ORIGINAL

Decision No. ____76063

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Application of the CITY OF LOS ANGELES, a municipal corporation, to construct TAMPA AVENUE at grade across the tracks of the Southern Pacific Company's Coast Line.

Application No. 50269 (Filed May 27, 1968)

Roger Armebergh, by Charles E.

Mattson and Charles W. Sullivan,
for the City of Ics Angeles,
applicant.

Randolph Karr, for Southern Pacific
Company, protestant.

Leslie E. Corkill, for the Department
of Public Utilities & Transportation,
City of Los Angeles, interested party.

T. J. McDonough, for the Reseda Chamber
of Commerce, interested party.

Robert W. Crommelin, for Associated
Chambers of Commerce of San Fernando
Valley, interested party.

Walter A. Burke, for Industrial
Association of San Fernando Valley,
interested party.

William L. Oliver, for the Commission
staff.

<u>OPINION</u>

By this application the City of Los Angeles seeks authority to establish a street crossing at grade across the tracks of the Southern Pacific Company.

Public hearings on the application were held before Examiner Abernathy at Los Angeles on September 16, 20 and 23, November 25 and 26, December 2 and 3, 1968. Eriefs and reply

briefs were filed on February 4 and 14, 1969, whereupon the matter was taken under submission.

The street which is involved herein is Tampa Avenue, which extends for a distance of more than eight miles across the western portion of the San Fernando Valley. The record shows that Tampa Avenue is being developed by the City of Los Angeles into a major highway of the valley area. At its northerly end it will be a primary access street into a residential development in excess of 4,000 acres. Near its southerly end it connects with the Ventura Freeway. Ultimately it will also connect with two other freeways, the proposed Whitnall Freeway (State Route 64) and the Simi Valley Freeway (State Route 118).

About midway along its route across the San Fernando Valley the continuity of Tampa Avenue is interrupted by the tracks of the Southern Pacific Company's Coast Line. It is at this point the proposed grade crossing would be established. At present the nearest available street crossings of the railroad tracks are at Corbin Avenue, about one-half mile to the west, and at Reseda Boulevard, about one mile to the east. Corbin Avenue crosses the tracks at grade. Reseda Boulevard crosses by separated grade.

Applicant states that if Tampa Avenue is to serve its basic function as an important arterial for the movement of persons and property, and thereby to facilitate the development of the valley area in accordance with approved land use plans, it is essential that Tampa Avenue be opened as a through highway A sketch of the area is attached hereto as Appendix A.

across the Valley. Applicant further states that the opening of Tampa Avenue as a through highway is also necessary as a measure to relieve traffic congestion on Corbin Avenue and Reseda Boulevard. Assertedly, these streets are carrying substantial volumes of traffic at present and will be carrying more in the future.

Applicant also states that the extension of Tampa Avenue as proposed across the Coast Line tracks of the Southern Pacific Company will not involve any factors of undue hazard to the public using the crossing either along the street or along the railroad tracks; that a separation of grades at such crossing would not be practicable because the cost thereof would greatly exceed the practicable value of such separation, and that the expenditure of public funds to construct a grade separation at the Tempa Avenue location would impair the timely development of other scheduled separation projects.

Evidence in support of the proposed grade crossing was submitted by applicant through four witnesses: an engineer in charge of the engineering and economic planning of the street system of the western portion of the San Fernando Valley area; a traffic engineer in charge of regional traffic studies for the City of Los Angeles, a representative of the City's Planning Department, and the Los Angeles City Councilman for the district in which the proposed crossing is located. These witnesses presented evidence to the following effect:

1. Tampa Avenue has been designated as a major highway on the master plan of highways of the City of los Angeles since 1934.

Corbin Avenue in going to and from their jobs; that there is other business traffic to and from the plant; that the general area in the vicinity of the plant is in the process of being developed commercially or industrially; that traffic in the area of Corbin Avenue and on Nordoff Streets is heavy, particularly in the mornings and late afternoons, and that the opening of a crossing at Tampa Avenue would provide an additional means of access to the area and would thereby be a convenience.

The granting of the application was opposed by the Southern Pacific Company. The company did not disagree with applicant concerning the need for a crossing at Tampa Avenue. Its opposition was mainly on the grounds that the opening of a grade crossing at Tampa Avenue would interfere with the operation of the company's trains; that the operation of the trains would interfere with the movement of highway traffic along Tampa Avenue; that the crossing should be in the form of a grade separation, and that applicant should bear the entire costs of the grade separation.

