

Decision No. 51265**ORIGINAL**

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Application of)
 VALLEY TRANSIT LINES, a California)
 corporation, for a certificate of)
 public convenience and necessity)
 authorizing: (a) An extension of its)
 passenger stage service from El Monte,)
 California, to Alhambra, California;)
 and (b) The establishment of certain)
 alternate routes on its presently)
 existing lines.)

Application No. 36524

Glanz and Russell, by R. Y. Schureman, for applicant.
Dale Harlan and T. N. Bristow for Metropolitan Coach
 Lines; George H. Smith for the City of San Gabriel;
 and Floyd S. Lee for the San Gabriel Chamber of Commerce;
 protestants.
Arthur Ager and W. R. Hibbard for the Commission's staff;

O P I N I O N

Pursuant to authority from this Commission, Valley Transit Lines renders service as a passenger stage corporation via six routes between points in and near the City of El Monte, and between El Monte and Temple City, Monrovia and the City of Hope. In addition it serves between El Monte and horse-racing tracks in Los Angeles and Orange Counties. ⁽¹⁾ All of its regular passenger stage services originate at and return to the intersection of Columbia Street and Tyler Avenue in El Monte.

By the application herein, filed on December 3, 1954, and amended on February 1, 1955, Valley Transit Lines seeks authority (1) (a) to extend its Ardon Drive-Temple City Line No. 8 from the intersection of Broadway and Temple City Boulevard, via Broadway, Mission Drive and Main Street to Garfield Avenue in the City of Alhambra, subject to the restrictions that westbound it shall pick

(1) Decision No. 48933, dated August 4, 1953, on Application No. 34255; Decision No. 50023, dated May 11, 1954, on Application No. 35364.

up no passengers west of the intersection of Charlotte Avenue and Broadway, and eastbound it shall discharge no passengers west of the same intersection, (b) to abandon service on the portion of Line No. 8 along Temple City Boulevard between Broadway and Las Tunas Drive, and (c) to provide an alternate service via Line No. 8 from the intersection of Lower Azusa Road and Tyler Avenue via Lower Azusa Road, Arden Way, Arden Drive, Marsden Avenue, Ranger Street and El Monte Avenue to Lower Azusa Road; (2) to add alternate routes to its El Monte-Monrovia Line No. 2 (a) from Peck Road and Hemlock Street, via Hemlock Street, Cogswell Road and Rio Hondo Parkway to Peck Road, and (b) from Peck Road and Lower Azusa Road via Lower Azusa Road to Tyler Avenue; (3) to add an alternate route to its Hoyt-Merced Line No. 7 from the intersection of Tyler Avenue and Hoyt Avenue via Tyler Avenue, Thienes Avenue, Cogswell Road, Slack Road, Leafdale Avenue and Central Avenue to Tyler Avenue; and (4) to add an alternate route to its Cogswell Line No. 1 from Lower Azusa Road and Cogswell Road via lower Azusa Road to Tyler Avenue.

Public hearings were held in Alhambra on January 21, 1955, and in Los Angeles on February 9, 1955, before Examiner Kent C. Rogers. At the hearings evidence was presented and the matter was argued and submitted. It is ready for decision.

Temple City to Alhambra extension of Line No. 8.

The authorized routing of this line is from Columbia Street, along Tyler Avenue, Valley Boulevard, Arden Drive, Arden Way, Lower Azusa Road and Temple City Boulevard to Las Tunas Drive. Applicant proposes to abandon service between the intersection of Broadway and Temple City Boulevard and the intersection of Broadway and Las Tunas Drive, a distance of about three-tenths of a mile, and to extend service west via Broadway and other streets into Alhambra. Applicant's El Monte-Temple City Line No. 3 serves from the center

of El Monte via Tyler Avenue, Freer Street, Halifax Road, Olive Street (about two blocks south of Broadway) and Temple City Boulevard to Las Tunas Drive. Line 8 and Line 3 are on one-hour schedules, but the schedules are staggered so that service along Temple City Boulevard is approximately one-half hourly between Olive Street and Las Tunas Drive. If Line No. 8 is extended into Alhambra, service along Temple City Boulevard between Broadway and Las Tunas Drive will be provided by Line No. 3 only. Applicant's president stated that applicant will schedule Line No. 3 and Line No. 8 to arrive at Broadway and Temple City Boulevard at approximately the same time, thereby avoiding a long wait for passengers transferring from one line to the other. In the last six months, he said, a total of five passengers were picked up on Temple City Boulevard between Broadway and Las Tunas Drive, exclusive of those two streets.

The proposed fares on Line 8 will be 15 cents to Lower Azusa Road and Ardon Drive, an additional 5 cents to Broadway and Temple City Boulevard, an additional 5 cents to Rosomead Boulevard and Broadway, and an additional 5 cents from that point to Alhambra.

