

From: Skinner, Nathaniel

Sent: 6/3/2013 10:35:04 AM

Young, Patrick (Patrick.Young@cpuc.ca.gov); Amanda Gonzalez (AGonzalez@energy-solution.com); blaising@braunlegal.com (blaising@braunlegal.com); tam.hunt@gmail.com (tam.hunt@gmail.com); marcusdacunha@hotmail.com (marcusdacunha@hotmail.com); Andrew.Wang@SolarReserve.com (Andrew.Wang@SolarReserve.com); smartinez@nrdc.org (smartinez@nrdc.org); sahm@clean-coalition.org (sahm@clean-coalition.org); ktreleven@gmail.com (ktreleven@gmail.com); Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com (Adam.Gusman@GlacialEnergy.com); rick\_noger@praxair.com (rick\_noger@praxair.com); mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com (mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com); douglass@energyattorney.com (douglass@energyattorney.com); igoodman@commerceenergy.com (igoodman@commerceenergy.com); kb@EnerCalUSA.com (kb@EnerCalUSA.com); TPhillips@TigerNaturalGas.com (TPhillips@TigerNaturalGas.com); AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com (AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com); kara.morgan@tac-denver.com (kara.morgan@tac-denver.com); cpacc@calpine.com (cpacc@calpine.com); akbar.jazayeri@sce.com (akbar.jazayeri@sce.com); abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com (abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com); daking@semprausgp.com (daking@semprausgp.com); AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com (AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com); awilliams@libertypowercorp.com (awilliams@libertypowercorp.com); p.shepard@dgc-us.com (p.shepard@dgc-us.com); kwd@vnf.com (kwd@vnf.com);

To: Cherry, Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7); sdhilton@stoel.com (sdhilton@stoel.com); edwardoneill@dwt.com (edwardoneill@dwt.com); Lee, Diana (diana.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); nes@a-klaw.com (nes@a-klaw.com); mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com (mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com); liddell@energyattorney.com (liddell@energyattorney.com); bcragg@goodinmacbride.com (bcragg@goodinmacbride.com); tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com (tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com); GloriaB@anzaelectric.org (GloriaB@anzaelectric.org); mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com (mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com); andrea.morrison@directenergy.com (andrea.morrison@directenergy.com); sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com (sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com); matthew@turn.org (matthew@turn.org); jeffgray@dwt.com (jeffgray@dwt.com); dorth@krcd.org (dorth@krcd.org); gbass@noblesolutions.com (gbass@noblesolutions.com); mcampbell@sfwater.org (mcampbell@sfwater.org); lcottle@winston.com (lcottle@winston.com); ek@a-klaw.com (ek@a-klaw.com); mday@goodinmacbride.com (mday@goodinmacbride.com); jstoddard@manatt.com (jstoddard@manatt.com); mmattes@nossaman.com (mmattes@nossaman.com); theresa.mueller@sfgov.org (theresa.mueller@sfgov.org); martin.kadillak@shell.com (martin.kadillak@shell.com); wrostov@earthjustice.org (wrostov@earthjustice.org); dbehles@ggu.edu (dbehles@ggu.edu); william.kissinger@bingham.com (william.kissinger@bingham.com); proceedings@megawatts.com

