

ORIGINAL

Decision 96-11-005 November 6, 1996

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Application of)
William S. Vaughan d.b.a. Kids Koach)
For certificate of public convenience and necessity to operate a children's shuttle service as a Passenger Stage within the areas of San Diego County, between locations as requested by the child's parents.)

Application 96-04-031
(Filed April 15, 1996;
amended July 26, 1996)

INTERIM OPINION

William S. Vaughan (applicant) an individual requests authority pursuant to Public Utilities (PU) Code § 1031, et seq., to establish and operate as a passenger stage corporation (PSC) an on-call service to transport children at or below the 12th-grade level, between points and places within designated zip codes in and around San Diego County as shown in Exhibit "A" attached to the application. Applicant proposes to transport children, to a variety of places (including day care facilities), residences, private or public schools, after school activities, field trips, and to other locations, such as music, dancing, sports, medical or dental appointments, and other points and places requested by the passengers' parents.

Applicant proposes to provide on-call, door-to-door service Monday through Saturday between 6:30 a.m. and 6:30 p.m. using a seven-passenger van. The unaudited balance sheet indicates total assets of \$382,400, total liabilities of \$167,500, and a net worth of \$214,000. The proposed tariff, containing the rules and fares is shown in Exhibits "B" and "C." The proposed fares are comparable to current fares charged for similar services and are reasonable. The applicant proposes that the destinations will be set primarily by the parent, guardian, or adult supervisor of the child passenger. The rates or charges to be assessed are

JANUARY 1990

Decision 86-11-005 November 6, 1986

entirely based on the collection of individual fares and the service is between fixed termini.

The applicant alleges that a large number of the families within these cities have few, if any, alternative choices for transporting their children. Applicant will provide an alternative transportation system which will be available when other systems are not convenient, time saving, economical, viable, or safe.

Discussion

Applicant's proposed operations fall within the definition of a PSC as defined in PU Code § 226.¹ A PSC is defined as:

(E)very corporation or person engaged as a common carrier, for compensation, in the ownership, control, operation, or management of any passenger stage over any public highway in this state between fixed termini or over a regular route except those, 98 percent or more of whose operations, as measured by total route mileage operated, which are exclusively within the limits of a single city, or whose operations consist solely in the transportation of bona fide pupils attending an institution of learning between their homes and that institution, (PU Code § 226(a).)²

PSCs are not permitted to operate without first having obtained a certificate of public convenience and necessity from the Commission authorizing the proposed operation; (PU Code §

¹ The Commission has previously granted interim authority to similarly specialized transportation services for children to operate as PSC carriers (see e.g., D.95-108-56)

² Transportation of any pupils to and from a public or private school, or to and from activities of a public or private school, where the fare charged for the transportation is not computed, collected, or demanded on an individual fare basis is not subject to a PSC designation. (Id., § 226(b).)

1031, et seq.) The proposed youth transportation service must be categorized as a PSC because the applicant proposes to operate as a common carrier, engaged in transportation for compensation over the public highways of this state, between fixed termini on an individual fare basis.

The Vehicle Code contains provisions concerning certain specified forms of transportation of school children. Vehicle Code § 233 defines "bus" as a vehicle designed, used, or transported, maintained, for carrying more than 10 persons, including the school driver. A "youth bus" is any bus, other than a school bus, designed for and when actually carrying not more than 16 persons and the driver, used to transport children at or below the 12th-grade level directly from a public or private school to an organized nonschool-related youth activity within 25 miles of the school, or directly from a location which provides the organized nonschool-related activity to a public or private school within 25 miles of that location. (Veh. Code § 680.) A school bus is defined in Vehicle Code § 545, generally as any motor vehicle designed, used, or maintained for the transportation of any school pupil at or below the 12th-grade level to or from a public or private school or to or from public or private school activities. Passenger vehicles designed for and carrying not more than 10 people (including the driver) are exempted from Vehicle Code § 545. A school pupil activity bus is any motor vehicle, other than a school bus, operated by a common carrier, or by and under the exclusive jurisdiction of a publicly owned transit system, or by a passenger charter-party carrier, used under a contractual agreement between a school and carrier to transport school pupils at or below the 12th-grade level to or from a public or private school activity, or used to transport pupils to or from certain residential schools, when the pupils are received and discharged at off-highway locations where a parent or adult designated by the