Applicant's president testified that one trip per hour will be made over Line 8 between 6:00 a.m. and 6:00 p.m.; that the proposed extension will be approximately four miles one way; that a round trip including the proposed extension, will be approximately $16\frac{1}{2}$ miles in length; that one stage will be adequate; that the estimated revenue per day on the whole line will be \$40 to \$45, or about 20 cents per mile; that applicant's out-of-pocket cost of operation is about 30 cents per mile;⁽²⁾ and that a loss is to be expected for a short period.

(2) See Exhibit 3 for financial statement including noncertificated operations.

As justification for the proposed operation applicant's president testified that he has received numerous requests for a more frequent service between El Monte and Alhambra than that provided by Metropolitan Coach Lines, Line No. 61, which serves with approximately a two-hour headway via Valley Boulevard and Mission Drive.

A Catholic priest testified that approximately 60 El Monte children attend a Catholic high school in San Gabriel; that, although the children can get to school via Metropolitan Coach Lines' Line No. 61, they do not desire to use this service to return to El Monte as they must leave San Gabriel at 3:00 to 3:15 p.m., and hence have no time to participate in school activities; that Metropolitan has no other schedule until about 6:00 p.m., which is too late; and that owing to the scheduling of Metropolitan Coach Lines' services the El Monte Catholics have a private bus which takes the children to school in San Gabriel and picks them up at night, and that they will discontinue this service if this application is granted.

A representative of the San Gabriel Valley Hospital, located near Broadway and Del Mar Avenue in San Gabriel, testified that this hospital has 82 beds; that patients come from all over the San Gabriel Valley and about one-fourth of them come from El Monte; that the patients from El Monte find it difficult to get to and from the hospital via the Metropolitan Coach Lines' Line No. 61 because of the existing two-hour headway on that line; and that the hospital desires that the proposed hourly service be authorized.

In addition, two homemakers testified that they desired the proposed services between El Monte and Alhambra for the reason that intervals between buses on the Metropolitan Coach Lines'

El Monte to Alhambra services are too long.

The Mayor of San Gabriel and the president of the San Gabriel Chamber of Commerce, each speaking for himself personally, testified that they oppose the proposed services along Broadway and desire that the proposal be modified so that service would be rendered between Alhambra and the intersection of Broadway and San Gabriel Boulevard via Las Tunas Drive and San Gabriel Boulevard. Their contentions were that Broadway is too narrow to be used and that Las Tunas is adequate in width and is the main business street in San Gabriel.

Metropolitan Coach Lines protested the extension of applicant's Line No. 8 between Temple City and Alhambra. It offers a service with 10 to 15 minute headways between Los Angeles and Baldwin Avenue in Temple City via Main Street (in Alhambra) and Las Tunas Drive (in Temple City). At Baldwin Avenue the services branch with some schedules terminating at Baldwin Avenue and Las Tunas Drive, some going north to Arcadia and some continuing east on Las Tunas Drive to Mayflower Avenue. Between Baldwin Avenue and Mayflower Avenue service is on about a 30-minute headway in the peak periods and about 40 minutes in the base periods and no service is rendered on Sundays and holidays. Exhibit No. 9 shows that on Wednesday, January 9, 1955, a total of 80 persons arrived at the intersection of Temple City Boulevard and Las Tunas Drive via applicant's Line 3 and Line 8, and 26 of those used the protestant's services westward into Alhambra or beyond to Los Angeles. On the same day, 79 passengers boarded applicant's Lines 3 and 8 coaches at the named intersection for points served by applicant. Metropolitan Coach Lines' Long Beach-Pasadena via Whittier Line No. 61, referred to hereinabove, serves between El Monte and Alhambra via Valley Boulevard and Mission Drive. A traffic count on this

line, made on Wednesday, January 9, 1955, showed that 14 westbound passengers boarded the protestant's stages at or near points applicant is now authorized to serve in El Monte and were discharged at or near points applicant desires to serve via the proposed extension. It also shows that eastbound approximately 22 passengers were carried who boarded and alighted within reasonable walking distance of and could be served by the applicant's proposed service.

Protestant's fare on Valloy Boulevard between El Monte and Alhambra is 25 cents and on Las Tunas Drive between Temple City Boulevard and Alhambra is 20 cents. Applicant's services would cost 30 cents between El Monte and Alhambra, and between El Monte and Temple City 25 cents.

An Associate Transportation Engineer on the Commission's staff presented evidence concerning the application. Among the changes in service contemplated by the applicant are the proposals to extend Line 8 as above discussed and to reduce service on Line 7 from 1/2 hourly to hourly. It was the engineer's opinion that these changes will result in net increase of 13.5 miles on week days and 83.6 miles on Saturdays, or an annual increase of 7,790 miles. He stated that applicant's costs per mile, as shown by Exhibit C on the application, are 33 cents, and that, using this figure, the extension of service to Alhambra would cost the applicant approximately \$2,570 per year.

