

From: Dyana Delfin-Polk  
Sent: 9/6/2012 9:57:03 AM  
To: Skinner, Nathaniel (nathaniel.skinner@cpuc.ca.gov)  
Ketabi, Noushin (Noushin.Ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov); Dudney, Kevin (kevin.dudney@cpuc.ca.gov); Tam Hunt (tam.hunt@gmail.com); Pushkar Wagle (pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com); rick\_noger@praxair.com (rick\_noger@praxair.com); blaising@braunlegal.com (blaising@braunlegal.com); TPhillips@TigerNaturalGas.com (TPhillips@TigerNaturalGas.com); DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com (DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com); marcusdacunha@hotmail.com (marcusdacunha@hotmail.com); abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com (abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com); Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com (Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com); kwd@vnf.com (kwd@vnf.com); liddell@energyattorney.com (liddell@energyattorney.com); mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com (mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com); douglass@energyattorney.com (douglass@energyattorney.com); igoodman@commerceenergy.com (igoodman@commerceenergy.com); kb@EnerCalUSA.com (kb@EnerCalUSA.com); AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com (AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com); kara.morgan@tac-denver.com (kara.morgan@tac-denver.com); gbass@noblesolutions.com (gbass@noblesolutions.com); cpacc@calpine.com (cpacc@calpine.com); Andrew.Wang@SolarReserve.com (Andrew.Wang@SolarReserve.com); rkmoore@gswater.com (rkmoore@gswater.com); martin.kadillak@shell.com (martin.kadillak@shell.com); akbar.jazayeri@sce.com (akbar.jazayeri@sce.com); daking@semprausgp.com (daking@semprausgp.com); STomec@CapitalPower.com (STomec@CapitalPower.com); p.shepard@dgc-us.com (p.shepard@dgc-us.com); Cherry, Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7); ssmyers@att.net (ssmyers@att.net); sdhilton@stoel.com (sdhilton@stoel.com); edwardoneill@dwt.com (edwardoneill@dwt.com); Lee, Diana (diana.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); nes@a-klaw.com (nes@a-klaw.com); mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com (mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com); bcragg@goodinmacbride.com (bcragg@goodinmacbride.com); tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com (tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com); GloriaB@anzaelectric.org (GloriaB@anzaelectric.org); Huffman, Mark (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com (mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com); andrea.morrison@directenergy.com (andrea.morrison@directenergy.com); sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com (sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com); matthew@turn.org (matthew@turn.org); jeffgray@dwt.com (jeffgray@dwt.com); dorth@krcd.org (dorth@krcd.org); mcampbell@sfgwater.org (mcampbell@sfgwater.org); lcottle@winston.com (lcottle@winston.com); ek@a-klaw.com (ek@a-klaw.com); JChamberlin@LSPower.com (JChamberlin@LSPower.com); mday@goodinmacbride.com (mday@goodinmacbride.com); jstoddard@manatt.com (jstoddard@manatt.com); mmattes@nossaman.com (mmattes@nossaman.com); theresa.mueller@sfgov.org (theresa.mueller@sfgov.org); wrostov@earthjustice.org

