

Clay Faber - Director Regulatory Affairs 8330 Century Park Court San Diego, CA 92123-1548

Tel: 858.654.3563 Fax: 858.654.1788 cfaber@semprautilities.com

January 6, 2012

**ADVICE LETTER 2325-E** (U902-E)

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

SUBJECT: MODIFICATIONS TO THE MARKET PRICE BENCHMARK TO ACCOUNT FOR RENEWABLE RESOURCE REQUIREMENTS PURSUANT TO DECISION 11-12-018

San Diego Gas & Electric Company (SDG&E) hereby submits to the California Public Utilities Commission (Commission) its data necessary to revise the Power Charge Indifference Amount (PCIA), Competition Transition Charge (CTC), and Temporary Bundled Service tariffs to account for renewable resource requirements and the US Department of Energy premiums as directed in Ordering Paragraph (OP) 4 of Decision (D.)11-12-018.

#### **BACKGROUND**

In D.02-11-022, the Commission established a Cost Responsibility Surcharge (CRS) methodology which incorporated an indifference amount. A revised methodology to determine the indifference amount was approved in D.06-07-030, (subsequently modified by D.07-01-030, D.07-05-022, and D.07-05-005). The indifference amount is updated annually in each Investor-Owned Utility's (IOU's) Energy Resource Recovery Account (ERRA) proceeding.

The Indifference principle involves the interaction of three elements;

- a) a non-bypassable surcharge which DA customers pay to offset any cost impacts on bundled customers associated with their departure from or return to bundled service;
- b) switching rules which govern the movement of customers between DA and bundled service; and
- c) Transition Bundled Service (TBS) rates which accommodate customer movement while allowing the utility to adjust its generation portfolio without cost impacts on bundled customers.

To derive the indifference amount, the market value of the IOU's supply portfolio is subtracted from the total portfolio cost. The Market Price Benchmark (MPB) is a calculated proxy which represents the market value of the IOU total energy resource portfolio. The IOU total portfolio includes IOU-owned generation, purchased power, DWR contracts, fuel costs, and California Independent System Operator (CAISO) costs. A positive indifference amount indicates that the

IOU portfolio cost is above-market for that year. The indifference amount is recovered from DA customers through a non-bypassable surcharge to maintain bundled service customer indifference.

The current indifference methodology only recognizes the IOUs' cost of renewable resources in the calculation of the Total Portfolio Cost, but does not account for the market value of renewable resources in the MPB.

All load serving entities are subject to increasing requirements to procure renewable resources pursuant to Pub. Util. Code, Article 16, commencing with § 399.1. Renewable resources are more costly than traditional gas-fired generation, and thus have a higher market price as compared to the embedded cost of the utilities' portfolios. As the utilities add renewable generation, their average portfolio costs will increase. ESPs are facing the same mandate to buy a certain percentage of their power from renewable generation sources, and their costs are affected as well. Both the utilities and the ESPs thus face new requirements to purchase renewable power for a certain percentage of their load, causing their average portfolio costs to increase.

To accurately reflect the market value of RPS-compliant renewables, the benchmark should reflect prices paid by buyers and sellers in recent transactions for delivery of RPS-compliant power in California for the forecast year.

The Commission determined a proxy to serve as a RPS value based upon a weighting of different data sources. The IOUs' shall make use of sources of RPS data that incorporate transactions of other load serving entities. In the absence of any superior source that has been identified for this purpose, the IOU's shall make use of the western regional renewable energy contract premiums published by U.S. Department of Energy (DOE).

68% of the IOU's costs for RPS will be based on their proposed methodology. The remaining 32% of the RPS adder will be allocated using the DOE data. This weighting corresponds to the percentage of the total load subject to RPS requirements currently represented by IOU load. The applicable percentages are subject to updated data in subsequent years.

Pursuant to OP 4 of D.11-12-018, SDG&E is providing the following data herein as Attachments A and B:

- 1. The most recent 12 months figures derived from US Department of Energy survey of Western US renewable energy premiums in calculating a weighted proxy for the Market Price Benchmark compiled by the National Renewable Energy Laboratory; and
- 2. All RPS-compliant resources that are used to serve customers during the current year (i.e., most recent 12 months) and those projected to serve customers during the next year, including both contracts and IOU-owned resources; and
- 3. The projected costs together with the net qualifying capacity of energy produced by each of these resources (providing relevant costs in dollars and volumes in MWh and qualifying capacity in kW).

#### RENEWABLE PORTFOLIO STANDARD ADDER

Attached are documents responding to the requests for RPS and DOE data in accordance with D.11-12-018 in order for the Energy Division to calculate an RPS adder. Attachment A is a calculation of the DOE component of the RPS premium. The data source is the most recent DOE/NREL report on the Green Pricing Options (2009) data. That report includes a link to the website on page iii which includes the most current program data. Only Western Electricity Coordinating Council (WECC) program data are included. Programs that do not include \$/kWh premiums or have voluntary contributions were excluded from the calculation. If a range was shown in the data, the average was calculated. Based on this data, SDG&E has calculated a DOE premium of \$18.15 per MWh.

