

From: Sue Mara

Sent: 10/22/2013 3:46:44 PM

abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com (abraham.silverman@nrgenergy.com); Andy Brown (abb@eslawfirm.com); Andrew.Luszcz@GlacialEnergy.com (Andrew.Luszcz@GlacialEnergy.com); AGarza-Beutz@semprautilities.com (AGarza-Beutz@semprautilities.com); aivancovich@caiso.com (aivancovich@caiso.com); AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com (AKaplan@BrownRudnick.com); andra.pligavko@gmail.com (andra.pligavko@gmail.com); ag2@cpuc.ca.gov (ag2@cpuc.ca.gov); amanda.bergfield@directenergy.com (amanda.bergfield@directenergy.com); andrea.morrison@directenergy.com Morrison (andrea.morrison@DirectEnergy.com); Cherry, Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7); bcragg@goodinmacbride.com (bcragg@goodinmacbride.com); APak@SempraUtilities.com (APak@SempraUtilities.com); ao1@cpuc.ca.gov (ao1@cpuc.ca.gov); berlin@susieberlinlaw.com (berlin@susieberlinlaw.com); Berlinski@BeaconPower.com (Berlinski@BeaconPower.com); Wetstone, Brad (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=BIWA); atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com Trowbridge (atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com); aw3@cpuc.ca.gov (aw3@cpuc.ca.gov); ariel.lin@sce.com (ariel.lin@sce.com); bcooper@caiso.com (bcooper@caiso.com); b.bordiine@d-e-c-a.org (b.bordiine@d-e-c-a.org); bburns@caiso.com Burns (bburns@caiso.com); blaising@braunlegal.com Blaising (blaising@braunlegal.com); Barbara Barkovich (barbara@barkovichandyap.com); awilliams@LibertyPowerCorp.com Williams (awilliams@libertypowercorp.com); david@nemtzw.com (david@nemtzw.com); CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com (CentralFiles@SempraUtilities.com); cem@newsdata.com (cem@newsdata.com); case.admin@sce.com (case.admin@sce.com); Middlekauff, Charles (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd); davidmorse9@gmail.com (davidmorse9@gmail.com); californiadockets@pacificcorp.com (californiadockets@pacificcorp.com); cpacc@calpine.com (cpacc@calpine.com); ddavie@wellhead.com (ddavie@wellhead.com); danielle@ceert.org (danielle@ceert.org); dbp@cpuc.ca.gov (dbp@cpuc.ca.gov); david@ceert.org (david@ceert.org); cathompson@anaheim.net (cathompson@anaheim.net); dansvec@hdo.net (dansvec@hdo.net); blyons@TigerNaturalGas.com (blyons@TigerNaturalGas.com); cpuc@primuspower.com (cpuc@primuspower.com); brflynn@flynnrci.com (brflynn@flynnrci.com); dennis@ddecuir.com (dennis@ddecuir.com); braun@braunlegal.com (braun@braunlegal.com); Smith, Christopher (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=C5SE); dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com (dan.patry@recurrentenergy.com); brc@cpuc.ca.gov (brc@cpuc.ca.gov); cara.goldenberg@grueneich.com (cara.goldenberg@grueneich.com); David.Weidberg@jci.com (David.Weidberg@jci.com); cpuc-r1110023@olivineinc.com (cpuc-r1110023@olivineinc.com); cho@cpuc.ca.gov (cho@cpuc.ca.gov); chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov Lukins (chloe.lukins@cpuc.ca.gov); Donald Brooks