(wrostov@earthjustice.org); smartinez@nrdc.org (smartinez@nrdc.org);  
dbehles@ggu.edu (dbehles@ggu.edu); proceedings@megawatts.com  
(proceedings@megawatts.com); john@dicksongeesman.com  
(john@dicksongeesman.com); lchaset@keyesandfox.com  
(lchaset@keyesandfox.com); kristine@SoCalTelephone.com  
(kristine@SoCalTelephone.com); Duenas, Rosa  
(/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=R1DJ1); kmills@cbbf.com  
(kmills@cbbf.com); lmh@eslawfirm.com (lmh@eslawfirm.com);  
brbarkovich@earthlink.net (brbarkovich@earthlink.net); jimross@r-c-s-inc.com  
(jimross@r-c-s-inc.com); case.admin@sce.com (case.admin@sce.com);  
mrw@mrwassoc.com (mrw@mrwassoc.com); wem@igc.org (wem@igc.org);  
bobgex@dwt.com (bobgex@dwt.com); janreid@coastecon.com  
(janreid@coastecon.com); kelly@votesolar.org (kelly@votesolar.org);  
gmorris@emf.net (gmorris@emf.net); DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com  
(DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com); jsanders@caiso.com (jsanders@caiso.com);  
lwisland@ucsusa.org (lwisland@ucsusa.org); adam.green@solarreserve.com  
(adam.green@solarreserve.com); Zahariudakis, George  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=GxZ5); abb@eslawfirm.com  
(abb@eslawfirm.com); Gong, Alice  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=AxL3);  
Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net  
(Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net); tomb@crossborderenergy.com  
(tomb@crossborderenergy.com); klatt@energyattorney.com  
(klatt@energyattorney.com); cte@eslawfirm.com (cte@eslawfirm.com);  
Diane.Fellman@nrenergy.com (Diane.Fellman@nrenergy.com);  
californiadockets@pacificorp.com (californiadockets@pacificorp.com);  
ddavie@wellhead.com (ddavie@wellhead.com); mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com  
(mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com); ccollins@Energystrat.com  
(ccollins@Energystrat.com); dweisz@marinenergy.com (dweisz@marinenergy.com);  
carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com (carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com);  
matthew.barmack@calpine.com (matthew.barmack@calpine.com);  
bmarshall@psrec.coop (bmarshall@psrec.coop); dansvec@hdo.net  
(dansvec@hdo.net); agerterlinda@gmail.com (agerterlinda@gmail.com); deb@a-  
klaw.com (deb@a-klaw.com); gifford.jung@powerex.com  
(gifford.jung@powerex.com); stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com  
(stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com); jleslie@mckennalong.com  
(jleslie@mckennalong.com); oliviapara@dwt.com (oliviapara@dwt.com);  
ksoutherland@tas.com (ksoutherland@tas.com); ehsieh@a123systems.com  
(ehsieh@a123systems.com); sahm@clean-coalition.org (sahm@clean-coalition.org);  
margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com  
(margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com  
(chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com); andra.pligavko@gmail.com  
(andra.pligavko@gmail.com); randy.keller@calenergy.com  
(randy.keller@calenergy.com); Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org  
(Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org); rfagan@synapse-energy.com (rfagan@synapse-  
energy.com); hudsonr@conedsolutions.com (hudsonr@conedsolutions.com);

marilyn@sbesc.com (marilyn@sbesc.com); PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com (PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com); gestrada@krismayeslaw.com (gestrada@krismayeslaw.com); FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com (FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com); charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com (charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com); adaberko@starwood.com (adaberko@starwood.com); rwilson@synapse-energy.com (rwilson@synapse-energy.com); ronknecht@aol.com (ronknecht@aol.com); eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com (eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com); amanda.klopf@sce.com (amanda.klopf@sce.com); jcandelaria@aspenerg.com (jcandelaria@aspenerg.com); ndivekar@synapse-energy.com (ndivekar@synapse-energy.com); bvitale@climatetrust.org (bvitale@climatetrust.org); mansell@ieta.org (mansell@ieta.org); fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com (fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com); RegRelCPUCCases (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases); Peck, David B. (david.peck@cpuc.ca.gov); jeanne.sole@sfgov.org (jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); filings@a-klaw.com (filings@a-klaw.com); mpa@a-klaw.com (mpa@a-klaw.com); jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net (jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net); Ungson, Chris (chris.ungson@cpuc.ca.gov); CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com (CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com); Gamson, David M. (david.gamson@cpuc.ca.gov); glw@eslawfirm.com (glw@eslawfirm.com); cem@newsdata.com (cem@newsdata.com); whb@a-klaw.com (whb@a-klaw.com); e-recipient@caiso.com (e-recipient@caiso.com); Middlekauff, Charles (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd); Jones, Kimberly (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=KCJ5); Gonzales, Matthew (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg); Chow, Lily (lily.chow@cpuc.ca.gov); todd.edmister@bingham.com (todd.edmister@bingham.com); Lee, Rebecca Tsai-Wei (rebecca.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); shong@goodinmacbride.com (shong@goodinmacbride.com); dkk@eslawfirm.com (dkk@eslawfirm.com); Parrillo, Jordan (jordan.parrillo@cpuc.ca.gov); Rogers, Nika (nika.rogers@cpuc.ca.gov); Spencer, Peter (peter.spencer@cpuc.ca.gov); Lukins, Chloe (chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov); Lakhchaura, Megha (megha.lakhchaura@cpuc.ca.gov); kowalewskia@calpine.com (kowalewskia@calpine.com); eddyconsulting@gmail.com (eddyconsulting@gmail.com); steven@iepa.com (steven@iepa.com); mpryor@energy.state.ca.us (mpryor@energy.state.ca.us); martinhomec@gmail.com (martinhomec@gmail.com); djurijew@capitalpower.com (djurijew@capitalpower.com); atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com (atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com); dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net (dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net); Kwasny, Iryna (iryna.kwasny@cpuc.ca.gov); dws@r-c-s-inc.com (dws@r-c-s-inc.com); bsb@eslawfirm.com (bsb@eslawfirm.com); Hieta, Karin M. (karin.hieta@cpuc.ca.gov); kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com (kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com); White, Keith D. (keith.white@cpuc.ca.gov); sean.beatty@genon.com (sean.beatty@genon.com); rvn@a-klaw.com (rvn@a-klaw.com); brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com (brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); beth@beth411.com (beth@beth411.com); Franz, Damon A. (damon.franz@cpuc.ca.gov); Poirier, Marcelo (marcelo.poirier@cpuc.ca.gov);

dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net (dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net); Khosrowjah, Sepideh (sepideh.khosrowjah@cpuc.ca.gov); kristin.b.burford@gmail.com (kristin.b.burford@gmail.com); david@ceert.org (david@ceert.org); dwang@nrdc.org (dwang@nrdc.org); pcort@earthjustice.org (pcort@earthjustice.org); Lasko, Yakov (yakov.lasko@cpuc.ca.gov); rpsantos@semprautilities.com (rpsantos@semprautilities.com); jack@casaraquel.com (jack@casaraquel.com); jbaird@earthjustice.org (jbaird@earthjustice.org); slazerow@cbecal.org (slazerow@cbecal.org); WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com (WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com); philm@scdenergy.com (philm@scdenergy.com); Randolph, Edward F. (edward.randolph@cpuc.ca.gov); bspeckman@nexant.com (bspeckman@nexant.com); daniel.h.kim@me.com (daniel.h.kim@me.com); will.mitchell@cpv.com (will.mitchell@cpv.com); Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com (Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com); matt.vespa@SierraClub.org (matt.vespa@SierraClub.org); TLindl@kfwlaw.com (TLindl@kfwlaw.com); O'Donnell, Arthur J. (Arthur.O'Donnell@cpuc.ca.gov); Kao, Valerie (valerie.kao@cpuc.ca.gov); nicole@braunlegal.com (nicole@braunlegal.com); b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org (b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org); Kito, Michele (michele.kito@cpuc.ca.gov); ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com (ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com); cbk@eslawfirm.com (cbk@eslawfirm.com); Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com (Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com); Siao, David (David.Siao@cpuc.ca.gov); Stevens, Brian (brian.stevens@cpuc.ca.gov); Wecker, Alan (Alan.Wecker@cpuc.ca.gov); sbailey@semprausgp.com (sbailey@semprausgp.com); irene@igc.org (irene@igc.org); ericg@votesolar.org (ericg@votesolar.org); aadeyeye@earthjustice.org (aadeyeye@earthjustice.org); TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com (TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com); CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com (CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com); Gupta, Alope (aloke.gupta@cpuc.ca.gov); mark.tucker@pacificcorp.com (mark.tucker@pacificcorp.com); Iwahashi, Miyuki (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MXI8); connie.leni@energy.ca.gov (connie.leni@energy.ca.gov); mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us (mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); dhou@caiso.com (dhou@caiso.com); ravage@ieta.org (ravage@ieta.org); cpospisil@edisonmission.com (cpospisil@edisonmission.com); nick@ethree.com (nick@ethree.com); jshields@ssjid.com (jshields@ssjid.com); peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com (peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com); Young, Patrick (Patrick.Young@cpuc.ca.gov); Ciupagea, Radu (radu.ciupagea@cpuc.ca.gov); greg.blue@sbcglobal.net (greg.blue@sbcglobal.net); Ischwartz@raponline.org (Ischwartz@raponline.org); ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com (ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com); sfoley@ggu.edu (sfoley@ggu.edu); JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org (JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org); Meal, Meg (MMeal@sfwater.org)

Bcc:

Subject: RE: R.12-03-014 - Technical Comments on Proposed Scenarios

Good morning, Nat, Kevin and parties of R. 12-03-014,

In light of the fact that the template for the technical comments was sent at the end of the day last Friday and the RPS calculator was posted the day before yesterday, the Clean Coalition respectfully requests an extension of time for parties to submit technical comments on the scenarios until Wednesday, September 12th. This should give parties sufficient time to review the materials and give efficient feedback.

Best regards,

--

Dyana Marie Delfin-Polk, MPP  
Policy Associate  
Clean Coalition  
(209) 658-5837 (mobile)  
[dyana@clean-coalition.org](mailto:dyana@clean-coalition.org)

On Wed, Sep 5, 2012 at 9:01 AM, Skinner, Nathaniel <[nathaniel.skinner@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:nathaniel.skinner@cpuc.ca.gov)> wrote:

Hi Tam,

Small PV is defined in the June 27<sup>th</sup> ACR on Standardized Planning Assumptions, at page 17 of the pdf document (page 13 of Attachment A).