Attachment B contains renewable contract data for the years 2011 and 2012. All RPS contracts that were included in SDG&E's 2011 and 2012 ERRA forecast filings, Application (A.) 10-10-001 and A.11-09-022 respectively, are shown in this spreadsheet. Attachment B contains data that is confidential and has been redacted to conceal SDG&E's renewable energy and cost information. An unredacted version will be provided to the Energy Division under confidential seal. Included are forecasts of RPS energy in MWh, costs in \$, and net qualifying capacity (NQC) in kW.

#### RESOURCE ADEQUACY CAPCACITY ADDER

D.11-12-018 adopts Southern California Edison's proposal to update the RA capacity adder component of the MPB based on the most recent California Energy Commission (CEC) estimate of the going forward cost of a combustion turbine. Based on the CEC's most recent estimate, the RA capacity adder would be \$50.17/kW-yr. This estimate is based on data from Table B-4 of the Final CEC 2009 Comparative Costs of California Central Station Electric Generation Report and is the summation of three components: (1) Insurance (\$9.63), (2) Ad Valorem (\$13.09) and (3) Fixed O&M (\$27.45) for a Small Simple Cycle plant.

#### **EFFECTIVE DATE**

SDG&E believes this filing is subject to Energy Division disposition and should be classified as Tier 2 (effective after staff approval) pursuant to GO 96-B. SDG&E respectfully requests that this filing become effective on February 5, 2012, which is 30 days after the date filed.

#### **PROTEST**

Anyone may protest this Advice Letter to the California Public Utilities Commission. The protest must state the grounds upon which it is based, including such items as financial and service impact, and should be submitted expeditiously. The protest must be made in writing and must be received no later than January 26, 2012, which is 20 days of the date this Advice Letter was filed with the Commission. There is no restriction on who may file a protest. The address for mailing or delivering a protest to the Commission is:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> D.11-12-018 at p. 115.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See: <a href="http://www.energy.ca.gov/2009publications/CEC-200-2009-017/CEC-200-2009-017-SF.PDF">http://www.energy.ca.gov/2009publications/CEC-200-2009-017/CEC-200-2009-017-SF.PDF</a>

CPUC Energy Division Attention: Tariff Unit 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

Copies of the protest should also be sent via e-mail to the attention of both Honesto Gatchalian (<a href="mailto:inj@cpuc.ca.gov">inj@cpuc.ca.gov</a>) and Maria Salinas (<a href="mailto:mas@cpuc.ca.gov">mas@cpuc.ca.gov</a>) of the Energy Division. A copy of the protest should also be sent via both e-mail <a href="mailto:and">and</a> facsimile to the address shown below on the same date it is mailed or delivered to the Commission.

Attn: Megan Caulson
Regulatory Tariff Manager
8330 Century Park Court, Room 32C
San Diego, CA 92123-1548
Facsimile No. (858) 654-1879
E-mail: MCaulson@semprautilities.com

#### **NOTICE**

A copy of this filing has been served on the utilities and interested parties shown on the attached list, including interested parties in R.07-05-025, by providing them a copy hereof either electronically or via the U.S. mail, properly stamped and addressed.

Address changes should be directed to SDG&E Tariffs by facsimile at (858) 654-1879 or by email to SDG&ETariffs@semprautilities.com.

CLAY FABER
Director – Regulatory Affairs

**Attachments** 

# CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

## ADVICE LETTER FILING SUMMARY ENERGY UTILITY

MUST BE COMPLETED BY UTILITY (Attach additional pages as needed)							
Company name/CPUC Utility No. SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC (U 902)							
Utility type: Contact Person: Christina Sondrini							
$\boxtimes$ ELC $\square$ GAS	Phone #: (858) <u>636-5736</u>						
☐ PLC ☐ HEAT ☐ WATER	ER E-mail: csondrini@semprautilities.com						
EXPLANATION OF UTILITY TY	EXPLANATION OF UTILITY TYPE (Date Filed/ Received Stamp by CPUC)						
ELC = Electric $GAS = GasPLC = Pipeline$ $HEAT = Heat$ $WATER = Water$							
Advice Letter (AL) #: 2325-E							
Subject of AL: Modifications to the Ma	arket Price Benchm	ark to Account for Renewable Resource					
Requirements Pursuan	t to Decision 11-12-	-018					
Keywords (choose from CPUC listing):	Compliance, Dire	ect Access					
AL filing type:  Monthly  Quarterl	y 🗌 Annual 🔀 On	e-Time 🗌 Othe r					
If AL filed in compliance with a Comm	ission order, indicat	te relevant Decision/Resolution #:					
D.11-12-018							
Does AL replace a withdrawn or rejected	ed AL? If so, identi	fy the prior AL N/A					
Summarize differences between the AI	and the prior with	drawn or rejected AL¹:					
Does AL request confidential treatmen	t? If so, provide exp	lanation: N/A					
Resolution Required?   Yes   No		Tier Designation: $\square$ 1 $\square$ 2 $\square$ 3					
Requested effective date: 2/5/12		No. of tariff sheets: <u>0</u>					
Estimated system annual revenue effect	et: (%): <u>N/A</u>						
Estimated system average rate effect (9	%): <u>N/A</u>						
When rates are affected by AL, include (residential, small commercial, large C		showing average rate effects on customer classes ating).					
Tariff schedules affected: N/A							
Service affected and changes proposed¹:N/A							
Pending advice letters that revise the same tariff sheets: N/A							
Protests and all other correspondence regarding this AL are due no later than 20 days after the date of this filing, unless otherwise authorized by the Commission, and shall be sent to:							
CPUC, Energy Division		San Diego Gas & Electric					
Attention: Tariff Unit 505 Van Ness Ave.,		attention: Megan Caulson 3330 Century Park Ct, Room 32C					
San Francisco, CA 94102 San Diego, CA 92123							
mas@cpuc.ca.gov and jnj@cpuc.ca.gov	mas@cpuc.ca.gov and jnj@cpuc.ca.gov mcaulson@semprautilities.com						