(dbr@cpuc.ca.gov); brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com Theaker  
(brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); deb@a-klaw.com Brookhyser (deb@a-klaw.com);  
Carolyn Kehrein (cmkehrein@ems-ca.com); CLamasBabbini@Comverge.com  
(clamasbabbini@comverge.com) (clamasbabbini@comverge.com); filings@a-  
klaw.com (filings@a-klaw.com); hayley@turn.org (hayley@turn.org); e-  
recipient@caiso.com (e-recipient@caiso.com); gmorris@emf.net  
(gmorris@emf.net); DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com  
(DWTCPUCDOCKETS@dwt.com); GloriaB@anzaelectric.org  
(GloriaB@anzaelectric.org); igoodman@commerceenergy.com  
(igoodman@commerceenergy.com); Zahariudakis, George  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=GxZ5); jjg@eslawfirm.com  
(jjg@eslawfirm.com); jeffgray@dwt.com (jeffgray@dwt.com); dorth@krcd.org  
(dorth@krcd.org); eddyconsulting@gmail.com (eddyconsulting@gmail.com);  
dgrandy@caonsitegen.com (dgrandy@caonsitegen.com); dws@r-c-s-inc.com  
(dws@r-c-s-inc.com); jna@speakeasy.org (jna@speakeasy.org);  
Joni.Templeton@sce.com (Joni.Templeton@sce.com); kdw@woodruff-expert-  
services.com (kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com); JChamberlin@LSPower.com  
(JChamberlin@LSPower.com); jwoodwar@energy.state.ca.us  
(jwoodwar@energy.state.ca.us); julien.dumoulin-smith@ubs.com (julien.dumoulin-  
smith@ubs.com); dweisz@marinenergy.com (dweisz@marinenergy.com);  
kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com (kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com);  
energy@3phasesrenewables.com (energy@3phasesrenewables.com);  
Joseph.Phalen@bves.com (Joseph.Phalen@bves.com); jason.lewis@jpmorgan.com  
(jason.lewis@jpmorgan.com); jf2@cpuc.ca.gov (jf2@cpuc.ca.gov);  
kfox@kfwlaw.com (kfox@kfwlaw.com); kerry.hattevik@nee.com  
(kerry.hattevik@nee.com); kho@cpuc.ca.gov (kho@cpuc.ca.gov);  
JFriderichs@pilotpowergroup.com (JFriderichs@pilotpowergroup.com);  
kimjohnson@ebarton.com (kimjohnson@ebarton.com); irene@igc.org  
(irene@igc.org); ericg@votesolar.org (ericg@votesolar.org);  
dschlosberg@brightsourceenergy.com (dschlosberg@brightsourceenergy.com); Dan  
Douglass (douglass@energyattorney.com); df1@cpuc.ca.gov (df1@cpuc.ca.gov);  
dyana@clean-coalition.org (dyana@clean-coalition.org); dm@cpuc.ca.gov  
(dm@cpuc.ca.gov); dhou@caiso.com (dhou@caiso.com); jhcaldwelljr@gmail.com  
(jhcaldwelljr@gmail.com); eac@cpuc.ca.gov (eac@cpuc.ca.gov);  
keene@braunlegal.com (keene@braunlegal.com); justin.boone@sce.com  
(justin.boone@sce.com); elizabeth.dorman@cpuc.ca.gov  
(elizabeth.dorman@cpuc.ca.gov); jenniferchamberlin@gmail.com  
(jenniferchamberlin@gmail.com); jbaak@votesolar.org (jbaak@votesolar.org);  
gkatta@caiso.com (gkatta@caiso.com); ekelly@marinenergyauthority.org  
(ekelly@marinenergyauthority.org); Joseph.williams@cwt.com  
(Joseph.williams@cwt.com); ericj@eslawfirm.com (ericj@eslawfirm.com);  
joanna.gubman@cpuc.ca.gov (joanna.gubman@cpuc.ca.gov);  
EOlson@SempraUtilities.com (EOlson@SempraUtilities.com); Jennifer Chamberlin  
(jenchamberlin@earthlink.net); kgillick@sflower.org Gillick  
(kgillick@sflower.org); jderosa@ces-ltd.com DeRosa (jderosa@ces-ltd.com);  
jay.robertson@directenergy.com Robertson (jay.robertson@directenergy.com);

