

From: [Redacted]  
Sent: 4/22/2013 5:12:12 PM  
To: Warner, Christopher (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CJW5); Kahlon, Gurbux (gurbux.kahlon@cpuc.ca.gov); Dietz, Sidney (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=SBD4); Maguire, William (William.Maguire@cpuc.ca.gov); Chawla, Taaru (taaru.chawla@cpuc.ca.gov); Elizabeth Kelly (ekelly@marinenergy.com); Dawn Weisz (dweisz@marinenergy.com)  
Cc: Randolph, Edward F. (edward.randolph@cpuc.ca.gov); Litteneker, Randall (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RJL9); [Redacted]  
[Redacted] Lakhanpal, Manisha (Manisha.Lakhanpal@cpuc.ca.gov); Tom, Jonathan P. (jonathan.tom@cpuc.ca.gov); [Redacted] Samson, Renee (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=r5sz); Emily Goodwin (egoodwin@marinenergy.com)  
Bcc:  
Subject: RE: Memo3-22-13MEAAccessstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

Gurbux-

I wanted to respond to your questions below, currently Sid is unavailable due to personal matters.

In addition I believe Sid said Alope Gupta at the Energy Division is up to speed with the technical detail around the interval data sharing issues. Per your questions:

1. Please provide specific citations to Commission decisions/resolutions where you think an issue is still pending at the Commission and PG&E is awaiting for an order from the Commission.

**RESPONSE:** As PG&E's March 22 legal memo indicated, the legal issue pending before the Commission is whether PU Code 8380(e)(2) and the CPUC's privacy rules applicable to PG&E permit PG&E to provide to MEA customer electricity and natural gas consumption data relating to retail electricity and gas customers who are not MEA CCA customers, for purposes of MEA's energy efficiency programs without (a) the consent of those customers, or (b) a contract that protects privacy consistent with PU Code 8380(e)(2), or (c) a specific order of the Commission authorizing PG&E to provide such customer data to MEA exempt from the requirements of PU Code

8380(e)(2). PG&E has no legal issue with providing the electricity consumption data of existing MEA CCA customers to MEA for purposes of MEA's energy efficiency programs and MEA CCA load planning purposes.

2. A specific citation/reference to a Commission decision/resolution that the data security audit is required to be performed by PG&E or that the audit is a precondition to MEA getting the data.

**RESPONSE:** PU Code 8380(d) and Commission D.11-07-056, Attachment D, Rule 8(a) require PG&E to use "reasonable security procedures and practices" to protect a customer's electrical and gas consumption data from unauthorized use, access, and disclosure. For several years, PG&E's standard customer privacy and information security program and protocols have required third-parties to undergo an information security review prior to receiving customer-specific data. This practice is industry standard practice, and PG&E has applied the requirement to its third-party vendors as well as other third-parties, including state and local agencies and their contractors.

3. Did PG&E raise the issue of cost of providing interval meter data and whether and how it was addressed by D. 12-08-045?

**RESPONSE:** No. However, outside that case, MEA has asked PG&E for interval electric usage data for planning and implementing MEA's CCA program. We agree that there is no legal issue regarding its access to this data under the CCA tariffs, and we have provided it such data on an historic basis. However, MEA has asked to get it on a near real time basis. As we previously mentioned to MEA, we do not yet have that capability on a cost-effective basis, but are moving forward with developing it as part of our Customer Data Access application. As we have explained in previous meetings with MEA, we do not wish to build one new system for MEA and a separate system for others under the Customer Data Access application. Hopefully, the CPUC will move forward to approve our Customer Data Access application very soon. PG&E's application is still pending in A.12-03-012, but PG&E, MEA and representatives of ESPs have agreed to a settlement under which CCAs such as MEA and ESPs will not be charged extra for access to interval meter data under the CCA tariffs that is otherwise available to other third parties under the Customer Data Access program proposed in A.12-03-012.

