

From: Yip-Kikugawa, Amy C.

Sent: 6/21/2013 1:32:03 PM

liddell@energyattorney.com (liddell@energyattorney.com);
tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com (tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com); matthew@turn.org
(matthew@turn.org); jleslie@mckennalong.com (jleslie@mckennalong.com);
dhilla@consumercal.org (dhilla@consumercal.org); whitney@clean-coalition.org
(whitney@clean-coalition.org); SLowe@EagleCrestEnergy.com
(SLowe@EagleCrestEnergy.com); Gupta, Alope (aloke.gupta@cpuc.ca.gov);
rick_noger@praxair.com (rick_noger@praxair.com); douglass@energyattorney.com
(douglass@energyattorney.com); igoodman@commerceenergy.com
(igoodman@commerceenergy.com); lwisland@ucsusa.org (lwisland@ucsusa.org);
adam.green@solarreserve.com (adam.green@solarreserve.com);
cpacc@calpine.com (cpacc@calpine.com); info@3PhasesRenewables.com
(info@3PhasesRenewables.com); mike_windpower@yahoo.com
(mike_windpower@yahoo.com); MbeLively@aol.com (MbeLively@aol.com);
AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com (AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com);
karlk@dietzedavis.com (karlk@dietzedavis.com); ehsieh@a123systems.com
(ehsieh@a123systems.com); lflowers111@gmail.com (lflowers111@gmail.com);
kim.johnson@RiverbankPower.com (kim.johnson@RiverbankPower.com);
GBenson@perkinscoie.com (GBenson@perkinscoie.com);
To: katherine.krause@DirectEnergy.com (katherine.krause@DirectEnergy.com);
ssmyers@att.net (ssmyers@att.net); sdhilton@stoel.com (sdhilton@stoel.com);
nes@a-klaw.com (nes@a-klaw.com); jeanne.sole@sfgov.org
(jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com (mtierney-
lloyd@enernoc.com); bcragg@goodinmacbride.com
(bcragg@goodinmacbride.com); cathy.karlstad@sce.com (cathy.karlstad@sce.com);
gmorris@emf.net (gmorris@emf.net); GloriaB@anzaelectric.org
(GloriaB@anzaelectric.org); Huffman, Mark (Law)
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2);
mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com (mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com);
andrea.morrison@directenergy.com (andrea.morrison@directenergy.com);
tomb@crossborderenergy.com (tomb@crossborderenergy.com); dorth@krcd.org
(dorth@krcd.org); gbass@noblesolutions.com (gbass@noblesolutions.com);
barmackm@calpine.com (barmackm@calpine.com); rkmoore@gswater.com
(rkmoore@gswater.com); Thomas, Sarah R. (sarah.thomas@cpuc.ca.gov);
VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com (VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com);
wrostov@earthjustice.org (wrostov@earthjustice.org); Reid, Alice L (Law)
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=ALR4); KSEngineers@aol.com
(KSEngineers@aol.com); ames_doug@yahoo.com (ames_doug@yahoo.com);
knakatani@calhrc.org (knakatani@calhrc.org); ATrial@SempraUtilities.com
(ATrial@SempraUtilities.com); gotschall@ti-sd.com (gotschall@ti-sd.com);
Hal@AltonEnergy.com (Hal@AltonEnergy.com);
dschlosberg@brightsourceenergy.com (dschlosberg@brightsourceenergy.com);
dkates@sonic.net (dkates@sonic.net); toconnor@edf.org (toconnor@edf.org);
proceedings@megawattsf.com (proceedings@megawattsf.com);