Greg Bass (gbass@noblesolutions.com); John Goodin (jgoodin@caiso.com); hudsonr@conedsolutions.com Hudson (hudsonr@conedsolutions.com); JLeslie@McKennaLong.com Leslie (JLeslie@McKennaLong.com); Jeanne.Sole@sfgov.org Sole (jeanne.sole@sfgov.org); Jeremy Waen (JWaen@MarinEnergy.com); Jaime Rose Gannon (jrg@cpuc.ca.gov); john@dmcadvisors.com Dalessi (john@dmcadvisors.com); tlong@turn.org (tlong@turn.org); RegRelCPUCCases (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases); kmills@cfbf.com (kmills@cfbf.com); mgo@goodinmacbride.com (mgo@goodinmacbride.com); mpa@a-klaw.com (mpa@a-klaw.com); mrw@mrwassoc.com (mrw@mrwassoc.com); wynne@braunlegal.com (wynne@braunlegal.com); william.sanders@sfgov.org (william.sanders@sfgov.org); pthomsen@ormat.com (pthomsen@ormat.com); tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com (tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com); thomaspcorr@gmail.com (thomaspcorr@gmail.com); Gonzales, Matthew (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRGg); rick\_noger@praxair.com (rick\_noger@praxair.com); Huffman, Mark (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); lwisland@ucsusa.org (lwisland@ucsusa.org); rl@eslawfirm.com (rl@eslawfirm.com); Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net (Patrick.VanBeek@CommercialEnergy.net); tomb@crossborderenergy.com (tomb@crossborderenergy.com); nrader@calwea.org (nrader@calwea.org); spauker@wsgr.com (spauker@wsgr.com); mpryor@energy.state.ca.us (mpryor@energy.state.ca.us); lcottle@winston.com (lcottle@winston.com); pmaxwell@navigantconsulting.com (pmaxwell@navigantconsulting.com); rkmoore@gswater.com (rkmoore@gswater.com); mday@goodinmacbride.com (mday@goodinmacbride.com); mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com (mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com); tsolomon@winston.com (tsolomon@winston.com); VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com (VidhyaPrabhakaran@dwt.com); peter.pearson@bves.com (peter.pearson@bves.com); smatlock@gswater.com (smatlock@gswater.com); RNicholson@SempraUtilities.com (RNicholson@SempraUtilities.com); matthew.barmack@calpine.com (matthew.barmack@calpine.com); martin.kadillak@shell.com (martin.kadillak@shell.com); NTang@SempraUtilities.com (NTang@SempraUtilities.com); wrostov@earthjustice.org (wrostov@earthjustice.org); Jarman, Thomas A (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=TAJ8); philm@scdenergy.com (philm@scdenergy.com); mcrane@bluestarenergy.com (mcrane@bluestarenergy.com); NILEN@vestas.com (NILEN@vestas.com); smartinez@nrdc.org (smartinez@nrdc.org); stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com (stephen.t.greenleaf@jpmorgan.com); psd@cpuc.ca.gov (psd@cpuc.ca.gov); SMK@cpuc.ca.gov (SMK@cpuc.ca.gov); nguyen.quan@gswater.com (nguyen.quan@gswater.com); matt.vespa@SierraClub.org (matt.vespa@SierraClub.org); TLindl@kfwlaw.com (TLindl@kfwlaw.com); Inavarro@edf.org (Inavarro@edf.org); nicole@braunlegal.com (nicole@braunlegal.com); sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com

(sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com); Rachel@largescalesolar.org  
(Rachel@largescalesolar.org); mstamas@nrdc.org (mstamas@nrdc.org);  
wtr@cpuc.ca.gov (wtr@cpuc.ca.gov); rshilling@krcd.org (rshilling@krcd.org);  
mk1@cpuc.ca.gov (mk1@cpuc.ca.gov); whitney@clean-coalition.org  
(whitney@clean-coalition.org); virinder.singh@edf-re.com (virinder.singh@edf-  
re.com); Steph@Clean-Coalition.org (Steph@Clean-Coalition.org);  
sarah.keane@bingham.com (sarah.keane@bingham.com);  
shaun.logue@brookfieldrenewable.com (shaun.logue@brookfieldrenewable.com);  
SZuretti@seia.org (SZuretti@seia.org); NODonovan@LREnergy.com  
(NODonovan@LREnergy.com); sahm@clean-coalition.org (sahm@clean-  
coalition.org); margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com  
(margaret.miller@brookfieldrenewable.com); TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com  
(TCSaile@SempraUtilities.com); proceedings@psrec.coop  
(proceedings@psrec.coop); Greenacre, Wade  
(/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=WAG9); michael.colvin@cpuc.ca.gov  
(michael.colvin@cpuc.ca.gov); ygomez@libertypowercorp.com  
(ygomez@libertypowercorp.com); mhyams@sflower.org (mhyams@sflower.org);  
Marty.Rogers@nee.com (Marty.Rogers@nee.com); STomec@CapitalPower.com  
(STomec@CapitalPower.com); winton.kelly@nee.com (winton.kelly@nee.com);  
pramod@ces-ltd.com (pramod@ces-ltd.com); mcmahon.rachel@gmail.com  
(mcmahon.rachel@gmail.com); tandu.mcmannes@solar.abengoa.com  
(tandy.mcmannes@solar.abengoa.com); mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us  
(mike.jaske@energy.state.ca.us); mm2@cpuc.ca.gov (mm2@cpuc.ca.gov);  
michael.evans@shell.com (michael.evans@shell.com); mla@cpuc.ca.gov  
(mla@cpuc.ca.gov); phs@cpuc.ca.gov (phs@cpuc.ca.gov); ynl@cpuc.ca.gov  
(ynl@cpuc.ca.gov); Mobasheri@ElectricPowerGroup.com  
(Mobasheri@ElectricPowerGroup.com); Rich.Quattrini@jci.com  
(Rich.Quattrini@jci.com); Susan.E.Smith@shell.com (Susan.E.Smith@shell.com);  
mburrows@3phasesRenewables.com (mburrows@3phasesRenewables.com);  
Tracey.Drabant@bves.com (Tracey.Drabant@bves.com); onmyers@gmail.com  
(onmyers@gmail.com); rfagan@synapse-energy.com (rfagan@synapse-  
energy.com); Tex.Wilkins@gmail.com (Tex.Wilkins@gmail.com);  
mryan@montaukenegy.com (mryan@montaukenegy.com); scott.dayer@ge.com  
(scott.dayer@ge.com); Taber@PrincetonEnergy.net (Taber@PrincetonEnergy.net);  
MJacobs@ucsusa.org (MJacobs@ucsusa.org); Robin.Smutny-  
Jones@IberdrolaRen.com (Robin.Smutny-Jones@IberdrolaRen.com);  
scheduling.nwngs@nwnatural.com (scheduling.nwngs@nwnatural.com); Mona  
Tierney-Lloyd (mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com); nes@a-klaw.com Sheriff (nes@a-  
klaw.com); rcl@cpuc.ca.gov (rcl@cpuc.ca.gov); Kathy Treleven  
(ktreleven@gmail.com); xl2@cpuc.ca.gov (xl2@cpuc.ca.gov); Mary Lynch  
(mary.lynch@constellation.com); Scarlett Liang-Uejio (scl@cpuc.ca.gov); Sue Mara  
(sue.mara@rtoadvisors.com); tam@clean-coalition.org Hunt (tam@clean-  
coalition.org); smaye@nappartners.com Maye (smaye@nappartners.com);  
liddell@energyattorney.com Liddell (liddell@energyattorney.com); Sara Myers  
(ssmyers@att.net); Shalini Swaroop (sswaroop@MarinEnergy.com);  
klatt@energyattorney.com Klatt (klatt@energyattorney.com);

sbailey@semprausgp.com Bailey (sbailey@semprausgp.com)

Cc:

Bcc:

Subject: R.11-10-023 (Resource Adequacy) Informal Comments of AReM on Draft Staff Proposal

TO SERVICE LIST IN R.11-10-023 (Resource Adequacy):

Attached are the informal comments of the Alliance for Retail Energy Markets (AReM) on the Draft Staff Proposal issued September 13, 2013. As directed in the August 2, 2013 Phase 3 Scoping Memo, these comments have been sent to the service list in the Resource Adequacy (RA) proceeding (R.11-10-023), but have not been filed at the Commission.

Regards,

Sue Mara  
On Behalf of AReM

**Sue Mara**  
RTOAdvisors, L.L.C.  
164 Springdale Way  
Redwood City, CA 94062  
[sue.mara@rtoadvisors.com](mailto:sue.mara@rtoadvisors.com)  
(415) 902-4108