

From: Larry Chaset

Sent: 9/7/2012 11:51:38 AM

Skinner, Nathaniel (nathaniel.skinner@cpuc.ca.gov); kevin.dudney@cpuc.ca.gov (kevin.dudney@cpuc.ca.gov); rick\_noger@praxair.com (rick\_noger@praxair.com); blaising@braunlegal.com (blaising@braunlegal.com); TPhillips@TigerNaturalGas.com (TPhillips@TigerNaturalGas.com); DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com (DBodine@LibertyPowerCorp.com); marcusdacunha@hotmail.com (marcusdacunha@hotmail.com); abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com (abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com); Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com (Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com); kwd@vnf.com (kwd@vnf.com); liddell@energyattorney.com (liddell@energyattorney.com); mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com (mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com); douglass@energyattorney.com (douglass@energyattorney.com); igoodman@commerceenergy.com (igoodman@commerceenergy.com); kb@EnerCalUSA.com (kb@EnerCalUSA.com); AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com (AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com); kara.morgan@tac-denver.com (kara.morgan@tac-denver.com); gbass@noblesolutions.com (gbass@noblesolutions.com); cpacc@calpine.com (cpacc@calpine.com); Andrew.Wang@SolarReserve.com (Andrew.Wang@SolarReserve.com); rkmoore@gswater.com (rkmoore@gswater.com); martin.kadillak@shell.com (martin.kadillak@shell.com); akbar.jazayeri@sce.com (akbar.jazayeri@sce.com); daking@semprausgp.com (daking@semprausgp.com); STomec@CapitalPower.com (STomec@CapitalPower.com); p.shepard@dgc-us.com (p.shepard@dgc-us.com); Cherry, Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7); sdhilton@stoel.com (sdhilton@stoel.com); edwardoneill@dwt.com (edwardoneill@dwt.com); nes@a-klaw.com (nes@a-klaw.com); mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com (mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com); bcragg@goodinmacbride.com (bcragg@goodinmacbride.com); tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com (tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com); GloriaB@anzaelectric.org (GloriaB@anzaelectric.org); Huffman, Mark (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com (mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com); andrea.morrison@directenergy.com (andrea.morrison@directenergy.com); tam.hunt@gmail.com (tam.hunt@gmail.com); sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com (sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com); matthew@turn.org (matthew@turn.org); jeffgray@dwt.com (jeffgray@dwt.com); Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net (Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net); dorth@krcd.org (dorth@krcd.org); mcampbell@sfwater.org (mcampbell@sfwater.org); lcottle@winston.com (lcottle@winston.com); ek@a-klaw.com (ek@a-klaw.com); JChamberlin@LSPower.com (JChamberlin@LSPower.com); mday@goodinmacbride.com (mday@goodinmacbride.com); jstoddard@manatt.com (jstoddard@manatt.com); mmattes@nossaman.com (mmattes@nossaman.com); theresa.mueller@sfgov.org (theresa.mueller@sfgov.org); wrostov@earthjustice.org (wrostov@earthjustice.org); smartinez@nrdc.org (smartinez@nrdc.org);

dbehles@ggu.edu (dbehles@ggu.edu); dil@cpuc.ca.gov (dil@cpuc.ca.gov);  
proceedings@megawatts.com (proceedings@megawatts.com);  
john@dicksongeesman.com (john@dicksongeesman.com);  
kristine@SoCalTelephone.com (kristine@SoCalTelephone.com); Duenas, Rosa  
(/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=R1DJ1); kmills@cfbf.com  
(kmills@cfbf.com); lmh@eslawfirm.com (lmh@eslawfirm.com);  
brbarkovich@earthlink.net (brbarkovich@earthlink.net); jimross@r-c-s-inc.com  
(jimross@r-c-s-inc.com); mrw@mrwassoc.com (mrw@mrwassoc.com);  
wem@igc.org (wem@igc.org); bobgex@dwt.com (bobgex@dwt.com);  
janreid@coastecon.com (janreid@coastecon.com); kelly@votesolar.org  
(kelly@votesolar.org); gmorris@emf.net (gmorris@emf.net);  
DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com (DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com);  
jsanders@caiso.com (jsanders@caiso.com); lwisland@ucsusa.org  
(lwisland@ucsusa.org); adam.green@solarreserve.com  
(adam.green@solarreserve.com); Zahariudakis, George  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=GxZ5); abb@eslawfirm.com  
(abb@eslawfirm.com); Gong, Alice  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=AxL3);  
tomb@crossborderenergy.com (tomb@crossborderenergy.com);  
klatt@energyattorney.com (klatt@energyattorney.com); cte@eslawfirm.com  
(cte@eslawfirm.com); Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com  
(Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com); californiadockets@pacificorp.com  
(californiadockets@pacificorp.com); ddavie@wellhead.com  
(ddavie@wellhead.com); mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com  
(mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com); ccollins@Energystrat.com  
(ccollins@Energystrat.com); dweisz@marinenergy.com  
(dweisz@marinenergy.com); carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com  
(carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com); matthew.barmack@calpine.com  
(matthew.barmack@calpine.com); bmarshall@psrec.coop (bmarshall@psrec.coop);  
dansvec@hdo.net (dansvec@hdo.net); agerterlinda@gmail.com  
(agerterlinda@gmail.com); deb@a-klaw.com (deb@a-klaw.com);  
gifford.jung@powerex.com (gifford.jung@powerex.com);  
stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com (stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com);  
jleslie@mckennalong.com (jleslie@mckennalong.com); oliviapara@dwt.com  
(oliviapara@dwt.com); ksoutherland@tas.com (ksoutherland@tas.com);  
ehsieh@a123systems.com (ehsieh@a123systems.com); sahm@clean-coalition.org  
(sahm@clean-coalition.org); margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com  
(margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com  
(chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com); andra.pligavko@gmail.com  
(andra.pligavko@gmail.com); dyana@clean-coalition.org (dyana@clean-  
coalition.org); randy.keller@calenergy.com (randy.keller@calenergy.com);  
Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org (Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org);  
rfagan@synapse-energy.com (rfagan@synapse-energy.com);  
hudsonr@conedsolutions.com (hudsonr@conedsolutions.com); tam@clean-  
coalition.org (tam@clean-coalition.org); marilyn@sbesc.com (marilyn@sbesc.com);  
PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com (PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com);