JWaen@MarinEnergy.com (JWaen@MarinEnergy.com); RegRelCPUCCases (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases); clamasbabbini@comverge.com (clamasbabbini@comverge.com); david@nemtzow.com (david@nemtzow.com); tam@communityrenewables.biz (tam@communityrenewables.biz); sephra.ninow@energycenter.org (sephra.ninow@energycenter.org); mrw@mrwassoc.com (mrw@mrwassoc.com); DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com (DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com); Pagedar, Sujata (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=sxpg); blaising@braunlegal.com (blaising@braunlegal.com); abb@eslawfirm.com (abb@eslawfirm.com); dkk@eslawfirm.com (dkk@eslawfirm.com); klatt@energyattorney.com (klatt@energyattorney.com); JanMcFar@sonic.net (JanMcFar@sonic.net); spauker@wsgr.com (spauker@wsgr.com); Erin.Grizard@BloomEnergy.com (Erin.Grizard@BloomEnergy.com); ttutt@smud.org (ttutt@smud.org); Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com (Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com); californiadockets@pacificorp.com (californiadockets@pacificorp.com); lwhouse@innercite.com (lwhouse@innercite.com); michelle.d.grant@dynegey.com (michelle.d.grant@dynegey.com); bmarshall@psrec.coop (bmarshall@psrec.coop); dansvec@hdo.net (dansvec@hdo.net); steven.huhman@morganstanley.com (steven.huhman@morganstanley.com); jack@casaraquel.com (jack@casaraquel.com); cpuc@primuspowers.com (cpuc@primuspowers.com); sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com (sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com); klr@a-klaw.com (klr@a-klaw.com); nellie.tong@dnvkema.com (nellie.tong@dnvkema.com); pcarson@energycentral.com (pcarson@energycentral.com); Capp@GridStorageConsulting.com (Capp@GridStorageConsulting.com); Rachel@ConsciousVenturesGroup.com (Rachel@ConsciousVenturesGroup.com); mehta.associates@ymail.com (mehta.associates@ymail.com); Steph@Clean-Coalition.org (Steph@Clean-Coalition.org); n.davidson@renewableanalytics.com (n.davidson@renewableanalytics.com); praveen.kathpal@aes.com (praveen.kathpal@aes.com); Richard.S.Flood@jci.com (Richard.S.Flood@jci.com); janderson@viridityenergy.com (janderson@viridityenergy.com); usappk@gmail.com (usappk@gmail.com); jspilman@gridflexenergy.com (jspilman@gridflexenergy.com); AAmirali@starwood.com (AAmirali@starwood.com); skincaid@makerscapital.com (skincaid@makerscapital.com); dadams@viridityenergy.com (dadams@viridityenergy.com); JJudson-mcqueeney@ces-ltd.com (JJudson-mcqueeney@ces-ltd.com); yu@beaconpower.com (yu@beaconpower.com); NODonovan@LREnergy.com (NODonovan@LREnergy.com); rfo@sovereignenergy.net (rfo@sovereignenergy.net); rokeefe@xtremepower.com (rokeefe@xtremepower.com); sdavis@kngrid.com (sdavis@kngrid.com); michael.stelts@panasonic.com (michael.stelts@panasonic.com); abrown@xtremepower.com (abrown@xtremepower.com); sahm@clean-coalition.org (sahm@clean-coalition.org); margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com (margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); Berlinski@BeaconPower.com (Berlinski@BeaconPower.com); jLin@strategen.com (jLin@strategen.com); rspolek@besciences.com (rspolek@besciences.com); TJS@cyp-res.com (TJS@cyp-res.com); steve.eckert@BrookfieldPower.com

