

Chonda J. Nwamu

Mailing Address P.O. Box 7442 San Francisco, CA 94120

Street/Courier Address Law Department 77 Beale Street San Francisco, CA 94105

(415) 973-6650 Fax: (415) 973-0516 Internet: CJN3@pge.com

March 10, 2011

VIA ELECTRONIC (fnh@cpuc.ca.gov) AND FIRST-CLASS MAIL

Frederick Harris, Esq. California Public Utilities Commission 505 Van Ness Ave. San Francisco, CA 94102

Re:

PG&E's Redaction of Employee Names - Consumer Protection Safety

Division's Data Request Regarding the On-Line Activity of Former PG&E SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> Director William Devereaux

#### Dear Mr. Harris:

This letter is in response to your February 22, 2011 electronic communication to Lise Jordan regarding PG&E's submission of redacted documents in response to Consumer Protection Safety Division's (CPSD) Data Request regarding the on-line activity of former PG&E SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> Director William Devereaux. PG&E appreciates the opportunity to articulate the basis for its redaction of employee names on the responsive documents.

Your letter addresses two areas of concern related to PG&E's redaction of the responsive documents: 1) PG&E's redaction of PG&E employee names without also redacting names of non-PG&E employees; and 2) PG&E's redaction of all employee names as distinct from a more narrowly defined subgroup of PG&E employees. I will address each of these concerns.

PG&E's redaction practice with respect to employee names is based on careful consideration of the totality of the circumstances including PG&E's legal obligations to maintain employee privacy and to maintain a safe work environment for its employees. Consistent with this policy, PG&E determined that for this SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup>-related data submission, there was a strong and compelling safety-related basis to redact all employee names from the documents. Over the last year, PG&E employees and some customers have been the subject of escalating threats and acts of violence by some ant-SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> activists. In one instance, a PG&E employee who attended a SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> outreach event was later contacted at home by one of the attendees.

PG&E is prepared to submit employee declarations under penalty of perjury demonstrating that some employees are fearful for their safety and the safety of their families due to verbal abuse

Frederick Harris, Esq. March 10, 2011 Page 2

and threats of physical violence directed toward them and other PG&E employees. In light of this extraordinary climate within which organized protestors and individuals have made verbal threats and even engaged in some combative conduct due to an anti-SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> sentiment, it would be irresponsible for PG&E to make available to the public the names of its employees working on its SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> Program.

Further, given that the CPUC has complete unredacted access to the documents, there does not appear to be a legitimate public interest served by additionally disclosing employee names to the public given the hostile, anti-SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> environment. The California Public Records Act exempts from disclosure certain information where the public interest served by not disclosing the information clearly outweighs the public interest served by its disclosure. Cal. Gov. Code § 6255(a). PG&E has attached to this letter two logs documenting the escalation in verbal threats and general climate of hostility directed toward PG&E employees associated with the SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> Program. The first log documents the specific activities of EMF Network and Stop SmartMeters. (*See Attachment 1*). The second log is PG&E's Corporate Security record of threats and other anti-SmartMeter activity related to meter deployment. (*See Attachment 2*, Confidential per § 583¹). Based on the specific facts of this case, the public interest in the safety of PG&E employees and contractors outweighs the public interest that would be served by disclosure of employee names. Consistent with the public interest exemption included as part of the Public Records Act, PG&E concluded it had an obligation to redact all employee names from the documents given the threats targeted to its employees working on the SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> Project.

To address your additional concern regarding what you characterize as a "one-sided" redaction policy, PG&E's legal obligation to protect employee privacy and maintain a safe work environment does not extend beyond its employees. With that said, as a courtesy, PG&E considered redacting all individual names from the documents. However, PG&E did not redact the names of the anti-SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> individuals because their names appeared on documents copied from various *publicly-accessible* anti-SmartMeter<sup>TM</sup> blogs, posts and websites. Given that these individuals' names were already in the public space (unlike the PG&E and CPUC employee names), there was no basis to redact the names.

I hope this letter addresses your concerns. Feel free to contact me with any additional questions or concerns.

Sincerely,

Chonda J. Nwanzu

CJN/mbs

Attachments

Attachment 3, Corporate Security Investigation Log, includes the names of customers and, therefore, PG&E is submitting this Attachment as Confidential pursuant to Public Utilities Code Section 583.