(proceedings@megawatts.com); STomec@CapitalPower.com  
(STomec@CapitalPower.com); ravage@ieta.org (ravage@ieta.org);  
kristine@SoCalTelephone.com (kristine@SoCalTelephone.com);  
RegRelCPUCCases  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases);  
kmills@cbbf.com (kmills@cbbf.com); ssmyers@att.net (ssmyers@att.net);  
lmh@eslawfirm.com (lmh@eslawfirm.com); jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net  
(jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net); mrw@mrwassoc.com  
(mrw@mrwassoc.com); wem@igc.org (wem@igc.org); bobgex@dwt.com  
(bobgex@dwt.com); janreid@coastecon.com (janreid@coastecon.com);  
gmorris@emf.net (gmorris@emf.net); DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com  
(DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com); Huffman, Mark (Law)  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); jsanders@caiso.com  
(jsanders@caiso.com); lwisland@ucsusa.org (lwisland@ucsusa.org);  
rl@eslawfirm.com (rl@eslawfirm.com); Zahariudakis, George  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=GxZ5); Gong, Alice  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=AxL3);  
Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net  
(Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net); tomb@crossborderenergy.com  
(tomb@crossborderenergy.com); cte@eslawfirm.com (cte@eslawfirm.com);  
Erin.Grizard@BloomEnergy.com (Erin.Grizard@BloomEnergy.com);  
Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com (Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com);  
californiadockets@pacificorp.com (californiadockets@pacificorp.com);  
ddavie@wellhead.com (ddavie@wellhead.com); JChamberlin@LSPower.com  
(JChamberlin@LSPower.com); VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com  
(VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com); julien.dumoulin-smith@ubs.com (julien.dumoulin-  
smith@ubs.com); matthew.barmack@calpine.com  
(matthew.barmack@calpine.com); bmarshall@psrec.coop (bmarshall@psrec.coop);  
dansvec@hdo.net (dansvec@hdo.net); aes\_ltp@aes.com (aes\_ltp@aes.com);  
deb@a-klaw.com (deb@a-klaw.com); gifford.jung@powerex.com  
(gifford.jung@powerex.com); stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com  
(stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com); jleslie@mckennalong.com  
(jleslie@mckennalong.com); JMauldin@adamsbroadwell.com  
(JMauldin@adamsbroadwell.com); b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org (b.bordine@d-e-c-a.org);  
barbara@barkovichandyap.com (barbara@barkovichandyap.com); Steph@Clean-  
Coalition.org (Steph@Clean-Coalition.org); oliviapara@dwt.com  
(oliviapara@dwt.com); ksoutherland@tas.com (ksoutherland@tas.com);  
dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com (dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com);  
ehsieh@a123systems.com (ehsieh@a123systems.com); rfo@sovereignenergy.net  
(rfo@sovereignenergy.net); margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com  
(margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); Berlinski@BeaconPower.com  
(Berlinski@BeaconPower.com); WJKeese@aol.com (WJKeese@aol.com);  
john@dicksongeesman.com (john@dicksongeesman.com);  
anfanzone@semprautilities.com (anfanzone@semprautilities.com);  
sswaroop@marinenergy.com (sswaroop@marinenergy.com);  
andra.pligavko@gmail.com (andra.pligavko@gmail.com); dyana@clean-

coalition.org (dyana@clean-coalition.org); Ekelly@MarinEnergy.com  
(Ekelly@MarinEnergy.com); randy.keller@calenergy.com  
(randy.keller@calenergy.com); lchaset@keyesandfox.com  
(lchaset@keyesandfox.com); michael.evans@shell.com (michael.evans@shell.com);  
rfagan@synapse-energy.com (rfagan@synapse-energy.com); tam@clean-  
coalition.org (tam@clean-coalition.org); d.hicks@dgc-us.com (d.hicks@dgc-  
us.com); PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com (PLuckow@Synapse-Energy.com);  
dfelix@northlightpower.com (dfelix@northlightpower.com); rwilson@synapse-  
energy.com (rwilson@synapse-energy.com); ndivekar@synapse-energy.com  
(ndivekar@synapse-energy.com); bvitale@climatetrust.org  
(bvitale@climatetrust.org); Peck, David B. (david.peck@cpuc.ca.gov);  
jeanne.sole@sfgov.org (jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); steven@moss.net  
(steven@moss.net); clamasbabbini@comverge.com  
(clamasbabbini@comverge.com); filings@a-klaw.com (filings@a-klaw.com);  
mpa@a-klaw.com (mpa@a-klaw.com); CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com  
(CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com); jimross@r-c-s-inc.com (jimross@r-c-s-  
inc.com); glw@eslawfirm.com (glw@eslawfirm.com); cem@newsdata.com  
(cem@newsdata.com); case.admin@sce.com (case.admin@sce.com);  
pthomsen@ormat.com (pthomsen@ormat.com); e-recipient@caiso.com (e-  
recipient@caiso.com); Middlekauff, Charles (Law)  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd); Jones, Kimberly  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=KCJ5); Gonzales, Matthew  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg); Pagedar, Sujata  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=sxpg); shong@goodinmacbride.com  
(shong@goodinmacbride.com); adam.green@solarreserve.com  
(adam.green@solarreserve.com); dkk@eslawfirm.com (dkk@eslawfirm.com);  
klatt@energyattorney.com (klatt@energyattorney.com); Lucha, Ed  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=ELL5); kowalewskia@calpine.com  
(kowalewskia@calpine.com); DNiehaus@SempraUtilities.com  
(DNiehaus@SempraUtilities.com); eddyconsulting@gmail.com  
(eddyconsulting@gmail.com); nrader@calwea.org (nrader@calwea.org);  
steven@iepa.com (steven@iepa.com); dgrandy@caonsitegen.com  
(dgrandy@caonsitegen.com); martinhomec@gmail.com  
(martinhomec@gmail.com); djurijew@capitalpower.com  
(djurijew@capitalpower.com); atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com  
(atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com); dws@r-c-s-inc.com (dws@r-c-s-inc.com);  
pmaxwell@navigantconsulting.com (pmaxwell@navigantconsulting.com);  
kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com (kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com);  
Monica.Schwebs@bingham.com (Monica.Schwebs@bingham.com);  
ccollins@Energystrat.com (ccollins@Energystrat.com);  
brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com (brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); beth@beth411.com  
(beth@beth411.com); jpierce@semprautilities.com (jpierce@semprautilities.com);  
wmc@a-klaw.com (wmc@a-klaw.com); dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net  
(dmarcus2@sbcglobal.net); carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com  
(carol.schmidfrazee@sce.com); david@ceert.org (david@ceert.org);  
pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com (pushkarwagle@flynnrci.com); dwang@nrdc.org

