

From: Schultz, Adam

Sent: 5/10/2013 3:56:32 PM

andre.devilbiss@recurrentenergy.com (andre.devilbiss@recurrentenergy.com); marcel@turn.org (marcel@turn.org); regulatory\_affairs@recurrentenergy.com (regulatory\_affairs@recurrentenergy.com); hans@silveradopower.com (hans@silveradopower.com); luke.dunnington@recurrentenergy.com (luke.dunnington@recurrentenergy.com); pmiller@nrdc.org (pmiller@nrdc.org); susannah@votesolar.org (susannah@votesolar.org); kbundy@BiologicalDiversity.org (kbundy@BiologicalDiversity.org); tandy.mcmannes@solar.abengoa.com (tandy.mcmannes@solar.abengoa.com); filings@a-klaw.com (filings@a-klaw.com); Middlekauff, Charles (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd); Lucha, Ed (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=ELL5); Mason, Cory (law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CMMw); Chan, Maggie M (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MMCL); Abreu, Carlos (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CxAs); Kjellund, Niels (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=NxK2); Pappas, John (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=JSP5); ashiana.esmail@lw.com (ashiana.esmail@lw.com); phanschen@mofocom.com (phanschen@mofocom.com); Greenacre, Wade (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=WAG9); borion@lawyersforcleanenergy.com (borion@lawyersforcleanenergy.com); bruce.perlstein@navigant.com (bruce.perlstein@navigant.com); fred.wellington@navigantconsulting.com (fred.wellington@navigantconsulting.com); Vanko, Maria (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MNVA); Jones, Derek (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=DRJf); Cherry, Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7); cem@newsdata.com (cem@newsdata.com); lisa\_weinzimer@platts.com (lisa\_weinzimer@platts.com); Huffman, Mark (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); Khamou, Karen (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=K1K3); robin@resource-solutions.org (robin@resource-solutions.org); katherine@evomarkets.com (katherine@evomarkets.com); kowalewskia@calpine.com (kowalewskia@calpine.com); andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com (andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com); lcottle@winston.com (lcottle@winston.com); CPUCCases@pge.com (CPUCCases@pge.com); Monica.Schwebs@bingham.com (Monica.Schwebs@bingham.com); jmalta-weingard@naturener.net (jmalta-weingard@naturener.net); jscancarelli@crowell.com (jscancarelli@crowell.com); tkaushik@manatt.com (tkaushik@manatt.com); tsolomon@winston.com (tsolomon@winston.com); chris@emeter.com (chris@emeter.com); jared.johnson@lw.com (jared.johnson@lw.com); beth@beth411.com (beth@beth411.com); markfumia@dwt.com (markfumia@dwt.com); jstoddard@manatt.com (jstoddard@manatt.com); nformosa@winston.com (nformosa@winston.com); michael.hindus@pillsburylaw.com (michael.hindus@pillsburylaw.com); jpaul@naturener.net (jpaul@naturener.net);