# Log of EMF Network/Stop Smart Meters Organization Actions

## Category 1: Incidents related to Wellington and PG&E SmartMeter™ installers

Date/Time	Location	Description
7/26/10	Scotts Valley	Josh Hart video tapes and follows a WEI Exchanger
		in the field. Places video on public Internet.
7/27/10	Scotts Valley	Josh Hart follows and video tapes a WEI Exchanger
		in the field. Places video on public Internet.
8/26/10	Santa Cruz Crossdock	Protest at Crossdock preventing trucks from leaving
		yard. Police at scene, no arrests made.
8/27/10	Santa Cruz Crossdock	Protest at Crossdock preventing trucks from leaving
		yard. Police at scene, no arrests made.
8/30/10	Santa Cruz Crossdock	Protest at Crossdock preventing trucks from leaving
		yard. Police at scene, no arrests made.
10/28/10	Santa Rosa Crossdock	Protest at Crossdock. WEI had moved to another
•		location (Napa Crossdock).
11/2/10	Stinson Beach	Protesters block public road; Wellington leaves
		scene.
11/22/10	Santa Rosa Crossdock	Protest at Crossdock preventing trucks from leaving
A		yard. Police on scene, no arrests made.
12/27/10	Inverness	Confrontation in field with WEI employee and
		protestor.
12/29/10	Inverness	Large group of protesters blocking Sir Frances
		Drake Blvd. Police at scene and arrest protesters
		who are creating a public safety hazard.
1/11/11	Santa Rosa Crossdock	Protest at Crossdock preventing trucks from leaving
		yard. Police at scene, no arrests made.
3/2/11	San Francisco,	Protesters surround Wellington truck. Police at
	Marina district	scene, no arrests made.

Category 2: Incidents related to PG&E's Presence at Public City Council Meetings

Date/Time	Location	Description
9/15/10	Fairfax	PG&E representatives attended a "Listening
		Meeting", where Fairfax residents had an
		opportunity to voice their concerns in an open
		forum. Per the City Council's request, PG&E was
		prohibited from speaking at this event; rather,
		representatives were asked to remain silent. The
		passionate and often hostile crowd of
		approximately 75 people heckled PG&E employees.
9/29/10	Fairfax	Town of Fairfax hosted a special community
		meeting to allow PG&E representatives the
		opportunity to respond to the nearly one hundred
		SmartMeter-related questions raised at the open-
		mic "Listening Meeting" on 9/15. The passionate
		and often hostile crowd heckled PG&E employees.
11/30/10	Fairfax	Town of Fairfax hosted a third community meeting
		to allow PG&E representatives the opportunity to
		respond to the nearly one hundred SmartMeter-
		related questions raised at the open-mic "Listening
		Meeting" on 9/15. A second session was required
		to answer all of the questions that were posed. In
		approximately 5 instances, participants asked PG&E
	1111	employees in the audience to identify themselves.
	THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY O	When the PG&E employees did so, the residents
		directed threatening comments at them, including
	Walter Company of the	that the PG&E employees should be "tried and
		executed for capital murder" and that anti RF
		supporters would "defend their homes by any
		means necessary".

Date/Time	Location	Description
2/15/11	Sebastopol	PG&E representatives attended a Sebastopol City Council meeting where the Council was reconsidering a SmartMeter moratorium ordinance. PG&E representatives were ridiculed by the hostile crowd. When the City did not enact an ordinance against SmartMeters, the crowd became incensed, shouting from their seats. PG&E representatives were concerned for their personal safety, and were taunted by comments such as: "the only thing stopping PG&E from installing SmartMeter on my house is my shotgun." The Sebastopol Police Chief was in attendance and advised the PG&E representatives not to leave the building because he feared for their safety. He abruptly brought an Officer in to help them exit.
3/1/11	Monterey	At a Monterey public City Council meeting, PG&E representatives and a council member were verbally threatened by EMF Network members.  One individual stated to a council member that she "should just shoot you and the people from PG&E" and was escorted from the Council Chamber.  Following that, an EMF Network protestor spit at PG&E representatives and called one of them a "child molester."

Category 3: Incidents related to protests of the EMF Network/Stop SmartMeters Organization at PG&E Neighborhood Payment Centers.

