

**From:** Horner, Trina  
**Sent:** 7/15/2013 4:29:36 PM  
**To:** Cherry, Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7);  
'Zafar, Marzia' (marzia.zafar@cpuc.ca.gov)  
**Cc:**  
**Bcc:**  
**Subject:** RE: PPD California electric consumption data 2012.xlsx

Hi Marzia, I left you a voicemail. We'd be happy to show you our analysis – give me a call.

Trina

973-6490 (o)

722-6504 (m)

**From:** Zafar, Marzia [mailto:marzia.zafar@cpuc.ca.gov]  
**Sent:** Monday, July 15, 2013 2:51 PM  
**To:** Cherry, Brian K; Prusnek, Brian C; Dietz, Sidney; Michael.Hoover@sce.com;  
Laura.Genao@sce.com  
**Cc:** Horner, Trina  
**Subject:** RE: PPD California electric consumption data 2012.xlsx

Actually, I show Indian Wells, Tulare, Kings county and Orange as 4 of the 10 high users. I can tell you that neither Tulare nor Kings county initiate the thought in my head as rich cities... ☺. And Orange is the same way, this is not the OC, it is just Orange.

Trina – give me a call sometime today so that I don't send 10 more emails ☺

*Marzia Zafar – California Public Utilities Commission – [Zaf@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:Zaf@cpuc.ca.gov) – 415-703-1997*

**From:** Cherry, Brian K [mailto:BKC7@pge.com]  
**Sent:** Monday, July 15, 2013 2:48 PM  
**To:** Zafar, Marzia; Prusnek, Brian C; Dietz, Sidney; [Michael.Hoover@sce.com](mailto:Michael.Hoover@sce.com); [Laura.Genao@sce.com](mailto:Laura.Genao@sce.com)  
**Cc:** Horner, Trina

**Subject:** RE: PPD California electric consumption data 2012.xlsx

It is intuitively obvious. I will ask Trina to get you the CARE material. I would not just use it as a footnote since the impact is large.

**From:** Zafar, Marzia [<mailto:marzia.zafar@cpuc.ca.gov>]  
**Sent:** Monday, July 15, 2013 2:46 PM  
**To:** Cherry, Brian K; Prusnek, Brian C; Dietz, Sidney; [Michael.Hoover@sce.com](mailto:Michael.Hoover@sce.com);  
[Laura.Genao@sce.com](mailto:Laura.Genao@sce.com)  
**Cc:** Horner, Trina  
**Subject:** RE: PPD California electric consumption data 2012.xlsx

Also, I didn't show any sort of correlation between income and usage. Where do you get that from??

*Marzia Zafar – California Public Utilities Commission – [Zaf@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:Zaf@cpuc.ca.gov) – 415-703-1997*

**From:** Zafar, Marzia  
**Sent:** Monday, July 15, 2013 2:45 PM  
**To:** 'Cherry, Brian K'; Prusnek, Brian C; Dietz, Sidney; [Michael.Hoover@sce.com](mailto:Michael.Hoover@sce.com);  
[Laura.Genao@sce.com](mailto:Laura.Genao@sce.com)  
**Cc:** Horner, Trina  
**Subject:** RE: PPD California electric consumption data 2012.xlsx

Hi,

Actually, I don't get a different answer. I have tried it. and you have the excel spreadsheet and you can try it as well. The top 10 cities by usage stay the same and the top 15 cities by bill stay the same.

As far the CARE issue, I agree that a further breakdown by CARE and Non-CARE will give you better data, but I don't have it. You can certainly provide it for me and I'll run

that way otherwise I can just make a footnote to make a note of it. does that work??

marzia

*Marzia Zafar – California Public Utilities Commission – [Zaf@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:Zaf@cpuc.ca.gov) – 415-703-1997*

**From:** Cherry, Brian K [<mailto:BKC7@pge.com>]  
**Sent:** Monday, July 15, 2013 2:41 PM  
**To:** Zafar, Marzia; Prusnek, Brian C; Dietz, Sidney; [Michael.Hoover@sce.com](mailto:Michael.Hoover@sce.com); [Laura.Genao@sce.com](mailto:Laura.Genao@sce.com)  
**Cc:** Horner, Trina  
**Subject:** RE: PPD California electric consumption data 2012.xlsx

Marzia – the data you used showing a strong correlation between usage and incomes doesn't take into account CARE and other factors. In addition, the cities represent a select group that does not represent households in general in our service territories. When you include larger cities like SFO and San Jose, you get a very different answer. Trina's folks have looked at this and will be happy to share with you our findings that don't show a strong correlation between income and usage in our territory.

**From:** Zafar, Marzia [<mailto:marzia.zafar@cpuc.ca.gov>]  
**Sent:** Monday, July 15, 2013 1:55 PM  
**To:** Prusnek, Brian C; Cherry, Brian K; Dietz, Sidney; [Michael.Hoover@sce.com](mailto:Michael.Hoover@sce.com); [Laura.Genao@sce.com](mailto:Laura.Genao@sce.com)  
**Subject:** FW: PPD California electric consumption data 2012.xlsx

Hello,

Just another thing on the data. Here's my spreadsheet that I used to get those charts and graphs in case you have questions. This the raw data that you supplied me and what forms the graphs/charts. The only thing that I add was a column for average rate using your data.

Let me know by this Wednesday if you have an issue with me sending this data to institutions like the CEC and OPR as well as publicizing it. I understand that avg bill and avg consumption will show different info mainly because the CARE matter, but the data is still very useful and interesting.

Thanks,

marzia

*Marzia Zafar – California Public Utilities Commission – [Zaf@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:Zaf@cpuc.ca.gov) – 415-703-1997*

PG&E is committed to protecting our customers' privacy.

To learn more, please visit <http://www.pge.com/about/company/privacy/customer/>

PG&E is committed to protecting our customers' privacy.

To learn more, please visit <http://www.pge.com/about/company/privacy/customer/>