Reilly, Brooke A (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=BAR11);  
MeganMMyers@yahoo.com (MeganMMyers@yahoo.com);  
dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com (dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com);  
jvandalen@calpine.com (jvandalen@calpine.com); Iwahashi, Miyuki  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MXI8); sarah.barker-  
ball@bingham.com (sarah.barker-ball@bingham.com);  
wesley.spowhn@pillsburylaw.com (wesley.spowhn@pillsburylaw.com);  
JenniferAChamberlin@gmail.com (JenniferAChamberlin@gmail.com);  
rmccann@umich.edu (rmccann@umich.edu); joyw@mid.org (joyw@mid.org);  
kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com (kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com);  
alex.kang@itron.com (alex.kang@itron.com); cbarry@iwpnews.com  
(cbarry@iwpnews.com); wem@igc.org (wem@igc.org); e-recipient@caiso.com (e-  
recipient@caiso.com); bepstein@fablaw.com (bepstein@fablaw.com);  
rschmidt@bartlewells.com (rschmidt@bartlewells.com);  
anders.glader@elpower.com (anders.glader@elpower.com); mjensen@mercedid.org  
(mjensen@mercedid.org); tbrunello@calstrat.com (tbrunello@calstrat.com);  
barmackm@calpine.com (barmackm@calpine.com); tom\_victorine@sjwater.com  
(tom\_victorine@sjwater.com); tobinjmr@sbcglobal.net (tobinjmr@sbcglobal.net);  
saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov (saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov); rick@sierraecos.com  
(rick@sierraecos.com); cwooten@lumenxconsulting.com  
(cwooten@lumenxconsulting.com); ed.smeloff@sunpowercorp.com  
(ed.smeloff@sunpowercorp.com); dgrandy@caonsitegen.com  
(dgrandy@caonsitegen.com); ron.perry@commercialenergy.net  
(ron.perry@commercialenergy.net); eric.cherniss@gmail.com  
(eric.cherniss@gmail.com); tfaust@redwoodrenewables.com  
(tfaust@redwoodrenewables.com); tpomales@arb.ca.gov (tpomales@arb.ca.gov);  
lindaf@mid.org (lindaf@mid.org); davido@mid.org (davido@mid.org);  
jna@speakeasy.org (jna@speakeasy.org); pmaxwell@navigantconsulting.com  
(pmaxwell@navigantconsulting.com); ed.mainland@sierraclub.org  
(ed.mainland@sierraclub.org); Margaret.Miller@brookfieldpower.com  
(Margaret.Miller@brookfieldpower.com); keithwhite@earthlink.net  
(keithwhite@earthlink.net); johnspilman@netzero.net (johnspilman@netzero.net);  
lynn@lmaconsulting.com (lynn@lmaconsulting.com); nellie.tong@us.kema.com  
(nellie.tong@us.kema.com); shani@scvas.org (shani@scvas.org);  
gtrobinson@lbl.gov (gtrobinson@lbl.gov); matthew.schafer@nexteraenergy.com  
(matthew.schafer@nexteraenergy.com); bossman\_burgess@yahoo.com  
(bossman\_burgess@yahoo.com); JChamberlin@LSPower.com  
(JChamberlin@LSPower.com); masont@bv.com (masont@bv.com);  
ramesh.ramchandani@commercialenergy.net  
(ramesh.ramchandani@commercialenergy.net); brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com  
(brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); ramonag@ebmud.com (ramonag@ebmud.com);  
wylier@beutlercorp.com (wylier@beutlercorp.com); agerterlinda@gmail.com  
(agerterlinda@gmail.com); jerry.mix@wattstopper.com  
(jerry.mix@wattstopper.com); mjberm@davisenergy.com  
(mjberm@davisenergy.com); daniel.h.kim@me.com (daniel.h.kim@me.com);  
acsmith@stoel.com (acsmith@stoel.com); TLindl@kfwlaw.com