At the hearings on this matter, the Jouthern Facific Company filed a petition to consolidate this application with another application, Application No. 49688, by which the City of Los Angeles seeks the establishment of a grade crossing of Haskell Avenue over the Coast Line. The company also requested the Commission to institute an investigation on its own motion to determine what crossings in the San Fernando Valley area should be separated and what crossings should be constructed at grade.

This same petition was also filed during hearings on Application No. 49688. It was denied by the decision in that matter, Decision No. 75793, dated June 17, 1969. No further action thereon is required here.

A. 50269 - LR The Southern Pacific Company presented evidence through three witnesses: the company's assistant terminal superintendent for the San Fernando Valley area, an industrial agent, and a public projects engineer for the company. These witnesses testified in substance as follows: 1. The portion of the Southern Pacific Company's Coast Line which runs through the San Fernando Valley area is a single track line. It has no sidings of sufficient size for trains to pass. Auxiliary trackage consists mainly of industrial spurs and drill track. 2. Thirteen to seventeen mainline trains of 3/4 to 1 1/2 miles in length operate deily along the Coast Line. In addition, a train which is engaged in local hauling within the San Fernando Valley area makes two trips a day. 3. The mainline trains travel at speeds of about 60 miles an hour except when restricted to lesser speeds because of traffic conditions. 4. The operations of the local train are coordinated as much as possible with the movement of the through trains in order to avoid delays to said trains. They are also coordinated with the needs of the industries which are served by the local trains. 5. Despite the efforts toward coordination and avoidance of delays, delays to the mainline trains occur. Where the delays cause stoppages of trains over grade crossings, highway traffic is also delayed. The breaking of stopped trains, in order to avoid highway traffic delays of more than five minutes, causes further and substantial delays in the train movements. 6. A condition which requires a train to reduce speed within the San Fernando Valley area may cause delays to following trains by activating block signals which warn the following trains to reduce speed or to stop and thereafter to proceed slowly. A train delay in the San Fernando Valley area may thus affect the movement of following trains miles distant. Highway traffic over grade crossings is also delayed. Where the trains are operating under reduced speed requirements, their movement through grade crossings is slowed, thereby delaying highway traffic at said crossings. -8With reference to the assertions of representatives of the City of Los Angeles that the City does not possess the funds to underwrite the cost of constructing a grade separation structure at this time, the position of the Jourhern Pacific Company was to the contrary. In this regard the attorney for the Southern Pacific Company developed that the representations concerning the nonavailability of funds were based on the City's allocation of funds to the councilmanic district for the area in which the sought crossing is located, and that the Los Angeles City Council as a whole had not considered whether the City could bear the costs of a grade separation of Tampa Avenue.

The attorney also declared in effect that the situation here presented corresponds to that which grew out of the Southern Pacific Company's extension of its line known as the Palmdale-Colton Cutoff. In connection with said extension the Southern Pacific Company, as the moving party, was required to construct a number of grade separations at its own expense. The attorney asserted that as the moving party in this matter, the City should be required to bear the full cost of a grade separation at the proposed crossing.

Decisions No. 69365, dated October 26, 1965, in Application No. 45589; Decision No. 70064, dated December 7, 1965, in Case No. 8214, and Decisions Nos. 70210 and 70211, dated January 11, 1966, in Case No. 3214.

The application was opposed also by the Transportation Division of the Commission's staff. A staff engineer submitted and explained a report which he had prepared to show that in terms of the costs of opening a grade separated crossing at Tampa Avenue and in terms of the traffic volume which applicant estimated the crossing will carry by 1930, the crossing is similar to other crossings in southern California for which grace separations have been authorized by the Commission during the past ten years. In the rejort he also set forth data purporting to show that the traffic volume over the Tampa Avenue crossing will exceed that over the crossings for which grade separations were constructed in connection with the Palmeale-Colton Cutoff. According to the engineer's calculations, the benefits to be derived per dollar spent for the construction of a grade separation at Tampa Avenue would exceed the average benefits from the grade separations of the Palmdale-Colton Cutoff and would be about half of that of the other crossings for which the Commission has authorized grade separations.