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 1}$  Discuss in AL if more space is needed.

#### General Order No. 96-B ADVICE LETTER FILING MAILING LIST

cc: (w/enclosures)

**Public Utilities Commission** 

<u>DRA</u>

S. Cauchois

R. Pocta

W. Scott

**Energy Division** 

P. Clanon

S. Gallagher

H. Gatchalian

D. Lafrenz

M. Salinas

CA. Energy Commission

F. DeLeon

R. Tavares

Alcantar & Kahl LLP

K. Cameron

American Energy Institute

C. King

**APS Energy Services** 

J. Schenk

**BP Energy Company** 

J. Zaiontz

Barkovich & Yap, Inc.

B. Barkovich

**Bartle Wells Associates** 

R. Schmidt

Braun & Blaising, P.C.

S. Blaising

California Energy Markets

S. O'Donnell

C. Sweet

California Farm Bureau Federation

K. Mills

California Wind Energy

N. Rader

Children's Hospital & Health Center

T. Jacoby

City of Chula Vista

M. Meacham

City of Poway

R. Willcox

City of San Diego

J. Cervantes

G. Lonergan

M. Valerio

Commerce Energy Group

V. Gan

CP Kelco

A. Friedl

Davis Wright Tremaine, LLP

E. O'Neill

J. Pau

Dept. of General Services

H. Nanjo

M. Clark

Douglass & Liddell

D. Douglass

D. Liddell

G. Klatt

**Duke Energy North America** 

M. Gillette

Dynegy, Inc.

J. Paul

Ellison Schneider & Harris LLP

E. Janssen

**Energy Policy Initiatives Center (USD)** 

S. Anders

**Energy Price Solutions** 

A. Scott

Energy Strategies, Inc.

K. Campbell

M. Scanlan

Goodin, MacBride, Squeri, Ritchie & Day

B. Craga

J. Heather Patrick

J. Squeri

Goodrich Aerostructures Group

M. Harrington

Hanna and Morton LLP

N. Pedersen

Itsa-North America

L. Belew

J.B.S. Energy

J. Nahigian

Luce, Forward, Hamilton & Scripps LLP

J. Leslie

Manatt, Phelps & Phillips LLP

D. Huard

R. Keen

Matthew V. Brady & Associates

M. Brady

Modesto Irrigation District

C. Mayer

Morrison & Foerster LLP

P. Hanschen

MRW & Associates

D. Richardson

Pacific Gas & Electric Co.

J. Clark

M. Huffman

S. Lawrie

E. Lucha

Pacific Utility Audit, Inc.

E. Kellv

San Diego Regional Energy Office

S. Freedman

J. Porter

School Project for Utility Rate Reduction

M. Rochman

Shute, Mihaly & Weinberger LLP

O. Armi

Solar Turbines

F. Chiang

Sutherland Asbill & Brennan LLP

K. McCrea

Southern California Edison Co.

M. Alexander

K. Cini

K. Gansecki

H. Romero

<u>TransCanada</u>

R. Hunter

D. White

<u>TURN</u>

M. Hawiger

**UCAN** 

M. Shames

U.S. Dept. of the Navy

K. Davoodi

N. Furuta

L. DeLacruz

Utility Specialists, Southwest, Inc.

D. Koser

Western Manufactured Housing

**Communities Association** 

S. Dey

White & Case LLP

L. Cottle

Interested Parties In:

R.07-05-025

				Start		
State	<u>Utility Name</u>	Program Name	<u>Type</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Premium</u>	\$/MWh
			wind and			
AZ	Arizona Public Service	Green Choice	geothermal	2007	0.4¢/kWh	4.00
			central PV, wind,			
l			landfill gas, small	1998/		
AZ	Salt River Project	EarthWise Energy	hydro, geothermal	2001	3.0¢/kWh	30.00
<b> </b>	Tri Otata Occasiona A Transcription Octobra Electric Occasional and	Renewable Resource		0004	0.04/1.38/1-	
AZ	Tri-State Generation & Transmission: Columbus Electric Cooperative, Inc.	Power Service	wind, hydro		0.8¢/kWh	8.00
AZ	Tucson Electric	GreenWatts	landfill gas, PV	2000	10¢/kWh	100.00
AZ	UniSource Energy Services	GreenWatts	PV	2004	10¢/kWh	100.00
١	A CONTRACTOR OF THE CONTRACTOR	Green Power for the				
CA	Anaheim Public Utilities	Grid	wind, landfill gas	2002	1.5¢/kWh	15.00
CA	Burbank Water and Power	Green Energy Champion	Ivarious	2007	2.0¢/kWh	20.00
<del> </del>	Bulbank Water and Fower	Green Power for a	Various	2001	2.09/10011	
CA	Los Angeles Department of Water and Power	Green LA	wind, landfill gas	1999	3.0¢/kWh	30.00
	Marin Energy Authority: City of Belvedere, Town of Fairfax, County of Marin, City					
	of Mill Valley, Town of San Anselmo, City of San Rafael, City of Sausalito, Town					
CA	of Tiburon	Deep Green	100% renewable	2010	1.0¢/kWh	10.00
CA	PacifiCorp: Pacific Power	Blue Sky Block	wind	2000	1.95¢/kWh	19.50
				2003 /		
CA	Palo Alto Utilities / 3Degrees	Palo Alto Green	wind, PV	2000	1.5¢/kWh	15,00
CA	Pasadena Water & Power	Green Power	wind	2003	2.5¢/kWh	25.00
CA	Roseville Electric	Green Roseville	wind, PV	2005	1.5¢/kWh	15.00
			wind, landfill gas,		1.0¢/kWh or	
CA	Sacramento Municipal Utility District	Greenergy	hydro, PV	1997	\$6/month	10.00
l <u>.</u> .					5.0¢kWh or	
CA	Sacramento Municipal Utility District	SolarShares	PV	2007	\$30/month	50.00
	Cilinan Vallay Payer / 2Darrage	Santa Clara Green	lusing D\/	2004	4 = 4 (1.5 A /15	45.00
CA	Silicon Valley Power / 3Degrees	Power Voluntary Renewable	wind, PV	2004	1.5¢/kWh	15.00
		Energy Certificates				
CA	Truckee Donner PUD	Program	wind	2008	2.0¢/kWh	20.00
CO	Colorado Springs Utilities	Green Power	wind		3.0¢/kWh	30.00
	Colorado Springs Otinites	Green Lowel	Iwina	IIBBB	JO.UG/KVVII	30.00

				Start		
State	<u>Utility Name</u>	Program Name	<u>Type</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Premium</u>	\$/MWh
		Renewable Energy	wind and			
co	Colorado Springs Utilities	Certificates Program	geothermal	2008	0.34¢/kWh	3.40
СО	Xcel Energy	WindSource	wind	1997	-0.67¢/kWh	(6.70)
СО	Holy Cross Energy	Wind Power Pioneers	wind	1998	1.5¢/kWh	15.00
		Local Renewable Energy	′			
co	Holy Cross Energy	Pool	small hydro, PV	2002	2.33¢/kWh	23.30
СО	Intermountain Rural Electric Association / Sterling Planet	National Wind	wind	2006	1.0¢/kWh	10.00
СО	Intermountain Rural Electric Association / Sterling Planet	National Solar	solar	2006	5.5¢/kWh	55.00
	Platte River Power Authority: Estes Park, Fort Collins Utilities, Longmont Power &				1.0¢/kWh-	
co	Communications, Loveland Water & Power	Wind Energy Premium	wind	1999	2.5¢/kWh	17.50
	Tri-State Generation & Transmission : Delta-Montrose Electric Association,					
	Empire Electric Association, Inc., Gunnison County Electric Association, Inc.,					
	Highline Electric Association, La Plata Electric Association, Inc., Morgan County					
	Rural Electric Association, Mountain Parks Electric, Inc., Mountain View Electric					
	Association, Inc., Poudre Valley Rural Electric Association, Inc., San Isabel					1,22
	Electric Association, Inc., San Luis Valley Rural Electric Cooperative, Inc., San					
	Miguel Power Association, Inc., Sangre de Cristo Electric Association, Inc.,					
	Southeast Colorado Power Association, United Power, Inc., White River Electric	Renewable Resource	1.,,,			
CO	Association, Inc., Y-W Electric Association, Inc.	Power Service	wind, hydro		0.8¢/kWh	8.00
co	Yampa Valley Electric Association	Wind Energy Program	wind		0.6¢/kWh	6.00
ID	Avista Utilities	Buck-A-Block	wind		0.33¢/kWh	3.30
ID	Idaho Power	Green Power Program	various	2001	0.98¢/kWh	9.80
l			l		0.71¢/kWh-	
ID	PacifiCorp: Rocky Mountain Power	Blue Sky	wind	2003	1.94¢/kWh	13.25
	A.P. aller et a. Pilla a C.P. a. On a care and P. a.	Alternative Renewable			4 4 / (1 ) 8 (1-	44.00
ID	Vigilante Electric Cooperative	Energy Program	wind	2003	1.1¢/kWh	11,00
I <sub>NAT</sub>	Basin Electric Power Cooperative: Flathead Electric Coop, Lower Yellowstone,	Drairie Winds	lurind	2000	O EdilaMb	F 00
MT	Powder River Energy	Prairie Winds	wind DV		0.5¢/kWh	5.00
MT	Northwestern Energy	E+ Green	wind, PV	2003	2.0¢/kWh	20.00
MT	Park Electric Cooperative	Green Power Program	various renewables	2002	1.02¢/kWh	10.20

