

ORIGINAL

Decision No. 50865

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Application of SAN DIEGO TRANSIT SYSTEM, )  
 a corporation, for certificate of public )  
 convenience and necessity to discontinue )  
 and abandon service on the two Route "R" )  
 shuttles. (1) From the intersection of )  
 Midway Drive and West Point Loma Boulevard ) Application No. 35295  
 west along West Point Loma Boulevard to )  
 Cable Street and (2) From the intersection )  
 of Mission Boulevard and Ventura Boulevard )  
 south along Mission Boulevard to Anacapa )  
 Court. )

Lindloy, Lazar and Scalos by Leon W. Scalos  
 for applicant.

Aaron W. Rouse for City of San Diego, and  
David H. R. Pain for Ocean Beach Chamber  
 of Commerce and residents of Mission  
 Beach and Ocean Beach, protestants.

O P I N I O N

San Diego Transit System by this application seeks authority to abandon its passenger stage service (1) along Mission Boulevard between Ventura Place and Anacapa Court, and (2) along West Point Loma Boulevard between Midway Drive and Cable Street.

A public hearing was held in San Diego, California, before Examiner Mark V. Chiesa. Oral and documentary evidence having been adduced, the matter was submitted for decision.

The applicant's position was presented by the testimony of its general manager and the vice president and controller, supported by various exhibits. The attorneys for protestants called many witnesses, residents of the Mission Boulevard and West Point Loma Boulevard areas, who testified in opposition to the company's proposal. Petitions against the discontinuance of said services were also presented for the Commission's consideration.

The record shows that the Mission Boulevard service is operated as a shuttle along that portion of Mission Boulevard between the intersection of Ventura Place and Mission Boulevard and the intersection of Anacapa Court and Mission Boulevard, a distance of approximately .9 miles. On weekdays thirty-seven round trips are operated between 5:43 a.m. and 6:38 p.m. On Saturdays there are twenty-three schedules and on Sundays no service is provided. Daily base and Saturday schedules are on a thirty-minute headway, and daily peak-time service is approximately every fifteen minutes. Applicant uses one bus and employs two drivers for this operation. The average weekday number of inbound and outbound riders for the period December 17 to 23, 1953 (five weekdays) was 112 and 106 respectively, or 2.9 passengers per trip inbound and 2.8 passengers per trip outbound. For a four-day period, April 13 to 16, 1954, the daily average was 104 passengers inbound and 90 passengers outbound, or an average per trip of 2.8 and 2.4 passengers respectively. It was testified that 14.5 passengers for each round trip are necessary to meet operating expenses on this shuttle line. Revenue per bus mile is approximately 25 cents, and system costs per bus mile are approximately 51 cents.<sup>(1)</sup>

The record also shows that in addition to the adult passengers there are about 92 one-way or 46 round-trip student rides sold on school days, or approximately 1.23 additional riders per one-way trip for the thirty-seven schedules. Applicant's general manager testified that a school bus service would be provided along this route if the present service is discontinued. No school service

---

(1) For bus mile cost of operation of the Mission Boulevard Shuttle was given as 98 cents. The high cost was attributed to the character of the run as round trips require only six minutes compared with much longer layover periods.

is contemplated or proposed for the West Point Loma Boulevard route as there are only fourteen one-way student riders daily on said line.

Many workers and school children use the Mission Boulevard Shuttle service in the morning between approximately 6 a.m. and 8:30 a.m., and in the afternoon between approximately 3 p.m. and 6 p.m. The Commission is of the opinion that continuation of a weekday service during said periods is justified and in the public interest. Approximately twelve trips per day could be eliminated by curtailing service to peak periods and would result in a material reduction in the operating costs of said shuttle line.

