

**ORIGINAL**Decision No. 70716

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Application of SAN DIEGO TRANSIT SYSTEM, a corporation, for authority to (a) discontinue its Route "B" - ALLIED GARDENS-FAIRMOUNT PARK line; (b) discontinue its Route "C" - 30TH STREET-NAVAL STATION line; (c) discontinue its Route "D" - LA JOLLA-KEARNY MESA lines; (d) discontinue Saturday service on its Route "F" - MONTEREY HEIGHTS-LEMON GROVE line; (e) discontinue its Route "G" - DOWNTOWN SAN DIEGO-KEARNY MESA line; (f) discontinue its Route "J" - SPRING VALLEY-FLETCHER HILLS line, and extend its Route "E" - LA MESA-EL CAJON line to cover the Fletcher Hills portion of Route "J"; (g) discontinue Saturday service on its Route "K" - CATALINA BOULEVARD line; (h) discontinue Saturday service on its Route "T" - CROWN POINT line; and (i) combine a portion of its Route "W" - HARBISON-LINCOLN ACRES line and a portion of its Route "12" - PARADISE HILLS line into a new Route "12" - PARADISE HILLS-LINCOLN ACRES line.

Application No. 48036  
 (Filed November 4, 1965)  
 (Amended January 7, 1966)

(For Appearances See Appendix B)

O P I N I O N

San Diego Transit System requests authorization to discontinue present regular service along certain routes of its passenger stage operations and to make changes in other routes by extending or combining them and to discontinue Saturday service on some other seldom used routes for the purpose of

reducing losses of revenue which it alleges have been sustained on these routes in the amount of \$110,500 for 1965.

A public hearing was held before Examiner DeWolf on January 19 and 20, 1966, in San Diego, on which latter date the matter was submitted.

Public notice was given, in accordance with the Commission's rules of procedure, to public agencies in the service area involved and it was given also by publication in a newspaper and by posting in the buses.

The application describes the routes proposed to be discontinued, changed or combined and allocates the loss of patronage and revenue attributed to each.

It is proposed to discontinue service on four routes - Route "B", Allied Gardens-Fairmount Park; Route "C", 30th Street-Naval Station; Route "D", La Jolla-Kearny Mesa; and Route "G", Downtown San Diego-Kearny Mesa. Also, it is proposed to discontinue Saturday service on three routes - Route "F", Monterey Heights-Lemon Grove; Route "K", Catalina Boulevard; and Route "T", Crown Point.

Other routes to be partly discontinued and partly combined with new or other routes are as follows: Route "J", Spring Valley-Fletcher Hills, is to be discontinued and Route "E", La Mesa-El Cajon, is to be extended over a portion of said Route "J"; and it is proposed to combine part of Route "W", Harbison-Lincoln Acres line, and Route "12", Paradise Hills Line, into a new Route "12", Paradise Hills-Lincoln Acres line.

The application alleges that two-day traffic checks were made on Routes "B", "C", "D", "G", "J" and "W" and a Saturday traffic check on the other routes showing passenger revenue and out-of-pocket data. The out-of-pocket expense is

figured at a rate of 56.31¢ per mile, after deducting 1.14¢ per mile representing the revenue per mile gained from a grant-in-aid to applicant from the City of San Diego for \$84,000 for the calendar year 1965.

The traffic check statistics set forth in the application are combined in the following table:

WEEKDAYS						
:Route	:Passengers :Per Trip	:Average :Revenue :Per Trip	:Revenue :Per Mile	:Cost/trip: :Out-Of :Pocket	:Estimated :Annual :Loss	:
B North	6.78	\$2.39		\$4.67		
B South	5.33	1.86	37.87¢	4.70	\$ 26,100	
C South	10.	2.88		9.97		
C North	11.	3.09	24.70¢	9.55	3,450	
D Outbound	17.	6.43		23.48		
D Inbound	15.	5.66	21.84¢	23.14	17,600	
F North	9.	3.11		8.55		
F South	10.	3.75	19.12¢	8.58	3,925	
G Outbound	12.	6.19		11.87		
G Inbound	14.	7.30	44.05¢	11.67	5,100	
J South	10.	3.87		8.10		
J North	10.	3.33	14.00¢	7.99	31,600	
K South	7.	2.51		4.50		
K North	7.	2.37	41.04¢	4.45	2,550	
T South	6.	2.44		3.80		
T North	7.	2.10	22.13¢	3.86	2,275	
W South	5.	1.48		3.87		
W North	4.	1.30	22.49¢	4.15	17,100	
12-West	5.	1.88		2.97		
12-East	7.	2.06	31.58¢	2.92	10,800	

Applicant introduced Exhibits 1 through 7 and 9 through 22. Exhibits 1 and 2 are the affidavits of publication and posting of the notice of hearing. Exhibits 3, 4 and 5 are maps of the transit routes, two of them being overlays showing the routes and portions sought to be changed or discontinued.

