

From: sierramrnc@gmail.com

Sent: 9/7/2012 5:11:26 PM

To: Sara Steck Myers (ssmyers@att.net)

Skinner, Nathaniel (nathaniel.skinner@cpuc.ca.gov); marcusdacunha@hotmail.com (marcusdacunha@hotmail.com); Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com (Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com); kevin.dudney@cpuc.ca.gov (kevin.dudney@cpuc.ca.gov); rick_noger@praxair.com (rick_noger@praxair.com); kb@EnerCalUSA.com (kb@EnerCalUSA.com); blaising@braunlegal.com (blaising@braunlegal.com); TPhillips@TigerNaturalGas.com (TPhillips@TigerNaturalGas.com); DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com (DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com); cpacc@calpine.com (cpacc@calpine.com); abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com (abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com); kwd@vnf.com (kwd@vnf.com); liddell@energyattorney.com (liddell@energyattorney.com); tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com (tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com); mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com (mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com); douglass@energyattorney.com (douglass@energyattorney.com); GloriaB@anzaelectric.org (GloriaB@anzaelectric.org); igoodman@commerceenergy.com (igoodman@commerceenergy.com); AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com (AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com); kara.morgan@tac-denver.com (kara.morgan@tac-denver.com); gbass@noblesolutions.com (gbass@noblesolutions.com); Andrew.Wang@SolarReserve.com (Andrew.Wang@SolarReserve.com); rkmoore@gswater.com (rkmoore@gswater.com); martin.kadillak@shell.com (martin.kadillak@shell.com); akbar.jazayeri@sce.com (akbar.jazayeri@sce.com); daking@semprausgp.com (daking@semprausgp.com); STomec@CapitalPower.com (STomec@CapitalPower.com); p.shepard@dgc-us.com (p.shepard@dgc-us.com); Cherry, Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7); sdhilton@stoel.com (sdhilton@stoel.com); edwardoneill@dwt.com (edwardoneill@dwt.com); nes@a-klaw.com (nes@a-klaw.com); mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com (mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com); bcragg@goodinmacbride.com (bcragg@goodinmacbride.com); gmorris@emf.net (gmorris@emf.net); Huffman, Mark (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com (mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com); lwisland@ucsusa.org (lwisland@ucsusa.org); andrea.morrison@directenergy.com (andrea.morrison@directenergy.com); tam.hunt@gmail.com (tam.hunt@gmail.com); sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com (sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com); matthew@turn.org (matthew@turn.org); jeffgray@dwt.com (jeffgray@dwt.com); Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net (Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net); dorth@krcd.org (dorth@krcd.org); mcampbell@sfwater.org (mcampbell@sfwater.org); lcottle@winston.com (lcottle@winston.com); ek@a-klaw.com (ek@a-klaw.com); JChamberlin@LSPower.com (JChamberlin@LSPower.com); mday@goodinmacbride.com (mday@goodinmacbride.com); jstoddard@manatt.com (jstoddard@manatt.com); mmattes@nossaman.com (mmattes@nossaman.com);

