

From: Ketabi, Noushin

Sent: 8/29/2012 4:49:57 PM

'marcusdacunha@hotmail.com' (marcusdacunha@hotmail.com);
'Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com' (Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com);
'blaising@braunlegal.com' (blaising@braunlegal.com);
'abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com' (abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com);
'tphillips@tigernaturalgas.com' (tphillips@tigernaturalgas.com);
'rick_noger@praxair.com' (rick_noger@praxair.com); 'cpacc@calpine.com'
(cpacc@calpine.com); 'kwd@vnf.com' (kwd@vnf.com);
'DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com' (DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com);
'DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com' (DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com);
'liddell@energyattorney.com' (liddell@energyattorney.com);
'liddell@energyattorney.com' (liddell@energyattorney.com);
'douglass@energyattorney.com' (douglass@energyattorney.com);
'igoodman@commerceenergy.com' (igoodman@commerceenergy.com);
'akbar.jazayeri@sce.com' (akbar.jazayeri@sce.com); 'kb@enercalusa.com'
(kb@enercalusa.com); 'rkmoore@gswater.com' (rkmoore@gswater.com);
'AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com' (AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com);
'GBass@NobleSolutions.com' (GBass@NobleSolutions.com);
'mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com' (mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com);
To: 'andrew.wang@solarreserve.com' (andrew.wang@solarreserve.com);
'STomec@CapitalPower.com' (STomec@CapitalPower.com);
'daking@semprausgp.com' (daking@semprausgp.com); 'martin.kadillak@shell.com'
(martin.kadillak@shell.com); 'p.shepard@dgc-us.com' (p.shepard@dgc-us.com);
'kara.morgan@tac-denver.com' (kara.morgan@tac-denver.com); Cherry, Brian K
(/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7);
'theresa.mueller@sfgov.org' (theresa.mueller@sfgov.org); Lee, Diana
(diana.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); Huffman, Mark (Law)
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); 'nes@a-klaw.com' (nes@a-
klaw.com); 'mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com' (mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com);
'GloriaB@anzaelectric.org' (GloriaB@anzaelectric.org);
'BCragg@GoodinMacbride.com' (BCragg@GoodinMacbride.com);
'mday@goodinmacbride.com' (mday@goodinmacbride.com);
'mmattes@nossaman.com' (mmattes@nossaman.com); 'jeffgray@dwt.com'
(jeffgray@dwt.com); 'edwardoneill@dwt.com' (edwardoneill@dwt.com);
'matthew@turn.org' (matthew@turn.org); 'sdhilton@stoel.com'
(sdhilton@stoel.com); 'ek@a-klaw.com' (ek@a-klaw.com);
'MCampbell@sfwater.org' (MCampbell@sfwater.org); 'sue.mara@rtoadvisors.com'
(sue.mara@rtoadvisors.com); 'tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com'
(tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com); 'ssmyers@att.net' (ssmyers@att.net); 'mtierney-
lloyd@enernoc.com' (mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com); 'wrostov@earthjustice.org'
(wrostov@earthjustice.org); 'dbehles@ggu.edu' (dbehles@ggu.edu);
'JChamberlin@LSPower.com' (JChamberlin@LSPower.com);
'Andrea.Morrison@DirectEnergy.com' (Andrea.Morrison@DirectEnergy.com);
'lcottle@winston.com' (lcottle@winston.com); 'tam.hunt@gmail.com'

