

From: Karen Terranova

Sent: 12/26/2012 3:39:29 PM

clamasbabbini@comverge.com (clamasbabbini@comverge.com);
jleslie@mckennalong.com (jleslie@mckennalong.com); rick_noger@praxair.com
(rick_noger@praxair.com); sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com
(sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com); Andrew.Luszcz@GlacialEnergy.com
(Andrew.Luszcz@GlacialEnergy.com); kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com
(kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com); blyons@TigerNaturalGas.com
(blyons@TigerNaturalGas.com); abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com
(abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com); sahm@clean-coalition.org (sahm@clean-
coalition.org); Joseph.williams@cwt.com (Joseph.williams@cwt.com);
liddell@energyattorney.com (liddell@energyattorney.com);
tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com (tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com);
douglass@energyattorney.com (douglass@energyattorney.com);
GloriaB@anzaelectric.org (GloriaB@anzaelectric.org);
igoodman@commerceenergy.com (igoodman@commerceenergy.com);
To: andrea.morrison@directenergy.com (andrea.morrison@directenergy.com);
gbass@noblesolutions.com (gbass@noblesolutions.com); Joni.Templeton@sce.com
(Joni.Templeton@sce.com); rkmoore@gswater.com (rkmoore@gswater.com);
nquan@gswater.com (nquan@gswater.com); martin.kadillak@shell.com
(martin.kadillak@shell.com); APak@SempraUtilities.com
(APak@SempraUtilities.com); energy@3phasesrenewables.com
(energy@3phasesrenewables.com); akbar.jazayeri@sce.com
(akbar.jazayeri@sce.com); awilliams@libertypowercorp.com
(awilliams@libertypowercorp.com); jccasadont@bluestarenergy.com
(jccasadont@bluestarenergy.com); Cherry, Brian K
(/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7); ssmyers@att.net
(ssmyers@att.net); mgo@goodinmacbride.com (mgo@goodinmacbride.com);
hayley@turn.org (hayley@turn.org); mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com (mtierney-
lloyd@enernoc.com); bcragg@goodinmacbride.com
(bcragg@goodinmacbride.com); kelly@votesolar.org (kelly@votesolar.org);
cmkehrein@ems-ca.com (cmkehrein@ems-ca.com); abb@eslawfirm.com
(abb@eslawfirm.com); jeffgray@dwt.com (jeffgray@dwt.com);
Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net
(Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net); tomb@crossborderenergy.com
(tomb@crossborderenergy.com); dorth@krcd.org (dorth@krcd.org);
mcampbell@sfwater.org (mcampbell@sfwater.org); lcottle@winston.com
(lcottle@winston.com); mday@goodinmacbride.com
(mday@goodinmacbride.com); dweisz@marinenergy.com
(dweisz@marinenergy.com); bmarshall@psrec.coop (bmarshall@psrec.coop);
dansvec@hdo.net (dansvec@hdo.net); aivancovich@caiso.com
(aivancovich@caiso.com); mary.lynch@constellation.com
(mary.lynch@constellation.com); cpuc@primuspower.com
(cpuc@primuspower.com); stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com
(stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com); ahaubenstock@brightsourceenergy.com