Date/Time	Location	Description
12/09/10	PG&E Customer	15-20 protestors from EMF Network Group block
	Service Office, Santa	entrance to door, preventing customers from
	Rosa	accessing PG&E services and creating a safety
		hazard. PG&E closes office.
12/13/10	PG&E Customer	15-20 protesters from the EMF Network took over
The Address of the State of the	Service Office, Santa	the Santa Rosa Customer Service Center.
	Rosa	Protesters eventually left the interior of the center
		and blocked the doorway. Santa Rosa police
		responded, no arrests made. PG&E video tape
		captured the event.
12/14/10	PG&E Customer	San Rafael Customer Service office was
Parameter and the second secon	Service Office, San	overwhelmed by 15-20 EMF Network protestors.
	Rafael	Protesters left the office and blocked the doorway.
		San Rafael Police Department and PG&E Corporate
and the state of t		Security responded. No arrests were made. PG&E
		customer who was trying to get inside was
de militario de la companio del companio de la companio della comp		physically pushed by protesters. Video of this ran
		on broadcast news KTVU.
12/15/10	PG&E Customer	EMF Network Protest closed office down from 10
	Service Office,	am – 2 pm. Initially 5 protesters, but reduced to 3
	Capitola	after first hour. Protesters blocked the entrance
		with signage.

Category 4: Inflammatory Statements on Website <u>www.stopsmartmeters.org</u> which are directed toward PG&E employees:

### Samples include:

"PG&E Investors Still Cashing In- Perhaps We Need to Bring Cairo to Beale St"

SICK From SMARTMETERS says:

March 1, 2011 at 8:15 am

Excellent!! Lucky people, who have managed to keep CRIMINALS from TAMPERING with their meters, that are safe and work perfectly fine. Lucky people that not to be blasted with radiation 24 hours a day from CRIMINAL SMART METERS!!

The chains and locks need to also be wrapped on the CRIMINALS at PG&E, the CPUC, and Wellington Energy for DEPLOYING RADIATION EMITTING DEVICES on OUR HOMES AGAINST OUR WILL, WITHOUT our CONSENT, slowly KILLING our BABIES, CHILDREN, PETS, AND FAMILY!!!! WE DEMAND AN OPT\_OUT NOW!!!

THESE CRUEL PEOPLE need to be locked behind bars, until they learn that it is a WAR CRIME to expose innocent people to non-stop, close range, MICROWAVE RADIATION on our homes!!!

GO TO HELL to ANYONE THAT TRIES TO PUT ANOTHER SMART METER ON ANYONE'S HOME.

ANYONE THAT PUT A SINGLE SMART METER on a home, should step up, and begin removing them.

# Smart Meter Protesters Pack CPUC Meeting

Posted on February 25, 2011 by onthelevelblog

http://stopsmartmeters.files.wordpress.com/2011/02/img 3773.jpg

I have another list that also grows longer every day. It is a list of people willing to take personal direct action to stop this insanity. –Josh Hart

Terry L. Clark says:

February 16, 2011 at 9:01 pm

Pillage and Greed...and if that doesn't work. Execute. PG&E...

# 3 Responses to Why Stop Smart Meters?

1. Al n Horn says:

- 5 -

### February 15, 2011 at 6:02 pm

If Wellington/pg&e comes to my home to install, I will not even order them off my property. I will immediately arrest them and hold them until police come to haul them to jail and impound their vehicles. Trespassers with radiation devices beware and be very afraid.

# CONFIDENTIAL SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES CODE SECTION 583



Pacific Gas and Electric Company

Chronological Log of Investigation

87-167 7/89 Corporate Security

Case Num 10-1937	ber			Type of Complaint Miscellaneous: Complaint Type
Assigned S General, (	Security Repre Cases	sentative		Miscellaneous: Complaint Type  Date Assigned 11/12/2010
Date	Time	Activity	. v	Last Mod Last Mod Date
Redacted				Deda
		Redacted		
		Redact		Redacted Redact  Redacted Redacted
		Dedact		Redacted
		Redacted		Red
			Redacted	Redacted
		Redacted		