parent is present to accept the pupil or place the pupil on the bus. (Veh. Code § 546.) The application contemplates the use of a van which generally accommodates six passengers and a driver and is therefore, exempt from the "bus" designation. There is no contractual arrangement proposed between the applicant and a school. The applicant also contemplates not only the transportation of children at or below the 12th-grade level from a school to a nonschool-related youth activity within 25 miles of the school, but additionally the transportation of children to and from destinations that have no relation to school and which may exceed a 25-mile radius. Therefore, it appears that the applicant's proposed services exceed those of a school bus, a school pupil activity bus, or a youth bus.

Legislative requirements pertaining to "traditional" forms of for-hire transportation of children.

The Vehicle Code contains provisions concerning the safe operations and licensing requirements for school bus, school pupil activity bus, and youth bus operations. For example, no person under the age of 18 years may drive pupils in a school bus. (Veh. Code § 12516.) Vehicle Code § 12517 concerns the licensing qualifications for school bus and pupil activity bus drivers. Vehicle Code § 12523 concerns the licensing requirements for youth bus operators, including successful completion of a driver training course consisting of 10 hours of classroom instruction and a minimum of 10 hours of behind-the-wheel training in a vehicle used as a youth bus, as well as refresher courses each 12 months, and a driver certificate issued only to qualified applicants who have successfully completed examinations administered by the Department of California Highway Patrol (CHP) and the Department of Motor Vehicles (DMV). Every person who operates a school bus is additionally required to successfully

complete an examination on first aid practices. (Veh. Code section § 12522) The Education Code contains certain provisions that do not duplicate the Vehicle Code with respect to the school bus, school pupil activity bus, and youth bus designations. (See e.g., Ed. Code §§ 39830, 39830.17) The Education Code provides various non-safety requirements for school bus operations, including that the CHP shall adopt regulations relating to the safe operations of school buses which shall include requiring school district governing boards to include in their school bus driver training programs the proper actions to be taken in the event that a school bus is hijacked. (Ed. Code §§ 39831; see also, Ed. Code §§ 39823, 39833, 39834, 39838) The Education Code also provides for the instruction in emergency procedures for all elementary and secondary level pupils who are transported in a school bus. (Id., § 39831.5) As discussed above, the Legislature has enacted numerous provisions for the safety of pupils being transported to and from their homes to schools and/or to or from school/non-school related activities or vice versa. The Legislature has authorized us to ensure the safe operations of PSCs. The Legislature has also enacted numerous other provisions to assist the public in finding safe and healthful child care arrangements. (See e.g., Health & Safety Code §§ 1596 et seq.; Ed. Code §§ 8171 et seq.)

The proposed service is a nontraditional form of for-hire transportation of children.

The youth transportation service proposed by this applicant is within the PSC designation. The applicant proposes to use vehicles that can accommodate seven or fewer people. The applicant does not intend to enter into a contract with schools; rather, the applicant contemplates contracts for transportation with the parent or adult guardian of the youth, and payment of the fare on an individual fare basis. Thus, neither the school bus

nor school pupil activity bus designations appear relevant to the proposed service. As noted above, the proposed activities contemplated by this applicant exceed the youth bus definition. A variety of this applicant's proposed services are not statutorily defined, e.g., transportation concerning infants and other nonpupils; and transportation that is not based on a school-oriented classification (e.g., transportation to or from school or transportation of pupils to nonschool related or after-school activities).

In order to ensure the safety and general welfare of the public and the cultivation of this fledgling industry, we have issued an Rulemaking (R) 95208-002, so that this applicant and other interested parties have a forum to discuss and develop the safety measures that should ultimately be adopted with respect to this unique new form of PSC service.