				Start		
State	<u>Utility Name</u>	Program Name	<u>Type</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Premium</u>	\$/MWh
	Southern Montana Electric Generation and Transmission Cooperative (5 coops					
	offer program): Fergus Electric, Yellowstone Valley, Bear Tooth Electric, Mid	Environmentally				
MT	Yellowstone, and Tongue River	Preferred Power	wind, hydro	2002	1.05¢/kWh	10.50
		Renewable Resource				
MT	Tri-State Generation & Transmission: Big Horn Rural Electric Company	Power Service	wind, hydro	2001	0.8¢/kWh	8.00
l		Alternative Renewable				
MT	Vigilante Electric Cooperative	Energy Program	wind	2003	1.1¢/kWh	11.00
NV	Deseret Power: Mt. Wheeler Power Cooperative	GreenWay	various	2005	1.95¢/kWh	19.50
NM	El Paso Electric	Renewable Energy Tariff	wind	2003	2.28¢/kWh	22.80
NM	Los Alamos Department of Public Utilities	Green Power	wind	2005	1.8¢/kWh	18.00
		Voluntary Renewable			,	
NM	Navopache Electric Cooperative	Energy Program	TBD	2008	4.0¢/kWh	40.00
NM	Public Service of New Mexico	PNM Sky Blue	wind	2003	1.1¢/kWh	11.00
	Tri-State Generation & Transmission: Central New Mexico Electric Cooperative,					
	Inc., Columbus Electric Cooperative, Inc., Continental Divide Electric					
	Cooperative, Inc., Jemez Mountains Electric Cooperative, Inc., Kit Carson Electric					
	Cooperative, Inc., Mora-San Miguel Electric Cooperative, Inc., Navopache					
	Electric Cooperative, Northern Rio Arriba Electric Cooperative, Otero County					
l	Electric Cooperative, Inc., Sierra Electric Cooperative, Inc., Socorro Electric	Renewable Resource	l		0.4¢/kWh-	
NM	Cooperative, Inc., Southwestern Electric Cooperative, Inc., Springer Electric	Power Service	wind, hydro		2.5¢/kWh	14.50
NM	Xcel Energy	WindSource	wind	1999	3.0¢/kWh	30.00
OR	City of Ashland / Bonneville Environmental Foundation	Renewable Pioneers	PV, wind	2003	2.0¢/kWh	20.00
OR	Columbia River PUD	Choice Energy	wind	2005	1.5¢/kWh	15.00
		Choose Renewable				
OR	Emerald People's Utility District/Green Mountain Energy	Electricity	wind, geothermal	2003	1.2¢/kWh	12.00
	Eugana Water & Electric Board	EMED Crooppourer	lugrious renovables	2007	1.0¢/kWh-	40.50
OR	Eugene Water & Electric Board	EWEB Greenpower	various renewables		1.5¢/kWh	12.50
OR	Eugene Water & Electric Board	EWEB Wind Power	wind	-	0.91¢/kWh	9.10
OR	Idaho Power	Green Power Program	various	2001	0.98¢/kWh	9.80
OR	Midstate Electric Cooperative	Environmentally- Preferred Power	wind	1999	2.5¢/kWh	25.00

				Start		
<u>State</u>	<b>Utility Name</b>	Program Name	<u>Type</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Premium</u>	\$/MWh
OR	Oregon Trail Electric Cooperative	Green Power	wind	2002	1.5¢/kWh	15.00
OR	PacifiCorp: Pacific Power	Blue Sky Block	wind	2000	1.95¢/kWh	19.50
					0.78¢/kWh +	
					\$2.50/mo.	
OR	PacifiCorp: Pacific Power / 3Degrees	Blue Sky Habitat	wind, biomass, PV	2002	donation	7.80
OR	PacifiCorp: Pacific Power / 3Degrees	Blue Sky Usage	wind, biomass, PV	2002	0.78¢/kWh	7.80
	Pacific Northwest Generating Cooperative: Blachly-Lane Electric Cooperative,					
	Central Electric Cooperative, Clearwater Power, Consumers Power, Coos-Curry					
	Electric Cooperative, Douglas Electric Cooperative, Fall River Rural Electric					
	Cooperative, Lost River Electric Cooperative, Raft River Rural Electric					
	Cooperative, Umatilla Electric Cooperative, West Oregon Electric Cooperative,				1.8¢/kWh-	
OR	(11 of 15 coops offer program)	Green Power	landfill gas	1998	2.0¢/kWh	19.00
		Clean Wind for Medium				
	Deatherst Occasion Florida Occasion	to Large Commercial &	o to a		4 7 / // / // /	47.00
OR	Portland General Electric Company	Industrial Accounts	wind	2003	1.7¢/kWh	17.00
OR	Portland General Electric Company	Clean Wind Power	wind	2002	1.75¢/kWh	17.50
			existing geothermal, hydro,			
OR	Portland General Electric Company / Green Mountain Energy	Green Source	new wind	2002	0.8¢/kWh	8.00
OR	Portland General Electric Company / Green Mountain Energy	Renewable Future	wind	2007	1.5¢/kWh	15.00
OR	Springfield Utility Board	ECOchoice	various	2007	1.0¢/kWh	10.00
UT	City of St. George	Clean Green Power	wind, small hydro	2005	2.95¢/kWh	29.50
UT	Deseret Power	GreenWay	various	2003	1.95¢/kWh	19.50
<del>                                      </del>	Descrict Fower	Greenvay	Various	2004	0.71¢/kWh-	19.50
UT	PacifiCorp: Rocky Mountain Power	Blue Sky	wind	2003	1.94¢/kWh	13.25
UT	PacifiCorp: Utah Power	Blue Sky	wind	2000	1.95¢/kWh	19.50
		Renewable Resource			<i>'</i>	
UT	Tri-State Generation & Transmission: Empire Electric Association, Inc.	Power Service	wind, hydro	2001	0.8¢/kWh	8.00
WA	Avista Utilities	Buck-A-Block	wind	2002	0.33¢/kWh	3.30
		Clallam County PUD				
WA	Clallam County PUD	Green Power Program	landfill gas	2001	0.69¢/kWh	6.90