Thanks-

Eric

Redacted  
Pacific Gas and Electric Company  
Office: Redacted  
Cellular: Redacted  
Email: Redacted

**From:** Warner, Christopher (Law)  
**Sent:** Monday, April 22, 2013 3:20 PM  
**To:** Kahlon, Gurbux; Elizabeth Kelly; Redacted Dawn Weisz; Dietz, Sidney; Maguire, William; Chawla, Taaru  
**Cc:** Litteneker, Randall (Law); Redacted Randolph, Edward F.; Lakhanpal, Manisha; Reda Redacted Redacted Emily Goodwin  
**Subject:** RE: Memo3-22-13MEAAccessstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

Yes Gurbux, I believe there are – Sid Dietz and Redacted can fill you in on those issues. I believe they have provided details to Energy Division staff on those issues.

Chris

**From:** Kahlon, Gurbux [<mailto:gurbux.kahlon@cpuc.ca.gov>]  
**Sent:** Monday, April 22, 2013 3:03 PM  
**To:** Warner, Christopher (Law); Elizabeth Kelly; Redacted Dawn Weisz; Dietz, Sidney; Maguire, William; Chawla, Taaru  
**Cc:** Litteneker, Randall (Law); Redacted Randolph, Edward F.; Lakhanpal, Manisha; Tom, Jonathan P.; Redacted Emily Goodwin  
**Subject:** RE: Memo3-22-13MEAAccessstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

Chris, are there other issues holding up meeting MEA's request for access to interval meter data other than the legal issue discussed in the memo? Are there any technological capability issues or cost related issues as well? Trying to get the full lay of the land so we can properly and expeditiously scope and resolve the issues.

Gurbux Kahlon

Manager, Market Structure, Costs and Natural Gas

Energy Division

California Public Utilities Commission

505 Van Ness Ave, San Francisco Ca 94102

Tel: 415-703-1775

E-mail: [gkk@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:gkk@cpuc.ca.gov)

**From:** Warner, Christopher (Law) [<mailto:CJW5@pge.com>]

**Sent:** Monday, April 22, 2013 12:35 PM

**To:** Elizabeth Kelly; Kahlon, Gurbux; [Redacted] Eric; Dawn Weisz; Dietz, Sidney; Maguire, William; Chawla, Taaru

**Cc:** Litteneker, Randall (Law); [Redacted] Randolph, Edward F.; Lakhanpal, Manisha; [Redacted] [Redacted] [Redacted] Emily Goodwin

**Subject:** RE: Memo3-22-13MEAAccessstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

Thx Beth. Yes, I understand Sid sent the memo to the Energy Division on March 22. See below.

Chris

**From:** Dietz, Sidney

**Sent:** Friday, March 22, 2013 06:21 PM

**To:** [william.maguire@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:william.maguire@cpuc.ca.gov) <[william.maguire@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:william.maguire@cpuc.ca.gov)>; [dweisz@marinenergy.com](mailto:dweisz@marinenergy.com) <[dweisz@marinenergy.com](mailto:dweisz@marinenergy.com)>; [taaru.chawla@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:taaru.chawla@cpuc.ca.gov) <[taaru.chawla@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:taaru.chawla@cpuc.ca.gov)>; [ekelly@marinenergy.com](mailto:ekelly@marinenergy.com) <[ekelly@marinenergy.com](mailto:ekelly@marinenergy.com)>

**Cc:** Warner, Christopher (Law); [Redacted] Litteneker, Randall (Law); [Redacted] [Redacted]

**Subject:** Memo3-22-13MEAAccessstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

MEA and CPUC teams --

Sorry for my tardy response on this memo -- it is entirely due to my being on the road all day. In any case, here is the legal memo requested. Please let us know if you have any questions about it.

Eric will be back on Monday and will coordinate with Sebastien on finishing up scheduling the meeting.