(dwang@nrdc.org); pcort@earthjustice.org (pcort@earthjustice.org);  
rpsantos@semprautilities.com (rpsantos@semprautilities.com);  
agerterlinda@gmail.com (agerterlinda@gmail.com); Jarman, Thomas A  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=TAJ8); jack@casaraquel.com  
(jack@casaraquel.com); jbaird@earthjustice.org (jbaird@earthjustice.org);  
slazerow@cbeal.org (slazerow@cbeal.org); WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com  
(WKeilani@SempraUtilities.com); philm@scdenergy.com (philm@scdenergy.com);  
bspeckman@nexant.com (bspeckman@nexant.com); daniel.h.kim@me.com  
(daniel.h.kim@me.com); will.mitchell@cpv.com (will.mitchell@cpv.com);  
Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com (Melissa.Hovsepian@sce.com); Barry, Donna L  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=DLBf); nguyen.quan@gswater.com  
(nguyen.quan@gswater.com); matt.vespa@SierraClub.org  
(matt.vespa@SierraClub.org); TLindl@kfwlaw.com (TLindl@kfwlaw.com);  
tculley@kfwlaw.com (tculley@kfwlaw.com); aschwartz@solarcity.com  
(aschwartz@solarcity.com); nicole@braunlegal.com (nicole@braunlegal.com);  
sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com (sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com);  
ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com (ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com); cbk@eslawfirm.com  
(cbk@eslawfirm.com); sbeserra@sbcglobal.net (sbeserra@sbcglobal.net);  
jderosa@ces-ltd.com (jderosa@ces-ltd.com); rshilling@krcd.org  
(rshilling@krcd.org); SHruby@SempraUtilities.com  
(SHruby@SempraUtilities.com); tara.collins@sfgov.org (tara.collins@sfgov.org);  
rvillarreal@earthjustice.org (rvillarreal@earthjustice.org);  
Rachel@ConsciousVenturesGroup.com (Rachel@ConsciousVenturesGroup.com);  
Smith, Christopher (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=C5SE);  
MeganMMyers@yahoo.com (MeganMMyers@yahoo.com);  
greencowboysdf@gmail.com (greencowboysdf@gmail.com);  
sbailey@semprausgp.com (sbailey@semprausgp.com); irene@igc.org  
(irene@igc.org); ericg@votesolar.org (ericg@votesolar.org);  
aadeyeye@earthjustice.org (aadeyeye@earthjustice.org);  
TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com (TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com);  
CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com (CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com);  
chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com (chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com);  
James.J.Hirsch@gmail.com (James.J.Hirsch@gmail.com);  
kim.johnson@RiverbankPower.com (kim.johnson@RiverbankPower.com);  
JWaen@MarinEnergy.com (JWaen@MarinEnergy.com);  
bruce.perlstein@navigant.com (bruce.perlstein@navigant.com); Iwahashi, Miyuki  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MXI8);  
fred.wellington@navigantconsulting.com  
(fred.wellington@navigantconsulting.com); ygomez@libertypowercorp.com  
(ygomez@libertypowercorp.com); sarah.barker-ball@bingham.com (sarah.barker-  
ball@bingham.com); Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org  
(Sarah.Friedman@SierraClub.org); dhou@caiso.com (dhou@caiso.com);  
Mobasheri@ElectricPowerGroup.com (Mobasheri@ElectricPowerGroup.com);  
Rich.Quattrini@jci.com (Rich.Quattrini@jci.com); keene@braunlegal.com  
(keene@braunlegal.com); jbaak@votesolar.org (jbaak@votesolar.org);  
David.Weidberg@jci.com (David.Weidberg@jci.com); scott.dayer@ge.com

