Fine vs. Net Income

Net Income

Fine (squares are to scale)

Consumers Energy	UGI Utilities	El Paso Gas
Pipeline explosion fatalities: 2 (2010) Net Income: \$382M ¹ Fine: \$1M (<1%)	Pipeline explosion fatalities: 5 (2011) Net Income: \$199M ² Fine: \$0.5M (<1%)	Pipeline explosion fatalities: 10 (2007) Net Income: \$442M ³ Fine: \$100M (22.6%)



Pacific Gas and Electric Company

Pipeline explosion fatalities: 8 (2010) Net Income: \$830M (2012)⁴ Proposed fine: \$4000M (481%)⁵

¹Source: Consumers Energy 2012 Anuual Report

² Source: UGI Corporation 2012 Annual Report

³ Source: Statista.com [http://www.statista.com/statistics/217202/el-paso-corporation-net-income/)

⁴ Source: PG&E Corporation and Pacific Gas and Electric Company 2012 Annual Report

⁵ Fine issuance TBD