

From: Pushkar Wagle
Sent: 9/4/2012 10:52:17 AM
To: Ketabi, Noushin (Noushin.Ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov)
'blaising@braunlegal.com' (blaising@braunlegal.com);
'abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com' (abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com);
'marcusdacunha@hotmail.com' (marcusdacunha@hotmail.com);
'Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com' (Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com);
'kb@enercalusa.com' (kb@enercalusa.com); 'tphillips@tigernaturalgas.com'
(tphillips@tigernaturalgas.com); 'rick_noger@praxair.com'
(rick_noger@praxair.com); 'cpacc@calpine.com' (cpacc@calpine.com);
'kwd@vnf.com' (kwd@vnf.com); 'p.shepard@dgc-us.com' (p.shepard@dgc-us.com);
'kara.morgan@tac-denver.com' (kara.morgan@tac-denver.com);
'DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com' (DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com);
'liddell@energyattorney.com' (liddell@energyattorney.com);
'douglass@energyattorney.com' (douglass@energyattorney.com);
'GloriaB@anzaelectric.org' (GloriaB@anzaelectric.org);
'tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com' (tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com);
'igoodman@commerceenergy.com' (igoodman@commerceenergy.com);
'akbar.jazayeri@sce.com' (akbar.jazayeri@sce.com); 'tam.hunt@gmail.com'
(tam.hunt@gmail.com); 'rkmoore@gswater.com' (rkmoore@gswater.com);
Cc: 'AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com' (AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com);
'GBass@NobleSolutions.com' (GBass@NobleSolutions.com);
'mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com' (mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com);
'andrew.wang@solarreserve.com' (andrew.wang@solarreserve.com);
'STomec@CapitalPower.com' (STomec@CapitalPower.com);
'daking@semprausgp.com' (daking@semprausgp.com); 'martin.kadillak@shell.com'
(martin.kadillak@shell.com); 'kristine@SoCalTelephone.com'
(kristine@SoCalTelephone.com); Cherry, Brian K
(/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7);
'theresa.mueller@sfgov.org' (theresa.mueller@sfgov.org); Lee, Diana
(diana.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); Huffman, Mark (Law)
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); 'nes@a-klaw.com' (nes@a-
klaw.com); 'mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com' (mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com);
'BCragg@GoodinMacbride.com' (BCragg@GoodinMacbride.com);
'mday@goodinmacbride.com' (mday@goodinmacbride.com);
'mmattes@nossaman.com' (mmattes@nossaman.com); 'jeffgray@dwt.com'
(jeffgray@dwt.com); 'edwardoneill@dwt.com' (edwardoneill@dwt.com);
'matthew@turn.org' (matthew@turn.org); 'sdhilton@stoel.com'
(sdhilton@stoel.com); 'ek@a-klaw.com' (ek@a-klaw.com);
'MCampbell@sfwater.org' (MCampbell@sfwater.org); 'sue.mara@rtoadvisors.com'
(sue.mara@rtoadvisors.com); 'ssmyers@att.net' (ssmyers@att.net);
'lwisland@ucsusa.org' (lwisland@ucsusa.org); 'mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com'
(mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com); 'wrostov@earthjustice.org'
(wrostov@earthjustice.org); 'dbehles@ggu.edu' (dbehles@ggu.edu);
'JChamberlin@LSPower.com' (JChamberlin@LSPower.com); 'gmorris@emf.net'

