

From: Sahn White  
Sent: 10/31/2013 4:45:34 PM  
To: joanna.gubman@cpuc.ca.gov (joanna.gubman@cpuc.ca.gov);  
RAFiling@cpuc.ca.gov (RAFiling@cpuc.ca.gov)  
clamasbabbini@comverge.com (clamasbabbini@comverge.com);  
sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com (sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com);  
jleslie@mckennalong.com (jleslie@mckennalong.com); Tam Hunt (tam@clean-  
coalition.org); rick\_noger@praxair.com (rick\_noger@praxair.com);  
Andrew.Luszcz@GlacialEnergy.com (Andrew.Luszcz@GlacialEnergy.com);  
kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com (kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com);  
blyons@TigerNaturalGas.com (blyons@TigerNaturalGas.com);  
abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com (abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com);  
proceedings@psrec.coop (proceedings@psrec.coop); Joseph.williams@cwt.com  
(Joseph.williams@cwt.com); mryan@montaukenergy.com  
(mryan@montaukenergy.com); liddell@energyattorney.com  
(liddell@energyattorney.com); pthomsen@ormat.com (pthomsen@ormat.com);  
tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com (tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com);  
douglass@energyattorney.com (douglass@energyattorney.com);  
GloriaB@anzaelectric.org (GloriaB@anzaelectric.org);  
igoodman@commerceenergy.com (igoodman@commerceenergy.com);  
andrea.morrison@directenergy.com (andrea.morrison@directenergy.com);  
Cc: Joni.Templeton@sce.com (Joni.Templeton@sce.com); rkmoore@gswater.com  
(rkmoore@gswater.com); martin.kadillak@shell.com (martin.kadillak@shell.com);  
APak@SempraUtilities.com (APak@SempraUtilities.com);  
energy@3phasesrenewables.com (energy@3phasesrenewables.com);  
nguyen.quan@gswater.com (nguyen.quan@gswater.com);  
awilliams@libertypowercorp.com (awilliams@libertypowercorp.com); Kim Johnson  
(kimjohnson@ebarton.com); Thomas Corr (thomaspcorr@gmail.com); Cherry,  
Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7);  
jeanne.sole@sfgov.org (jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); mgo@goodinmacbride.com  
(mgo@goodinmacbride.com); mpa@a-klaw.com (mpa@a-klaw.com);  
hayley@turn.org (hayley@turn.org); mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com (mtierney-  
lloyd@enernoc.com); cmkehrein@ems-ca.com (cmkehrein@ems-ca.com);  
rl@eslawfirm.com (rl@eslawfirm.com); abb@eslawfirm.com  
(abb@eslawfirm.com); jeffgray@dwt.com (jeffgray@dwt.com);  
Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net  
(Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net); dorth@krcd.org (dorth@krcd.org);  
dweisz@marinenergy.com (dweisz@marinenergy.com); dansvec@hdo.net  
(dansvec@hdo.net); aivancovich@caiso.com (aivancovich@caiso.com);  
cpuc@primuspower.com (cpuc@primuspower.com);  
stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com (stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com);  
Rachel@largescalesolar.org (Rachel@largescalesolar.org);  
dschlosberg@brightsourceenergy.com (dschlosberg@brightsourceenergy.com);  
Nora Sheriff (nes@a-klaw.com); Lynch, Mary (Mary.Lynch@constellation.com);  
mm2@cpuc.ca.gov (mm2@cpuc.ca.gov); ariel.lin@sce.com (ariel.lin@sce.com);