US Department of Energy - Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy
Green Pricing Utility Programs by State - Data as of December 12, 2012
For States Comprising the CAISO, Northwest and Southwest Power Markets (Western Electric Coordinating Council)

				Start		
State	<u>Utility Name</u>	<u>Program Name</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Premium</u>	\$/MWh
WA	Clark Public Utilities	Green Lights	PV, wind	2002	1.5¢/kWh	15.00
		Renewable Resource				
WA	Cowlitz PUD		wind, PV	2002	2.0¢/kWh	20.00
		Alternative Energy				
WA	Grant County PUD	•	wind		2.0¢/kWh	20.00
WA	Grays Harbor PUD		wind	2002	3.0¢/kWh	30.00
1		Green Power Energy				
WA	Lewis County PUD	Rate	wind	-	2.0¢/kWh	20.00
WA	Mason County PUD No. 3	Mason Evergreen Power	wind	2003	1.0¢/kWh	10.00
WA	Northen Wasco County PUD	Pure Power	wind	2007	2.5¢/kWh	25.00
WA	Orcas Power & Light	Go Green	wind, hydro	1999	3.5¢/kWh	35.00
WA	Pacific County PUD	Green Power	landfill gas	2002	1.05¢/kWh	10.50
WA	Pacificorp: Pacific Power	Blue Sky Block	wind	2000	1.95¢/kWh	19.50
WA	Peninsula Light	Green by Choice	wind, hydro, biogas	2002	2.0¢/kWh	20.00
WA	Puget Sound Energy	,	wind, PV, biogas	2002	1.25¢/kWh	12.50
WA	Seattle City Light		wind	2005	1.5¢/kWh	15.00
WA	Snohomish County Public Utility District	Planet Power	wind	2002	2.0¢/kWh	20.00
WA	Tacoma Power	EverGreen Options	wind	2000	1.2¢/kWh	12.00
WY	Basin Electric Power Cooperative: Powder River Energy	Prairie Winds	wind	2000	0.5¢/kWh	5.00
		Renewable Premium	99% new wind, 1%			
WY	Cheyenne Light, Fuel and Power Company/Bonneville Environmental Foundation	Program	new solar	2006	3.5¢/kWh	35.00
WY	Lower Valley Energy	Green Power	wind	2003	1.167¢/kWh	11.67
WY	Pacificorp: Pacific Power	Blue Sky	wind	2000	1.95¢/kWh	19.50
		Renewable Resource				
WY	Tri-State Generation & Transmission: Carbon Power & Light, Inc.	Power Service	wind, hydro	2001	0.8¢/kWh	8.00
WY	Yampa Valley Electric Association	Wind Energy Program	wind	1999	0.6¢/kWh	6.00

**Source:** National Renewable Energy Laboratory, Golden, Colorado.

**Notes:** Utility green pricing programs may only be available to customers located in the utility's service territory.

Average Premium = \$18.15

# SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC ADVICE LETTER 2325-E ATTACHMENT B (REDACTED - PUBLIC VERSION)

### 2011 ERRA PROJECTED RENEWABLE ENERGY

BIO GAS/BIO MASS	Energy (MWh)	Cost (\$)	NQC (kW)
GRS Sycamore Landfill Plant			1,260
MM Prima Deshecha Energy LLC			3,500
MM San Diego LLC - Miramar Landfill			2,900
MM San Diego LLC - North City Bio Plant			200
Covanta Otay 1			1,450
Covanta Otay 3			2,700
San Diego MWD			2,200
GRS Coyote Canyon			5,640
Covanta Delano			33,000
Blue Lake			-
Subtotal			52,850
GEOTHERMAL			
Calpine Geysers			25,000
Subtotal			25,000
OTHER			
Rancho Penasquitos			2,600
Subtotal			<b>2</b> ,600
SOLAR			
Solar_Stirling			15,000
Subtotal			15,000
WIND			
Kumeyaay			6,500
Alta Mesa			4,800
Oasis Power Partners			7,230
PPM Energy			-
WTE Monecito			-
Subtotal			18,530
Total Non-REC			113,980
WIND TREC*			1
Glacier Wind			-
Shell Energy			-
Total TREC*			-