The engineer listed what he considered to be hazards that would result from the opening of a grade crossing at Tampa Avenue. We said that, as a concentration of industry adjacent to the railroad tracks develops, visibility of approaching trains will be restricted for motorists crossing the tracks; that with the growth of industries along the tracks increased train traffic to serve said industries can be expected; that the increased train traffic traffic can result in celesys to motorists which will cause the

motorists to take unoue risks in crossing the tracks, and that even with automatic gates as protection, crossing accidents can be expected, inasmuch as studies show that motorists drive through the gates and collide with trains, or they collide with other motorists who have stopped for the gates. He said that the studies show, furthermore, that about one third of the accidents at grade crossings occur when trains are not present. He concluded from this circumstance that the disruption from the flow of traffic by the slowing of motor vehicles at grade crossings is itself an important cause of accidents at grade crossings. He said that the best automatic protection available is not an appropriate solution for the elimination of accidents at highway crossings of main line railroad tracks, and he asserted that in his opinion all crossings of main line railroad tracks by major and secondary highways should be at separated grades.

With reference to the financing of a grade separation at Tampa Avenue, it was the position of the engineer that little if any weight should be given to the assertions of applicant that the City can not finance a grade separation for ten years or more. He said it appears that the City has not fully explored the possibility of obtaining federal funds for the project, or of raising the necessary money by special assessment district bonds and/or general obligation bonds as some other cities in southern California have done. In general the engineer declared that grade separation projects for new crossings should be financed by such means.

Discussion

In a proceeding of this kind the paramount questions to be decided are: (a) whether the public need is sufficient to warrant the establishment of the sought crossing, and (b) whether the type of crossing which is proposed, and the protection thereof, is consistent with the requirements of public safety.

Bearing on the question of the public need for the crossing, we note the development of Tampa Avenue as a major highway across the Jan Fernando Valley; the fact that Tampa Avenue will serve as a connecting link to, from and between the Ventura, Simi and Whitnall Freeways; the substantial volume of vehicular traffic which is now being corried by the edjacent streets, Corbin Avenue and Reseda Boulevard, and the increasing volume of vehicular traffic to capacity loads which is expected for Corbin Avenue and Reseda Boulevard unless Tampa Avenue is opened. If Tampa Avenue is to fulfill its designed function as a principal artery for the movement of the public ecross the Jan Fernando Valley, it must provide for a continuous flow of traffic along its route. The continuity of its route cannot be broken by the Southern Pacific Company's Coast Line, as at present. We find that public need requires the establishment of a crossing of Tampa Avenue over the railroad tracks of the Couthern Pacific Company's Coast Line.

In considering how the crossing should be accomplished, we must concur with the representatives of the Commission's staff and of the Southern Pacific Company that the crossing

convenience, a crossing at separated grade is underiably superior to a crossing at grade inasmuch as it permits a continuous flow both of highway traffic and of railroad traffic. This consideration is particularly apropos when the highway which is involved is a major highway, the purpose of which is the movement of substantial volumes of traffic expeditiously. Inasmuch as the crossing which is involved herein is that of a major highway over the main line of a major railroad, we find that public convenience requires that the crossing be by separated grade.

From the standpoint of public safety also, a grade separation is superior to a crossing at grade. The avoidance of accidents at a grade crossing basically involves the timely halting of highway traffic ocross the crossing while the crossing is occupied or is about to be occupied by a train. Even though the crossing may be protected by warning signals of the highest type such as are being proposed by the applicant in this matter, accidents may still result as a consequence of motorists' disregard of or failure to give proper heed to the signals. On the other hand, the divergence in routes between highway traffic and railroad traffic which is accomplished by a grade separation eliminates a need for the halting of highway traffic upon the approach and occupancy of a crossing by a train. Hence, the possibility of collision between highway and railroad traffic is removed and the possibility of highway collisions as a result of the halting of the highway craffic is also removed. Inasmuch

¥,,

as Tampa Avenue, as a major highway, will carry a substantial volume of traffic, and inasmuch as the Coast Line is the main line of the Southern Pacific Company and carries a number of high speed trains, we find that public safety requires the crossing of Tampa Avenue to be by separated grade.

Nevertheless, and notwithstanding our findings that the crossing of Tampa Avenue should be at separated grade, applicant's request for authority to extend Tampa Avenue over the Southern Pacific Company's tracks at grade should not be denied. As the record shows, the planning and construction of the type of structure that is needed for a grade separation requires about three and one-half years' time. Additional time will be required for the funding of the project. In all, it appears that the separation project will require approximately five years to be brought to completion. The deferral of any action to alleviate the traffic conditions in the meantime by the establishment of a crossing of Tampa Avenue over the Southern Pacific Company's tracks is unwarranted and would not give needed recognition to the requirements of the public for an additional traffic artery across the San Fernando Valley.