(tam.hunt@gmail.com); 'smartinez@nrdc.org' (smartinez@nrdc.org);
'dorth@krcd.org' (dorth@krcd.org); 'proceedings@megawatts.com'
(proceedings@megawatts.com); 'JStoddard@manatt.com'
(JStoddard@manatt.com); 'John@DicksonGeesman.com'
(John@DicksonGeesman.com); 'kristine@SoCalTelephone.com'
(kristine@SoCalTelephone.com); Duenas, Rosa
(/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=R1DJ1); Zahariudakis,
George (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=GxZ5); Gong, Alice
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=AxL3); 'abb@eslawfirm.com'
(abb@eslawfirm.com); 'mrw@mrwassoc.com' (mrw@mrwassoc.com);
'kmills@cbbf.com' (kmills@cbbf.com); 'brbarkovich@earthlink.net'
(brbarkovich@earthlink.net); 'bobgex@dwt.com' (bobgex@dwt.com);
'klatt@energyattorney.com' (klatt@energyattorney.com);
'diane.fellman@nrgenergy.com' (diane.fellman@nrgenergy.com);
'lmh@eslawfirm.com' (lmh@eslawfirm.com); 'tomb@crossborderenergy.com'
(tomb@crossborderenergy.com); 'californiadockets@pacificorp.com'
(californiadockets@pacificorp.com); 'wem@igc.org' (wem@igc.org); 'jimross@r-c-s-
inc.com' (jimross@r-c-s-inc.com); 'janreid@coastecon.com'
(janreid@coastecon.com); 'DWTCPUCKETTS@dwt.com'
(DWTCPUCKETTS@dwt.com); 'jleslie@McKennaLong.com'
(jleslie@McKennaLong.com); 'lwisland@ucsusa.org' (lwisland@ucsusa.org);
'gifford.jung@powerex.com' (gifford.jung@powerex.com); 'deb@a-klaw.com'
(deb@a-klaw.com); 'agerterlinda@gmail.com' (agerterlinda@gmail.com);
'bmarshall@psrec.coop' (bmarshall@psrec.coop); 'gmorris@emf.net'
(gmorris@emf.net); 'kelly@votesolar.org' (kelly@votesolar.org);
'ddavie@wellhead.com' (ddavie@wellhead.com);
'Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net'
(Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net); 'jsanders@caiso.com'
(jsanders@caiso.com); 'ccollins@energystrat.com' (ccollins@energystrat.com);
'dansvec@hdo.net' (dansvec@hdo.net); 'ehsieh@a123systems.com'
(ehsieh@a123systems.com); 'adam.green@solarreserve.com'
(adam.green@solarreserve.com); 'cte@eslawfirm.com' (cte@eslawfirm.com);
'marilyn@sbesc.com' (marilyn@sbesc.com); 'ronknecht@aol.com'
(ronknecht@aol.com); 'jcandelaria@aspenerg.com' (jcandelaria@aspenerg.com);
'mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com' (mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com);
'randy.keller@calenergy.com' (randy.keller@calenergy.com); 'sahm@clean-
coalition.org' (sahm@clean-coalition.org); 'dyana@clean-coalition.org'
(dyana@clean-coalition.org); 'oliviapara@dwt.com' (oliviapara@dwt.com);
'chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com' (chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com);
'Matthew.Barmack@calpine.com' (Matthew.Barmack@calpine.com);
'LChaset@KeyesAndFox.com' (LChaset@KeyesAndFox.com); 'PLuckow@Synapse-
Energy.com' (PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com); 'rfagan@synapse-energy.com'
(rfagan@synapse-energy.com); 'margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com'
(margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); 'tam@clean-coalition.org' (tam@clean-
coalition.org); 'stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com'
(stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com); 'hudsonr@conedsolutions.com'

