

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION  
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Resolution ALJ-274. Establishes Citation Procedures for the Enforcement of Safety Regulations by the Consumer Protection and Safety Division Staff for Violations by Gas Corporations of General Order 112-E and Code of Federal Regulations, Title 49, Parts 190, 191, 192, 193 and 199.

Draft Resolution ALJ-274  
(Served October 10, 2011)

**REPLY COMMENTS  
OF THE DIVISION OF RATEPAYER ADVOCATES  
ON DRAFT RESOLUTION ALJ-274**

**I. INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with Rule 14.5 of the Rules of Practice and Procedure of the California Public Utilities Commission (Commission) and with the schedule for comments set in the Chief Administrative Law Judge's (ALJ) notice of availability of draft Resolution ALJ-274, the Division of Ratepayer Advocates (DRA) hereby submits its reply comments regarding draft Resolution ALJ-274, issued on October 10, 2011. DRA disagrees with the opening comments of Southern California Gas Company and San Diego Gas & Electric Company (jointly, Sempra)<sup>1</sup> and of Southwest Gas Corporation (SWG)<sup>2</sup> arguing that Resolution ALJ-274 improperly delegates Commission authority and violates due process.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Joint Comments of Southern California Gas Company and San Diego Gas & Electric Company on Draft Resolution ALJ-274 (Sempra Comments), Oct. 21, 2011.

<sup>2</sup> Opening Comments of Southwest Gas Corporation (SWG Comments), Oct. 21, 2011.

<sup>3</sup> Silence on an issue does not indicate consent or agreement.

## II. DRAFT RESOLUTION ALJ-274 DOES NOT IMPROPERLY DELEGATE AUTHORITY TO COMMISSION STAFF AND DOES NOT VIOLATE DUE PROCESS

Sempra and SWG argue that adoption of the citation program set forth in draft Resolution ALJ-274 would be an improper delegation of Commission authority to the Consumer Protection and Safety Division (CPSD). Sempra states: “the Commission may delegate investigatory duties to Staff but the decision whether and/or what amount of fine is to be imposed would be an ‘exercise of judgment or discretion’ and therefore ‘cannot be surrendered or delegated to subordinates in the absence of statutory authorization.’”<sup>4</sup> SWG “is concerned that ... the issuance of a citation (and therefore penalties) can be applied unevenly based upon a particular inspector’s experience, knowledge or interpretation of the law because the decision of whether to issue a citation will be based largely upon the subjective determination by each CPSD Staff Inspector.”<sup>5</sup>

It is well settled that a public agency is limited in its ability to delegate discretionary authority to its staff or subordinates, but it “may delegate the performance of ministerial tasks, including the investigation and determination of facts preliminary to agency action, functions relating to the application of standards, and the making of preliminary recommendations and draft orders.”<sup>6</sup> The Commission has clarified this general rule to “stand for the narrower principle that while agencies cannot delegate the power to make fundamental policy decisions or ‘final’ discretionary decisions, they may act in a practical manner and delegate authority to investigate, determine facts, make recommendations ... even though such activities in fact require Staff to exercise judgment and discretion.”<sup>7</sup> “Thus, in determining whether a delegation of authority is unlawful, the question is

---

<sup>4</sup> Sempra Comments at 9.

<sup>5</sup> SWG Comments at 2.

<sup>6</sup> Decision (“D.”) 09-05-020, Order Modifying Resolution ROSB-002 and Denying Rehearing of Resolution, as Modified, May 7, 2009, citing *Bagley v. City of Manhattan Beach* (1976) 18 Cal.3d 22, 24; *California School Employees Assoc. v. Personnel Comm’n* (1970) 3 Cal.3d 139, 144; *Schechter v. County of Los Angeles* (1968) 258 Cal.App.2d 391, 396.

<sup>7</sup> D.09-05-020 at 3, citing *California Assoc. of Competitive Telecommunication Cos.* [D.02-02-049] 2002 Cal. PUC LEXIS 162.

whether the Commission has delegated its power to make fundamental policy decisions or final discretionary decisions.”<sup>8</sup> Clearly, here, the Commission has not. Draft Resolution ALJ-274 authorizes CPSD Staff to administer a citation program, but does not transfer final decision-making authority from the Commission to CPSD or other Commission staff.