We believe it is clear that this unique service is aimed at a particular class of people: minors. It is reasonable to ensure that the children are transported safely by people knowledgeable of the special requirements and needs of infants and children. It is also reasonable that parents and adult care providers designated by parents, be permitted to accompany their children and that adults (who are not accompanying child passengers and who are not designated by the parents to care for) their children be excluded from this transportation service. (The PU Code prohibits the granting of any unreasonable preference or advantage, or prejudice or disadvantage. (PU Code § 453.) For all of the reasons discussed throughout this decision, it does not appear that the service offered here, nor the rates to be charged for this service, are unreasonable. There appears to be an increasing public need for reliable and safer transportation of unaccompanied children. We also note an environmental advantage of transporting many people in one vehicle which diminishes the need for multiple vehicles to

transport the same people. Accordingly, we shall grant this operator interim authority for a period of no longer than two years. This interim authority shall expire when the Commission issues a final decision in R:95-08-002. However, the authority if granted today shall be limited to the transportation of unaccompanied children in the kindergarten through the 12th-grade level of school. Applicant is authorized to transport children under the kindergarten-grade level when such children are accompanied by a parent, legal guardian, or parent authorized adult. In order for us to consider extending this authority to the operator to transport infants and children below the kindergarten-grade level, the operator must demonstrate in a different proceeding which could be through a petition to modify this decision, that it and each and every one of its drivers who will transport such young children or each of its employees accompanying such driver is a duly licensed day care provider in good standing with the Department of Social Services of the State of California.

In addition to the usual PSC compliance requirements, we shall also require this operator to establish several programs to ensure the safety of its children passengers. We take official notice of Vehicle Code § 12523 (b) which requires driver training for youth bus drivers. Although the applicant does not propose youth bus operation, we believe that in the interim pending our final decision in R:95-08-002, requirements similar to Vehicle Code § 12523 (b) would better ensure the safety of the children passengers. We shall also require a diligent search of the applicant's and every one of its drivers' records and drivers' assistants' records. The search shall include, but not limited to, a background review administered by the Department of Justice through its Trust Line Unit to ensure that neither applicant nor any of its drivers or drivers' assistants have criminal histories or unsafe driving or child care records. Applicant must

additionally establish a preventative maintenance program which shall include, but not limited to, inspection of the brake and suspension systems, components, and leaks, brake adjustments, fuel lines, wipers, lights, steering and suspension systems, tires and wheels, and safety devices for all vehicles used in this service. Applicant shall maintain records of these programs in its office, subject to annual inspection by Commission staff pursuant to Part 46 of General Order (GO) 158-A16.

Pursuant to the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, Rule 21(k) the applicant has mailed a notice that this application has been filed with the Commission to all city and county governmental entities and regional transportation planning agencies within whose boundaries passengers will be loaded or offloaded. Notice of filing of the application appeared in the Commission's Daily Calendar on April 17, 1996. Applicant frequently published a notice of his proposed service in the North County Times. No protests were filed. Applicant appears to possess the financial responsibility necessary to provide the proposed service based on the financial data submitted in their application. It appears that the proposed service will provide a convenience to the public and that there is a public necessity for this type of operation in the location applicant proposes to serve. The application should be granted for the interim period.

Findings of Fact

1. Applicant proposes to perform an on-call, door-to-door service between points and places in designated zip codes in and around San Diego County with one (1) six-passenger van.

2. Applicant proposes to transport only persons at or below the 12th grade level.

3. The primary passengers the applicant proposes to transport are children and infants. Through its first line of effort to ensure that infants and children are a specific class of people, generally designated as minors, who are unable to drive or unsafe to drive.

5. Minors do not have the same availability of transportation alternatives that are available to adults.

6. Federal motor vehicle safety regulations require various safety restraint systems based on the age and weight of an infant or child passenger.

7. The State of California requires people operating child care facilities, as defined in the Health and Safety Code, §1596, to hold a valid license issued by the California Department of Social Services.

8. In the case of child care providers, the State of California requires the maintenance of an adult to child ratio no greater than 1:4 for the care of children under age two years, 1:12 for the care of children between the ages of 2 to 16 years, and no greater than 1:15 for children between the years of 16 to 18 years.

9. Minors are a particularly vulnerable group of people.

10. Children in primary and secondary schools are generally minors; however, some students in secondary school are 18 years of age or older.

11. Minors are a class of people for whom it is reasonable to provide a specialized transportation service for minors.

12. It is reasonable that specialized transportation service for minors are available to all students at or below the 12th grade level.