gestrada@krismayeslaw.com (gestrada@krismayeslaw.com);  
FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com (FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com);  
charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com (charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com);  
adaberko@starwood.com (adaberko@starwood.com); rwilson@synapse-energy.com  
(rwilson@synapse-energy.com); snichols@summitpower.com  
(snichols@summitpower.com); ronknecht@aol.com (ronknecht@aol.com);  
eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com (eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com);  
jcandelaria@aspenerg.com (jcandelaria@aspenerg.com); ndivekar@synapse-  
energy.com (ndivekar@synapse-energy.com); bvitale@climatetrust.org  
(bvitale@climatetrust.org); mansell@ieta.org (mansell@ieta.org);  
fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com (fmobasheri@electricpowergroup.com);  
RegRelCPUCCases  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases);  
jeanne.sole@sfgov.org (jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); filings@a-klaw.com (filings@a-  
klaw.com); mpa@a-klaw.com (mpa@a-klaw.com);  
jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net (jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net);  
CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com (CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com);  
glw@eslawfirm.com (glw@eslawfirm.com); cem@newsdata.com  
(cem@newsdata.com); case.admin@sce.com (case.admin@sce.com); whb@a-  
klaw.com (whb@a-klaw.com); e-recipient@caiso.com (e-recipient@caiso.com);  
Middlekauff, Charles (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd);  
Jones, Kimberly (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=KCJ5); Gonzales,  
Matthew (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg);  
todd.edmister@bingham.com (todd.edmister@bingham.com);  
shong@goodinmacbride.com (shong@goodinmacbride.com); dkk@eslawfirm.com  
(dkk@eslawfirm.com); kowalewskia@calpine.com (kowalewskia@calpine.com);  
eddyconsulting@gmail.com (eddyconsulting@gmail.com); steven@iepa.com  
(steven@iepa.com); mpryor@energy.state.ca.us (mpryor@energy.state.ca.us);  
martinhomerc@gmail.com (martinhomerc@gmail.com); djurijew@capitalpower.com  
(djurijew@capitalpower.com); atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com  
(atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com); dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net  
(dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net); dws@r-c-s-inc.com (dws@r-c-s-inc.com);  
bsb@eslawfirm.com (bsb@eslawfirm.com); kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com  
(kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com); sean.beatty@genon.com  
(sean.beatty@genon.com); rvn@a-klaw.com (rvn@a-klaw.com);  
brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com (brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); beth@beth411.com  
(beth@beth411.com); dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net (dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net);  
skh@cpuc.ca.gov (skh@cpuc.ca.gov); mpo@cpuc.ca.gov (mpo@cpuc.ca.gov);  
dbp@cpuc.ca.gov (dbp@cpuc.ca.gov); kristin.b.burford@gmail.com  
(kristin.b.burford@gmail.com); david@ceert.org (david@ceert.org);  
pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com (pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com); dwang@nrdc.org  
(dwang@nrdc.org); pcort@earthjustice.org (pcort@earthjustice.org);  
rpsantos@semprautilities.com (rpsantos@semprautilities.com);  
jack@casaraquel.com (jack@casaraquel.com); jbaird@earthjustice.org  
(jbaird@earthjustice.org); slazerow@cbecal.org (slazerow@cbecal.org);  
WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com (WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com);

philm@scdenergy.com (philm@scdenergy.com); bspeckman@nexant.com (bspeckman@nexant.com); daniel.h.kim@me.com (daniel.h.kim@me.com); will.mitchell@cpv.com (will.mitchell@cpv.com); Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com (Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com); clu@cpuc.ca.gov (clu@cpuc.ca.gov); nlr@cpuc.ca.gov (nlr@cpuc.ca.gov); kwh@cpuc.ca.gov (kwh@cpuc.ca.gov); nws@cpuc.ca.gov (nws@cpuc.ca.gov); aol@cpuc.ca.gov (aol@cpuc.ca.gov); matt.vespa@SierraClub.org (matt.vespa@SierraClub.org); TLindl@kfwlaw.com (TLindl@kfwlaw.com); nicole@braunlegal.com (nicole@braunlegal.com); b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org (b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org); ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com (ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com); cbk@eslawfirm.com (cbk@eslawfirm.com); efr@cpuc.ca.gov (efr@cpuc.ca.gov); wtr@cpuc.ca.gov (wtr@cpuc.ca.gov); kar@cpuc.ca.gov (kar@cpuc.ca.gov); mk1@cpuc.ca.gov (mk1@cpuc.ca.gov); Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com (Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com); iak@cpuc.ca.gov (iak@cpuc.ca.gov); kho@cpuc.ca.gov (kho@cpuc.ca.gov); sbailey@semprausgp.com (sbailey@semprausgp.com); irene@igc.org (irene@igc.org); ericg@votesolar.org (ericg@votesolar.org); aadeyeye@earthjustice.org (aadeyeye@earthjustice.org); TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com (TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com); CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com (CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com); df1@cpuc.ca.gov (df1@cpuc.ca.gov); ag2@cpuc.ca.gov (ag2@cpuc.ca.gov); aw3@cpuc.ca.gov (aw3@cpuc.ca.gov); mark.tucker@pacificorp.com (mark.tucker@pacificorp.com); bruce.perlstein@navigant.com (bruce.perlstein@navigant.com); Iwahashi, Miyuki (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MXI8); ds1@cpuc.ca.gov (ds1@cpuc.ca.gov); connie.leni@energy.ca.gov (connie.leni@energy.ca.gov); mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us (mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); dmg@cpuc.ca.gov (dmg@cpuc.ca.gov); mla@cpuc.ca.gov (mla@cpuc.ca.gov); phs@cpuc.ca.gov (phs@cpuc.ca.gov); dhou@caiso.com (dhou@caiso.com); ynl@cpuc.ca.gov (ynl@cpuc.ca.gov); brc@cpuc.ca.gov (brc@cpuc.ca.gov); ravage@ieta.org (ravage@ieta.org); cpospisil@edisonmission.com (cpospisil@edisonmission.com); amanda.klopf@sce.com (amanda.klopf@sce.com); nick@ethree.com (nick@ethree.com); jshields@ssjid.com (jshields@ssjid.com); peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com (peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com); greg.blue@sbcglobal.net (greg.blue@sbcglobal.net); lschwartz@raponline.org (lschwartz@raponline.org); kd1@cpuc.ca.gov (kd1@cpuc.ca.gov); cu2@cpuc.ca.gov (cu2@cpuc.ca.gov); Sara Steck Myers (ssmyers@att.net); rc5@cpuc.ca.gov (rc5@cpuc.ca.gov); vuk@cpuc.ca.gov (vuk@cpuc.ca.gov); py2@cpuc.ca.gov (py2@cpuc.ca.gov); lily.chow@cpuc.ca.gov (lily.chow@cpuc.ca.gov); jordan.parrillo@cpuc.ca.gov (jordan.parrillo@cpuc.ca.gov); ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com (ERasmussen@MarinEnergy.com); nk1@cpuc.ca.gov (nk1@cpuc.ca.gov); sfoley@ggu.edu (sfoley@ggu.edu); noushin.Ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov (noushin.Ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov); JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org (JWaen@MarinEnergyAuthority.org)

Cc:

Bcc:

Subject: CPUC Docket R.12-03-014 (LTPP proceeding) -- Technical Comments of Friends of the Earth on the Staff's Proposed Scenarios

**TO: Energy Division Staff and Service List in R.12-03-014:**

Please find attached the **Technical Comments of the Friends of the Earth** on the Energy Division's Proposed Scenarios.

These Technical Comments are being submitted and served in accordance with the instructions provided by Energy Division Staff on August 29, 2012. Since those instructions specified that comments should be limited to two pages, we are attaching two versions of our comments: (1) a version consisting of two pages, but without formal captions and footnotes; and (2) a three-page version with footnotes and formal captions.

Should you have any questions about this document, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Larry

-----

**Laurence Chaset**

Keyes, Fox & Wiedman LLP

Distributed Generation & Renewable Energy Law

(510) 282-4935 | [lchaset@keyesandfox.com](mailto:lchaset@keyesandfox.com) | [www.keyesandfox.com](http://www.keyesandfox.com)

This electronic message transmission contains information from this law firm which may be confidential or privileged. The information is intended for the exclusive use of the individual or entity named above. If you are not the intended recipient, be aware that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the contents of this information is prohibited. If you have received this electronic transmission in error, please notify me at 510-282-4935 or [lchaset@keyesandfox.com](mailto:lchaset@keyesandfox.com) immediately.