The evidence concerning the West Point Loma Boulevard Shuttle service shows that thirty-five round trips are operated along West Point Loma Boulevard between Midway Drive where connections are made with buses of the "R" and "T" routes, and Cable Street where the "O" route bus operates. The total one-way distance is approximately 1.7 miles. Average number of passengers carried each round trip is seven, or 3.5 passengers per trip. For the year 1953 this line showed a loss of \$25,477 on revenue of \$3,690, and expenses of \$29,167 (Exhibit No. 14). (2)

During the week of March 8 to 14, 1954, inclusive, this shuttle line produced the following revenues:

<u>Date</u>	<u>Revenue</u>	<u>Mileage</u>	<u>Revenue per Mile</u> (Cents)
8th	\$ 11.58	120.8	9.59
9th	12.14	120.8	10.05
10th	10.29	120.8	8.52
11th	11.04	120.8	9.14
12th	12.88	120.8	10.01
Sat. 13th	9.54	111.2	8.58
Sun. 14th	4.10	92.0	4.46
	<u>\$ 71.57</u>	<u>804.2</u>	<u>8.90</u>

(2) The evidence showed that an average of fourteen one-way school fares were sold daily, or \$126 additional annual revenue.

There are two principal reasons for the poor showing on this line: the lack of patronage by the present residents living in the areas served, and (2) the abandonment of a very large federal housing project, 2,844 units having been vacated.

Many of those now using the service reside within .5 miles of either the "O" or "R" and "T" routes. Others living in or adjacent to the Valeta St.-Camulos St.-Famosa Boulevard area would have to walk from .6 to .8 miles. The number of such riders, however, is so small that the continuation of an operation which is losing approximately \$25,000 per year is not justified.

Applicant presented evidence (Exhibit No. 2) showing that its operations in 1953 resulted in a system profit of \$50,877 compared with a loss of \$36,589 for the first three months of 1954. Revenue passengers dropped 14.59% in March 1954, compared with March 1953.

The application was protested by many residents of both areas, and the San Diego City Council, by resolution filed at the hearing, opposed the proposed discontinuance of service. The principal objections of the riders were that they would be deprived of transportation, or inconvenienced by having to walk to other lines. Some testified they might have to move from their present homes. It was also suggested that this company operate certain schedules of the "R" and "O" routes along the present shuttle routes, or that a service be inaugurated over the new Mission Bay bridge connecting Midway Drive and West Point Loma Boulevard. Applicant's general manager testified that consideration had been given to the bridge route, but because of the location of the bridge, the additional mileage, limited patronage, and the abandonment of the housing project along said route, the operation would

not be compensatory. A departure from the "R" line along Mission Boulevard to Anacapa Court is also opposed by applicant as not being good operational practice. An increase of at least six minutes to the present running time would tend to lose business for the company by inconveniencing a large number of present patrons while benefiting only a few. The "R" route is the La Jolla line and one of the longest runs in applicant's system.

Undoubtedly there is justification for the position taken by some of the witnesses, and the Commission has given serious consideration to their testimony. However, the evidence is clear that the public has not been supporting the services as now provided. The operating results of said shuttle services show that the company has incurred an annual loss in excess of \$40,000.

The Commission having fully considered the evidence of record is of the opinion and finds that applicant's request for authority to discontinue the West Point Loma Shuttle service has been justified, and that the Mission Boulevard Shuttle service is at present overserved and should be curtailed as hereinafter provided. The application will be granted in part and denied in part.

O R D E R

A public hearing having been held, the Commission being fully advised in the premises, and good cause appearing,

IT IS ORDERED:

(1) That San Diego Transit System be, and it hereby is, authorized to discontinue its passenger stage service (a) along West Point Loma Boulevard between Midway Drive and Cable Street,

and (b) shall revise its present schedules of its Mission Boulevard Shuttle service to provide a morning and afternoon service substantially in accordance with the time periods hereinabove set forth.

(2) That applicant be, and it hereby is, authorized to cancel, upon not less than five days' notice to the public and to the Commission, all fares, rules, regulations and schedules applying to the passenger stage service hereinabove authorized to be discontinued.

(3) That applicant shall post notices of discontinuance of service and revision of schedules in all buses and at terminals used in rendering the service herein authorized to be discontinued for a period of at least five continuous days preceding the termination of said service.

(4) That except as expressly granted by this decision, the application herein is denied.

The effective date of this order shall be twenty days after the date hereof.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 14<sup>th</sup> day of DECEMBER, 1954.

*Robert E. Mitchell*  
 PRESIDENT  
*Justin J. Craven*  
*Lawrence P. Patten*  
*James J. Higgins*  
*Raymond L. Carver*  
 COMMISSIONERS