Thanks.

yours,

sid

**From:** Elizabeth Kelly [mailto:ekelly@marinenergy.com]

**Sent:** Monday, April 22, 2013 12:06 PM

**To:** Kahlon, Gurbux; [Redacted] Dawn Weisz; Dietz, Sidney; Maguire, William; Chawla, Taaru

**Cc:** Warner, Christopher (Law); Litteneker, Randall (Law); [Redacted] Randolph, Edward F.; Lakhapal, Manisha; [Redacted] [Redacted] Emily Goodwin

**Subject:** RE: Memo3-22-13MEAAccessstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

Gurbux:

Please find attached the Memo which PG&E sent to us.

Kind regards,

Beth

Elizabeth Kelly

Marin Energy Authority

Office: +1 (415) 464-6022

[ekelly@marinenergy.com](mailto:ekelly@marinenergy.com)

**From:** Kahlon, Gurbux [mailto:[gurbux.kahlon@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:gurbux.kahlon@cpuc.ca.gov)]

**Sent:** Monday, April 22, 2013 11:35 AM

**To:** [Redacted] Dawn Weisz; Dietz, Sidney; Maguire, William; Chawla, Taaru; Elizabeth Kelly

**Cc:** Warner, Christopher (Law); Litteneker, Randall (Law) [Redacted] Randolph, Edward F.; Lakhanpal, Manisha [Redacted] [Redacted] Emily Goodwin

**Subject:** RE: Memo3-22-13MEAAccessstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

Eric/Sid: I don't have the memo you sent to MEA addressing their request for interval usage data for MEA customers and for electric and gas data for non-MEA customers for EE purposes. I would like to know for each of these why PG&E cannot provide the data per MEA's request.

1. Please provide specific citations to Commission decisions/resolutions where you think an issue is still pending at the Commission and PG&E is awaiting for an order from the Commission.
2. A specific citation/reference to a Commission decision/resolution that the data security audit is required to be performed by PG&E or that the audit is a precondition to MEA getting the data.
3. Did PG&E raise the issue of cost of providing interval meter data and whether and how it was addressed by D. 12-08-045?

Please also provide me a copy of any memo that was sent to MEA on this. I need to nail down these issues this week. Thanks.

*Gurbux Kahlon*

*Manager, Market Structure, Costs and Natural Gas*

*Energy Division*

*California Public Utilities Commission*

*505 Van Ness Ave, San Francisco Ca 94102*

*Tel: 415-703-1775*

*E-mail: [gkk@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:gkk@cpuc.ca.gov)*

**From:** [Redacted] [mailto:ERE7@pge.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 27, 2013 11:15 AM  
**To:** Dawn Weisz; Dietz, Sidney; Maguire, William; Chawla, Taaru; Elizabeth Kelly  
**Cc:** Warner, Christopher (Law); Litteneker, Randall (Law); [Redacted] Kahlon, Gurbux; Randolph, Edward F.; Lakhanpal, Manisha; [Redacted] [Redacted]; Emily Goodwin  
**Subject:** RE: Memo3-22-13MEAAccessstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

Dawn –

There seem to be two issues here that I think we should separate.

First, there is the question of the interval usage data for CCA customers. We agree that there is no privacy issue for this data, as outlined in the memo that we sent on Friday. We have provided you such data on a historic basis under the CCA-INFO tariff, but you have asked for new ways to get it on a more current basis. As we have mentioned, we do not wish to build one new system for MEA and a separate system for others under the Customer Data Access case. We are happy to discuss how to deliver that data to MEA, which we will discuss with you tomorrow at the meeting with our IT director, John Warnock. I also think it would be very helpful for CPUC staff to hear the issues on the technical side around this type of data.

Second, there is the issue of the EE data sharing involving non-CCA customers, including bundled and gas-only customers. Unless you are seeking near real time interval data, there are not so many technical issues here, but only the privacy issues that both MEA's and PG&E's memos address. I didn't think this was the focus of the meeting tomorrow.