(gmmorris@emf.net); 'Andrea.Morrison@DirectEnergy.com'
(Andrea.Morrison@DirectEnergy.com); 'lcottle@winston.com'
(lcottle@winston.com); 'Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net'
(Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net); 'smartinez@nrdc.org'
(smartinez@nrdc.org); 'dorth@krcd.org' (dorth@krcd.org);
'proceedings@megawatts.com' (proceedings@megawatts.com);
'JStoddard@manatt.com' (JStoddard@manatt.com); 'John@DicksonGeesman.com'
(John@DicksonGeesman.com); 'LChaset@KeyesAndFox.com'
(LChaset@KeyesAndFox.com); Duenas, Rosa
(/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=R1DJ1); Zahariudakis,
George (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=GxZ5); Gong, Alice
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=AxL3); 'abb@eslawfirm.com'
(abb@eslawfirm.com); 'mrw@mrwassoc.com' (mrw@mrwassoc.com);
'kmills@cbbf.com' (kmills@cbbf.com); 'case.admin@sce.com'
(case.admin@sce.com); 'brbarkovich@earthlink.net' (brbarkovich@earthlink.net);
'bobgex@dwt.com' (bobgex@dwt.com); 'klatt@energyattorney.com'
(klatt@energyattorney.com); 'diane.fellman@nrgenergy.com'
(diane.fellman@nrgenergy.com); 'lmh@eslawfirm.com' (lmh@eslawfirm.com);
'tomb@crossborderenergy.com' (tomb@crossborderenergy.com);
'californiadockets@pacificorp.com' (californiadockets@pacificorp.com);
'wem@igc.org' (wem@igc.org); 'jimross@r-c-s-inc.com' (jimross@r-c-s-inc.com);
'janreid@coastecon.com' (janreid@coastecon.com);
'DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com' (DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com);
'jleslie@McKennaLong.com' (jleslie@McKennaLong.com);
'gifford.jung@powerex.com' (gifford.jung@powerex.com); 'deb@a-klaw.com'
(deb@a-klaw.com); 'agerterlinda@gmail.com' (agerterlinda@gmail.com);
'bmarshall@psrec.coop' (bmarshall@psrec.coop); 'carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com'
(carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com); 'kelly@votesolar.org' (kelly@votesolar.org);
'ddavie@wellhead.com' (ddavie@wellhead.com); 'Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com'
(Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com); 'jsanders@caiso.com' (jsanders@caiso.com);
'ccollins@energystrat.com' (ccollins@energystrat.com); 'dansvec@hdo.net'
(dansvec@hdo.net); 'ehsieh@a123systems.com' (ehsieh@a123systems.com);
'adam.green@solarreserve.com' (adam.green@solarreserve.com);
'cte@eslawfirm.com' (cte@eslawfirm.com); 'marilyn@sbesc.com'
(marilyn@sbesc.com); 'ronknecht@aol.com' (ronknecht@aol.com);
'jandelaria@aspenerg.com' (jandelaria@aspenerg.com);
'mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com' (mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com);
'randy.keller@calenergy.com' (randy.keller@calenergy.com); 'sahm@clean-
coalition.org' (sahm@clean-coalition.org); 'dyana@clean-coalition.org'
(dyana@clean-coalition.org); 'oliviapara@dwt.com' (oliviapara@dwt.com);
'chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com' (chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com);
'Matthew.Barmack@calpine.com' (Matthew.Barmack@calpine.com);
'PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com' (PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com);
'rfagan@synapse-energy.com' (rfagan@synapse-energy.com);
'margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com'
(margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); 'tam@clean-coalition.org' (tam@clean-