theresa.mueller@sfgov.org (theresa.mueller@sfgov.org); wrostov@earthjustice.org
(wrostov@earthjustice.org); dbehles@ggu.edu (dbehles@ggu.edu);
dil@cpuc.ca.gov (dil@cpuc.ca.gov); proceedings@megawattsf.com
(proceedings@megawattsf.com); john@dicksongeesman.com
(john@dicksongeesman.com); lchaset@keyesandfox.com
(lchaset@keyesandfox.com); kristine@SoCalTelephone.com
(kristine@SoCalTelephone.com); Duenas, Rosa
(/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=R1DJ1); kmills@cfbf.com
(kmills@cfbf.com); lmh@eslawfirm.com (lmh@eslawfirm.com);
brbarkovich@earthlink.net (brbarkovich@earthlink.net); jimross@r-c-s-inc.com
(jimross@r-c-s-inc.com); case.admin@sce.com (case.admin@sce.com);
mrw@mrwassoc.com (mrw@mrwassoc.com); wem@igc.org (wem@igc.org);
bobgex@dwt.com (bobgex@dwt.com); janreid@coastecon.com
(janreid@coastecon.com); kelly@votesolar.org (kelly@votesolar.org);
DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com (DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com);
jsanders@caiso.com (jsanders@caiso.com); adam.green@solarreserve.com
(adam.green@solarreserve.com); Zahariudakis, George
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=GxZ5); abb@eslawfirm.com
(abb@eslawfirm.com); Gong, Alice
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=AxL3);
tomb@crossborderenergy.com (tomb@crossborderenergy.com);
klatt@energyattorney.com (klatt@energyattorney.com); cte@eslawfirm.com
(cte@eslawfirm.com); Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com
(Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com); californiadockets@pacificorp.com
(californiadockets@pacificorp.com); ddavie@wellhead.com
(ddavie@wellhead.com); mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com
(mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com); ccollins@Energystrat.com
(ccollins@Energystrat.com); dweisz@marinenergy.com
(dweisz@marinenergy.com); carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com
(carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com); matthew.barmack@calpine.com
(matthew.barmack@calpine.com); bmarshall@psrec.coop (bmarshall@psrec.coop);
dansvec@hdo.net (dansvec@hdo.net); agerterlinda@gmail.com
(agerterlinda@gmail.com); deb@a-klaw.com (deb@a-klaw.com);
gifford.jung@powerex.com (gifford.jung@powerex.com);
stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com (stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com);
jleslie@mckennalong.com (jleslie@mckennalong.com); oliviapara@dwt.com
(oliviapara@dwt.com); ksoutherland@tas.com (ksoutherland@tas.com);
ehsieh@a123systems.com (ehsieh@a123systems.com); sahm@clean-coalition.org
(sahm@clean-coalition.org); margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com
(margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com
(chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com); andra.pligavko@gmail.com
(andra.pligavko@gmail.com); dyana@clean-coalition.org (dyana@clean-
coalition.org); randy.keller@calenergy.com (randy.keller@calenergy.com);
Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org (Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org);
rfagan@synapse-energy.com (rfagan@synapse-energy.com);
hudsonr@conedsolutions.com (hudsonr@conedsolutions.com); tam@clean-

coalition.org (tam@clean-coalition.org); marilyn@sbesc.com (marilyn@sbesc.com);
PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com (PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com);
gestrada@krismayeslaw.com (gestrada@krismayeslaw.com);
FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com (FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com);
charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com (charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com);
adaberko@starwood.com (adaberko@starwood.com); rwilson@synapse-energy.com
(rwilson@synapse-energy.com); snichols@summitpower.com
(snichols@summitpower.com); ronknecht@aol.com (ronknecht@aol.com);
eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com (eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com);
amanda.klopf@sce.com (amanda.klopf@sce.com); jandelaria@aspenerg.com
(jandelaria@aspenerg.com); ndivekar@synapse-energy.com (ndivekar@synapse-
energy.com); bvitale@climatetrust.org (bvital@climatetrust.org); mansell@ieta.org
(mansell@ieta.org); fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com
(fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com); RegRelCPUCCases
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases);
jeanne.sole@sfgov.org (jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); filings@a-klaw.com (filings@a-
klaw.com); mpa@a-klaw.com (mpa@a-klaw.com);
jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net (jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net);
CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com (CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com);
glw@eslawfirm.com (glw@eslawfirm.com); cem@newsdata.com
(cem@newsdata.com); whb@a-klaw.com (whb@a-klaw.com); e-
recipient@caiso.com (e-recipient@caiso.com); Middlekauff, Charles (Law)
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd); Jones, Kimberly
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=KCJ5); Gonzales, Matthew
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg);
todd.edmister@bingham.com (todd.edmister@bingham.com);
shong@goodinmacbride.com (shong@goodinmacbride.com); dkk@eslawfirm.com
(dkk@eslawfirm.com); kowalewska@calpine.com (kowalewska@calpine.com);
eddyconsulting@gmail.com (eddyconsulting@gmail.com); steven@iepa.com
(steven@iepa.com); mpryor@energy.state.ca.us (mpryor@energy.state.ca.us);
martinhom@iepa.com (martinhom@iepa.com); djurjew@capitalpower.com
(djurjew@capitalpower.com); atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com
(atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com); dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net
(dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net); dws@r-c-s-inc.com (dws@r-c-s-inc.com);
bsb@eslawfirm.com (bsb@eslawfirm.com); kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com
(kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com); sean.beatty@genon.com
(sean.beatty@genon.com); rvn@a-klaw.com (rvn@a-klaw.com);
brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com (brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); beth@beth411.com
(beth@beth411.com); dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net (dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net);
skh@cpuc.ca.gov (skh@cpuc.ca.gov); mpo@cpuc.ca.gov (mpo@cpuc.ca.gov);
dbp@cpuc.ca.gov (dbp@cpuc.ca.gov); kristin.b.burford@gmail.com
(kristin.b.burford@gmail.com); david@ceert.org (david@ceert.org);
pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com (pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com); pcort@earthjustice.org
(pcort@earthjustice.org); rpsantos@semprautilities.com
(rpsantos@semprautilities.com); jack@casaraquel.com (jack@casaraquel.com);
jbaird@earthjustice.org (jbaird@earthjustice.org); slazerow@cbeval.org