Furthermore, it appears that such action cannot be justified on the ground of public safety. The evidence is clear that in the absence of a crossing at Tampa Avenue, the volume of traffic along Corbin Avenue and Reseda Boulevard will increase

materially during the next several years. With respect to Corbin Avenue, particularly, we note that applicant has estimated that by 1980 the volume of traffic along Corbin Avenue will be 100 percent in excess of that street's designed capacity. It appears, moreover, that in the alternative much of the increase in traffic via Corbin Avenue would move via Tampa Avenue where the sought crossing is established. In other words, if the sought crossing at Tampa Avenue is not established, there will be a heavy concentration of traffic moving across the Corbin Avenue grade crossing. If the sought crossing is authorized, there will be a substantial diversion of Corbin Avenue traffic to the Tampa Avenue grade crossing. In either case, it appears that the movement of highway traffic across the Jouthern Pacific Company's tracks will be subject to hazerds incidental to a grade crossing. However, we must agree with the contentions of the City of Los Angeles that a denial of the sought authority will result in greater hazards to the public than would result if the sought crossing were established. Taking this aspect of the matter into account, we believe our action must be determined by what will enhance the public safety until the more desirable kind of construction, a grade separation structure, can be built. Me find that the opening of the sought crossing is consistent with the requirements of public safety.

From the standpoint both of public convenience and necessity and of public safety we find that the establishment of the sought grade crossing of Tampa Avenue should be authorized.

In making this finding we do not accept the contentions of the Southern Pacific Company and of the staff representatives that our actions in the Palmdale-Colton Cutoff matters should be controlling here, with the result that the City of Los Angeles would be required to open the crossing at Tampa Avenue by a grade separation structure. The necessity for meeting the public's requirements for an expansion of the highway system in the San Fernando Valley area, which requirements can not be reasonably left unsatisfied until the construction of a grade separation, distinguish this proceeding from said matters.

Cur action in here authorizing the sought crossing of Tampa Avenue at grade is taken solely as an interim measure to enable the City of Los Angeles to meet its immediate needs for an effective expansion of its highway system in the San Fernando Valley. However, the needs of the crossing require that a grade separation be established as soon as practicable. As a condition to the exercise of the authority hereinafter granted, the City will be required to initiate prompt action toward the establishment of said grade separation structure and thereafter to proceed with due diligence until said grade separation structure has been completed and opened to public use.

A further condition which needs be imposed deals with the matter of costs. As previously pointed out in the presentation of the Commission's staff representatives, the establishment of the grade crossing hereinafter authorized will make the subsequent construction of a grade separation structure eligible for State funds towards defraying the costs thereof. As a consequence applicant's share of the costs of said grade separation

structure will become less than half of the total costs involved. Another consequence is that the interim establishment of the grade crossing will permit the City to meet its needs for an enlargement of its highway system in the San Fernando Valley while deferring the expenditures necessary to the construction of a grade separation. On the other hand such benefits as the City will realize from the deferment of the separation will be offset in part by any inflation of the costs of the separation, particularly upon the costs of right of way. Since the State will be called upon to share in the costs of the grade separation, the State fund will be adversely affected also by inflationary increases in right-of-way costs. The state fund should not be unreasonably prejudiced in this respect. To avoid such result the City will be expected, in connection with its construction of the grade crossing, to acquire the right of way necessary to the subsequent construction of the grade separation. Our order will be conditioned accordingly.

Findings:

- 1. Tampa Avenue is being developed as a major highway across the western portion of the San Fernando Valley area. Said area is growing rapidly both as a residential area and as an important commercial/industrial area.
- 2. Tampa Avenue will also provide an important link between the Ventura, Simi and Whitnall Freeways.
- 3. Adjacent highways providing crossings or substantial crossings of the San Fernando Valley area are Corbin Avenue, a secondary highway one-half mile west of Tampa Avenue, and Reseda Boulevard, a major highway one mile east of Tampa Avenue.

Assuming the opening of the Tampa Avenue crossing, as sought, projected counts of traffic volume across Corbin Avenue, Reseda Boulevard and Tampa Avenue crossings are as follows:

	Cars per Day		
	1970	1980	
Corbin Avenue Reseda Doulevard Tampa Avenue	17,000 20,000 15,500	27,000 30,000 26,000	

Thirteen to seventeen high-speed trains operate along the Southern Pacific Company's Coast Line daily. In addition a local-hauling train makes 10. two trips daily within the San Fernando Valley area.

