

Decision No. 55468

**ORIGINAL**

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

RIDGE VIEW CIVIC ASSOCIATION, )  
 ROWAN CIVIC CLUB, LE ROY SECKLER, )  
 MARTIN J. BOUMAN; ROBERT KIRK; )  
 ABRAHAM SANDLER, THEODORE )  
 ZIEMKIEWICZ, FREDERICK W. W. )  
 CAMERON, )  
 )  
 Complainants, )  
 )  
 vs )  
 )  
 SAN DIEGO TRANSIT SYSTEM, )  
 )  
 Defendant. )

Case No. 5907

Leroy Seckler, attorney, for all complainants,  
and Thomas C. Taylor, for complainant Ridge  
View Civic Association.

Lindley, Lazar & Scales, by Leon W. Scales, for  
San Diego Transit System, respondent.

Frederick B. Holoboff, for City of San Diego;  
Wayne Fry and Harold Culver, for San Diego  
City Schools; interested parties.

M. L. Adler, for self, protestant.

William F. Hibbard, for the Public Utilities  
Commission staff.

O P I N I O N

Complainants allege that public convenience and necessity require that defendant extend its Route "B" line an additional 1.6 miles from its present southern terminus at Gateway Drive and Rexford Drive, in the Fairmount Park area of the City of San Diego, to Federal Boulevard and 47th Street, making connection there with the Route "5" bus line.

A public hearing was held in San Diego on May 6, 1957, before Examiner Mark V. Chiesa. Oral and documentary evidence having been adduced, the matter was submitted for decision.

Route "B" line operates in a southerly-northerly direction between Fairmount Park and the Allied Gardens area in the City of San Diego. Two buses are used to provide an average headway of 30 minutes except for approximately three hours at midday when the schedules are on an hourly basis. The first trip leaves northbound from Fairmount Park at 5:55 a.m., and the last regular trip leaves southbound from Allied Gardens at 6:57 p.m. There are two later trips starting at University Avenue and terminating at Gateway Drive. Passengers wishing to travel from Fairmount Park to downtown San Diego may transfer to frequent services provided by Routes "7" and "E" along University Avenue and El Cajon Boulevard. The round-trip distance on Route "B" is approximately 13.7 miles, and daily schedules require the operation of approximately 320 miles. The evidence shows that present revenue per mile is approximately 27 cents, and out-of-pocket cost per mile is approximately 40 cents.

The principal complainants are the Ridge View Civic Association composed of residents of the Ridge View area. Said area is located on a ridge approximately midway between the present southern terminus of said "B" line and the intersection of Federal Boulevard and 47th Street. There are approximately 460 homes in the said Ridge View area, including adjoining Melissa Park. The Ridge View area is approximately 1.2 miles in

length, bounded, roughly, by Euclid Avenue on the north, 43rd Street (extended) on the south, Home Avenue ravine on the west, and Chollas Creek ravine on the east. Complainants described the area as rural, with two-lane roads having "sharp vertical and horizontal curves, extremely narrow bridges and no sidewalks." There is no public transportation.

The principal access streets into the Ridge View area are Euclid Avenue on the north and Fairmount Avenue on the south, which streets intersect with Ridge View Drive, the principal street along the ridge.

There are two elementary schools serving the said area, Marshall Elementary, situated approximately one-half mile north of Euclid Avenue, which serves the school children living along the north portion of said ridge area north of Laurel Street, which bisects the Ridge View area, and Webster Elementary, situated approximately one-half mile southeasterly of the intersection of Fairmount Avenue and Ridge View Drive, serving the children living along the south portion of the ridge. Beginning next school term elementary school children living in the southerly portion of Laurel Street will be permitted to attend either school. Children living north of Laurel Street will be required to attend Marshall Elementary School, and therefore could not use the bus service to and from school, as proposed by complainants.

The proposed extension of Route "B" is southeasterly along Gateway Drive down grade into Home Avenue Ravine, northeasterly along Home Avenue to its intersection with Fairmount

Avonue, thence southwesterly up the east bank of the ravine crossing to the Ridge View area and continuing easterly down into the Chollas Creek Ravine and up the ravine to 47th Street, thence southerly along 47th to its intersection with Federal Boulevard. Webster Elementary School is located immediately northeast of the latter intersection. As hereinabove indicated, Fairmount Avenue, in the Ridge View area, is a narrow and curved two-lane street without sidewalks. The conditions for pedestrians are unsafe and the record clearly shows that to be one of the principal reasons for this complaint.

Defendant has supplied transportation for school children in the Ridge View area, but upon the opening of the Marshall Elementary School, in January 1957, notice was given of the intention to discontinue said service. The service was temporarily discontinued but later was re-established. At present school transportation service between the Ridge View area and Webster Elementary School is being furnished under contract with the San Diego School Board. This service was discontinued at the end of the 1956-57 school term.

A Commission engineer testified that one bus must be added to maintain the present schedules on Route "B" if the line is extended; that a reduction of present schedules would result in additional losses. He also estimated the population of the Ridge View area, including a recent subdivision known as Melissa Park, to be approximately 1,600 persons; that there is a potential of approximately 23 bus riders, or a total of 46 one-way fares per weekday; that an average of approximately 52 children are

using the present school bus service to and from Webster Elementary School; that the proposed extension would return an additional daily revenue, from adult and school fares, of approximately \$12.50 compared with an additional out-of-pocket cost of \$49.00 per day, or an estimated annual out-of-pocket loss of approximately \$11,000.00.

Evidence is lacking that there is a substantial need for persons to travel between points on the present "B" route and points south of the Ridge View area, or vice versa. A need exists for some of the residents in the Ridge View area, adults and school children, but such need is not substantial nor is it commensurate with additional cost of providing the service.

The vice president and general manager of San Diego Transit System testified that the annual out-of-pocket cost of extending Route "B" to the intersection of 47th Street and Federal Avenue, and continuing to provide present patrons service comparable with that now available, would be \$18,490; that estimated additional annual revenue resulting from such extension is \$2,953, or a loss of \$15,537 per year. Said estimates were based on approximately 460 homes in the Ridge View and Melissa Park areas, or a total population of approximately 1,610 residents.

Complainants' suggestion that increased operating costs might be averted by reducing present service to a 45-minute or hourly headway does not appear reasonable in view of the inconvenience of such change to approximately 1,000 present daily patrons.

Having considered the evidence of record, the Commission is of the opinion and finds that public convenience and necessity does not require the establishment and operation of the proposed extension of Route "B" as hereinabove set forth. We also find that the proposed extension would materially increase the expense of operating the said line without compensating revenues, and that such increase does not appear to be justified. The complaint will be dismissed.

O R D E R

A public hearing having been held, the Commission being fully advised in the premises and having found facts and concluded as hereinabove set forth,

IT IS ORDERED that the complaints of Ridge View Civic Association, Rowan Civic Club, Le Roy Seckler,

Martin J. Bouman, Robert Kirk, Abraham Sandler, Theodore Ziemkiewicz, and Frederick W. W. Cameron, being Case No. 5907, be and they hereby are denied.

The effective date of this order shall be twenty days after the date hereof.

Dated at Los Angeles, California, this 27th day of August, 1957.

Paula Intermier President  
A. Hardy  
E. L. Taylor

Commissioners

Peter E. Mitchell  
Commissioner G. Matthew J. Dealey being necessarily absent, did not participate in the disposition of this proceeding.