(ahaubenstock@brightsourceenergy.com); matt.vespa@SierraClub.org
(matt.vespa@SierraClub.org); Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com
(Rachel.McMahon@firstsolar.com); Rachel@ConsciousVenturesGroup.com
(Rachel@ConsciousVenturesGroup.com); andra.pligavko@gmail.com
(andra.pligavko@gmail.com); mm2@cpuc.ca.gov (mm2@cpuc.ca.gov);
b.bordiine@d-e-c-a.org (b.bordiine@d-e-c-a.org); Michael Alcantar (mpa@a-
klaw.com); William H. Booth (whb@a-klaw.com); RegRelCPUCCases
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases);
brbarkovich@earthlink.net (brbarkovich@earthlink.net); david@nemtzwow.com
(david@nemtzwow.com); CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com
(CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com); case.admin@sce.com (case.admin@sce.com);
mrw@mrwassoc.com (mrw@mrwassoc.com); wynne@braunlegal.com
(wynne@braunlegal.com); william.sanders@sfgov.org (william.sanders@sfgov.org);
Gonzales, Matthew (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg);
DWTCPUCCDOCKETS@dwt.com (DWTCPUCCDOCKETS@dwt.com);
shong@goodinmacbride.com (shong@goodinmacbride.com);
igoodman@commerceenergy.com (igoodman@commerceenergy.com);
blaising@braunlegal.com (blaising@braunlegal.com); Zahariudakis, George
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=GxZ5); klatt@energyattorney.com
(klatt@energyattorney.com); nrader@calwea.org (nrader@calwea.org);
spauker@wsgr.com (spauker@wsgr.com); davidmorse9@gmail.com
(davidmorse9@gmail.com); californiadockets@pacificcorp.com
(californiadockets@pacificcorp.com); cpacc@calpine.com (cpacc@calpine.com);
kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com (kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com);
ddavie@wellhead.com (ddavie@wellhead.com); VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com
(VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com); brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com
(brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); peter.pearson@bves.com
(peter.pearson@bves.com); julien.dumoulin-smith@ubs.com (julien.dumoulin-
smith@ubs.com); smatlock@gswater.com (smatlock@gswater.com);
RNicholson@SempraUtilities.com (RNicholson@SempraUtilities.com);
matthew.barmack@calpine.com (matthew.barmack@calpine.com);
smaye@nappartners.com (smaye@nappartners.com); cathompson@anaheim.net
(cathompson@anaheim.net); NTang@SempraUtilities.com
(NTang@SempraUtilities.com); megan.cyr@ubs.com (megan.cyr@ubs.com);
TraceyDrabant@gswater.com (TraceyDrabant@gswater.com); Jarman, Thomas A
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=TAJ8); AGarza-
Beutz@semprautilities.com (AGarza-Beutz@semprautilities.com);
mcrane@bluestarenergy.com (mcrane@bluestarenergy.com); NILEN@vestas.com
(NILEN@vestas.com); Joseph.Phalen@bves.com (Joseph.Phalen@bves.com);
jason.lewis@jpmorgan.com (jason.lewis@jpmorgan.com); kgillick@sfgwater.org
(kgillick@sfgwater.org); braun@braunlegal.com (braun@braunlegal.com);
whitney@clean-coalition.org (whitney@clean-coalition.org);
JFriderichs@pilotpowergroup.com (JFriderichs@pilotpowergroup.com);
sbailey@semprausgp.com (sbailey@semprausgp.com);
AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com (AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com); SZuretti@seia.org
(SZuretti@seia.org); NODonovan@LREnergy.com (NODonovan@LREnergy.com);

margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com
(margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com
(TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com); Wetstone, Brad
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=BIWA); Nora Sheriff (nes@a-
klaw.com); ygomez@libertypowercorp.com (ygomez@libertypowercorp.com);
STomec@CapitalPower.com (STomec@CapitalPower.com);
tandy.mcmannes@solar.abengoa.com (tandy.mcmannes@solar.abengoa.com);
ariel.lin@sce.com (ariel.lin@sce.com); Mobasheri@ElectricPowerGroup.com
(Mobasheri@ElectricPowerGroup.com); Susan.E.Smith@shell.com
(Susan.E.Smith@shell.com); justin.boone@sce.com (justin.boone@sce.com);
mburrows@3phasesRenewables.com (mburrows@3phasesRenewables.com);
jay.robertson@directenergy.com (jay.robertson@directenergy.com);
hudsonr@conedsolutions.com (hudsonr@conedsolutions.com);
amanda.bergfield@directenergy.com (amanda.bergfield@directenergy.com); filings
(filings@a-klaw.com); cem@newsdata.com (cem@newsdata.com); e-
recipient@caiso.com (e-recipient@caiso.com); Huffman, Mark (Law)
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); rl@eslawfirm.com
(rl@eslawfirm.com); abb@eslawfirm.com (abb@eslawfirm.com);
jgg@eslawfirm.com (jgg@eslawfirm.com); Gong, Alice
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=AxL3); eddyconsulting@gmail.com
(eddyconsulting@gmail.com); mpryor@energy.state.ca.us
(mpryor@energy.state.ca.us); dgrandy@caonsitegen.com
(dgrandy@caonsitegen.com); atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com
(atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com); dws@r-c-s-inc.com (dws@r-c-s-inc.com);
sean.beatty@genon.com (sean.beatty@genon.com); danielle@ceert.org
(danielle@ceert.org); JChamberlin@LSPower.com (JChamberlin@LSPower.com);
mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com (mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com);
jwoodwar@energy.state.ca.us (jwoodwar@energy.state.ca.us);
tsolomon@winston.com (tsolomon@winston.com); bburns@caiso.com
(bburns@caiso.com); bmcc@mccarthyllaw.com (bmcc@mccarthyllaw.com);
david@ceert.org (david@ceert.org); wrostov@earthjustice.org
(wrostov@earthjustice.org); brflynn@flynnrci.com (brflynn@flynnrci.com);
dennis@ddecuir.com (dennis@ddecuir.com); psd@cpuc.ca.gov (psd@cpuc.ca.gov);
SMK@cpuc.ca.gov (SMK@cpuc.ca.gov); aol@cpuc.ca.gov (aol@cpuc.ca.gov);
TLindl@kfwlaw.com (TLindl@kfwlaw.com); nicole@braunlegal.com
(nicole@braunlegal.com); kfox@kfwlaw.com (kfox@kfwlaw.com);
kerry.hattevik@nee.com (kerry.hattevik@nee.com); wtr@cpuc.ca.gov
(wtr@cpuc.ca.gov); jderosa@ces-ltd.com (jderosa@ces-ltd.com); dbr@cpuc.ca.gov
(dbr@cpuc.ca.gov); shaun.logue@brookfieldrenewable.com
(shaun.logue@brookfieldrenewable.com); irene@igc.org (irene@igc.org);
ericg@votesolar.org (ericg@votesolar.org); mc3@cpuc.ca.gov (mc3@cpuc.ca.gov);
df1@cpuc.ca.gov (df1@cpuc.ca.gov); ag2@cpuc.ca.gov (ag2@cpuc.ca.gov);
aw3@cpuc.ca.gov (aw3@cpuc.ca.gov); JWaen@MarinEnergy.com
(JWaen@MarinEnergy.com); mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us
(mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); scl@cpuc.ca.gov (scl@cpuc.ca.gov);
dmg@cpuc.ca.gov (dmg@cpuc.ca.gov); jrg@cpuc.ca.gov (jrg@cpuc.ca.gov);

mia@cpuc.ca.gov (mia@cpuc.ca.gov); phs@cpuc.ca.gov (phs@cpuc.ca.gov);
dhou@caiso.com (dhou@caiso.com); bcooper@caiso.com (bcooper@caiso.com);
ynl@cpuc.ca.gov (ynl@cpuc.ca.gov); eac@cpuc.ca.gov (eac@cpuc.ca.gov);
Rich.Quattrini@jci.com (Rich.Quattrini@jci.com); elizabeth.dorman@cpuc.ca.gov
(elizabeth.dorman@cpuc.ca.gov); jgoodin@caiso.com (jgoodin@caiso.com);
john@dmcadvisors.com (john@dmcadvisors.com); chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov
(chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov); gkatta@caiso.com (gkatta@caiso.com);
ekelly@marinenergyauthority.org (ekelly@marinenergyauthority.org);
onmyers@gmail.com (onmyers@gmail.com); David.Weidberg@jci.com
(David.Weidberg@jci.com); Taber@PrincetonEnergy.net
(Taber@PrincetonEnergy.net); cho@cpuc.ca.gov (cho@cpuc.ca.gov);
pkulkarn@energy.state.ca.us (pkulkarn@energy.state.ca.us); Don Brookhyser
(deb@a-klaw.com); kbarrentine@caiso.com (kbarrentine@caiso.com)

Cc:

Bcc:

Subject: R11-10-023 (RA) - CLECA Comments

Attached in PDF are the Comments of the California Large Energy Consumers Association in response to the Scoping Ruling of Dec. 6 on the Joint Parties' Proposal on Resource Adequacy and Flexible Capacity in the above proceeding which were filed today.

Karen

Karen Terranova

Alcantar & Kahl

33 New Montgomery Street

Suite 1850

San Francisco, CA 94105

415-403-5542

kt@a-klaw.com