Tex.Wilkins@gmail.com (Tex.Wilkins@gmail.com); b.bordiine@d-e-c-a.org  
(b.bordiine@d-e-c-a.org); BCragg (BCragg@goodinmacbride.com); MDay  
(MDay@goodinmacbride.com); Sara Steck Myers (ssmyers@att.net); Tom Beach  
(tomb@crossborderenergy.com); Matt Vespa (matt.vespa@sierraclub.org); Lisa  
Cottle (lcottle@winston.com); Andra Pligavko (andra.pligavko@gmail.com);  
RegRelCPUCCases  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases);  
david@nemtzw.com (david@nemtzw.com); CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com  
(CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com); case.admin@sce.com (case.admin@sce.com);  
mrw@mrwassoc.com (mrw@mrwassoc.com); wynne@braunlegal.com  
(wynne@braunlegal.com); DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com  
(DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com); blaising@braunlegal.com  
(blaising@braunlegal.com); Zahariudakis, George  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=GxZ5); gbass@noblesolutions.com  
(gbass@noblesolutions.com); klatt@energyattorney.com  
(klatt@energyattorney.com); nrader@calwea.org (nrader@calwea.org);  
californiadockets@pacificorp.com (californiadockets@pacificorp.com);  
cpacc@calpine.com (cpacc@calpine.com); kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com  
(kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com); brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com  
(brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); peter.pearson@bves.com  
(peter.pearson@bves.com); julien.dumoulin-smith@ubs.com (julien.dumoulin-  
smith@ubs.com); matthew.barmack@calpine.com  
(matthew.barmack@calpine.com); smaye@nappartners.com  
(smaye@nappartners.com); AGarza-Beutz@semprautilities.com (AGarza-  
Beutz@semprautilities.com); mcrane@bluestarenergy.com  
(mcrane@bluestarenergy.com); NILEN@vestas.com (NILEN@vestas.com);  
jason.lewis@jpmorgan.com (jason.lewis@jpmorgan.com); mstamas@nrdc.org  
(mstamas@nrdc.org); barbara@barkovichandyap.com  
(barbara@barkovichandyap.com); braun@braunlegal.com (braun@braunlegal.com);  
virinder.singh@edf-re.com (virinder.singh@edf-re.com);  
JFriderichs@pilotpowergroup.com (JFriderichs@pilotpowergroup.com);  
AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com (AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com);  
NODonovan@LREnergy.com (NODonovan@LREnergy.com);  
margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com  
(margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); Berlinski@BeaconPower.com  
(Berlinski@BeaconPower.com); Wetstone, Brad  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=B1WA); Laura Wisland  
(lwisland@ucsusa.org); sswaroop@marinenergy.com  
(sswaroop@marinenergy.com); ygomez@libertypowercorp.com  
(ygomez@libertypowercorp.com); Marty.Rogers@nee.com  
(Marty.Rogers@nee.com); STomec@CapitalPower.com  
(STomec@CapitalPower.com); winton.kelly@nee.com (winton.kelly@nee.com);  
pramod@ces-ltd.com (pramod@ces-ltd.com); michael.evans@shell.com  
(michael.evans@shell.com); Mobasheri@ElectricPowerGroup.com  
(Mobasheri@ElectricPowerGroup.com); Susan.E.Smith@shell.com  
(Susan.E.Smith@shell.com); justin.boone@sce.com (justin.boone@sce.com);

mburrows@3phasesRenewables.com (mburrows@3phasesRenewables.com);  
jay.robertson@directenergy.com (jay.robertson@directenergy.com);  
rfagan@synapse-energy.com (rfagan@synapse-energy.com);  
David.Weidberg@jci.com (David.Weidberg@jci.com);  
hudsonr@conedsolutions.com (hudsonr@conedsolutions.com);  
amanda.bergfield@directenergy.com (amanda.bergfield@directenergy.com);  
MJacobs@ucsusa.org (MJacobs@ucsusa.org); Robin.Smutny-  
Jones@IberdrolaRen.com (Robin.Smutny-Jones@IberdrolaRen.com); Doug Davie  
(ddavie@wellhead.com); Sierra Martinez (smartinez@nrdc.org); Dyana Delfin-Polk  
(Dyana@clean-coalition.org); Steve Zuretti (SZuretti@seia.org); Shawn Bailey  
(sbailey@semprausgp.com); rachel mcmahon (mcmahon.rachel@gmail.com);  
jenchamberlin@earthlink.net (jenchamberlin@earthlink.net);  
EOlson@SempraUtilities.com (EOlson@SempraUtilities.com); Stephanie Wang  
(Steph@clean-coalition.org); David Morse (davidmorse9@gmail.com); whitney  
(whitney@clean-coalition.org); tlong@turn.org (tlong@turn.org); kmills@cfbf.com  
(kmills@cfbf.com); filings@a-klaw.com (filings@a-klaw.com);  
cem@newsdata.com (cem@newsdata.com); william.sanders@sfgov.org  
(william.sanders@sfgov.org); e-recipient@caiso.com (e-recipient@caiso.com);  
Middlekauff, Charles (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd);  
Gonzales, Matthew (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg);  
Huffman, Mark (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2);  
jjg@eslawfirm.com (jjg@eslawfirm.com); Lukins, Chloe  
(chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov); spauker@wsgr.com (spauker@wsgr.com);  
mprior@energy.state.ca.us (mprior@energy.state.ca.us);  
dgrandy@caonsitegen.com (dgrandy@caonsitegen.com); dws@r-c-s-inc.com  
(dws@r-c-s-inc.com); jna@speakeasy.org (jna@speakeasy.org);  
pmaxwell@navigantconsulting.com (pmaxwell@navigantconsulting.com);  
danielle@ceert.org (danielle@ceert.org); JChamberlin@LSPower.com  
(JChamberlin@LSPower.com); mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com  
(mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com); jwoodwar@energy.state.ca.us  
(jwoodwar@energy.state.ca.us); tsolomon@winston.com (tsolomon@winston.com);  
VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com (VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com); Colvin, Michael  
(michael.colvin@cpuc.ca.gov); bburns@caiso.com (bburns@caiso.com);  
smatlock@gswater.com (smatlock@gswater.com);  
RNicholson@SempraUtilities.com (RNicholson@SempraUtilities.com);  
david@ceert.org (david@ceert.org); cathompson@anaheim.net  
(cathompson@anaheim.net); Jarman, Thomas A  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=TAJ8); Dorman, Elizabeth  
(elizabeth.dorman@cpuc.ca.gov); Joseph.Phalen@bves.com  
(Joseph.Phalen@bves.com); kgillick@sfgwater.org (kgillick@sfgwater.org);  
brflynn@flynnrci.com (brflynn@flynnrci.com); aol@cpuc.ca.gov  
(aol@cpuc.ca.gov); TLindl@kfwlaw.com (TLindl@kfwlaw.com);  
lnavarro@edf.org (lnavarro@edf.org); nicole@braunlegal.com  
(nicole@braunlegal.com); sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com  
(sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com); kfox@kfwlaw.com (kfox@kfwlaw.com);  
kerry.hattevik@nee.com (kerry.hattevik@nee.com); wtr@cpuc.ca.gov