13. It is reasonable to permit parents, legal guardians, or adults designated by parents or guardians to care for their children or to accompany children being transported by a PSCAS.

14. It is reasonable for PSCAS authorized to perform this unique child-oriented transportation service to deny or not provide transportation to adults not accompanying children.

15. The Unit conducts background reviews of child care providers and babysitters.

16. It is reasonable for the applicant to charge a special fare to adults accompanying children being transported by this specialized service.

17. Applicant's proposed operations fall within the definition of passenger stage corporation as defined in PU Code § 226.

18. Applicant proposes to use a vehicle that is designed to seat not more than nine persons, including the driver.

19. Applicant proposes to transport children not only directly from school to organized nonschool-related activities within a 25-mile radius, but also to and from a variety of other places and activities.

20. The Vehicle and Education Codes provide for specific age, educational, and driving requirements for school bus, school pupil activity bus, and youth bus drivers. The Vehicle Code further provides for criminal background checks for these drivers.

21. Applicant's proposed operations exceed those contemplated by the Vehicle Code and specifically are not school bus, school pupil activity bus, or youth bus operations.

22. The people of the State of California have an interest in the safe transportation and general health, safety, and welfare of children being transported by PSCs.

23. The service being offered is a unique type of transportation of children in that it contemplates children as the primary passengers. It is not an arrangement made between the operator and a school district and it is not necessarily school- or pupil-oriented.

24. During the time that unaccompanied children are under the care of applicant's drivers, those drivers will be providing care for those children.

25. The California Department of Justice, through its Trust Line Unit, conducts background reviews of child care providers and/or babysitters.

26. Because the State of California has recognized the particular vulnerability of children age 4 or younger by the use of special vehicle restraint systems for their transportation, by requiring providers in business for the care of young children to meet certain age and health requirements, and by requiring a certain adult to child ratio in child care settings, we shall not authorize the unaccompanied transportation of such infants and children without a further showing by the applicant that it and all of his employees who would transport or assist the driver in the transportation of such unaccompanied infants and young children satisfy the requirements established by the State of California, Department of Social Services for child care providers. We shall, however, permit the transportation of children under the kindergarten-grade level when such children are accompanied by parents, guardians, or noncarrier affiliated child care providers designated by a parent or guardian to care for that parent's or guardian's child(ren).

27. It is reasonable to require the applicant to require each of his drivers and/or employees engaging in the transportation of children passengers to have successfully completed a cardiopulmonary respiration course for infants and children and to successfully complete annual refresher courses.

28. It is reasonable to require the applicant to require each of its drivers to have successfully completed an infant and child first-aid course and to successfully complete annual refresher course.

29. Applicant possesses the financial responsibility and equipment necessary to provide the proposed service.

30. Pursuant to the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, Rule 21(k), applicant has mailed a notice that the application has been filed with the Commission to all city and county governmental entities and regional transportation planning agencies within whose boundaries passengers will be loaded or

unloaded. Applicant published a notice of their proposed service in the North County Times and no protest has been filed in this application. Applicant demonstrated that there is a public convenience and necessity for the proposed service and require the issuance of a certificate.

Applicant's proposed service should result in the reduction of automobiles, traffic, fuel, pollutants, and noise which would be an environmental benefit. All of his employees who are authorized to transport of such unaccompanied

Applicant's operations fall within the definition of a passenger stage corporation as defined by PU Code § 226.

Applicant must comply with all of the Commission's requirements of a PSC, including but not limited to the insurance requirements of GO Series 101, compliance with the CHP safety rules, enrollment in the "Full Notice Program" of the DMV, compliance with Workers' Compensation laws, and the PSC rules and regulations contained in GO 158A.

3. Applicant's proposed operations are not school bus, school pupil activity bus, or youth bus operations.

4. Authorizing a specialized transportation service for infants and children as a class is lawful and nondiscriminatory because of the particularly vulnerable nature of being a minor person, the lack of transportation alternatives available to minors, and the overriding interest for society in ensuring the protection and safety of minors.

5. In order to avoid discrimination of students attending secondary schools, it is reasonable for applicant to offer the proposed service to all students and children at or below the 12th-grade level.

6. It is lawful an adult parent, guardian or adult supervisor of a child passenger to accompany a passenger at or below the 12th-grade level being transported by this operator.

