for applicant. Louise Klinger for South San Gabriel Chamber of Commerce, Harry C. Williams for City of Monterey Park and City of Alhambra, Milda LaBerge for Citizens' Committee of South San Gabriel, Elmer M. Enstrom, Jr., for Mission Park Property Owners' Association, Lloyd K. Fager for South San Gabriel Chamber of Commerce and Citizens' Committee, Urban Wayne Troxel and James E. Howe for Brotherhood of Railroad Trainmen, L. H. Ball for Monterey Park Chamber of Commerce, Marie K. Robinett, Ellsworth R. Talmon, Geo. Kohl, Jr., Dorothy M. Dahl, Mrs. Bruno Walter, O. C. Dexter, Molly Hays, Homer Miller, Mrs. Vera L. Miller, and Walter E. Bedke, protestants. Mrs. Frances Mallory, interested party.

O P I N I O N

Applicant operates its Los Angeles-Hellman Avenue Line, (1)
Route No. 69, pursuant to authority from this Commission.
Service is rendered daily including Sundays and holidays. It
seeks authority to discontinue the Sunday and holiday service.

(1) Decision No. 44161, dated May 9, 1950, on Application No. 30095; Decision No. 46471, dated November 27, 1951, on Application No. 32443, Appendix A, pages 14 and 15, Route No. 69; Decision No. 48071, dated December 16, 1952, on Application No. 33834.

A public hearing was held in Monterey Park on November 27, 1952, before Examiner Rogers, evidence was presented and the matter was submitted subject to the filing of concurrent briefs by the applicant and the Mission Park Property Owners' Association of Rosemead, protestant. These briefs have been filed and considered and the matter is ready for decision. Prior to the hearing, notice thereof was published and posted as required by the Commission.

The Hellman Avenue Line was authorized in May, 1950, to replace an existing rail line. Operations were commenced on October 1, 1950. At the outset, 13 round trips per Sunday or holiday were made. Commencing with May 26, 1952, ten round trips are made on each Sunday and holiday. ⁽²⁾ The first westbound schedule leaves the eastern terminus at 9:42 a.m., and the first eastbound schedule leaves Los Angeles at 10:40 a.m. The headway is one hour and 20 minutes. The area has developed since 1950, but the number of passengers per trip on Sundays and holidays has remained approximately constant, 12.02 passengers each direction per trip having been carried when 13 round trips were made in the first five months of 1952, and 11.8 passengers each direction per trip since that time. Applicant has incurred a loss each month the Hellman Avenue Line has been operated, with the exception of August, 1952. The loss for the year 1951 was \$29,347, and for the first nine months of 1952 was \$31,253. ⁽³⁾ The

(2) Exhibit A on the application.
(3) Exhibit No. 3.

annual out-of-pocket loss from the Sunday and holiday service only is estimated at \$1,607.⁽⁴⁾

Applicant checked the passengers using the Hellman Avenue Line on Sunday, July 27, 1952. One hundred fifteen passengers used the line eastbound and 85 passengers used the line westbound. All but 21 of these 200 passengers either boarded or alighted at Los Angeles.⁽⁵⁾

The Garvey Avenue Line and the Valley Boulevard Line parallel the Hellman Avenue Line. Neither of these lines is more than .67 of a mile from Hellman Avenue at any point (except in the Los Angeles pickup and discharge area). The Garvey Boulevard Line is one-half mile from Hellman Avenue at all points between Atlantic Boulevard and the east end of the Hellman Avenue Line. This distance is deceptive, however, as many north-south streets are not accessible from Hellman Avenue.⁽⁶⁾ Twenty-six schedules are operated on the Valley Boulevard Line on Sundays and holidays with a 40-minute headway,⁽⁷⁾ and 29 schedules are operated on Sundays and holidays on the Garvey Avenue Line with a 30-minute headway.⁽⁸⁾

Ramona Freeway is in the course of construction. This highway is approximately 700 feet north of and parallel to Hellman Avenue. When this road is constructed it will increase the distance which some passengers originating at or destined to points north of the freeway will be required to walk to use the Hellman Avenue Line as the number of passenger crossovers will be limited.

-
- (4) Exhibit No. 7.
 - (5) Exhibits 5 and 6.
 - (6) Exhibit No. 8.
 - (7) Exhibit C on the application.
 - (8) Exhibit D on the application.

In general, the protestants desired that the Sunday and holiday services on the Hellman Avenue Line be continued. The opinion was voiced that if the schedules were rearranged to allow the local patrons to attend church services, the use would increase. The evidence showed that homes had been purchased in reliance upon the continuance of adequate transportation via the Hellman Avenue Line. Representatives of several chambers of commerce and property owners' associations also protested the discontinuance of service.

Ordinarily, it is improper for a utility to continue the operation of a service which cannot reasonably be justified from a transportation standpoint. The applicant, however, serves an area via the Hellman Avenue Line which is not readily accessible from other parallel lines due to lack of through streets and the construction of Ramona Freeway which has few pedestrian crossovers. A substantial number of passengers use this line on Sundays and holidays. The loss incurred by the applicant through the performance of Sunday and holiday service is small compared with the annual over-all loss alleged to be incurred from the performance of this service and, also, is small when compared to the disadvantage to a substantial number of patrons if Sunday and holiday service is discontinued. In addition, it is within the Commission's knowledge that applicant's over-all passenger operations are performed at a loss and the annual loss claimed to result from the Sunday and holiday service on the Hellman Avenue Line is minute compared to applicant's over-all picture. Furthermore, applicant has pending before this Commission a request for authority to increase all

interurban fares and if favorable consideration is given to this proposal by the Commission the entire picture of the Hellman Avenue operations could be changed. In view of the foregoing circumstances the application will be denied.

O R D E R

A public hearing having been held, briefs having been filed, and the matter now being ready for decision,

IT IS ORDERED that the application of Pacific Electric Railway Company for authority to discontinue Sunday and holiday service on its Los Angeles-Hellman Avenue Line, Route No. 69, be, and the same hereby is, denied.

The effective date of this order shall be twenty days after the date hereof.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 10th day of February, 1953.

[Signature]
 President

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]
 Commissioners