(wtr@cpuc.ca.gov); jderosa@ces-ltd.com (jderosa@ces-ltd.com);  
rshilling@krcd.org (rshilling@krcd.org); dbr@cpuc.ca.gov (dbr@cpuc.ca.gov);  
berlin@susieberlinlaw.com (berlin@susieberlinlaw.com); mk1@cpuc.ca.gov  
(mk1@cpuc.ca.gov); kho@cpuc.ca.gov (kho@cpuc.ca.gov); Smith, Christopher  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=C5SE);  
dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com (dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com);  
shaun.logue@brookfieldrenewable.com (shaun.logue@brookfieldrenewable.com);  
irene@igc.org (irene@igc.org); ericg@votesolar.org (ericg@votesolar.org);  
TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com (TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com); Greenacre, Wade  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=WAG9); df1@cpuc.ca.gov  
(df1@cpuc.ca.gov); ag2@cpuc.ca.gov (ag2@cpuc.ca.gov); aw3@cpuc.ca.gov  
(aw3@cpuc.ca.gov); JWaen@MarinEnergy.com (JWaen@MarinEnergy.com);  
tandy.mcmannes@solar.abengoa.com (tandy.mcmannes@solar.abengoa.com);  
mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us (mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); scl@cpuc.ca.gov  
(scl@cpuc.ca.gov); dmG@cpuc.ca.gov (dmG@cpuc.ca.gov); jrg@cpuc.ca.gov  
(jrg@cpuc.ca.gov); mla@cpuc.ca.gov (mla@cpuc.ca.gov); phs@cpuc.ca.gov  
(phs@cpuc.ca.gov); dhou@caiso.com (dhou@caiso.com); bcooper@caiso.com  
(bcooper@caiso.com); jhcaldwelljr@gmail.com (jhcaldwelljr@gmail.com);  
ynl@cpuc.ca.gov (ynl@cpuc.ca.gov); eac@cpuc.ca.gov (eac@cpuc.ca.gov);  
Rich.Quattrini@jci.com (Rich.Quattrini@jci.com); keene@braunlegal.com  
(keene@braunlegal.com); jgoodin@caiso.com (jgoodin@caiso.com);  
john@dmcadvisors.com (john@dmcadvisors.com); brc@cpuc.ca.gov  
(brc@cpuc.ca.gov); Tracey.Drabant@bves.com (Tracey.Drabant@bves.com);  
jenniferchamberlin@gmail.com (jenniferchamberlin@gmail.com);  
gkatta@caiso.com (gkatta@caiso.com); ekelly@marinenergyauthority.org  
(ekelly@marinenergyauthority.org); cara.goldenberg@grueneich.com  
(cara.goldenberg@grueneich.com); scott.dayer@ge.com (scott.dayer@ge.com);  
cpuc-r1110023@olivineinc.com (cpuc-r1110023@olivineinc.com);  
cho@cpuc.ca.gov (cho@cpuc.ca.gov); scheduling.nwns@nwnatural.com  
(scheduling.nwns@nwnatural.com); ericj@eslawfirm.com (ericj@eslawfirm.com);  
Douglas, Paul (psd@cpuc.ca.gov); Brookhyser, Don (deb@a-klaw.com); Ann  
Trowbridge (atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com); Kamins, Sara M.  
(SMK@cpuc.ca.gov); Julie Fitch (jf2@cpuc.ca.gov); Peck, David B.  
(DBP@cpuc.ca.gov); rcl@cpuc.ca.gov (rcl@cpuc.ca.gov); Will Rostov  
(wrostov@earthjustice.org); Kathy Treleven (ktreleven@gmail.com); Jim Baak  
(jbaak@votesolar.org); xl2@cpuc.ca.gov (xl2@cpuc.ca.gov); Phillip Muller  
(philm@scdenergy.com); Shannon Eddy (eddyconsulting@gmail.com); Nuo Tang  
(NTang@semprautilities.com); Sarah Barker-Ball (sarah.keane@bingham.com);  
Greg Morris (gmorris@emf.net); Steve Taber (Taber@princetonenergy.net); Oliver  
Myers (onmyers@gmail.com); Aram Shumavon (a.shumavon@decapower.org);  
Dennis De Cuir (dennis@ddecuir.com); Mike Hyams (mhyams@sfwater.org)

Bcc:

Subject: Re: Clean Coalition and DECA informal comments related to Treatment of Use-Limited Resources, Resource Adequacy Workshop (R.11-10-023)

Clean Coalition and DECA informal comments related to Treatment of Use-Limited Resources

in the Draft Staff Proposal for Qualifying Capacity and Effective Flexible Capacity Calculation Methodologies for Energy Storage and Supply-Side Demand Response ResourcesResource Adequacy Workshop (R.11-10-023)

Please find our informal comments attached.

--

Kenneth Sahm White  
Director, Economic & Policy Analysis  
[sahm@clean-coalition.org](mailto:sahm@clean-coalition.org)  
831-425-5866