As heretofore stated, applicant estimates that it will lose approximately 10 cents per mile at the commencement of the operation. Applicant's financial condition is at the present time unsound (see Exhibit No. 3).

Applicant's support came from people in the vicinity of El Monte who are dissatisfied with Metropolitan Coach Lines' 2-hour

headway between El Monte and Alhambra. This service is infrequent but it appears adequate in view of the amount of traffic involved (Exhibit No. 8).

Service by Metropolitan Coach Lines on Las Tunas Drive between Temple City and Alhambra is more frequent than that proposed by the applicant. There was no support from any witness desiring service between Temple City and Alhambra or intermediate points. The proposed service is interurban in character, and Las Tunas Drive is between 1/4 and 1/2 mile from Broadway, applicant's proposed route. In our opinion Metropolitan Coach Lines' service on Las Tunas Drive adequately serves the area between Broadway and Las Tunas Drive.

Upon the record herein it appears, and we find, that public convenience and necessity do not require that applicant extend its services between Temple City and Alhambra and that portion of the application will be denied.

Proposed local extensions on Lines Nos. 1, 2, 7 and 8.

The proposed changes or extensions on Lines 1, 2 and 8, other than the extension of Line 8 into Alhambra, are alternate routes to enable applicant to provide transportation for school children. No extra equipment will be required and the regular schedules will be continued in each instance. The extension of Line 7, south of Tyler Avenue, amounts to a rerouting of this line, inasmuch as all but four schedules will be via the proposed routing. The only portion of Route 7 which will be deprived of service via all schedules is a short stretch along Tyler Avenue, and all passengers will have less than one-fourth of a mile to walk to receive service on the new route. The proposed extension will, it is claimed, permit applicant to serve a residential development south of Tyler Avenue. In connection with applicant's proposal

to extend service into Alhambra, applicant also proposes to reduce service on Line 7 from the present 1/2 hourly headway to hourly headway. In view of the fact that we are denying applicant's request for authority to extend service to Alhambra, applicant may not desire to reduce its headway on Line 7 to an hourly basis. The record herein shows that hourly service along Line 7 is adequate and there appears to be no reason why applicant may not reduce service on Line 7 to an hourly basis if it so desires.

Upon the evidence of record herein, we find that public convenience and necessity require that applicant extend service as hereinafter in the order set forth.

O R D E R

A public hearing having been held, evidence presented thereat, the matter having been argued and submitted, and the Commission being informed and having made the findings set forth in the opinion herein, and based upon the evidence of record and said findings,

I. IT IS ORDERED:

That a certificate of public convenience and necessity be, and it is granted to Valley Transit Lines, a corporation, authorizing the establishment and operation of passenger stage services, as defined in Section 226 of the Public Utilities Code, for the transportation of persons via the following routes and between the following points, including intermediate points, as extensions of and to be consolidated with the following routes fully described in Decision No. 48933, dated August 4, 1953, on Application No. 34255:

Line No. 1, "Cogswell"

From Cogswell Road and Lower Azusa Road, via Lower Azusa Road to Tyler Avenue. Return via the reverse of the going route.

Line No. 2, "El Monto-Monrovia"

(1) From Peck Road and Hemlock Street, via Hemlock Street, Cogswell Road and Rio Hondo Parkway to Peck Road. Return via the reverse of the going route.

(2) From Peck Road and Lower Azusa Road, via Lower Azusa Road to Tyler Avenue. Return via the reverse of the going route.

Line No. 7, "Hoyt-Merced"

From Tyler Avenue and Hoyt Avenue, via Tyler Avenue, Thienes Avenue, Cogswell Road, Slack Road, Leafdale Avenue and Central Avenue to Tyler Avenue.

Line No. 8, "Arden Drive-Temple City"

(1) From Lower Azusa Road and Tyler Avenue via Lower Azusa Road to El Monte Avenue. Return via the reverse of the going route.

(2) From Arden Drive and Marsden Avenue via Marsden Avenue, Ranger Street, El Monte Avenue and Lower Azusa Road to Arden Way. Return via the reverse of the going route.

II. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the authority granted by ordering paragraph I of the order herein, is subject to the following conditions:

- (a) That applicant shall give not less than five days' notice of the route changes on Line No. 7 before such changes are effected, by posting plainly visible notices at terminals of said line and on all buses used in the operation of said line.

III. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that in all other respects the application is denied.

The effective date of this order shall be twenty days from the date hereof.

Dated at San Francisco, California, this 29th day of March, 1955:

[Signature]

 President
[Signature]

[Signature]

Matthew J. Dooley
 Commissioner, being necessarily absent, did not participate in the disposition of this proceeding.

COMMISSIONERS