A. 50260 - NV/HV/ * Conclusions The application of the City of Los Angeles for authority to establish a crossing of Tampa Avenue over the mainline tracks of the Southern Pacific Company's Coast Line should be authorized, subject to the conditions hereinafter specified. ORDER IT IS ORDERED that: 1. The City of Los Angeles is authorized to construct a crossing of Tampa Avenue across the tracks of the Coast Line of the Southern Pacific Company in accordance with the plans set forth in Exhibit No. 2 in this proceeding. Said crossing is to be identified as Crossing No. E-448.2. Construction of said crossing shall be equal to Standard No. 2 of General Order No. 72. There shall be installed at the crossing four Standard No. S flashing light signals (General Order No. 75-B). Two of these signals shall be placed at the edge of the pavement and two shall be placed on median islands, one on each side of the crossing. Said signals shall be supplemented by automatic crossing gates. Backlights may be omitted on the signals placed on the medians. There shall also be installed or provided advance warning signs and double clearance and railroad RIR pavement markings. The cost of installing and of maintaining the grade crossing protection shall be borne by the City of Los Angeles: pursuant to and in accordance with Section 1202.2 of the Public Utilities Code. -22-

A. 50269 - JR * 4. The City shall bear 100 percent of all construction costs of the crossing and approaches and the maintenance cost of the crossing outside of lines two feet outside the rails. 5. The Southern Pacific Company shall bear 100 percent of the maintenance costs of the crossing within lines two feet outside of outside rails. The authority which is granted by Paragraph 1 above is subject to the following conditions: (a) Not later than July 1, 1972, the City of Los Angeles shall apply to this Commission for authority for the construction of a grade separation structure at the crossing of Tampa Avenue over the railroad tracks of the Southern Pacific Company's Coast Line and shall thereafter diligently take such action and/or pursue such steps as are necessary to bring to a completion a grade separation structure at the Tampa Avenue crossing of said tracks of the Southern Pacific Company's Coast Line. The City of Los Angeles shall undertake forthwith and shall diligently pursue actions to the end that it acquire as soon as practicable **(b)** the right of way necessary to the construction of the aforesaid grade separation structure and shall submit a progress report six months after the date hereof and each six months thereafter. The authority which is granted by the above Paragraph 1 of this order may not be exercised until the City of Los Angeles has first filed with the Commission its acceptance of the conditions set forth in the above Paragraph 6. 8. Within thirty days after completion of the work herein authorized, the City of Los Angeles and the Southern Pacific Company shall each notify the Commission in writing that said work has been completed. -23-

- 9. All crossing protection specified in this order shall be fully installed, completed, and placed in operable condition before the crossing is opened to the public.
- 10. The work herein specified is to be completed within one year after the effective date of this order unless an extension of time is granted by further order of the Commission.

The effective date of this order shall be twenty days after the date hereof.

		Dated at	San Prancisco	, California, this
day	o£	AUGUST	, 1969.	
				William Jones J.
				Augustan President
				Nicht Morrissey
			<i>س</i> ے	1 Detrum
				111 - 33

VICINITY MAP APPLICATION 110. 50269 CITY OF LOS ANGELES SAU FERUADOO KILLEY PROPOSED TAMPA AVELUSE PROPOSED GRADE Y-ING EXISTING GRADE E X-ING FLS-🔾 - EXISTING GRADE X-ING YIITH STO. NO. & FLS WITH AUTO. GATES EXISTING CROSSING WITH ISPARATED GRADES SCALE: 10 - 1.18 MILES san fernando <mark>i i</mark>missióu Granada Hills Reservoir DEVONSHIRE Chatsworth SAMPEAMANDO VALLEY PAIR GROUNDS LASSEN CLYD E PÁYSKÁJSKY KRTOTIO N PERNANDO VALLEY STATE COLLEGE PROFOSE D CROSSING CLEIZ A-50229 MORTHNIDGE MOSPITAL EL701 S Winnetka SATICOY Reseda Canoga Park WAY SHERMAN Los والماء برويم 150713 ERWIN neeneatiboat and Septilizeda Flori Control 1913 - Saiste Encino

Appendix A, Decision No.