Sempra and SWG complain that, while on the one hand the draft Resolution gives Staff too much discretion in citing violations, on the other it does not give Staff enough discretion in determining or negotiating with utilities the penalty amount and the timing of responses to citations and corrections of violations. Sempra believes that, because the draft Resolution “directs Staff to impose the maximum penalty in all cases, and does not allow for [Commission] review of the amount of the penalty,” it violates the requirement of Public Utilities Code section 2104.5 that factors such as good-faith attempts to achieve compliance should be considered in determining the amount of a penalty.<sup>9</sup> Sempra also notes that the draft Resolution requires a utility “to bring itself into compliance within seven days, no matter how burdensome (or even impossible) it may be to do so.”<sup>10</sup> SWG “believes the draft Resolution might actually reduce the effectiveness of the CPSD as it deprives the CPSD of the discretionary power to recommend a penalty amount appropriate to the circumstances and within the range allowed by law,” and that “CPSD should be afforded the discretion to impose a cure date and also the discretion to modify that date.”<sup>11</sup> As discussed above, the Commission “may assign certain functions for the Staff to perform, including investigation of facts preliminary to agency action, and the assessment of specific penalties for certain types of violations.”<sup>12</sup> In other citation programs implemented by the Commission, such as those related to resource adequacy (Res. E-4195), power plant operation and maintenance (G.O. 167), and rail safety (Res. ROSB-

---

<sup>8</sup> D.09-05-020 at 3.

<sup>9</sup> See Sempra Comments at 9-10.

<sup>10</sup> Sempra Comments at 6.

<sup>11</sup> SWG Comments at 3 and 4.

<sup>12</sup> D.09-05-020 at 7.

002), the fines and penalties for violations have been specified. Here, to allay Sempra and SWG's concerns regarding the draft Resolution's directive that "[e]ach citation will assess the maximum penalty amount provided for by § 2107,"<sup>13</sup> Resolution ALJ-274 could likewise include a range or schedule of penalties based on which Staff can determine the appropriate amount to include in a citation.<sup>14</sup>

Moreover, Sempra and SWG are incorrect that the citation program set forth by draft Resolution ALJ-274 violates procedural due process.<sup>15</sup> The Commission has implemented similar citation programs in the past. For example, the Commission in Resolution ROSB-002 delegated authority to CPSD to administer a citation program to enforce railroad carrier compliance with certain clearance requirements and operating rules.<sup>16</sup> The Commission found that "[a] citation program administered by Staff for specified violations of the Commission's General Orders and other requirements that apply to railroad carriers will allow prompt action by Staff to protect railroad employees, the public, and the environment, minimize enforcement costs, and fulfill the objectives of the Commission's railroad safety program."<sup>17</sup> In rejecting the railroads' due process arguments, the Commission found that the fiscal and administrative burdens on the railroads of defending against a citation were not significant and the railroads' ability to appeal all citations showed "the safeguards provided the railroad to be adequate as demanded under fundamental principles of due process law."<sup>18</sup>

---

<sup>13</sup> Draft Res. ALJ-274, p.6; *see also* at 8, Finding 8: "It is reasonable to assess penalties for each violation at the maximum amount set forth in Pub. Util. Code § 2107; this approach is consistent with the Commission's broad regulatory powers to protect public safety and to ensure compliance with the Commission's orders and the Public Utilities Code."

<sup>14</sup> For example, a failure to comply with G.O. 26-D has a scheduled penalty of \$1,000 per incident; a failure to comply with G.O. 118 carries a penalty of \$500 per incident plus \$50 per day for each day in violation.

<sup>15</sup> *See* Sempra Comments at 6-8, SWG Comments at 5.

<sup>16</sup> *See* Resolution (Res.) ROSB-002, Resolution Adopting a Railroad Citation Program for Enforcing Compliance with General Orders and Other Requirements Including Procedures for Appeal of Citation Issued to Railroad Carriers, Nov. 6, 2008.

<sup>17</sup> Res. ROSB-002 at 2.

<sup>18</sup> Res. ROSB-002 at 7-8.

Here, the citation program is consistent with other approved citation programs and similarly includes requirements for the contents of a citation, service and procedures for appeal and final Commission determination and, thus, provides procedural safeguards to ensure that respondents have adequate notice and opportunity to be heard.<sup>19</sup>

### III. CONCLUSION

The citation program established by Resolution ALJ-274 does not constitute an unlawful delegation of Commission authority, and does not violate due process requirements. With the changes proposed by DRA in its opening and reply comments, DRA recommends that the Commission adopt Resolution ALJ-274.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ MARION PELEO

---

MARION PELEO

Attorney for the Division of Ratepayer  
Advocates

California Public Utilities Commission  
505 Van Ness Avenue  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Phone: (415) 703-2130  
Fax: (415) 703-2262  
E-mail: [map@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:map@cpuc.ca.gov)

October 26, 2011

---

<sup>19</sup> See Resolution ROSB-002, Nov. 6, 2008.