Best,

Nat

### **Small solar photovoltaic (behind the meter)**

The impacts of initiatives, such as the California solar initiative, are embedded in the CED forecast. This

adjustment to a forecast would reflect further expansion of behind the meter programs, as separate

from systems located on the distribution system or connected to the transmission system. Small

photovoltaic are defined as up to 5 MW in AC nameplate capacity. The incremental values for the mid

and high assumptions are reflective of the increase in Net Energy Metering (NEM) from D.12 - 05 - 036.

**From:** Tam Hunt [mailto:[tam.hunt@gmail.com](mailto:tam.hunt@gmail.com)]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 04, 2012 4:15 PM  
**To:** Dudney, Kevin  
**Cc:** <SNIP>

**Subject:** Re: R.12-03-014 - Technical Comments on Proposed Scenarios

Kevin, can you please define "small PV" as used in question 5?

Sincerely,

Tam Hunt, J.D.  
Community Renewable Solutions, LLC  
(805) 214-6150  
Fax: (805) 456-7760  
Check out our new "Solar Broker" service

On Tue, Sep 4, 2012 at 1:38 PM, Dudney, Kevin <[kevin.dudney@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:kevin.dudney@cpuc.ca.gov)> wrote:

Pushkar and R.12-03-014,

Yes, that is correct. Also, the current version of the 33% RPS Calculator is now posted here:

[http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/PUC/energy/Procurement/LTPP/ltp\\_history.htm](http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/PUC/energy/Procurement/LTPP/ltp_history.htm)

I apologize for the delay in posting the 33% RPS Calculator.

Thanks,

Kevin

Kevin Dudney

CPUC – Generation and Transmission Planning

415.703.2557

**From:** pushkar wagle [mailto:[pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com](mailto:pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com)]

**Sent:** Tuesday, September 04, 2012 10:52 AM

**To:** Ketabi, Noushin

**Cc:** <SNIP>

**Subject:** Re: R.12-03-014 - Technical Comments on Proposed Scenarios

Energy Division Staff & Parties to R.12-03-14:

This reverses schedule that was presented on August 24th Workshop (Presentation Slide # 6: Schedule – Track 2). Please confirm that the parties are now expected to comment only on the "Technical" questions posed by the CPUC ED by 09/07; and that the Policy comments that were earlier due 09/07 are now due 10/01. Also, in order to responsibly provide comments on the 33% RPS calculator as requested by ED in the list of questions, please post the latest version of the calculator at your earliest.

Thanks.

Pushkar

--

Pushkar Waglé, Ph.D.

Senior Consultant

Flynn Resource Consultants Inc.

2900 Gordon Avenue, Suite 100-3

Santa Clara, California 95051

888-634-3339 (Direct)

888-634-3339 (fax)

On 8/29/12 4:49 PM, Ketabi, Noushin wrote:

Dear R.12-03-014,

Energy Division staff requests technical comments on the proposed scenarios and sensitivities (collectively, “proposed scenarios”) discussed during the 8/24 workshop. Staff asks that parties refer to the attached document, “Key Technical Questions for Parties in Response to Energy Division Proposed Scenarios for Use in the 2012 LTPP (R.12-03-014),” in preparing comments. These technical comments will not be in the record of the proceeding, but will be used to inform a revised staff proposal. The comments should be emailed to the service list on or before 9/7 and should be limited to two pages of text, not counting any supporting spreadsheets or tables. Staff anticipates that the revised staff proposal will be published on approximately 9/14. Policy comments, on the record, are due on 10/1.

For your reference, please find the Scenario Matrix, Scenario Tool (requires MS Excel version 2007 or later), and the 8/24 workshop PowerPoint presentation located on the [Long-Term Procurement Plan History](#) web page. Note that Energy Division staff will post the revised RPS calculator to this web page once available.

Best,

Noushin



**Noushin Ketabi**

Generation and Transmission Planning

Energy Division

California Public Utilities Commission

(415) 703-2230 (p)

(415) 703-2200 (f)

noushin.ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov

--

Pushkar Waglé, Ph.D.

Senior Consultant

Flynn Resource Consultants Inc.

2900 Gordon Avenue, Suite 100-3

Santa Clara, California 95051

888-634-3339 (Direct)

888-634-3339 (fax)

**Corporate Office:**

5440 Edgeview Drive

Discovery Bay, CA 94505

888-634-0222 Ext.5 (phone)

pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com

This electronic message contains information from Flynn Resource Consultants Inc., which is confidential or privileged. The information is intended to be sent to the individual or entity named above. If you are not the intended recipient, be aware that any disclosure, copying or distribution or use of the contents of this information is prohibited. If you have received this electronic transmission in error, please notify us by email at [security@flynnrci.com](mailto:security@flynnrci.com).