(slazerow@cbeval.org); WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com
(WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com); philm@scedenergy.com (philm@scedenergy.com);
bspeckman@nexant.com (bspeckman@nexant.com); daniel.h.kim@me.com
(daniel.h.kim@me.com); will.mitchell@cpv.com (will.mitchell@cpv.com);
Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com (Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com); clu@cpuc.ca.gov
(clu@cpuc.ca.gov); nlr@cpuc.ca.gov (nlr@cpuc.ca.gov); kwh@cpuc.ca.gov
(kwh@cpuc.ca.gov); nws@cpuc.ca.gov (nws@cpuc.ca.gov); ao1@cpuc.ca.gov
(ao1@cpuc.ca.gov); matt.vespa@SierraClub.org (matt.vespa@SierraClub.org);
TLindl@kfwlaw.com (TLindl@kfwlaw.com); nicole@braunlegal.com
(nicole@braunlegal.com); b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org (b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org);
ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com (ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com); cbk@eslawfirm.com
(cbk@eslawfirm.com); efr@cpuc.ca.gov (efr@cpuc.ca.gov); wtr@cpuc.ca.gov
(wtr@cpuc.ca.gov); kar@cpuc.ca.gov (kar@cpuc.ca.gov); mk1@cpuc.ca.gov
(mk1@cpuc.ca.gov); Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com
(Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com); iak@cpuc.ca.gov (iak@cpuc.ca.gov);
kho@cpuc.ca.gov (kho@cpuc.ca.gov); sbailey@semprausgp.com
(sbailey@semprausgp.com); irene@igc.org (irene@igc.org); ericg@votesolar.org
(ericg@votesolar.org); aadeyeye@earthjustice.org (aadeyeye@earthjustice.org);
TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com (TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com);
CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com (CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com);
df1@cpuc.ca.gov (df1@cpuc.ca.gov); ag2@cpuc.ca.gov (ag2@cpuc.ca.gov);
aw3@cpuc.ca.gov (aw3@cpuc.ca.gov); mark.tucker@pacificorp.com
(mark.tucker@pacificorp.com); bruce.perlstein@navigant.com
(bruce.perlstein@navigant.com); Iwahashi, Miyuki
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MXI8); ds1@cpuc.ca.gov
(ds1@cpuc.ca.gov); connie.leni@energy.ca.gov (connie.leni@energy.ca.gov);
mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us (mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); dmg@cpuc.ca.gov
(dmg@cpuc.ca.gov); mla@cpuc.ca.gov (mla@cpuc.ca.gov); phs@cpuc.ca.gov
(phs@cpuc.ca.gov); dhou@caiso.com (dhou@caiso.com); ynl@cpuc.ca.gov
(ynl@cpuc.ca.gov); brc@cpuc.ca.gov (brc@cpuc.ca.gov); ravage@ieta.org
(ravage@ieta.org); cpospasil@edisonmission.com (cpospasil@edisonmission.com);
nick@ethree.com (nick@ethree.com); jshields@ssjid.com (jshields@ssjid.com);
peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com (peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com);
greg.blue@sbcglobal.net (greg.blue@sbcglobal.net); lschwartz@raponline.org
(lschwartz@raponline.org); kd1@cpuc.ca.gov (kd1@cpuc.ca.gov);
cu2@cpuc.ca.gov (cu2@cpuc.ca.gov); Martinez, Sierra (smartinez@nrdc.org);
Wang, Devra (dwang@nrdc.org); rc5@cpuc.ca.gov (rc5@cpuc.ca.gov);
vuk@cpuc.ca.gov (vuk@cpuc.ca.gov); py2@cpuc.ca.gov (py2@cpuc.ca.gov);
lily.chow@cpuc.ca.gov (lily.chow@cpuc.ca.gov); jordan.parrillo@cpuc.ca.gov
(jordan.parrillo@cpuc.ca.gov); ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com
(ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com); nk1@cpuc.ca.gov (nk1@cpuc.ca.gov);
sfoley@ggu.edu (sfoley@ggu.edu); noushin.Ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov
(noushin.Ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov); JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org
(JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org)

Bcc:

Subject: R.12-03-014 (LTPP) NRDC Technical Comments on Energy Division Proposed Scenarios

Please find attached the Technical Comments of the Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC) on the Energy Division's Proposed Scenarios. These Technical Comments have been submitted and served pursuant to the instructions received from the Energy Division on August 29, 2012.

Sierra Martinez

Legal Director, California Energy Projects

NRDC

(415) 875-6108