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of “**REPLY COMMENTS OF THE DIVISION OF RATEPAYER ADVOCATES ON DRAFT RESOLUTION ALJ-274**” in **A.10-12-005, A.10-12-006, R.11-02-019 and A.09-09-013**, by using the following service:

**E-Mail Service:** sending the entire document as an attachment to all known parties of record who provided electronic mail addresses.

**U.S. Mail Service:** mailing by first-class mail with postage prepaid to all known parties of record who did not provide electronic mail addresses.

Executed on **October 26, 2011** at San Francisco, California.

/s/ NELLY SARMIENTO

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nelly Sarmiento

**SERVICE LISTS**  
**A1012005, A1012006,**  
**R1102019, A0909013**

jleslie@luce.com  
rdc\_law@swbell.net  
RVanderleeden@SempraUtilities.com  
jcorralejo@lbcgla.org  
DGilmore@SempraUtilities.com  
npedersen@hanmor.com  
douglass@energyattorney.com  
francis.mculty@sce.com  
dj0conklin@earthlink.net  
KMelville@SempraUtilities.com  
JPacheco@SempraUtilities.com  
mshames@ucan.org  
dbyers@landuselaw.com  
Faith.Mabuhayalliance@gmail.com  
rkoss@adamsbroadwell.com  
jab@cpuc.ca.gov  
nms@cpuc.ca.gov  
norman.furuta@navy.mil  
nsuetake@turn.org  
sls@a-klaw.com  
swf5@pge.com  
epoole@adplaw.com  
lencanty@BlackEconomicCouncil.org  
service@cforat.org  
stephaniec@greenlining.org  
rwillford@dralegal.org  
jweil@aglet.org  
billjulian@sbcglobal.net  
kmills@cfbf.com  
cadowney@cadowneylaw.com  
j4lr@pge.com  
jessica@ongrid.net  
JXYR@pge.com  
jwmitchell@mbartek.com  
mike@ucan.org  
naaz.khumawala@baml.com  
ppatterson2@nyc.rr.com  
regrelcpucases@pge.com  
dwtcpucdockets@dwt.com  
mrw@mrwassoc.com  
alison@bartlewells.com  
noah.hauser@barclayscapital.com  
jheckler@levincap.com  
khojasteh.davoodi@navy.mil  
makda.solomon@navy.mil  
ralphdennis@insightbb.com  
rsmithla@aol.com  
daniel.j.brink@exxonmobil.com  
kirby.bosley@jpmorgan.com

paul.gendron@JPMorgan.com  
Paul.Tramonte@jpmorgan.com  
randy.e.parker@exxonmobil.com  
robert.pettinato@ladwp.com  
RPrince@SempraUtilities.com  
JPong@SempraUtilities.com  
ASteinberg@SempraUtilities.com  
rothenergy@sbcglobal.net  
sendo@cityofpasadena.net  
eklinkner@cityofpasadena.net  
VPuffer@ci.glendale.ca.us  
slins@ci.glendale.ca.us  
bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us  
rmorillo@ci.burbank.ca.us  
case.admin@sce.com  
learl@SempraUtilities.com  
liddell@EnergyAttorney.com  
onell.soto@uniontrib.com  
marcie.milner@shell.com  
CManzuk@SempraUtilities.com  
pgirard@semprautilities.com  
CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com  
carl.wood@verizon.net  
sjkeene@iid.com  
cguss@anaheim.net  
ssciortino@anaheim.net  
ek@a-klaw.com  
sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com  
sswaroop@naacoalition.org  
mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com  
bfinkelstein@turn.org  
tlong@turn.org  
Fassil.t.Fenikile@att.com  
filings@a-klaw.com  
aaron.joseph.lewis@gmail.com  
cem@newsdata.com  
RobertGnaizda@gmail.com  
ssm3@pge.com  
ceyap@earthlink.net  
dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net  
rschmidt@bartlewells.com  
garrick@jbsenergy.com  
john@jbsenergy.com  
kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com  
rl@eslawfirm.com  
lmh@eslawfirm.com  
CaliforniaDockets@pacificorp.com  
michael.colvin@cpuc.ca.gov  
beg@cpuc.ca.gov

**SERVICE LISTS**  
**A1012005, A1012006,**  
**R1102019, A0909013**

dlf@cpuc.ca.gov  
dfb@cpuc.ca.gov  
ec2@cpuc.ca.gov  
jrw@cpuc.ca.gov  
jsw@cpuc.ca.gov  
zaf@cpuc.ca.gov  
ram@cpuc.ca.gov  
rmp@cpuc.ca.gov  
srt@cpuc.ca.gov  
sgm@cpuc.ca.gov  
sjg@cpuc.ca.gov  
txb@cpuc.ca.gov  
StephanieC@greenlining.org  
SLG0@pge.com  
carlwood@uwua.net  
jboehme@nicor.com  
justin.brown@swgas.com  
STomkins@semprautilities.com  
npedersen@hanmor.com  
bob.gorham@fire.ca.gov  
douglas.porter@sce.com  
Faith.Mabuhayalliance@gmail.com  
cjackson@sanbruno.ca.gov  
rkoss@adamsbroadwell.com  
gxh@cpuc.ca.gov  
map@cpuc.ca.gov  
austin.yang@sfgov.org  
marcel@turn.org  
cpj2@pge.com  
sgs@dcbsf.com  
bkc7@pge.com  
smeyers@meyersnave.com  
lencanty@BlackEconomicCouncil.org  
rwilliford@dralegal.org  
michaelboyd@sbcglobal.net  
bmcc@mccarthyLaw.com  
Mike@alpinenaturalgas.com  
dcarroll@downeybrand.com  
westgas@aol.com  
wwester@smud.org  
ajahns@jahnsatlaw.com  
Dave.Weber@nwnatural.com  
jason.dubchak@niskags.com  
a2mx@pge.com  
AGL9@pge.com  
artfrias@uwua.net  
cassandra.sweet@dowjones.com  
christine.tam@cityofpaloalto.org  
CMM6@pge.com

cleo.zagrean@macquarie.com  
enriqueg@greenlining.org  
grant.kolling@cityofpaloalto.org  
gclark@lodistorage.com  
jheckler@levincap.com  
j2ti@pge.com  
jleslie@luce.com  
karla.Dailey@CityofPaloAlto.org  
lauren.duke@db.com  
unionnancy@gmail.com  
ray.welch@navigantconsulting.com  
russell@lodistorage.com  
tcollier@buckeye.com  
timothyrea@hotmail.com  
ttutt@smud.org  
mrw@mrwassoc.com  
regrelcuccases@pge.com  
scott.senchak@decade-llc.com  
andrewgay@arcassetltd.com  
wschmidt@buckeye.com  
malp@pge.com  
daniel.j.brink@exxonmobil.com  
kmmj@pge.com  
christy.berger@swgas.com  
jim.mathews@swgas.com  
priscila.castillo@ladwp.com  
robert.pettinato@ladwp.com  
GHealy@semprautilities.com  
JLSalazar@SempraUtilities.com  
Naftab@semprautilities.com  
RCavalleri@SempraUtilities.com  
DNg@semprautilities.com  
RPrince@SempraUtilities.com  
jcorralejo@lbcgla.org  
ellen.isaacs@asm.ca.gov  
dtorres@sogate.org  
pat.jackson@teaminc.com  
klatt@energyattorney.com  
michael.alexander@sce.com  
douglass@energyattorney.com  
ssc.chrissy@gmail.com  
carneycomic@sbcglobal.net  
case.admin@sce.com  
gloria.ing@sce.com  
janet.combs@sce.com  
Robert.F.Lemoine@sce.com  
marcie.milner@shell.com  
CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com  
jhunter@riversideca.gov



**SERVICE LISTS**  
**A1012005, A1012006,**  
**R1102019, A0909013**

waltowaiji@tustinca.org  
laura@messimer.com  
sswaroop@naacoalition.org  
kfabry@sanbruno.ca.gov  
gcaldwell@sanbruno.ca.gov  
mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com  
SanBrunoGasSafety@cpuc.ca.gov  
joc@cpuc.ca.gov  
theresa.mueller@sfgov.org  
bfinkelstein@turn.org  
tlong@turn.org  
C4MU@pge.com  
d1ct@pge.com  
jldavis@dcbsf.com  
j1pc@pge.com  
jmalkin@orrick.com  
filings@a-klaw.com  
kck5@pge.com  
M1D1@pge.com  
NXKl@pge.com  
oxb4@pge.com  
sls@a-klaw.com  
tnhc@pge.com  
wvm3@pge.com  
bcragg@goodinmacbride.com  
jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.com  
mmattes@nossaman.com  
aaron.joseph.lewis@gmail.com  
cem@newsdata.com  
RobertGnaizda@gmail.com  
Susan.Durbin@doj.ca.gov  
Service@spurr.org  
sean.beatty@genon.com  
bstrottman@meyersnave.com  
dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net  
service@cforat.org  
tomb@crossborderenergy.com  
sberlin@mccarthy.com  
billjulian@sbcglobal.net  
bburns@caiso.com  
gvanpelt@caiso.com  
blake@consumercal.org  
kelder@aspenerg.com  
atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com  
wmc@a-klaw.com  
kuprewicz@comcast.net  
MD7@cpuc.ca.gov  
aad@cpuc.ca.gov  
ang@cpuc.ca.gov