(hudsonr@conedsolutions.com); 'ksoutherland@tas.com' (ksoutherland@tas.com);
 'charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com' (charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com);
 'rwilson@synapse-energy.com' (rwilson@synapse-energy.com);
 'gestrada@krismayeslaw.com' (gestrada@krismayeslaw.com);
 'adaberko@starwood.com' (adaberko@starwood.com);
 'Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org' (Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org);
 'eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com' (eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com);
 'FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com' (FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com);
 'dweisz@marinenergy.com' (dweisz@marinenergy.com);
 'andra.pligavko@gmail.com' (andra.pligavko@gmail.com); 'ndivekar@synapse-
 energy.com' (ndivekar@synapse-energy.com); 'bvitale@climatetrust.org'
 (bvitale@climatetrust.org); 'mansell@ieta.org' (mansell@ieta.org);
 'fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com' (fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com);
 RegRelCPUCCases
 (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases); Peck, David B.
 (david.peck@cpuc.ca.gov); Ungson, Chris (chris.ungson@cpuc.ca.gov); Gamson,
 David M. (david.gamson@cpuc.ca.gov); Skinner, Nathaniel
 (nathaniel.skinner@cpuc.ca.gov); Middlekauff, Charles (Law)
 (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd); Jones, Kimberly
 (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=KCJ5); Gonzales, Matthew
 (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg); Chow, Lily
 (lily.chow@cpuc.ca.gov); Lee, Rebecca Tsai-Wei (rebecca.lee@cpuc.ca.gov);
 Parrillo, Jordan (jordan.parrillo@cpuc.ca.gov); Rogers, Nika
 (nika.rogers@cpuc.ca.gov); Spencer, Peter (peter.spencer@cpuc.ca.gov); Lukins,
 Chloe (chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov); Lakhchaura, Megha
 (megha.lakhchaura@cpuc.ca.gov); Kwasny, Iryna (iryna.kwasny@cpuc.ca.gov);
 Hieta, Karin M. (karin.hieta@cpuc.ca.gov); White, Keith D.
 (keith.white@cpuc.ca.gov); Franz, Damon A. (damon.franz@cpuc.ca.gov); Poirier,
 Marcelo (marcelo.poirier@cpuc.ca.gov); Khosrowjah, Sepideh
 (sepideh.khosrowjah@cpuc.ca.gov); Lasko, Yakov (yakov.lasko@cpuc.ca.gov);
 Randolph, Edward F. (edward.randolph@cpuc.ca.gov);
 'atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com' (atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com);
 'cem@newsdata.com' (cem@newsdata.com); 'todd.edmister@bingham.com'
 (todd.edmister@bingham.com); 'rvn@a-klaw.com' (rvn@a-klaw.com);
 'case.admin@sce.com' (case.admin@sce.com); 'CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com'
 (CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com); 'jeanne.sole@sfgov.org'
 (jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); 'filings@a-klaw.com' (filings@a-klaw.com); 'whb@a-
 klaw.com' (whb@a-klaw.com); 'WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com'
 (WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com); O'Donnell, Arthur J.
 (Arthur.O'Donnell@cpuc.ca.gov); Kao, Valerie (valerie.kao@cpuc.ca.gov); Kito,
 Michele (michele.kito@cpuc.ca.gov); 'martinhomec@gmail.com'
 (martinhomec@gmail.com); 'shong@goodinmacbride.com'
 (shong@goodinmacbride.com); 'dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net'
 (dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net); Siao, David (David.Siao@cpuc.ca.gov); Stevens, Brian
 (brian.stevens@cpuc.ca.gov); 'dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net'
 (dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net); 'glw@eslawfirm.com' (glw@eslawfirm.com);