coalition.org); 'stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com'
(stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com); 'hudsonr@conedsolutions.com'
(hudsonr@conedsolutions.com); 'ksoutherland@tas.com' (ksoutherland@tas.com);
'charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com' (charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com);
'amanda.klopf@sce.com' (amanda.klopf@sce.com); 'rwilson@synapse-energy.com'
(rwilson@synapse-energy.com); 'gestrada@krismayeslaw.com'
(gestrada@krismayeslaw.com); 'adaberko@starwood.com'
(adaberko@starwood.com); 'Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org'
(Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org); 'eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com'
(eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com); 'FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com'
(FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com); 'dweisz@marinenergy.com'
(dweisz@marinenergy.com); 'andra.pligavko@gmail.com'
(andra.pligavko@gmail.com); 'ndivekar@synapse-energy.com' (ndivekar@synapse-
energy.com); 'bvitale@climatetrust.org' (bvitale@climatetrust.org);
'mansell@ieta.org' (mansell@ieta.org); 'fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com'
(fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com); RegRelCPUCCases
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases); Peck, David B.
(david.peck@cpuc.ca.gov); Ungson, Chris (chris.ungson@cpuc.ca.gov); Gamson,
David M. (david.gamson@cpuc.ca.gov); Skinner, Nathaniel
(nathaniel.skinner@cpuc.ca.gov); Middlekauff, Charles (Law)
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd); Jones, Kimberly
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=KCJ5); Gonzales, Matthew
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg); Chow, Lily
(lily.chow@cpuc.ca.gov); Lee, Rebecca Tsai-Wei (rebecca.lee@cpuc.ca.gov);
Parrillo, Jordan (jordan.parrillo@cpuc.ca.gov); Rogers, Nika
(nika.rogers@cpuc.ca.gov); Spencer, Peter (peter.spencer@cpuc.ca.gov); Lukins,
Chloe (chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov); Lakhchaura, Megha
(megha.lakhchaura@cpuc.ca.gov); Kwasny, Iryna (iryna.kwasny@cpuc.ca.gov);
Hieta, Karin M. (karin.hieta@cpuc.ca.gov); White, Keith D.
(keith.white@cpuc.ca.gov); Franz, Damon A. (damon.franz@cpuc.ca.gov); Poirier,
Marcelo (marcelo.poirier@cpuc.ca.gov); Khosrowjah, Sepideh
(sepideh.khosrowjah@cpuc.ca.gov); Lasko, Yakov (yakov.lasko@cpuc.ca.gov);
Randolph, Edward F. (edward.randolph@cpuc.ca.gov);
'atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com' (atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com);
'cem@newsdata.com' (cem@newsdata.com); 'todd.edmister@bingham.com'
(todd.edmister@bingham.com); 'rvn@a-klaw.com' (rvn@a-klaw.com);
'CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com' (CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com);
'jeanne.sole@sfgov.org' (jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); 'filings@a-klaw.com' (filings@a-
klaw.com); 'whb@a-klaw.com' (whb@a-klaw.com);
'WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com' (WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com); O'Donnell,
Arthur J. (Arthur.O'Donnell@cpuc.ca.gov); Kao, Valerie
(valerie.kao@cpuc.ca.gov); Kito, Michele (michele.kito@cpuc.ca.gov);
'martinhomec@gmail.com' (martinhomec@gmail.com);
'shong@goodinmacbride.com' (shong@goodinmacbride.com);
'dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net' (dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net); Siao, David
(David.Siao@cpuc.ca.gov); Stevens, Brian (brian.stevens@cpuc.ca.gov);

'dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net' (dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net); 'glw@eslawfirm.com' (glw@eslawfirm.com); 'steven@iepa.com' (steven@iepa.com); 'will.mitchell@cpv.com' (will.mitchell@cpv.com); Wecker, Alan (Alan.Wecker@cpuc.ca.gov); Gupta, Alope (aloke.gupta@cpuc.ca.gov); 'ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com' (ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com); 'TLindl@kfwlaw.com' (TLindl@kfwlaw.com); 'brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com' (brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); 'nicole@braunlegal.com' (nicole@braunlegal.com); 'kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com' (kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com); 'david@ceert.org' (david@ceert.org); 'matt.vespa@SierraClub.org' (matt.vespa@SierraClub.org); 'philm@scdenergy.com' (philm@scdenergy.com); 'mpa@a-klaw.com' (mpa@a-klaw.com); 'slazerow@cbeal.org' (slazerow@cbeal.org); 'jbaird@earthjustice.org' (jbaird@earthjustice.org); 'daniel.h.kim@me.com' (daniel.h.kim@me.com); 'kowalewskia@calpine.com' (kowalewskia@calpine.com); 'jack@casaraquel.com' (jack@casaraquel.com); 'dwang@nrdc.org' (dwang@nrdc.org); 'eddyconsulting@gmail.com' (eddyconsulting@gmail.com); 'dws@r-c-s-inc.com' (dws@r-c-s-inc.com); 'djurijew@capitalpower.com' (djurijew@capitalpower.com); 'beth@beth411.com' (beth@beth411.com); 'pcort@earthjustice.org' (pcort@earthjustice.org); 'e-recipient@caiso.com' (e-recipient@caiso.com); Iwahashi, Miyuki (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MXI8); 'sean.beatty@genon.com' (sean.beatty@genon.com); 'irene@igc.org' (irene@igc.org); 'jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net' (jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net); Young, Patrick (Patrick.Young@cpuc.ca.gov); Ciupagea, Radu (radu.ciupagea@cpuc.ca.gov); 'bsb@eslawfirm.com' (bsb@eslawfirm.com); 'jshields@ssjid.com' (jshields@ssjid.com); 'mpryor@energy.state.ca.us' (mpryor@energy.state.ca.us); 'cbk@eslawfirm.com' (cbk@eslawfirm.com); 'dkk@eslawfirm.com' (dkk@eslawfirm.com); Jeanne Sole (jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); 'kristin.b.burford@gmail.com' (kristin.b.burford@gmail.com); Dudley, Kevin (kevin.dudley@cpuc.ca.gov); 'Mark.Tucker@PacifiCorp.com' (Mark.Tucker@PacifiCorp.com); 'rpsantos@semprautilities.com' (rpsantos@semprautilities.com); 'sbailey@semprausgp.com' (sbailey@semprausgp.com); 'Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com' (Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com); 'sfoley@ggu.edu' (sfoley@ggu.edu); 'Connie.Leni@energy.ca.gov' (Connie.Leni@energy.ca.gov); 'aadeyeye@earthjustice.org' (aadeyeye@earthjustice.org); 'b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org' (b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org); 'TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com' (TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com); 'ericg@votesolar.org' (ericg@votesolar.org); 'dhou@caiso.com' (dhou@caiso.com); 'CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com' (CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com); 'ravage@ieta.org' (ravage@ieta.org); 'cpospisil@edisonmission.com' (cpospisil@edisonmission.com); 'nick@ethree.com' (nick@ethree.com); 'greg.blue@sbcglobal.net' (greg.blue@sbcglobal.net); 'peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com' (peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com); 'bspeckman@nexant.com' (bspeckman@nexant.com); 'mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us' (mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); 'lschwartz@raponline.org' (lschwartz@raponline.org); 'ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com' (ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com);

'JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org' (JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org); 'Meal, Meg' (MMeal@swater.org)

Bcc:

Subject: RE: R.12-03-014 - Technical Comments on Proposed Scenarios

Energy Division Staff & Parties to R.12-03-14:

This reverses schedule that was presented on August 24th Workshop (Presentation Slide # 6: Schedule – Track 2). Please confirm that the parties are now expected to comment only on the "Technical" questions posed by the CPUC ED by 09/07; and that the Policy comments that were earlier due 09/07 are now due 10/01. Also, in order to responsibly provide comments on the 33% RPS calculator as requested by ED in the list of questions, please post the latest version of the calculator at your earliest.

Thanks.

Pushkar

--

Pushkar Waglé, Ph.D.

Senior Consultant

Flynn Resource Consultants Inc.

2900 Gordon Avenue, Suite 100-3

Santa Clara, California 95051

888-634-3339 (Direct)

888-634-3339 (fax)

On 8/29/12 4:49 PM, Ketabi, Noushin wrote:

Dear R.12-03-014,

Energy Division staff requests technical comments on the proposed scenarios and sensitivities (collectively, “proposed scenarios”) discussed during the 8/24 workshop. Staff asks that parties refer to the attached document, “Key Technical Questions for Parties in Response to Energy Division Proposed Scenarios for Use in the 2012 LTPP (R.12-03-014),” in preparing comments. These technical comments will not be in the record of the proceeding, but will be used to inform a revised staff proposal. The comments should be emailed to the service list on or before 9/7 and should be limited to two pages of text, not

counting any supporting spreadsheets or tables. Staff anticipates that the revised staff proposal will be published on approximately 9/14. Policy comments, on the record, are due on 10/1.

For your reference, please find the Scenario Matrix, Scenario Tool (requires MS Excel version 2007 or later), and the 8/24 workshop PowerPoint presentation located on the [Long-Term Procurement Plan History](#) web page. Note that Energy Division staff will post the revised RPS calculator to this web page once available.

Best,

Noushin

Noushin Ketabi

Generation and Transmission Planning

Energy Division

California Public Utilities Commission

(415) 703-2230 (p)

(415) 703-2200 (f)

noushin.ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov

--

Pushkar Waglé, Ph.D.

Senior Consultant

Flynn Resource Consultants Inc.

2900 Gordon Avenue, Suite 100-3

Santa Clara, California 95051

888-634-3339 (Direct)

888-634-3339 (fax)

Corporate Office:

5440 Edgeview Drive

Discovery Bay, CA 94505

888-634-0222 Ext.5 (phone)

pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com

This electronic message contains information from Flynn Resource Consultants Inc., which is confidential or privileged. The information is intended to be sent to the individual or entity named above. If you are not the intended recipient, be aware that any disclosure, copying or distribution or use of the contents of this information is prohibited. If you have received this electronic transmission in error, please notify us by email at security@flynnrci.com.