17. It is lawful for this operator to refuse transportation to adults who are not accompanying infant and child passengers. It is lawful for applicant to charge a reasonable fee to an adult accompanying an infant or child being transported.

9. Applicant should be granted interim authority, subject to the conditions specified herein. Such authority shall expire no later than two years or upon issuance of a final decision in R.95-08-002, whichever event occurs first, unless otherwise ordered.

10. The people of the State of California have an interest in protecting and ensuring the safety of infants and children and it is reasonable to require applicant and applicant's employees to satisfy requirements similar to those imposed by the Vehicle and Education Codes for school bus and youth bus operators.

11. A motion to file a late protest was filed and was withdrawn. A public hearing is not necessary.

12. No protest was filed and there is a public need and convenience to be served by this proposed service. This decision should be effective today.

INTERIM ORDER

IT IS ORDERED that:

1. An interim certificate of public convenience and necessity is granted to William S. Vaughan (applicant), an individual, authorizing him to operate for no longer than two years from the date this decision is issued, or until a final decision is issued by the Commission in Rulemaking 95-08-002 as a passenger stage corporation as defined in Public Utilities (PU) Code § 226, between the points and over the routes set forth in Appendix PSC-10434 to transport unaccompanied children at or below the 12th-grade level to the kindergarten grade level. However, the authority is limited to the transportation of unaccompanied

children in the kindergarten through the 12th grade level of school and children of any age accompanied by their parent/guardian or noncarrier affiliated adult supervisor designated by the parent/guardian of child to whom an adult accompanying an adult

Applicant shall: 2. Applicant should be granted a license to the conditions specified herein. Such authority shall expire

a. File a written acceptance of this certificate within 30 days after no later than two (2) days of this order is effective; otherwise

b. Establish the authorized service and file tariffs and timetables within 120 days after this order is effective. The Board is protecting and ensuring the safety of children and

c. State in his tariffs and timetables when service will start, allow at least 10 days of notice to the

Commission; and make timetables and tariffs effective 10 of more days after this order is effective. A public utility withdrawal

d. Comply with General Orders (GO) Series 101, 104, and 158, and the Department of the California Highway Patrol (CHP) safety rules? No protest will be filed and this decision should be effective today.

e. Comply with the controlled substance and alcohol testing certification program pursuant to PU Code § 1032.1 and General Order Series 158. IT IS ORDERED THAT

f. Maintain accounting records in conformity with the Uniform System of Accounts. An interim license is granted to the individual, authorizing him to operate for no longer than two

g. Remit to the Commission the Transportation Reimbursement Fee required by PU Code § 403 when a decision is issued by mail to do so, notified by mail to do so, passenger state corporation as defined in Public Utilities (PU)

Comply with, but not limited to, Vehicle Code §§ 12516, 12517, 12523, 12522, and 1808.1, 1808.2, 1808.3, 1808.4, 1808.5, 1808.6, 1808.7, 1808.8, 1808.9, 1808.10, 1808.11, 1808.12, 1808.13, 1808.14, 1808.15, 1808.16, 1808.17, 1808.18, 1808.19, 1808.20, 1808.21, 1808.22, 1808.23, 1808.24, 1808.25, 1808.26, 1808.27, 1808.28, 1808.29, 1808.30, 1808.31, and 1808.32. However, the 12th-grade students and youth bus to school bus and youth bus operators. the authority is limited to the transportation of unaccompanied

1. Comply with PU Code §§ 460.7 and 1043, relating to the Workers' Compensation laws of this state.

3. Applicant shall not transport any adult not accompanying a child passenger at or below the 12th grade level.

4. Applicant shall establish, prior to the commencement of operations, the following programs to ensure the safety of his passengers. The records of these programs shall be maintained in his office, subject to inspection by Commission staff pursuant to Part 6 of GO 158-A. Applicant shall:

a. Establish a driver training, safety, and education program before commencing operations. Each of applicant's drivers shall

successfully complete a driver training course administered by or at the direction of applicant, consisting of a minimum of 10 hours of classroom instruction covering applicable laws and regulations, defensive driving practices, and stress commuter driving and a minimum of 10 hours of behind-the-wheel training in a vehicle similar to those to be used in applicant's operations. Each of applicant's drivers shall receive two hours of refresher training during each 12 months of employment. In addition, the applicant must ensure that each driver successfully completes a minimum of 10 hours training in first aid, cardio-pulmonary respiration, health care, and education courses within 30 days of employment.