(scott.dayer@ge.com); hudsonr@conedsolutions.com  
(hudsonr@conedsolutions.com); cpospasil@edisonmission.com  
(cpospasil@edisonmission.com); tvitolo@synapse-energy.com (tvitolo@synapse-  
energy.com); eluesebrink@edisonmission.com (eluesebrink@edisonmission.com);  
marilyn@sbesc.com (marilyn@sbesc.com); KUlrich@foe.org (KUlrich@foe.org);  
gestrada@krismayeslaw.com (gestrada@krismayeslaw.com);  
FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com (FairbanksA@ConEdSolutions.com);  
charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com (charles.purshouse@camcoglobal.com);  
adaberko@starwood.com (adaberko@starwood.com); snichols@summitpower.com  
(snichols@summitpower.com); dariush@shirconsultants.com  
(dariush@shirconsultants.com); ronknecht@aol.com (ronknecht@aol.com);  
eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com (eszalkowski@cleanlineenergy.com);  
jbbrown@gate.net (jbbrown@gate.net); amanda.klopf@sce.com  
(amanda.klopf@sce.com); nick@ethree.com (nick@ethree.com);  
rsb@worldbusiness.org (rsb@worldbusiness.org); jshields@ssjid.com  
(jshields@ssjid.com); peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com  
(peter.cavan@pulseenergy.com); fraser@ieta.org (fraser@ieta.org);  
greg.blue@sbcglobal.net (greg.blue@sbcglobal.net); lschwartz@raponline.org  
(lschwartz@raponline.org); venskus@lawsv.com (venskus@lawsv.com);  
erica@gqhlobby.com (erica@gqhlobby.com); jcandelaria@aspenerg.com  
(jcandelaria@aspenerg.com); sfoley@ggu.edu (sfoley@ggu.edu); Ungson, Chris  
(chris.ungson@cpuc.ca.gov); Gamson, David M. (david.gamson@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Chow, Lily (lily.chow@cpuc.ca.gov); Ouyang, Ke Hao  
(kehao.ouyang@cpuc.ca.gov); Lee, Rebecca Tsai-Wei (rebecca.lee@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Parrillo, Jordan (jordan.parrillo@cpuc.ca.gov); Rogers, Nika  
(nika.rogers@cpuc.ca.gov); Spencer, Peter (peter.spencer@cpuc.ca.gov); Simon,  
Sean A. (sean.simon@cpuc.ca.gov); Lukins, Chloe (chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Lakhchaura, Megha (megha.lakhchaura@cpuc.ca.gov); mpryor@energy.state.ca.us  
(mpryor@energy.state.ca.us); dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net  
(dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net); Kwasny, Iryna (iryna.kwasny@cpuc.ca.gov); Hieta,  
Karin M. (karin.hieta@cpuc.ca.gov); White, Keith D. (keith.white@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Franz, Damon A. (damon.franz@cpuc.ca.gov); Poirier, Marcelo  
(marcelo.poirier@cpuc.ca.gov); Khosrowjah, Sepideh  
(sepideh.khosrowjah@cpuc.ca.gov); Lasko, Yakov (yakov.lasko@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Randolph, Edward F. (edward.randolph@cpuc.ca.gov); Velasquez, Carlos A.  
(carlos.velasquez@cpuc.ca.gov); O'Donnell, Arthur J.  
(Arthur.O'Donnell@cpuc.ca.gov); Kao, Valerie (valerie.kao@cpuc.ca.gov); Kito,  
Michele (michele.kito@cpuc.ca.gov); Siao, David (David.Siao@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Stevens, Brian (brian.stevens@cpuc.ca.gov); Wecker, Alan  
(Alan.Wecker@cpuc.ca.gov); Gupta, Alope (aloke.gupta@cpuc.ca.gov);  
connie.leni@energy.ca.gov (connie.leni@energy.ca.gov);  
mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us (mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); Charkowicz, Ed  
(ed.charkowicz@cpuc.ca.gov); Bichkoff, Lewis (Lewis.Bichkoff@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Ketabi, Noushin (Noushin.Ketabi@cpuc.ca.gov); Ciupagea, Radu  
(radu.ciupagea@cpuc.ca.gov); Nakamura, Kevin S. (kevin.nakamura@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Cole, Alexander (Alexander.Cole@cpuc.ca.gov); 'Udi Helman (Consultant)'