Page 1 Case # 10-1937

# CONFIDENTIAL SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES CODE SECTION 583



Pacific Gas and Electric Company

# Chronological Log of Investigation

87-167 7/89 Corporate Security

Case Number 10-1937	)r	the property of the second sec	Type of Complaint Miscellaneous: Complaint Type	of administration of the second secon
Assigned Se General, C	curity Representa ases	itive	Type of Complaint Miscellaneous: Complaint Type Date Assigned 11/12/2010	enemen errotis hardele errotis de la dello errotis errotis errotis errotis errotis errotis errotis errotis err
Date	Time	Activity	Last Mod	Last Mod Date
Redacted		Dadadad		
		Redacted		
		Pedact Pedact		
			Redacted	
		Redacted		

Page 2 Case # 10-1937

### CONFIDENTIAL

## SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES CODE SECTION 583

Type of Complaint



Case Number

Pacific Gas and Electric Company

## Chronological Log of Investigation

87-167 7/89 Corporate Security

10-1937		··	Miscellaneous: Complaint Ty	ре	
Assigned Sec	curity Represer ses	ntative	Miscellaneous: Complaint Ty Date Assigned 11/12/2010		•
General, Ca	565		11/12/2010	******************	
Date	Time	Activity	Las	st Mod	Last Mod Date
Redacted		Dodactod Dod	. Las		Redacted
		Redacted  Dodactod			

# CONFIDENTIAL SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES CODE SECTION 583



Pacific Gas and Electric Company

Chronological Log of Investigation

87-167 7/89 Corporate Security

Case Number	Type of Complaint
10-1937	Miscellaneous: Complaint Type
Assigned Security Representative	Date Assigned
General, Cases	11/12/2010

~ ~ · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· ·		1 11 3 MIRW 2 V
Date	Time	Activity	Last Mod Last Mod Date
Redacted			
		Redacted	
		Redacted	Redacted
		ited	
		Redacte	
		Redacted	Dedact
		INFLIALIFI	
		Redacted	

Page 4 Case # 10-1937

#### CONFIDENTIAL SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES CODE SECTION 583



Pacific Gas and Electric Company

## Chronological Log of Investigation

87-167 7/89 Corporate Security

Case Number 10-1937 Assigned Se General, C	curity Represe	ontative	Type of Complaint Miscellaneous: Complaint Type Date Assigned 11/12/2010
Date	Time	Activity	Last Mod Last Mod Date
Redacted	TIMIC	Redacted	Last Mod Last Mod Date
		Redacted	Redacted  Redacted

Page 5 Case # 10-1937

# CONFIDENTIAL SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES CODE SECTION 583

Miscellaneous: Complaint Type

Type of Complaint



Case Number

10-1937

Pacific Gas and Electric Company

## Chronological Log of Investigation

87-167 7/89 Corporate Security

General, Ca	ses	entative	Date Assigned 11/12/2010	
Date	Time	Activity	<u> </u>	Last Mod Last Mod Date
Redacted			Redacted	
			Redacted	
		Redacted		
		Redacted	$\neg$	
		Redacted		

Page 6 Case # 10-1937

# CONFIDENTIAL SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES CODE SECTION 583



Pacific Gas and Electric Company

# Chronological Log of Investigation

87-167 7/89 Corporate Security

Case Number	Type of Complaint
10-1937	Miscellaneous: Complaint Type
Assigned Security Representative	Date Assigned
General, Cases	11/12/2010

Date	Tíme	Activity	Last Mod Last Mod Date
Redacted			
		Redacted	

Page 7 Case # 10-1937

# CONFIDENTIAL SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES CODE SECTION 583



Pacific Gas and Electric Company

# Chronological Log of Investigation

87-167 7/89 Corporate Security

Case Number	Type of Complaint
10-1937	Miscellaneous: Complaint Type
Assigned Security Representative	Date Assigned
General, Cases	11/12/2010

Date	Time	Activity	Last Mod Last Mod Date
Redacted			

Page 8 Case # 10-1937

#### CONFIDENTIAL

### SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES CODE SECTION 583

Type of Complaint



Case Number

Pacific Gas and Electric Company

## Chronological Log of Investigation

87-167 7/89 Corporate Security

10-1937 Assigned S General, C	ocurity Ropres ases	entative	Miscellaneous: Complaint Type  Date Assigned 11/12/2010		
Date	Time	Activity		Last Mod Last Mod Date	
Redacted		Redacted			

Page 9 Case # 10-1937