<sup>\*</sup> only includes cost of renewable attribute; does not include cost of energy

Confidential/Privileged Materials; Review and Access Restricted Subject to PU Code Sections 454.5(g), 583, 2111, G.O. 66-C and the Confidentiality Agreement with the CPUC.

# SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC ADVICE LETTER 2325-E ATTACHMENT B (REDACTED - PUBLIC VERSION) 2012 ERRA PROJECTED RENEWABLE ENERGY

CRS Sycamore Landfill   1,260   5an Marcos Landfill   700	BIO GAS/BIO MASS	Energy (MWh)	Cost (\$)	NQC (kW)
Sycamore Landfill	GRS Sycamore Landfill Plant			1,260
MM Prima Deshecha Energy LLC         3,500           MM San Diego LLC - Miramar Landfill         2,900           MM San Diego LLC - North City Bio Plant         200           Covanta Otay 1         1,450           Covanta Otay 3         2,700           San Diego MWD         2,200           GRS Coyote Canyon         5,640           Covanta Delano         33,000           Blue Lake         -           Subtotal         53,980           GEOTHERMAL         Calpine Geysers           Subtotal         25,000           Subtotal         25,000           OTHER         -           Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)         -           Rancho Penasquitos         2,600           Subtotal         2,600           Subtotal         15,600           Subtotal         15,600           WIND         -           Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PM Energy         -           WIND TREC*         6lacier Wind         -	San Marcos Landfill			700
MM San Diego LLC - Miramar Landfill         2,900           MM San Diego LLC - North City Bio Plant         200           Covanta Otay 1         1,450           Covanta Otay 3         2,700           San Diego MWD         2,200           GRS Coyote Canyon         5,640           Covanta Delano         33,000           Blue Lake         -           Subtotal         53,880           GEOTHERMAL         -           Calpine Geysers         25,000           Subtotal         25,000           Subtotal         25,000           OTHER         -           Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)         -           Rancho Penasquitos         2,600           Subtotal         2,600           SOLAR         15,600           Subtotal         15,600           Subtotal         15,600           WIND         -           Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         9           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy	Sycamore Landfill			430
MM San Diego LLC - North City Bio Plant         200           Covanta Otay 1         1,450           Covanta Otay 3         2,700           San Diego MWD         2,200           GRS Coyote Canyon         5,640           Covanta Delano         33,000           Blue Lake         -           Subtotal         53,980           GEOTHERMAL         -           Calpine Geysers         25,000           Subtotal         25,000           OTHER         -           Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)         -           Rancho Penasquitos         2,600           Subtotal         2,600           SULAR         15,600           SULAR         15,600           Subtotal         15,600           WIND         -           Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kurneyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PVM Energy         -           WTE Monecito         -           Subtotal         -	MM Prima Deshecha Energy LLC			3,500
1,450   2,700   2,700   3   2,700   3   2,700   3   3   3   3   3   3   3   3   3	MM San Diego LLC - Miramar Landfill			2,900
2,700   2,200   2,200   3,640   2,200   5,640   5,640   33,000   6   6,640	MM San Diego LLC - North City Bio Plant			200
San Diego MWD         2,200           GRS Coyote Canyon         5,640           Covanta Delano         33,000           Blue Lake         -           Subtotal         53,980           GEOTHERMAL         Calpine Geysers         25,000           Subtotal         25,000           OTHER         -           Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)         -           Rancho Penasquitos         2,600           Subtotal         2,600           Subtotal         15,600           SOLAR         15,600           NRG Borrego Solar         15,600           Subtotal         15,600           WIND         900           Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PME Energy         -           WTE Monecito         -           Subtotal         42,780           Total Non-REC         133,960           WIND TREC*         Glacier Wind         -           Rimin Co	Covanta Otay 1			1,450
Section	Covanta Otay 3			2,700
Subtotal   Subtotal	San Diego MWD			2,200
Blue Lake	GRS Coyote Canyon			5,640
GEOTHERMAL         25,000           Calpine Geysers         25,000           Subtotal         25,000           OTHER         Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)         -           Rancho Penasquitos         2,600           Subtotal         2,600           SOLAR         NRG Borrego Solar         15,600           Subtotal         15,600           WIND         Ceneric Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy         -           WITE Monecito         -           Subtotal         42,780           Total Non-REC         139,960           WIND TREC*         Glacier Wind           Glacier Wind         -           RimRook         -           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         -	Covanta Delano			33,000
GEOTHERMAL         25,000           Calpine Geysers         25,000           Subtotal         25,000           OTHER         —           Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)         -           Rancho Penasquitos         2,600           Subtotal         2,600           SOLAR         —           NRG Borrego Solar         15,600           Subtotal         15,600           WIND         —           Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesea         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy         —           WITE Monecito         —           Subtotal         42,780           Total Non-REC         139,960           WIND TREC*         Glacier Wind         —           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         —	Blue Lake			-