(TLindl@kfwlaw.com); ESchroeder@kfwlaw.com (ESchroeder@kfwlaw.com);  
jderosa@ces-ltd.com (jderosa@ces-ltd.com); berlin@susieberlinlaw.com  
(berlin@susieberlinlaw.com); JWaen@MarinEnergy.com  
(JWaen@MarinEnergy.com); DAustin@ZGlobal.biz (DAustin@ZGlobal.biz);  
george.simons@itron.com (george.simons@itron.com); arivera@geosunenergy.com  
(arivera@geosunenergy.com); MaryTuckerConsulting@mindspring.com  
(MaryTuckerConsulting@mindspring.com); jblenergy@comcast.net  
(jblenergy@comcast.net); tim@marinemngt.org (tim@marinemngt.org);  
david@branchcomb.com (david@branchcomb.com); PaulFenn@LocalPower.com  
(PaulFenn@LocalPower.com); alink@casaweb.org (alink@casaweb.org);  
erica@gqhlobby.com (erica@gqhlobby.com); Halligan, Julie  
(julie.halligan@cpuc.ca.gov); Peck, David B. (david.peck@cpuc.ca.gov); Singh,  
Devla (devla.singh@cpuc.ca.gov); mpa@a-klaw.com (mpa@a-klaw.com);  
glw@eslawfirm.com (glw@eslawfirm.com); vwood@smud.org  
(vwood@smud.org); Ouyang, Ke Hao (kehao.ouyang@cpuc.ca.gov); Lee, Rebecca  
Tsai-Wei (rebecca.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); Parrillo, Jordan  
(jordan.parrillo@cpuc.ca.gov); Rogers, Nika (nika.rogers@cpuc.ca.gov); Simon,  
Sean A. (sean.simon@cpuc.ca.gov); Simon, Jason (jason.simon@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Lukins, Chloe (chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov); Lee, Cheryl (cheryl.lee@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Douglas, Paul (paul.douglas@cpuc.ca.gov); Rahman, Junaid  
(junaid.rahman@cpuc.ca.gov); lisa.cherkas@morganstanley.com  
(lisa.cherkas@morganstanley.com); dvidaver@energy.state.ca.us  
(dvidaver@energy.state.ca.us); lgonzale@energy.state.ca.us  
(lgonzale@energy.state.ca.us); Tiffany.Roberts@lao.ca.gov  
(Tiffany.Roberts@lao.ca.gov); varanini@sbcglobal.net (varanini@sbcglobal.net);  
meredith\_lamey@transcanada.com (meredith\_lamey@transcanada.com); Danforth,  
Christopher (christopher.danforth@cpuc.ca.gov); steven@lipmanconsulting.com  
(steven@lipmanconsulting.com); steveb@foresthealth.org  
(steveb@foresthealth.org); Fitch, Julie A. (julie.fitch@cpuc.ca.gov); Bone, Traci  
(traci.bone@cpuc.ca.gov); mpryor@energy.state.ca.us (mpryor@energy.state.ca.us);  
pdoughma@energy.state.ca.us (pdoughma@energy.state.ca.us); cte@eslawfirm.com  
(cte@eslawfirm.com); rroth@smud.org (rroth@smud.org);  
gherrera@energy.state.ca.us (gherrera@energy.state.ca.us);  
john\_dunn@transcanada.com (john\_dunn@transcanada.com);  
djurijew@capitalpower.com (djurijew@capitalpower.com); lterry@water.ca.gov  
(lterry@water.ca.gov); Abhulimen, Joseph A. (joseph.abhulimen@cpuc.ca.gov);  
dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net (dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net);  
kzocchet@energy.state.ca.us (kzocchet@energy.state.ca.us); Kwasny, Iryna  
(iryna.kwasny@cpuc.ca.gov); Momoh, Rahmon O. (rahmon.momoh@cpuc.ca.gov);  
claufenb@energy.state.ca.us (claufenb@energy.state.ca.us); dws@r-c-s-inc.com  
(dws@r-c-s-inc.com); Atamturk, Nilgun (nilgun.atamturk@cpuc.ca.gov); Hieta,  
Karin M. (karin.hieta@cpuc.ca.gov); Kamins, Sara M. (sara.kamins@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Ebke, Maryam (maryam.ebke@cpuc.ca.gov); c.mentzel@cleanenergymaui.com  
(c.mentzel@cleanenergymaui.com); rmiller@energy.state.ca.us  
(rmiller@energy.state.ca.us); kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com (kdw@woodruff-  
expert-services.com); hraitt@energy.state.ca.us (hraitt@energy.state.ca.us); Loy,

Mark R. (mark.loy@cpuc.ca.gov); White, Keith D. (keith.white@cpuc.ca.gov); DocToxics@aol.com (DocToxics@aol.com); Marks, Jaclyn (jaclyn.marks@cpuc.ca.gov); hurlock@water.ca.gov (hurlock@water.ca.gov); karen@klindh.com (karen@klindh.com); Simon, Anne (anne.simon@cpuc.ca.gov); teri.ikeda@pacificorp.com (teri.ikeda@pacificorp.com); jluckhardt@downeybrand.com (jluckhardt@downeybrand.com); jwoodwar@energy.state.ca.us (jwoodwar@energy.state.ca.us); DeAngelis, Regina (regina.deangelis@cpuc.ca.gov); Obiora, Noel (noel.obiora@cpuc.ca.gov); Colvin, Michael (michael.colvin@cpuc.ca.gov); Miley, Matt (matt.miley@cpuc.ca.gov); Poirier, Marcelo (marcelo.poirier@cpuc.ca.gov); michael@rockwood-consulting.com (michael@rockwood-consulting.com); mlowder@rercnet.org (mlowder@rercnet.org); nicole@braunlegal.com (nicole@braunlegal.com); cpuc@libertyutilities.com (cpuc@libertyutilities.com); Kotch, Andrew (andrew.kotch@cpuc.ca.gov); Blackney, Robert (robert.blackney@cpuc.ca.gov); Siao, David (David.Siao@cpuc.ca.gov); Reiger, J. Jason (Jonathan.Reiger@cpuc.ca.gov); gkester@casaweb.org (gkester@casaweb.org); Mike.Chapel@yahoo.com (Mike.Chapel@yahoo.com); otang@energy.ca.gov (otang@energy.ca.gov); kate@kgconsulting.net (kate@kgconsulting.net); PMason@PacificForest.org (PMason@PacificForest.org); kcarr@sierranevada.ca.gov (kcarr@sierranevada.ca.gov); KChou@energy.ca.gov (KChou@energy.ca.gov); gbarkalo@energy.state.ca.us (gbarkalo@energy.state.ca.us); Daryl.Metz@energy.ca.gov (Daryl.Metz@energy.ca.gov); connie.leni@energy.ca.gov (connie.leni@energy.ca.gov); mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us (mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); JHaile@energy.ca.gov (JHaile@energy.ca.gov); aecaonline@gmail.com (aecaonline@gmail.com); Bichkoff, Lewis (Lewis.Bichkoff@cpuc.ca.gov); Huang, Xiao Selena (XiaoSelena.Huang@cpuc.ca.gov); Myers, Christopher (christopher.myers@cpuc.ca.gov); O'Rourke, Shannon (Shannon.O'Rourke@cpuc.ca.gov); Rizzo, Colin (Colin.Rizzo@cpuc.ca.gov); Schultz, Adam (adam.schultz@cpuc.ca.gov)