(uhelman@brightsourceenergy.com)

Cc:

Bcc:

Subject: RE: R.12-03-014 (2012 LTPP): Website updated to most recent LTPP Scenario Tool

Dear R.12-03-014,

The documents attached to Patrick's email from last week (changes listed below) have been posted on the LTPP website and are now available under the **May 31, 2013** entry.

Best,

Nat

**Nathaniel W. Skinner**

Generation and Transmission Planning

California Public Utilities Commission

415-703-1393 (office)

415-703-1292 (fax)

nathaniel.skinner@cpuc.ca.gov

In response to the "Update to Replicating TPP Scenario Assumptions submitted by the CAISO" filed on May 17, 2013 by the California ISO, CPUC staff has updated the scenario

“Replicating TPP” in Decision (D).12-12-010. Attached is an updated copy of the Scenario Tool v5, and the companion Summary Data of Revised Scenarios v5. The exercise of updating the Replicating TPP uncovered some details outlined below and also necessitated updating NQC values for the RPS Portfolios in some of the other Scenarios. Fortunately, the actual composition of all of the RPS Portfolios remain unaffected. Also attached is a summary table document describing the assumptions for the TPP and LTPP including this update.

Changes to LTPP Track 2 Scenarios:

- [REDACTED] We changed LTPP’s Rep. TPP scenario to use exactly the same RPS portfolio as was submitted by CEC/CPUC to the ISO in January 2013 for the 2013-14 TPP. The NQC values for this portfolio are reflected in Scenario Tool v5.
- [REDACTED] We changed LTPP’s Rep. TPP scenario to assume the Low savings amount for Incremental EE and no DR projection.
- [REDACTED] We added a sensitivity called “Rep. TPP + DR”, which assumes the Low DR projection.
- [REDACTED] There are no changes to the underlying RPS portfolios for the other LTPP scenarios.

However, there are two factors causing differences to appear in the NQC values for the RPS portfolios when comparing v4 and v5 of the Scenario Tool.

1. The new Rep. TPP Scenario RPS Portfolio is identical to the 2013-14 TPP RPS Portfolio. The Renewable Net Short calculation for the 2013-14 TPP RPS portfolio

- [REDACTED] assumed Mid Inc EE and Mid Inc Small PV,
- [REDACTED] included updated procured DG amounts,
- [REDACTED] included a projection of SB 1122 impacts,
- [REDACTED] assumed less Out-of-State renewable generation

These assumptions differ from the ones used to generate the original Rep. TPP scenario RPS portfolio NQC values.

2. An error in the RPS calculator undercounted NQC by inadvertently leaving out a few CREZs under the Commercial case. This error does not affect any of the RPS portfolios. It only affects the NQC projection which feeds into the Scenario Tool. Fixing this RPS calculator error resulted in corrections to the NQC values for the RPS portfolios of the LTPP Base, Early SONGS, Stress, and Rep. TPP scenarios.

The RPS calculator files incorporating these changes will be posted on the [LTPP website](#) within one week and this service list will be notified at that time.

Regards, Patrick Young

---

Patrick Young | Regulatory Analyst | California Public Utilities Commission  
505 Van Ness Ave, San Francisco CA 94102 | 415-703-5357 | [cpuc.ca.gov](http://cpuc.ca.gov)