Exhibit 6 is a map of new Route "12" and portions of Routes "W" and "12" proposed to be abandoned and Exhibit 7 is a map of Routes "E", "F" and "7" and portions of "J" planned to be abandoned.

Exhibit 12 lists the number of employees at Astro-nautics plant on March 1962 as 33,168 and on January 6, 1966, as 13,579. The other Exhibits 9 through 22 contain a summary of passengers and revenue by trips. The totals for the routes from these exhibits are as follows:

## AVERAGE PER TRIP

Route	Saturdays		Week Days	
	Passengers	Revenue	Passengers	Revenue
B North	6.91	\$2.48	6.78	\$2.39
B South	5.67	1.92	5.33	1.86
C South			10.	2.88
C North			11.	3.09
D-to Astro.			16.5	6.43
D-from Astro.			13.	5.66
F North	8.56	3.11		
F South	9.89	3.75		
G-to Astro.			11.5	6.19
G-from Astro.			14.	7.30
J South	7.	2.99	10.09	3.87
J North	7.33	2.27	10.15	3.33
K South	7.42	2.51		
K North	6.92	2.37		
T South	6.29	2.44		
T North	6.86	2.10		
W South			4.83	1.48
W North			3.58	1.30
12 West	4.67	1.65	5.56	1.88
12 East	6.27	1.88	6.67	2.06

Witnesses for applicant further testified that the school bus patronage on all the routes had fallen off since the school fare increase from 15¢ to 25¢, indicating a loss of school fares of 38 per cent at the time of filing the application and 40 per cent at the time of the hearing. The witnesses for applicant further testified that the proposed changes would result in annual savings to the company of \$107,000, about equalizing the losses which are due to reduction in patronage.

Numerous patrons of the bus service on Route "B", Allied Gardens, testified in opposition to discontinuance of the bus service on this route and several witnesses testified in opposition

to discontinuance of service on Route "J", Spring Valley line, and Route "G", Kearny Mesa line. At least fifty persons testified that they patronized the bus lines occasionally. Very few testified that they used the bus service daily in both directions but stated they were speaking for others who were at work and could not appear at the hearing.

No public agencies or employers at the Navy or aircraft installations appeared in opposition to the application.

Numerous witnesses living in the area of the "B" Route, Allied Gardens, testified that complete discontinuance of this line would leave this large area completely isolated as it is surrounded by freeways, hills and valleys, and it would then have no public transportation, except for the school service.

Examination of the schedules and fares on the "B" Route indicates that the weekday service produces approximately 45¢ per mile revenue against an approximate 56¢ per mile out-of-pocket cost. Saturday revenue is only approximately 14¢ per mile. Weekday service is now operated from approximately 5:30 a.m. to 6:30 p.m. with a 30-minute frequency during each peak period and a 60-minute frequency during the base period. Two coaches are necessary during the peak periods. Should service be retained on the "B" Route on an hourly headway from approximately 6:30 a.m. to 6:30 p.m. weekdays and discontinued on Saturdays, a sufficient saving would be accomplished to produce revenue approximately equal to out-of-pocket expense. One bus and a

driver at approximately \$25 per day would be saved.

Witnesses for applicant stated that it would be willing to operate two trips on the "J" Route in Spring Valley in each of the morning and afternoon peak periods on weekdays only, the same to be operated as a part of Route "F".

Based upon the evidence the Commission finds that:

1. The present operations of applicant as set forth in the application are not compensatory.
2. The volume of passengers does not justify the continuance of the present service on the lines set forth in the application except as herein set forth.
3. San Diego Transit System should be required to operate two trips in each of the morning and afternoon peak periods on the Spring Valley loop of present Route "J", said service to be operated as a part of Route "F" on weekdays only.
4. Applicant should be required to continue service over its entire Route "B" on weekdays only from approximately 6:30 a.m. to 6:30 p.m.
5. There is a public need for a continuance of service as herein set forth on Route "B", Allied Gardens-Fairmount Park line, and Route "J", Spring Valley loop, as herein set forth.
6. Discontinuance of applicant's present regular service along certain routes and the combining of portions of other routes as herein authorized is justified.
7. Applicant should be authorized to discontinue Route "C", 30th Street-Naval Station, Route "D", La Jolla-Kearny Mesa, and Route "G", Downtown San Diego-Kearny Mesa.