b. Prior to employment, perform a diligent search through the Trust Line Unit of the California Department of Justice and the California Child Care Resource and Referral Network as set forth in the Education Code § 8171 et seq., as

well as a search of each driver through the Department of Motor Vehicles's Automatic Name Index of each of his drivers records, which shall include a search of each employee and agent who will have contact with children passengers. Applicant's own records must also be researched and presented to the Commission staff for review.

c. Establish a preventative maintenance program which shall include, but not limited to, steering, tires, brakes, emergency systems, and fuel lines of each and every vehicle used in the performance of this passenger stage certificate service.

6. Applicant is authorized to begin operations only after all of the following provisions are fully complied with: (a) the Executive Director mails a notice to applicant that his evidence of insurance is on file with the Commission and (b) the CHP has approved the use of applicant's vehicles for service and all of the requirements in each of the ordering paragraphs are fulfilled.

7. The application is granted on an interim basis only, as stated in Ordering Paragraph 1.

This order is effective today.

Dated November 6, 1996, at San Francisco, California.

GREGORY CONLON
President

DANIEL Wm. FESSLER

JESSIE J. KNIGHT, JR.

HENRY M. DUQUE

JOSIAH L. NEEPER

Commissioners

Department of Justice and the California Child Care Resource and Referral Network as set forth in the Education Code § 8171 et seq., as

CERTIFICATE
OF
PUBLIC CONVENIENCE AND NECESSITY
AS A PASSENGER STAGE CORPORATION
PSC-10434

Showing passenger stage operative rights, restrictions,
limitations, exceptions, and privileges.

All changes and amendments as authorized by
the Public Utilities Commission of the State of California
will be made as revised pages or added original pages.

Issued under authority of Decision 96-11-005, dated November 6, 1996,
of the Public Utilities Commission of the State of California in
Application 96-04-031.

I N D E X

	<u>Page</u>
SECTION I. GENERAL AUTHORIZATIONS, RESTRICTIONS, LIMITATIONS, AND SPECIFICATIONS	2
SECTION II. SERVICE AREAS	3
SECTION III. ROUTE DESCRIPTION	3

SECTION I. GENERAL AUTHORIZATIONS, RESTRICTIONS, LIMITATIONS, AND SPECIFICATIONS.

William S. Vaughan, an individual, by the certificate of public convenience and necessity granted by the decision noted at the foot of the margin, is authorized to transport children who are at or below the 12th grade level to the kindergarten level unaccompanied by parents, guardians, and designated adult supervisors; and children below the kindergarten-grade level who are accompanied by at least a parent, guardian, or a noncarrier-affiliated adult supervisor designated by a parent or guardian; on an "on-call" door-to-door basis between the points described in Section II over and along the route described in Section III subject to the authority of this Commission to change or modify the route at any time and subject to the following provisions:

- a. When route descriptions are given in one direction, they apply to operation in either direction unless otherwise indicated.
- b. No passengers shall be transported except those having both points of origin and destination as described in Section II.
- c. The term "on-call" as used herein refers to service which is authorized to be rendered on the demands of a child passenger's parents, guardian, or noncarrier-affiliated adult supervisor designated by the parent or guardian arranging for a child passenger's transportation and for the transportation of an adult, if any, accompanying a child passenger. The tariffs shall show the conditions under which each authorized on-call service will be provided and shall include the description of the boundary of each fare zone.
- d. No passengers shall be transported from any airport to any point.

Issued by California Public Utilities Commission.

Decision 96-11-005, Application 96-04-031.

SECTION II. SERVICE AREAS.

Any point within these zip code zones:
92025, 92026, 92027, 92029, 92069

SECTION III. ROUTE DESCRIPTION.

ON -CALL SERVICE DOOR-TO-DOOR SERVICE

Commencing from any point within the areas described in Section II to any point within the areas described in Section II over the most convenient streets and highways.