'steven@iepa.com' (steven@iepa.com); 'will.mitchell@cpv.com' (will.mitchell@cpv.com); Wecker, Alan (Alan.Wecker@cpuc.ca.gov); Gupta, Alope (aloke.gupta@cpuc.ca.gov); 'ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com' (ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com); 'TLindl@kfwlaw.com' (TLindl@kfwlaw.com); 'brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com' (brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); 'nicole@braunlegal.com' (nicole@braunlegal.com); 'kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com' (kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com); 'david@ceert.org' (david@ceert.org); 'matt.vespa@SierraClub.org' (matt.vespa@SierraClub.org); 'philm@scdenergy.com' (philm@scdenergy.com); 'mpa@a-klaw.com' (mpa@a-klaw.com); 'slazerow@cbeal.org' (slazerow@cbeal.org); 'jbaird@earthjustice.org' (jbaird@earthjustice.org); 'daniel.h.kim@me.com' (daniel.h.kim@me.com); 'kowalewskia@calpine.com' (kowalewskia@calpine.com); 'jack@casaraquel.com' (jack@casaraquel.com); 'carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com' (carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com); 'dwang@nrdc.org' (dwang@nrdc.org); 'eddyconsulting@gmail.com' (eddyconsulting@gmail.com); 'dws@r-c-s-inc.com' (dws@r-c-s-inc.com); 'djurijew@capitalpower.com' (djurijew@capitalpower.com); 'pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com' (pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com); 'Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com' (Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com); 'beth@beth411.com' (beth@beth411.com); 'pcort@earthjustice.org' (pcort@earthjustice.org); 'e-recipient@caiso.com' (e-recipient@caiso.com); Iwahashi, Miyuki (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MXI8); 'sean.beatty@genon.com' (sean.beatty@genon.com); 'irene@igc.org' (irene@igc.org); 'jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net' (jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net); Young, Patrick (Patrick.Young@cpuc.ca.gov); Ketabi, Noushin (Noushin.Ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov); Ciupagea, Radu (radu.ciupagea@cpuc.ca.gov); 'bsb@eslawfirm.com' (bsb@eslawfirm.com); 'jshields@ssjid.com' (jshields@ssjid.com); 'mpryor@energy.state.ca.us' (mpryor@energy.state.ca.us); 'cbk@eslawfirm.com' (cbk@eslawfirm.com); 'dkk@eslawfirm.com' (dkk@eslawfirm.com); 'kristin.b.burford@gmail.com' (kristin.b.burford@gmail.com); Dudley, Kevin (kevin.dudley@cpuc.ca.gov); 'Mark.Tucker@PacifiCorp.com' (Mark.Tucker@PacifiCorp.com); 'rpsantos@semprautilities.com' (rpsantos@semprautilities.com); 'sbailey@semprausgp.com' (sbailey@semprausgp.com); 'Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com' (Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com); 'sfoley@ggu.edu' (sfoley@ggu.edu); 'Connie.Leni@energy.ca.gov' (Connie.Leni@energy.ca.gov); 'aadeyeye@earthjustice.org' (aadeyeye@earthjustice.org); 'b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org' (b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org); 'TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com' (TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com); 'ericg@votesolar.org' (ericg@votesolar.org); 'dhou@caiso.com' (dhou@caiso.com); 'CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com' (CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com); 'ravage@ieta.org' (ravage@ieta.org); 'cpospisil@edisonmission.com' (cpospisil@edisonmission.com); 'nick@ethree.com' (nick@ethree.com); 'amanda.klopf@sce.com' (amanda.klopf@sce.com); 'greg.blue@sbcglobal.net' (greg.blue@sbcglobal.net); 'peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com' (peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com); 'bspeckman@nexant.com' (bspeckman@nexant.com); 'mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us'

(mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); 'lschwartz@raonline.org'
(lschwartz@raonline.org); 'ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com'
(ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com); 'JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org'
(JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org)

Cc:

Bcc:

Subject: R.12-03-014 - Technical Comments on Proposed Scenarios

Dear R.12-03-014,

Energy Division staff requests technical comments on the proposed scenarios and sensitivities (collectively, “proposed scenarios”) discussed during the 8/24 workshop. Staff asks that parties refer to the attached document, “Key Technical Questions for Parties in Response to Energy Division Proposed Scenarios for Use in the 2012 LTPP (R.12-03-014),” in preparing comments. These technical comments will not be in the record of the proceeding, but will be used to inform a revised staff proposal. The comments should be emailed to the service list on or before 9/7 and should be limited to two pages of text, not counting any supporting spreadsheets or tables. Staff anticipates that the revised staff proposal will be published on approximately 9/14. Policy comments, on the record, are due on 10/1.

For your reference, please find the Scenario Matrix, Scenario Tool (requires MS Excel version 2007 or later), and the 8/24 workshop PowerPoint presentation located on the [Long-Term Procurement Plan History](#) web page. Note that Energy Division staff will post the revised RPS calculator to this web page once available.

Best,

Noushin

Noushin Ketabi

Generation and Transmission Planning

Energy Division

California Public Utilities Commission

(415) 703-2230 (p)

(415) 703-2200 (f)

noushin.ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov