# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Continue Implementation and Administration of California Renewables Portfolio Standard Program. Rulemaking 11-05-005 (Filed May 5, 2011)

### MOTION OF SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY (U902 E) FOR LEAVE TO FILE UNDER SEAL THE UNREDACTED VERSION OF ITS 2012 RENEWABLES PORTFOLIO STANDARD PROCUREMENT PLAN COMPLIANCE FILING

AIMEE M. SMITH 101 Ash Street, HQ-12 San Diego, California 92101 Telephone: (619) 699-5042

Facsimile: (619) 699-5027

Email: amsmith@semprautilities.com

Attorney for SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY

November 29, 2012

# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Continue Implementation and Administration of California Renewables Portfolio Standard Program.

Rulemaking 11-05-005 (Filed May 5, 2011)

### MOTION OF SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY (U902 E) FOR LEAVE TO FILE UNDER SEAL THE UNREDACTED VERSION OF ITS 2012 RENEWABLES PORTFOLIO STANDARD PROCUREMENT PLAN COMPLIANCE FILING

Pursuant to Rule 11.4 of Rules of Practice and Procedure of the California Public Utilities Commission (the "Commission") and Decision ("D.") 06-06-066, *et seq.*, San Diego Gas & Electric Company ("SDG&E") respectfully submits this motion for leave to file under seal the unredacted version of its 2012 Renewables Portfolio Standard ("RPS") Procurement Plan and related documents (together, the "Plan Documents"), filed concurrently herewith.

Public Utilities Code § 454.5(g) requires the Commission to protect from disclosure all "market sensitive information submitted in an electrical corporation's proposed procurement plan." In D.06-06-066, *et seq.*, the Commission adopted rules governing confidentiality of certain categories of electric procurement data routinely submitted to the Commission by investor owned utilities ("IOUs") and energy service providers ("ESPs"). The Commission established two matrices – one applicable to IOUs, the other to ESPs – setting forth categories and sub-categories of data and providing a confidentiality designation for each.<sup>1/2</sup>

 $<sup>^{1/2}</sup>$  See D.06-06-066, as amended by D.07-05-032, mimeo, Appendices 1 and 2.

To the extent information matches a Matrix category, it is entitled to the protection the Matrix provides for that category of information. In addition, the Commission has made clear that information must be protected where "it matches a Matrix category exactly . . . or consists of information from which that information may be easily derived." In order to claim the protection afforded by the relevant Matrix, the party seeking confidential treatment must establish:

- 1) That the material it is submitting constitutes a particular type of data listed in the Matrix,
- 2) Which category or categories in the Matrix the data correspond to.
- 3) That it is complying with the limitations on confidentiality specified in the Matrix for that type of data,
- 4) That the information is not already public, and
- 5) That the data cannot be aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure. 3/

SDG&E demonstrates below that the confidential information provided in the Plan Documents (the "Protected Information") falls within the scope of data protected as confidential pursuant to the IOU Matrix and/or under relevant statutory provisions:<sup>4/</sup>

Administrative Law Judge's Ruling on San Diego Gas & Electric Company's April 3, 2007 Motion to File Data Under Seal, issued May 4, 2007 in R.06-05-027, p. 2 (emphasis added).

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{3}{2}$  D.06-06-066, as amended by D.07-05-032, *mimeo*, p. 81, Ordering Paragraph 2.

The Matrix is derived from the statutory protections extended to non-public market sensitive and trade secret information. (See D.06-06-066, mimeo, Ordering Paragraph 1). The Commission is obligated to act in a manner consistent with applicable law. The analysis of protection afforded under the Matrix must always produce a result that is consistent with the relevant underlying statutes; if information is eligible for statutory protection, it must be protected under the Matrix. (See Southern California Edison Co. v. Public Utilities Comm. 2000 Cal. App. LEXIS 995, \*38-39) Thus, by claiming applicability of the Matrix, SDG&E relies upon and simultaneously claims the protection of applicable statutory provisions including, but not limited to, Public Utilities Code §§ 454.5(g) and 583, Govt. Code § 6254(k) and General Order 66-C.

Data at issue	D.06-06-066 Matrix	How moving party meets requirements			
	Requirements				
2012 RPS Plan,	Demonstrate that the material	These charts set forth analysis based on SDG&E's assessment of individual			
Section V:	submitted constitutes a	RPS projects. These charts also contain information related to SDG&E's			
Table 1 – RPS	particular type of data listed in	Bundled Retail Sales data which if disclosed would allow an interested party			
Sensitivity Analysis	the IOU Matrix	to estimate this data.			
	Identify the Matrix category or	Analysis and evaluation of RPS projects is protected under IOU Matrix			
	categories to which the data	category VII.G.			
	corresponds				
		Utility bundled retail sales data is protected under IOU Matrix category V.C.			
	Affirm that the IOU is	In accordance with the limitations on confidentiality set forth in the IOU			
	complying with the limitations	Matrix, SDG&E requests that the information be kept confidential for the			
	on confidentiality specified in	first partial year in which the information is submitted (2012) and the			
	the Matrix for that type of data   following annual three full years (2013-2015). As the				
		Compliance Period, SDG&E requests that the entirety of Compliance Periods			
		1 and 2 aggregated data be kept confidential (2011-2016).			
	Affirm that the information is	SDG&E has not publicly disclosed this information and is not aware that it			
	not already public	has been disclosed by any other party.			
	Affirm that the data cannot be The information was provided in the format that best conveys the				
	aggregated, redacted,	The data cannot be further aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or			
	summarized, masked or	otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.			
	otherwise protected in a way				
	that allows partial disclosure.				
2012 RPS Plan,	Demonstrate that the material	The SDG&E Residual Net Short for RPS Procurement – November 29, 2012			
Section V:	submitted constitutes a	tables show SDG&E's Bundled Retail Sales data and data that is a function			
2012 RPS Plan –	particular type of data listed in	of SDG&E's Bundled Retail Sales data – SDG&E's RPS Procurement			
SDG&E Residual Net	the IOU Matrix	Quantity Requirement, Category 3 Limitation, and Voluntary Margin of			
Short for RPS		Overprocurement.			

Procurement – November 29, 2012: Rows A, C, J, and R (Bundled Retail Sales Data)	Identify the Matrix category or categories to which the data corresponds	for 2012-2015. SDG&E's RPS Procurement Quantity Requirement, Category 3 Limitation, and Voluntary Margin of Overprocurement are all derived from Bundled Retail Sales Forecasts. Disclosure would allow interested parties to easily calculate SDG&E's Bundled Retail Sales data; accordingly, this information is also protected under IOU Matrix category V.C.			
	Affirm that the IOU is complying with the limitations on confidentiality specified in the Matrix for that type of data	In accordance with the limitations on confidentiality set forth in the IOU Matrix, SDG&E requests that the information be kept confidential for the first partial year in which the information is submitted (2012) and the following annual three full years (2013-2015). As the data is also aggregated by Compliance Period, SDG&E requests that the entirety of Compliance Periods 1 and 2 aggregated data be kept confidential (2011-2016). If this data was broken out, parties could calculate the bundled retail sales data for 2012-2015.			
	Affirm that the information is not already public	SDG&E has not publicly disclosed this information and is not aware that it has been disclosed by any other party.			
	Affirm that the data cannot be aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.	The information was provided in the format that best conveys the analysis.  The data cannot be further aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.			
2012 RPS Plan,	Demonstrate that the material	The SDG&E Residual Net Short for RPS Procurement – November 29, 2012			
Section V:	submitted constitutes a	tables show SDG&E's risk-adjusted analysis of its RPS position by year,			
2012 RPS Plan – SDG&E Residual Net Short for RPS	particular type of data listed in the IOU Matrix	analysis of banked and excess procurement by year as well as the margin of overprocurement as an implied percentage of retail sales, which are all a function of SDG&E's net open position surplus or deficit.			

Identify the Metrix estagemy or	Utility net long/short data is protected under IOU Matrix category VI.B.		
	Others her long/short data is protected under 100 watrix category vi.b.		
	Information recording CDC & E's strategy associated with application of the		
corresponds	Information regarding SDG&E's strategy associated with application of the		
	banking flexible compliance tool could allow a third party to calculate		
	SDG&E's bundled retail sales figure, which is protected under IOU Matrix		
1 20 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	category V.C. Accordingly, this data is also protected under category V.C. 5/		
	Matrix, SDG&E requests that the information be kept confidential for the		
	first partial year in which the information is submitted (2012) and the		
the Matrix for that type of data	following annual three full years (2013-2015). As the data is also aggregated		
	by Compliance Period, SDG&E requests that the entirety of Compliance		
	Periods 1 and 2 aggregated data be kept confidential (2011-2016). If this		
	data was broken out, parties could calculate the net long/short data for 2012-		
	2015.		
Affirm that the information is	SDG&E has not publicly disclosed this information and is not aware that it		
not already public	has been disclosed by any other party.		
Affirm that the data cannot be	The information was provided in the format that best conveys the analysis.		
aggregated, redacted,	The data cannot be further aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or		
summarized, masked or	otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.		
that allows partial disclosure.			
Demonstrate that the material	The Contracts Presently Delivering – November 29, 2012 tables set forth		
submitted constitutes a	analysis based on SDG&E's assessment of individual RPS projects.		
particular type of data listed in			
the IOU Matrix			
Identify the Matrix category or	Analysis and evaluation of RPS projects is protected under IOU Matrix		
•	category VII.G.		
	not already public  Affirm that the data cannot be aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.  Demonstrate that the material submitted constitutes a particular type of data listed in		

See Administrative Law Judge's Ruling Granting San Diego Gas & Electric Company's May 21, 2007 Amendment to April 3, 2007 Motion and May 22, 2007 Amendment to August 1, 2006 Motion, issued June 28, 2007 in R.06-05-027, p. 2 (finding that strategies associated with application of flexible compliance tools such as banking must be kept confidential since disclosure "would allow a third party to calculate SDG&E's bundled retail sales figure.").

CDID I III		T
CP1 Probability,	corresponds	
CP2&3 Probability,	Affirm that the IOU is	In accordance with the limitations on confidentiality set forth in the IOU
and Probability	complying with the limitations	Matrix, SDG&E requests that the information be kept confidential for the
Weighted Deliveries,	on confidentiality specified in	first partial year in which the information is submitted (2012) and the
rows 1-43	the Matrix for that type of data	following annual three full years (2013-2015).
	Affirm that the information is	SDG&E has not publicly disclosed this information and is not aware that it
	not already public	has been disclosed by any other party.
	Affirm that the data cannot be	The information was provided in the format that best conveys the analysis.
	aggregated, redacted,	The data cannot be further aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or
	summarized, masked or	otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.
	otherwise protected in a way	
	that allows partial disclosure.	
2012 RPS Plan,	Demonstrate that the material	The Contracts Presently Developing – November 29, 2012 tables set forth
Section V:	submitted constitutes a	analysis based on SDG&E's assessment of individual RPS projects.
2012 RPS Plan –	particular type of data listed in	
Contracts Presently	the IOU Matrix	
Developing -	Identify the Matrix category or	Analysis and evaluation of RPS projects is protected under IOU Matrix
November 29, 2012:	categories to which the data	category VII.G.
CP1 Probability,	corresponds	
CP2&3 Probability,	Affirm that the IOU is	In accordance with the limitations on confidentiality set forth in the IOU
and Probability	complying with the limitations	Matrix, SDG&E requests that the information be kept confidential for the
Weighted Deliveries,	on confidentiality specified in	first partial year in which the information is submitted (2012) and the
rows 1-35	the Matrix for that type of data	following annual three full years (2013-2015).
	Affirm that the information is	SDG&E has not publicly disclosed this information and is not aware that it
	not already public	has been disclosed by any other party.
	Affirm that the data cannot be	The information was provided in the format that best conveys the analysis.
	aggregated, redacted,	The data cannot be further aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or
	summarized, masked or	otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.
	otherwise protected in a way	other wise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.
	that allows partial disclosure.	
	mai anows partial disciosure.	

2012 RPS Plan,	Demonstrate that the material	This table provides quantitative analysis of RPS cost data. It includes (i)		
Section X:	submitted constitutes a	bundled retail sales forecast data; and (ii) cost forecast data.		
Cost Quantification	particular type of data listed in	buildied retail sales forecast data, and (ii) cost forecast data.		
Table	the IOU Matrix			
Table		I Itility, have all adverted and an IOU Metales, acts come V.C.		
	Identify the Matrix category or	Utility bundled retail sales data is protected under IOU Matrix category V.C.		
	categories to which the data			
	corresponds	Utility cost forecast data is protected under IOU Matrix category II.		
	Affirm that the IOU is	In accordance with the limitations on confidentiality set forth in the IOU		
	complying with the limitations	Matrix, SDG&E requests that the information be kept confidential for the		
	on confidentiality specified in	first partial year in which the information is submitted (2012) and the		
	the Matrix for that type of data	following annual three full years (2013-2015).		
	Affirm that the information is	SDG&E has not publicly disclosed this information and is not aware that it		
	not already public	has been disclosed by any other party.		
	Affirm that the data cannot be	The information was provided in the format that best conveys the analysis.		
	aggregated, redacted,	The data cannot be further aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or		
	summarized, masked or	otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.		
	otherwise protected in a way			
	that allows partial disclosure.			
Appendix C-	Demonstrate that the material	The illustrative table showing the methodology that SDG&E will use to		
Evaluation	submitted constitutes a	determine its need by CP shows data that is a function of SDG&E's Bundled		
Methodology (LCBF	particular type of data listed in	Retail Sales data – RPS Target (GWh).		
Process):	the IOU Matrix	The state of the s		
RPS SHORTLIST	Identify the Matrix category or	Utility Bundled Retail Sales data is protected under IOU Matrix category		
CALCULATION	categories to which the data	V.C. The RPS Target (GWh) is derived from Bundled Retail Sales		
(CP1 through CP3)	corresponds	Forecasts. Disclosure would allow interested parties to easily calculate		
(CI I mough CI 5)	Corresponds	SDG&E's Bundled Retail Sales data; accordingly, this information is		
		protected under IOU Matrix category V.C.		
	Affirm that the IOU is	In accordance with the limitations on confidentiality set forth in the IOU		
		l		
	complying with the limitations	Matrix, SDG&E requests that the information be kept confidential for the		

on confidentiality specified in	first partial year in which the information is submitted (2012) and the
the Matrix for that type of data	following annual three full years (2013-2015). As the data is also aggregated
	by Compliance Period, SDG&E requests that the entirety of Compliance
	Periods 1 and 2 aggregated data be kept confidential (2011-2016). If this
	data was broken out, parties could calculate the bundled retail sales data for
	2012-2015.
Affirm that the information is	SDG&E has not publicly disclosed this information and is not aware that it
not already public	has been disclosed by any other party.
Affirm that the data cannot be	The information was provided in the format that best conveys the analysis.
aggregated, redacted,	The data cannot be further aggregated, redacted, summarized, masked or
summarized, masked or	otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.
otherwise protected in a way	
that allows partial disclosure.	

SDG&E respectfully moves this Commission for an order directing that the Protected Information, which has been redacted in the public version of the Plan Documents, shall continue to remain under seal for the period identified in the table above.

Respectfully submitted this 29<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2012.

/s/ Aimee M. Smith

AIMEE M. SMITH 101 Ash Street, HQ-12 San Diego, California 92101 Telephone: (619) 699-5042 Facsimile: (619) 699-5006

Email: amsmith@semprautilities.com

Attorney for SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY

### PROPOSED ORDER

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Continue Implementation and Administration of California Renewables Portfolio Standard Program. Rulemaking 11-05-005 (Filed May 5, 2011)

#### **ORDER**

Pursuant to Rule 11.4 of the Rules of Practice and Procedure of the California Public Utilities Commission (the "Commission") and D.06-06-066, *et seq.*, San Diego Gas & Electric Company ("SDG&E") filed a motion on November 29, 2012 (the "Motion") requesting authority to file and maintain certain confidential, commercially sensitive and proprietary information under seal. The Motion sought confidential treatment of specific information appearing in the unredacted version of its 2012 Renewables Portfolio Standard Procurement Plan and related documents (together, the "Plan Documents").

The information for which confidential treatment is sought is protected under the IOU Matrix adopted in D.06-06-066. In addition, the information complies with the limitations on confidentiality specified in the IOU Matrix for that type of data and SDG&E has not publicly disclosed this information. The data cannot be aggregated, further redacted, summarized, masked or otherwise protected in a way that allows partial disclosure.

Therefore, it is ordered that:

 The confidential information contained in SDG&E's Plan Documents shall remain sealed and is not to be disclosed to anyone other than Commission staff, the Assigned Commissioner, the assigned Administrative Law Judge ("ALJ") or an ALJ designated to decide this motion;

Further proceedings, if any, held with respect to matters contained in the
confidential information shall be conducted in a manner the assigned ALJ
deems reasonably necessary to protect the confidentiality of the materials
described herein;

3. Non-market participants may request access to the confidential information pursuant to applicable rules; and

4. All additional documentary evidence in this proceeding that addresses or relates to the subject matter of the confidential information must be treated in the confidential manner described in paragraphs 1 and 2, above.

	Administrative Law Judge	
Dated:		

#### **AFFIDAVIT**

I am an employee of the respondent corporation herein, and am authorized to make this verification on its behalf. The matters stated in the foregoing MOTION OF SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY (U 902 E) FOR LEAVE TO FILE UNDER SEAL THE UNREDACTED VERSION OF ITS AMENDED 2012 DRAFT RENEWABLES PORTFOLIO STANDARD PROCUREMENT PLAN AND RELATED DOCUMENTS are true of my own knowledge, except as to matters which are therein stated on information and belief, and as to those matters I believe them to be true.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

Executed this 29th day of November, 2012, at San Diego, California

/s/ Hillary Hebert

Hillary Hebert
Partnerships and Programs Manager
Origination and Portfolio Design Department