8. Applicant should be authorized to discontinue Saturday service on the following routes:

- Route "B" - Allied Gardens-Fairmount Park
- Route "F" - Monterey Heights-Lemon Grove
- Route "K" - Catalina Boulevard
- Route "T" - Crown Point

9. Applicant should be authorized to effect changes in the following routes:

- a. To discontinue Route "J", Spring Valley-Fletcher Hills, as such, but to operate trips on the Spring Valley loop of this route during the morning and afternoon peak periods, on weekdays only, as part of Route "F", Monterey Heights-Lemon Grove.
- b. To reroute Route "E", La Mesa-El Cajon line to cover the Fletcher Hills portion of Route "J".
- c. To combine Routes "W" and "12" in a new Route "12", Paradise Hills-Lincoln Acres as herein set forth.

10. Public convenience and necessity no longer require the operation of the services herein authorized to be discontinued.

11. Public convenience and necessity require the operation of the services authorized to be combined or extended as herein set forth.

The application will be granted in part and denied in part.

San Diego Transit System is hereby placed on notice that operative rights, as such, do not constitute a class of property which may be capitalized or used as an element of value in rate fixing for any amount of money in excess of that originally paid to the State as the consideration for the grant of such rights. Aside from their purely permissive aspect, such rights extend to the holder a full or partial monopoly of a class of business over a particular route. This monopoly feature may be modified or canceled

at any time by the State, which is not in any respect limited as to the number of rights which may be given.

O R D E R

IT IS ORDERED that:

1. San Diego Transit System is authorized to discontinue its regular passenger stage service on:

Route "C", 30th Street-Naval Station;

Route "D", La Jolla-Kearny Mesa;

Route "G", Downtown San Diego-Kearny Mesa,

and to discontinue Saturday service only on the following routes:

Route "B", Allied Gardens-Fairmount Park;

Route "F", Monterey Heights-Lemon Grove;

Route "K", Catalina Boulevard;

Route "T", Crown Point,

and to discontinue Route "J" (provided the Spring Valley loop thereof is combined with Route "F" and the Fletcher Hills portion thereof is combined with Route "E") and to combine Routes "W" and "12" into a new Route "12", Paradise Hills-Lincoln Acres.

2. A certificate of public convenience and necessity is hereby granted to San Diego Transit System, a corporation, authorizing the establishment and operation of service as a passenger stage corporation, as that term is defined in Section 226 of the Public Utilities Code, for the transportation of passengers between the points and over the routes set forth in Appendix A attached hereto, as an extension and enlargement of,



consolidation with and subject to all the limitations and restrictions set forth in the certificate granted by Decision No. 55090, as amended.

3. Appendix A of Decision No. 55090, as heretofore amended, is further amended by incorporating therein Tenth Revised Page 2, Second Revised Page 9, Third Revised Page 9-A, Ninth Revised Page 10, Fourth Revised Page 11, Sixth Revised Page 11-A, Third Revised Page 12-A, Second Revised Page 20 and First Revised Page 30 attached hereto, in revision of Ninth Revised Page 2, First Revised Page 9, Second Revised Page 9-A, Eighth Revised Page 10, Third Revised Page 11, Fifth Revised Page 11-A, Second Revised Page 12-A, First Revised Page 20 and Original Page 30.

4. In providing service pursuant to the certificate herein granted, applicant shall comply with and observe the following service regulations:

- (a) Within thirty days after the effective date hereof, applicant shall file a written acceptance of the certificate herein granted. Applicant is placed on notice that, if it accepts the certificate of public convenience and necessity herein granted, it will be required, among other things, to comply with and observe the safety rules of the California Highway Patrol, the rules and other regulations of the Commission's General Order No. 98-A and insurance requirements of the Commission's General Order No. 101-A. Failure to comply with and observe the safety rules, or the provisions of General Orders Nos. 98-A or 101-A, may result in a cancellation of the operating authority granted by this decision.
- (b) Within one hundred twenty days after the effective date hereof, applicant shall establish the service herein authorized and file tariffs and timetables, in triplicate, in the Commission's office.