(steve.eckert@BrookfieldPower.com); WJKeese@aol.com (WJKeese@aol.com); anfanzone@semprautilities.com (anfanzone@semprautilities.com); sswaroop@marinenergy.com (sswaroop@marinenergy.com); andra.pligavko@gmail.com (andra.pligavko@gmail.com); dyana@clean-coalition.org (dyana@clean-coalition.org); csullivan@zbbenergy.com (csullivan@zbbenergy.com); bgross@caiso.com (bgross@caiso.com); Cherry, Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7); Malashenko, Elizaveta I. (elizaveta.malashenko@cpuc.ca.gov); Haertle, Steve (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=SRH1); Peck, David B. (david.peck@cpuc.ca.gov); lmh@eslawfirm.com (lmh@eslawfirm.com); joyw@mid.org (joyw@mid.org); Singh, Devla (devla.singh@cpuc.ca.gov); Villarreal, Christopher (christopher.villarreal@cpuc.ca.gov); eric@ethree.com (eric@ethree.com); filings@a-klaw.com (filings@a-klaw.com); CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com (CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com); Cotroneo, Eileen (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=EFM2); cem@newsdata.com (cem@newsdata.com); case.admin@sce.com (case.admin@sce.com); Roberts, Thomas (thomas.roberts@cpuc.ca.gov); e-recipient@caiso.com (e-recipient@caiso.com); Gonzales, Matthew (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg); Lee, Rebecca Tsai-Wei (rebecca.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); jsanders@caiso.com (jsanders@caiso.com); rl@eslawfirm.com (rl@eslawfirm.com); sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com (sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com); Simon, Jason (jason.simon@cpuc.ca.gov); Lukins, Chloe (chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov); kowalewskia@calpine.com (kowalewskia@calpine.com); andykatz@sonic.net (andykatz@sonic.net); steven@iepa.com (steven@iepa.com); dgrandy@caonsitegen.com (dgrandy@caonsitegen.com); atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com (atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com); juliettea7@aol.com (juliettea7@aol.com); Momoh, Rahmon O. (rahmon.momoh@cpuc.ca.gov); ek@a-klaw.com (ek@a-klaw.com); Hieta, Karin M. (karin.hieta@cpuc.ca.gov); amber@iepa.com (amber@iepa.com); ehadley@reupower.com (ehadley@reupower.com); kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com (kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com); Monica.Schwebs@bingham.com (Monica.Schwebs@bingham.com); HRasool@SempraUtilities.com (HRasool@SempraUtilities.com); White, Keith D. (keith.white@cpuc.ca.gov); ddavie@wellhead.com (ddavie@wellhead.com); marcie.milner@shell.com (marcie.milner@shell.com); mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com (mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com); chris@emeter.com (chris@emeter.com); brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com (brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); nsuetake@turn.org (nsuetake@turn.org); david@ceert.org (david@ceert.org); jbaird@earthjustice.org (jbaird@earthjustice.org); dbehles@ggu.edu (dbehles@ggu.edu); acsmith@stoel.com (acsmith@stoel.com); JMauldin@adamsbroadwell.com (JMauldin@adamsbroadwell.com); matt.vespa@SierraClub.org (matt.vespa@SierraClub.org); TLindl@kfwlaw.com (TLindl@kfwlaw.com); O'Donnell, Arthur J. (Arthur.O'Donnell@cpuc.ca.gov); aschwartz@solarcity.com (aschwartz@solarcity.com); dchia@solarcity.com (dchia@solarcity.com); Levin, Robert (robert.levin@cpuc.ca.gov); cpuc@libertyutilities.com

(cpuc@libertyutilities.com); Patwa, Daidipya (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=D2PA); Lee, Audrey (audrey.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); sbeserra@sbcglobal.net (sbeserra@sbcglobal.net); jderosa@ces-ltd.com (jderosa@ces-ltd.com); berlin@susieberlinlaw.com (berlin@susieberlinlaw.com); TRH@cpuc.ca.gov (TRH@cpuc.ca.gov); Fukui, Lucy (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=L GK2); word@altonenergy.com (word@altonenergy.com); mary.hemmingsen@brookfieldpower.com (mary.hemmingsen@brookfieldpower.com); shears@ceert.org (shears@ceert.org); rvillarreal@earthjustice.org (rvillarreal@earthjustice.org); sreineccius@gmail.com (sreineccius@gmail.com); BAdams@EnerVault.com (BAdams@EnerVault.com); francis.taylor@enersys.com (francis.taylor@enersys.com); jbryan@codaenergy.com (jbryan@codaenergy.com); Smith, Christopher (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=C5SE); nate.sandvig@enxco.com (nate.sandvig@enxco.com); mdetsky@dietzedavis.com (mdetsky@dietzedavis.com); Sterkel, Merideth "Molly" (MeridethMolly.Sterkel@cpuc.ca.gov); waltnerlaw@gmail.com (waltnerlaw@gmail.com); f.schubert@renewableanalytics.com (f.schubert@renewableanalytics.com); ddivine@eaglecrestenergy.com (ddivine@eaglecrestenergy.com); cecilia.aguillon@kyocera.com (cecilia.aguillon@kyocera.com); roger@cbeal.org (roger@cbeal.org); Wecker, Alan (Alan.Wecker@cpuc.ca.gov); dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com (dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com); toguin@lightsail.com (toguin@lightsail.com); tandrews@calmac.com (tandrews@calmac.com); aviramontes@lbl.gov (aviramontes@lbl.gov); Doug.Hackley@Calenergy.com (Doug.Hackley@Calenergy.com); shaun.logue@brookfieldrenewable.com (shaun.logue@brookfieldrenewable.com); irene@igc.org (irene@igc.org); ericg@votesolar.org (ericg@votesolar.org); Jim.Hicks@state.or.us (Jim.Hicks@state.or.us); paul.stith@greenonramp.com (paul.stith@greenonramp.com); yaron@voltmetrix.com (yaron@voltmetrix.com); wtorre@ucsd.edu (wtorre@ucsd.edu); cpuc-r1012007@olivineinc.com (cpuc-r1012007@olivineinc.com); Nancy.Allred@sce.com (Nancy.Allred@sce.com); aadeyeye@earthjustice.org (aadeyeye@earthjustice.org); dhawkins3@mac.com (dhawkins3@mac.com); maya@cbeal.org (maya@cbeal.org); whholmes@stoel.com (whholmes@stoel.com); art@ucan.org (art@ucan.org); kevin.snyder@hdrinc.com (kevin.snyder@hdrinc.com); afreifeld@viridityenergy.com (afreifeld@viridityenergy.com); pklauer@caiso.com (pklauer@caiso.com); CSummers@SempraUtilities.com (CSummers@SempraUtilities.com); martinc@mid.org (martinc@mid.org); agassner@enbala.com (agassner@enbala.com); SDeb@EnergyOnLine.com (SDeb@EnergyOnLine.com); sean.kagiyama@nedosv.org (sean.kagiyama@nedosv.org); jkopyciok@energy-solution.com (jkopyciok@energy-solution.com); Greenacre, Wade (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=WAG9); farshid.arman@siemens.com (farshid.arman@siemens.com); CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com (CalConsumersAlliance@gmail.com); NThakar@PerkinsCoie.com (NThakar@PerkinsCoie.com); msloustcher@codaelectric.com (msloustcher@codaelectric.com); Charles, Melicia (melicia.charles@cpuc.ca.gov);