djg@cpuc.ca.gov  
dbp@cpuc.ca.gov  
emm@cpuc.ca.gov  
cpe@cpuc.ca.gov  
hym@cpuc.ca.gov  
jzr@cpuc.ca.gov  
alf@cpuc.ca.gov  
jmh@cpuc.ca.gov  
kcl@cpuc.ca.gov  
mpo@cpuc.ca.gov  
mab@cpuc.ca.gov  
mwt@cpuc.ca.gov  
pap@cpuc.ca.gov  
psp@cpuc.ca.gov  
pzs@cpuc.ca.gov  
ram@cpuc.ca.gov  
rmp@cpuc.ca.gov  
srt@cpuc.ca.gov  
skh@cpuc.ca.gov  
tcr@cpuc.ca.gov  
janill.richards@doj.ca.gov  
glesh@energy.state.ca.us  
rkennedy@energy.state.ca.us  
sbender@energy.state.ca.us  
jleslie@luce.com  
marcel@turn.org  
keith.mccrea@sutherland.com  
kziober@sparkenergy.com  
francesca.ciliberti@elpaso.com  
trish.french@kernrivergas.com  
JPong@SempraUtilities.com  
npedersen@hanmor.com  
map@cpuc.ca.gov  
kck5@pge.com  
sls@a-klaw.com  
bcragg@goodinmacbride.com  
mday@goodinmacbride.com  
dhuard@manatt.com  
jkarp@winston.com  
Grant.Kolling@cityofpaloalto.org  
ken@in-houseenergy.com  
service@spurr.org  
Sean.Beatty@mirant.com  
JerryL@abag.ca.gov  
tomb@crossborderenergy.com  
bmcc@mccarthy.com  
dcarroll@downeybrand.com  
glw@eslawfirm.com  
atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com

**SERVICE LISTS**  
**A1012005, A1012006,**  
**R1102019, A0909013**

pinney@capp.ca  
cassandra.sweet@dowjones.com  
cleo.zagrean@macquarie.com  
klatt@energyattorney.com  
karla.Dailey@CityofPaloAlto.org  
michelle.d.grant@dynegy.com  
ray.welch@navigantconsulting.com  
rothenenergy@sbcglobal.net  
mrw@mrwassoc.com  
julien.dumoulin-smith@ubs.com  
Yim@ZimmerLucas.com  
jheckler@levincap.com  
doug.vanbrunt@credit-suisse.com  
jdibble@calpine.com  
eva\_neufeld@transcanada.com  
bday@sparkenergy.com  
william.tomlinson@elpaso.com  
peteresposito@earthlink.net  
kmmj@pge.com  
JLSalazar@SempraUtilities.com  
jcorralejo@lbcgla.org  
michael.alexander@sce.com  
marcie.milner@shell.com  
ek@a-klaw.com  
Faith.Mabuhayalliance@gmail.com  
jsperry@ifpte20.org  
CDO1@pge.com  
RegRelCPUCCases@pge.com  
mdm8@pge.com  
JKD5@pge.com  
filings@a-klaw.com  
NRN2@pge.com  
RAG5@pge.com  
jarmstrong@gmssr.com  
tkaushik@manatt.com  
tsolomon@winston.com  
edwardoneill@dwt.com  
lcottle@winston.com  
cem@newsdata.com  
MDP5@pge.com  
RobertGnaizda@gmail.com  
RegRelCPUCCases@pge.com  
KJBh@pge.com  
nathan.solov@asm.ca.gov  
Grant.kolling@CityofPaloAlto.org  
beth@beth411.com  
kowalewskia@calpine.com  
lencanty@BlackEconomicCouncil.org  
ceyap@earthlink.net

bill@jbsenergy.com  
bsb@eslawfirm.com  
jdh@eslawfirm.com  
smoorma@smud.org  
RNevis@daycartermurphy.com  
wmc@a-klaw.com  
Julie.Morris@iberdrolaren.com  
jason.dubchak@niskags.com  
DBP@cpuc.ca.gov  
cpe@cpuc.ca.gov  
jsw@cpuc.ca.gov  
kcl@cpuc.ca.gov  
pzs@cpuc.ca.gov  
ram@cpuc.ca.gov  
tmr@cpuc.ca.gov  
nate.solo@asm.ca.gov