- (c) The tariff and timetable filings shall be made effective not earlier than ten days after the effective date of this order on not less than five days' notice to the Commission and the public, and the effective date of the tariff and timetable filings shall be concurrent with the establishment of the service herein authorized.
- (d) The tariff and timetable filings made pursuant to this order shall comply with the regulations governing the construction and filing of tariffs and timetables set forth in the Commission's General Orders Nos. 79 and 98-A.
- (e) Applicant shall maintain its accounting records on a calendar year basis in conformance with the applicable Uniform System of Accounts or Chart of Accounts as prescribed or adopted by this Commission and shall file with the Commission, on or before March 31 of each year, an annual report of its operations in such form, content, and number of copies as the Commission, from time to time, shall prescribe.

The effective date of this order shall be ten days after the date hereof.

Dated at SAN FRANCISCO, California, this 17<sup>th</sup> day of MAY, 1966.

Frederick B. Hohlhoff  
President  
John S. Kitchell  
George H. Glover  
Augustus  
William L. Bennett  
Commissioners

I N D E X

Page No.

Section 1.	GENERAL AUTHORIZATIONS	
	Turning of Motor Coaches at Termini, etc. . . . .	4
	Direction of Route Descriptions . . . . .	4
	Relocated Highways . . . . .	4
	"On-Call" Service . . . . .	4
Section 2.	MOTOR COACHES OF EXCESS LENGTH AND WIDTH . . . . .	5-7
Section 3.	*ROUTE DESCRIPTIONS	
	<u>Route-Route Name</u>	
	B Allied Gardens-Fairmount Park . . . . .	8
	E La Mesa-El Cajon . . . . .	10
	F Monterey Heights-Spring Valley . . . . .	11
	H Hillcrest-Cabrillo Heights . . . . .	12
	K Catalina Boulevard . . . . .	13
	L Rosecrans . . . . .	14
	O Ocean Beach-National City-Imperial Beach . . . . .	15
	R La Jolla . . . . .	16
	S State College . . . . .	17
	T Crown Point . . . . .	18
	V Linda Vista-Chula Vista . . . . .	19
	1 El Cajon Boulevard Local . . . . .	21
	2 Broadway-30th Street . . . . .	22
	3 Mission Hills-Ocean View Boulevard . . . . .	23
	4 Pacific Beach-Imperial Avenue . . . . .	24
	5 Clairemont-Market Street . . . . .	25
	6 Point Loma-Mission Valley-North Park . . . . .	25A
	7 University Avenue-East San Diego . . . . .	26
	9 Coronado . . . . .	27
	10 Downtown Special . . . . .	28
	11 Adams Avenue-Logan Heights . . . . .	29
	12 Paradise Hills-Lincoln Acres . . . . .	30
	13 Westgate Park Service . . . . .	30A
	Balboa Park "On-Call" Service . . . . .	31
	Balboa Park "Park-Ride" Service . . . . .	31A

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

\*Changed by Decision No. 70716, Application No. 48036

Appendix A  
(Dec. No. 55090)

San Diego Transit System Second Revised Page 9  
(a corporation) Cancels  
First Revised Page 9

Section 3. ROUTE DESCRIPTIONS (continued)

\*Route "C" - 30th Street Naval Station - Cancelled

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

\*Changed by Decision No. 70716, Application No. 48036.

Appendix A  
(Dec. No. 55090)

SAN DIEGO TRANSIT SYSTEM

Third Revised Page 9A  
Cancels  
Second Revised Page 9A

Section 3. ROUTE DESCRIPTIONS (continued)

\* Route "D" - La Jolla-Kearny Mesa - Canceled.

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

\*Changed by Decision No. 70716, Application No. 48036.

Section 3. ROUTE DESCRIPTIONS

\* ROUTE "E" - LA MESA-EL CAJON

From the intersection of 2nd Street and Main Street in the City of El Cajon, via Main Street, El Cajon Boulevard, La Mesa Boulevard in the City of La Mesa, El Cajon Boulevard, Normal Street, Washington Street, and U. S. Highway 395 to 11th Avenue, then loop via U. S. Highway 395, 10th Avenue, B Street, 4th Avenue, E Street, and 11th Avenue to U. S. Highway 395.

Also, from the intersection of Garfield Avenue and Fletcher Parkway in the City of El Cajon, via Fletcher Parkway, Navajo Road, Lake Murray Boulevard, El Paso Street in the City of La Mesa, Jackson Drive, Parkway Drive, Amarillo Avenue, Mellmanor Drive, and Grossmont Center Drive to Center Drive, then south-westbound only via Center Drive to Entrance 4, then via Center Drive, Jackson Drive, Hayes Street, and Lincoln Street to La Mesa Boulevard.