Cc: Schultz, Adam (adam.schultz@cpuc.ca.gov)

Bcc:

Subject: R.11-05-005: Follow-up questions to Small-scale Bioenergy workshop held on 5/2

To all parties on the service list for R.11-05-005 (3 of 3):

On May 2, 2013, Energy Division staff held a workshop to review and seek informal input from parties on a draft consultant study titled, **“Small-scale Bioenergy: Resource Potential, Costs, and Feed-in Tariff Implementation Assessment.”** The draft study and the accompanying draft LCOE Model are both found online here (Recent Updates > April 9, 2013): <http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/PUC/energy/Renewables/index.htm>.

As a follow-up to the workshop, Energy Division staff now offers the opportunity for parties to file additional informal comments on the following:

(1) **Resource Potential.** Several parties identified, both at the workshop and in pre-workshop written comments, alternative public sources of data (including potential constraints on resources) and/or alternative assumptions or methodologies that might better inform the consultant study's quantification of the state's potential of SB 1122-eligible resources. If you have identified such a source and/or alternative assumption or methodology, please provide:

- a) A description of the source, assumption, or methodology that explains how incorporation of that information would have a *material impact* on the resource potential already identified in the draft consultant study;
- b) A citation to a public source of the data or justification for the alternative assumption or methodology, preferably including a direct website link or attaching a PDF; and,
- c) A justification, if providing alternative assumptions or methodologies, for why alternative approach or methodology to quantify resources is more appropriate than what has been utilized by the current draft consultant study.

(2) **Cost Estimates.** Several parties also identified, again both at the workshop and in pre-workshop written comments, alternative public estimates of the levelized cost of electricity (LCOE) of various SB 1122-eligible projects, or public sources of data that impact some component of the LCOE estimates (e.g., feedstock cost, transportation cost, etc.). If you have identified this type of data, please provide:

- a) A description of the information presented that explains how incorporation of the new information would have a *material impact* on the LCOE estimates already provided in the draft consultant study;
- b) A citation to a public source of the data, preferably including a direct website or attaching a PDF; and,
- c) An indication that the information provided reflects actual costs.

(3) **LCOE Model.** Several parties also indicated, again both at the workshop and in pre-workshop written comments, a desire to see refinements to the draft LCOE Model (Excel) that was used to inform the cost estimates in the draft consultant study. A link to the LCOE Model

is provided this e-mail but the file is locked so that it cannot be edited directly. If you have identified specific refinements that would improve the LCOE Model, please provide in written form:

- a) A description of how the proposed refinement of the LCOE Model would have a *material impact* on the LCOE estimates provided in the draft consultant study; and,
- b) A written guide that clearly identifies which Cell should be modified, how it should be modified, and why.

For (1) and (2) above, please clearly indicate with a bold + underlined heading whether the source of data or alternative assumption/methodology pertains to which of the following categories: (1) biogas from wastewater treatment, municipal organic waste diversion, food processing, and codigestion, (2) dairy and other agricultural bioenergy, or (3) bioenergy using byproducts of sustainable forest management.

Any party seeking to file responses to the above must do so **by Friday, June 14, 2013**. Responses should be limited to 10 pages. Responses filed to the above will be done so informally, and as such should not be filed on the docket for R.11-05-005. As with the informal pre-workshop comments, however, parties should e-mail their responses to the e-mail service list for R.11-05-005 and should copy [adam.schultz@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:adam.schultz@cpuc.ca.gov)

Please note that Energy Division staff is not seeking additional input at this time on the feed-in tariff (FIT) implementation assessment presented in the draft consultant study, or on any of the issues raised by parties in pre-workshop comments or at the workshop on this implementation assessment. There will be additional opportunities to provide input on implementation of the SB 1122 statute at a future date.

For any questions, please contact Adam Schultz at 415-703-2692 / [adam.schultz@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:adam.schultz@cpuc.ca.gov)