Let me know if you have any questions, thanks-

Eric

[Redacted]  
Pacific Gas and Electric Company  
[Redacted]

Email: [Redacted]

**From:** Dawn Weisz [mailto:dweisz@marinenergy.com]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 27, 2013 9:18 AM  
**To:** Dietz, Sidney; [william.maguire@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:william.maguire@cpuc.ca.gov); [taaru.chawla@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:taaru.chawla@cpuc.ca.gov); Elizabeth Kelly  
**Cc:** Warner, Christopher (Law); [Redacted] Litteneker, Randall (Law); [Redacted]  
[Redacted] Gurbux Kahlon; Randolph, Edward F.; Lakhanpal, Manisha; [Redacted] [Redacted]  
Emily Goodwin  
**Subject:** RE: Memo3-22-13MEAAccessstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

Sid,

The memo you sent across is not responsive to the issues regarding interval smart meter data for our existing customers, or the issues we raised in our memo regarding D. 12-08-045 (re-attached here). As you know, we have a meeting with your team scheduled for tomorrow to discuss logistics of transferring this interval data to MEA. However, we were informed by Randy Litteneker in an issues meeting yesterday that PG&E may still be planning to wait for additional proceedings to progress before transferring interval meter data to MEA. If this is the case, we are concerned that the meeting tomorrow will not be productive.

Please let us know if your team will be able to begin transferring this data or if we will need to escalate this issue further.

Regards,

Dawn

**Dawn Weisz**

**Executive Officer**

Marin Energy Authority

781 Lincoln Ave., Suite 320

San Rafael, CA 94901



415-464-6020

[dweisz@marinenergy.com](mailto:dweisz@marinenergy.com)

[www.mceCleanEnergy.com](http://www.mceCleanEnergy.com)

**From:** Dietz, Sidney [mailto:[SBD4@pge.com](mailto:SBD4@pge.com)]

**Sent:** Friday, March 22, 2013 6:21 PM

**To:** [william.maguire@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:william.maguire@cpuc.ca.gov); [dweisz@marinenergy.com](mailto:dweisz@marinenergy.com); [taaru.chawla@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:taaru.chawla@cpuc.ca.gov); [ekelly@marinenergy.com](mailto:ekelly@marinenergy.com)

**Cc:** Warner, Christopher (Law); [Redacted] Litteneker, Randall (Law); [Redacted]  
[Redacted]

**Subject:** Memo3-22-13MEAAccesstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

MEA and CPUC teams --

Sorry for my tardy response on this memo -- it is entirely due to my being on the road all day. In any case, here is the legal memo requested. Please let us know if you have any questions about it.

Eric will be back on Monday and will coordinate with Sebastien on finishing up scheduling the meeting.

Thanks.

yours,

sid

-----  
Do I seem terse? Blame the thumb keyboard.

**From:** Sid [mailto:[fortaudax@gmail.com](mailto:fortaudax@gmail.com)]

**Sent:** Friday, March 22, 2013 06:07 PM

**To:** Dietz, Sidney

**Subject:** Fwd: Fw: Memo3-22-13MEAAccesstoCustomerDataWithoutCustomerConsent.docx

PG&E is committed to protecting our customers' privacy.  
To learn more, please visit <http://www.pge.com/about/company/privacy/customer/>

*MCE is committed to protecting customer privacy. Learn more at: [www.mceCleanEnergy.com/privacy](http://www.mceCleanEnergy.com/privacy)*

PG&E is committed to protecting our customers' privacy.  
To learn more, please visit <http://www.pge.com/about/company/privacy/customer/>

*MCE is committed to protecting customer privacy. Learn more at: [www.mceCleanEnergy.com/privacy](http://www.mceCleanEnergy.com/privacy)*

PG&E is committed to protecting our customers' privacy.  
To learn more, please visit <http://www.pge.com/about/company/privacy/customer/>