Also, from the intersection of Center Drive and Entrance 4 in the City of La Mesa, southeastbound only via Entrance 4, Entrance 3, and Grossmont Center Drive to Center Drive.

Also, from the intersection of La Mesa Boulevard and Jackson Drive in the City of La Mesa, northbound only via Jackson Drive to Hayes Street.

Also, from the intersection of El Cajon Boulevard and Park Boulevard, via Park Boulevard and University Avenue to 5th Avenue, then loop via University Avenue, 4th Avenue, E Street, 6th Avenue, F Street, and 5th Avenue to University Avenue.

RESTRICTION: San Diego Transit System is not authorized, and is forbidden, to pick up or discharge passengers on U. S. Highway 395.

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

\*Changed by Decision No. 70716, Application No. 48036.

Section 3. ROUTE DESCRIPTIONS (continued)

\*ROUTE "F" - MONTEREY HEIGHTS-SPRING VALLEY

From the intersection of Allison Avenue and Palm Avenue in the City of La Mesa, via Palm Avenue, Imperial Avenue, Cypress Avenue, Alton Drive, Englewood Drive, Canton Drive, Massachusetts Avenue, Madera Street, Broadway, 60th Street, Kenwood Street, Iona Drive, and Market Street to 4th Avenue, then loop via Market Street, 3rd Avenue, E Street, and 4th Avenue to Market Street.

Also, from the intersection of Palm Avenue and Campo Road, eastbound only via Campo Road, Bancroft Drive, Troy Street, and Palm Street to Imperial Avenue.

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

\*Changed by Decision No. 70716, Application No. 48036.

Appendix A  
(Dec. No. 55090)

SAN DIEGO TRANSIT SYSTEM

Sixth Revised Page 11A

Cancel

Fifth Revised Page 11A

Section 3. ROUTE DESCRIPTIONS (continued)

\* Route "G" - Downtown San Diego-Kearny Mesa- Canceled.

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

\*Changed by Decision No. 70716, Application No. 48036.



Section 3. ROUTE DESCRIPTIONS (continued)

\* Route "J" - Spring Valley-Fletcher Hills - Canceled.

One portion of route made a part of Route "E" and  
the remainder made a part of Route "F".

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

\*Changed by Decision No. 70716, Application No. 48036.

Section 3. ROUTE DESCRIPTIONS (continued)

\* Route "W" - Harbison-Lincoln Acres - Rerouted and  
combined with Route "12" Paradise Hills-  
Lincoln Acres.

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

\*Changed by Decision No. 70716, Application No. 48036.

Section 3. ROUTE DESCRIPTIONS (continued)

\*ROUTE "12" - PARADISE HILLS-LINCOLN ACRES

From the intersection of National Avenue and 8th Street in National City, via 8th Street, Highland Avenue, 10th Street, L Avenue, 8th Street, Palm Avenue, Division Street, Sanitarium Avenue, 8th Street, Harbison Avenue, 16th Street, Rachael Avenue, Albemarle Street, Calle Serena, Alleghany Street, and Munda Road to Saipan Drive, then loop via Munda Road, Oriskany Road, Ranger Road, and Saipan Drive to Munda Road.

Also, from the intersection of Rachael Avenue and 18th Street in National City, via 18th Street to Granger Avenue, then loop via 18th Street, Grove Street, 22nd Street, Prospect Street, 24th Street, Grove Street, Sweetwater Road, Ridgeway Drive, and Granger Avenue to 18th Street.

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

\*Changed by Decision No. 70716, Application No. 48036.

APPENDIX B

APPEARANCES

Scales, Patton, Ellsworth & Corbett, by  
Leon W. Scales, for applicant.  
Mrs. Martha Coss and Fred B. Harrington,  
for Route B, Allied Gardens; Dr. Kenneth C.  
Snyder, for Bencroft Palms Mobile Court;  
Mrs. Wayne T. Hurst, for Paradise Hills  
Community Council; Etta Linton, for  
Golden Hills Democrat Club; William Perlman,  
for Senior Citizens of San Diego; William M.  
Taggart, in propria persona; Mrs. M. D. Clark,  
for Route B, 12 and Saturday service continued;  
and Irma Bolander, in propria persona; protestants.  
Rector K. Fox, for City of San Diego and Stuart R.  
Foutz, for the Department of the Navy, U.S.A.;  
interested parties.  
Fred G. Ballenger, for the Commission staff.