abining@energy.state.ca.us (abining@energy.state.ca.us); Ghazzagh, Farzad (farzad.ghazzagh@cpuc.ca.gov); Kalafut, Jennifer (jennifer.kalafut@cpuc.ca.gov); Al-Mukdad, Wendy (wendy.al-mukdad@cpuc.ca.gov); Ekelly@MarinEnergy.com (Ekelly@MarinEnergy.com); borion@lawyersforcleanenergy.com (borion@lawyersforcleanenergy.com); pdarcy@sna.sanyo.com (pdarcy@sna.sanyo.com); LManz@tresamigasllc.com (LManz@tresamigasllc.com)

Cc: ALJ Process (ALJ_Process@cpuc.ca.gov); ALJ Docket Office (ALJ_Docket_Office@cpuc.ca.gov)

Bcc:

Subject: R.10-12-007 (Energy Storage Rulemaking): - ALJ Ruling Entering Cost-Effectiveness Study Reports into the Record

To Parties in R.10-12-007,

On June 21, 2013, Energy Division staff served two separate cost-effectiveness study reports on the service list of this proceeding. The two reports are:

- A draft report by DNV KEMA Energy and Sustainability (DNV KEMA), entitled *Energy Storage Cost-effectiveness Methodology and Preliminary Results*
- A final report by the Electric Power Research Institute (EPRI), entitled *Cost-Effectiveness of Energy Storage in California*

On June 10, 2013, Commissioner Peterman issued an Assigned Commissioner's Ruling (ACR) proposing Storage Procurement Targets and Mechanisms. In that ACR, there were two questions concerning the DNV KEMA and EPRI studies.

This Administrative Law Judge's Ruling (Ruling) enters the DNV KEMA draft report and EPRI report into the record of this proceeding so that parties may cite to them in their July 8 comments on the Commissioner's proposal and in responses to the ACR questions. The scope of comments shall be limited to how the studies and their findings relate to the procurement targets, cost caps and the overall structure of the storage procurement process. Parties are not required to comment on the studies at the June 25, 2013 All-Party Meeting unless they wish to do so.

Finally, to ensure that these studies are readily available, Energy Division staff is directed to post the DNV KEMA and EPRI reports on the Commission's Electric Energy Storage webpage.

IT IS RULED that:

1. DNV KEMA's draft report entitled *Energy Storage Cost-effectiveness Methodology and Preliminary Results* is entered into the record.
2. EPRI's report, entitled *Cost-Effectiveness of Energy Storage in California* is entered into the record.

A confirming ruling shall be issued at a later date.

Amy C. Yip-Kikugawa
Administrative Law Judge
California Public Utilities Commission
415.703.5256