Calpine Geysers         25,000           Subtotal         25,000           OTHER	Subtotal			53,980
Subtotal         25,000           OTHER         Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)         -           Rancho Penasquitos         2,600           Subtotal         2,600           SOLAR         Interpretation (Subtotal)           WIND         15,600           WinD         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy         -           WTE Monecito         -           Subtotal         42,760           Total Non-REC         139,960           WIND TREC*         Glacier Wind           Glacier Wind         -           RimRock         -           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         -	GEOTHERMAL			1
OTHER         Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)         -           Rancho Penasquitos         2,600           Subtotal         2,600           SOLAR         15,600           NRG Borrego Solar         15,600           WIND         Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy         -           WTE Monecito         -           Subtotal         42,780           Total Non-REC         139,960           WIND TREC*         Glacier Wind         -           RimRock         -           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         -	Calpine Geysers			25,000
Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)	Subtotal			25,000
Proposed Portfolio deals (TREC + energy)	OTHER			
Rancho Penasquitos   2,600   2,600				-
SOLAR         15,600           NRG Borrego Solar         15,600           Subtotal         15,600           WIND         5,150           Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy         -           WTE Monecito         -           Subtotal         42,780           Total Non-REC         139,960           WIND TREC*         Glacier Wind         -           Glacier Wind         -           RimRock         -           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         -				2,600
NRG Borrego Solar         15,600           Subtotal         15,600           WIND				2,600
WIND         5,150           Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy         -           WTE Monecito         -           Subtotal         42,780           Total Non-REC         139,960           WIND TREC*         -           Glacier Wind         -           RimRock         -           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         -	SOLAR			
WIND         5,150           Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy         -           WTE Monecito         -           Subtotal         42,780           Total Non-REC         139,960           WIND TREC*         -           Glacier Wind         -           RimRock         -           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         -	NRG Borrego Solar			15,600
Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)         5,150           Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy         -           WTE Monecito         -           Subtotal         42,780           Total Non-REC         139,960           WIND TREC*         -           Glacier Wind         -           RimRock         -           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         -				
Coram Energy       900         Pacific Wind       18,200         Kumeyaay       6,500         Alta Mesa       4,800         Oasis Power Partners       7,230         PPM Energy       -         WTE Monecito       -         Subtotal       42,780         Total Non-REC       139,960         WIND TREC*       -         Glacier Wind       -         RimRock       -         Generic TREC (under negotiation)       -	WIND			<del>                                     </del>
Coram Energy         900           Pacific Wind         18,200           Kumeyaay         6,500           Alta Mesa         4,800           Oasis Power Partners         7,230           PPM Energy         -           WTE Monecito         -           Subtotal         42,780           Total Non-REC         139,960           WIND TREC*         -           Glacier Wind         -           RimRock         -           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         -	Generic Wind contracts (under negotiation)			5,150
Pacific Wind       18,200         Kumeyaay       6,500         Alta Mesa       4,800         Oasis Power Partners       7,230         PPM Energy       -         WTE Monecito       -         Subtotal       42,780         Total Non-REC       139,960         WIND TREC*       Glacier Wind         RimRock       -         Generic TREC (under negotiation)       -				900
Alta Mesa       4,800         Oasis Power Partners       7,230         PPM Energy       -         WTE Monecito       -         Subtotal       42,780         Total Non-REC       139,960         WIND TREC*       Clacier Wind         Glacier Wind       -         RimRock       -         Generic TREC (under negotiation)       -				18,200
Alta Mesa       4,800         Oasis Power Partners       7,230         PPM Energy       -         WTE Monecito       -         Subtotal       42,780         Total Non-REC       139,960         WIND TREC*       Clacier Wind         Glacier Wind       -         RimRock       -         Generic TREC (under negotiation)       -	Kumeyaay			6,500
PPM Energy				_
VITE Monecito	Oasis Power Partners			7,230
WIND TREC*         Glacier Wind         -           RimRock         -           Generic TREC (under negotiation)         -	PPM Energy			-
Total Non-REC  WIND TREC*  Glacier Wind  RimRock  Generic TREC (under negotiation)	WTE Monecito			-
WIND TREC* Glacier Wind - RimRock Generic TREC (under negotiation) -	Subtotal			42,780
Glacier Wind - RimRock - Generic TREC (under negotiation) -	Total Non-REC			139,960
Glacier Wind - RimRock - Generic TREC (under negotiation) -	WIND TREC*	Γ		<del>                                     </del>
RimRock Generic TREC (under negotiation) -				_
Generic TREC (under negotiation)				-
				-
				-

<sup>\*</sup> only includes cost of renewable attribute; does not include cost of energy

Confidential/Privileged Materials; Review and Access Restricted Subject to PU Code Sections 454.5(g), 583, 2111, G.O. 66-C and the Confidentiality Agreement with the CPUC.