

From: Marcel Hawiger

Sent: 5/20/2014 2:16:02 PM

Ekelly@mceCleanEnergy.org (Ekelly@mceCleanEnergy.org); Hymes, Kelly A. (kelly.hymes@cpuc.ca.gov); jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net (jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net); douglass@energyattorney.com (douglass@energyattorney.com); jleslie@mckennalong.com (jleslie@mckennalong.com); mpanfil@edf.org (mpanfil@edf.org); Steph@Clean-Coalition.org (Steph@Clean-Coalition.org); cmeehan@comverge.com (cmeehan@comverge.com); frader@energyhub.net (frader@energyhub.net); hchoy@isd.co.lacounty.gov (hchoy@isd.co.lacounty.gov); Cherry, Brian K (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BKC7); ssmyers@att.net (ssmyers@att.net); Woo, Shirley A (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=SAW0); nes@a-klaw.com (nes@a-klaw.com); mtierny-lloyd@enernoc.com (mtierny-lloyd@enernoc.com); liddell@energyattorney.com (liddell@energyattorney.com); sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com (sue.mara@RTOadvisors.com); sachu.constantine@energycenter.org (sachu.constantine@energycenter.org); TBrill@SempraUtilities.com (TBrill@SempraUtilities.com); dhillia@consumercal.org (dhillia@consumercal.org); MeganMMyers@yahoo.com (MeganMMyers@yahoo.com); Salvacion, Lisa-Marie (lisa-marie.salvacion@cpuc.ca.gov); breid@olivineinc.com (breid@olivineinc.com); olivia.samad@sce.com (olivia.samad@sce.com); pbull@nrdc.org (pbull@nrdc.org); Lolds@VWVRA.com (Lolds@VWVRA.com); RegRelCPUCcases (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCcases); kmills@cfbf.com (kmills@cfbf.com); jerryl@abag.ca.gov (jerryl@abag.ca.gov); ABesa@SempraUtilities.com (ABesa@SempraUtilities.com); david@nemtzw.com (david@nemtzw.com); elvine@lbl.gov (elvine@lbl.gov); davidmorse9@gmail.com (davidmorse9@gmail.com); Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com (Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com); jna@speakeasy.org (jna@speakeasy.org); cpucdockets@keyesandfox.com (cpucdockets@keyesandfox.com); enriqueg@greenlining.org (enriqueg@greenlining.org); service@cforat.org (service@cforat.org); dwang@nrdc.org (dwang@nrdc.org); Eric@CoalitionofEnergyUsers.org (Eric@CoalitionofEnergyUsers.org); aschwartz@solarcity.com (aschwartz@solarcity.com); dwooley@kfwlaw.com (dwooley@kfwlaw.com); dchia@solarcity.com (dchia@solarcity.com); charlie.buck@energycenter.org (charlie.buck@energycenter.org); ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com (ahmad.faruqui@brattle.com); barbara@barkovichandyap.com (barbara@barkovichandyap.com); dadams@viridityenergy.com (dadams@viridityenergy.com); jennifer.anne.chamberlin@jci.com (jennifer.anne.chamberlin@jci.com); afreifeld@viridityenergy.com (afreifeld@viridityenergy.com); HSANDERS@caiso.com (HSANDERS@caiso.com); grover@evergreenecon.com (grover@evergreenecon.com); wilson1224@gmail.com (wilson1224@gmail.com); edward.koch@honeywell.com (edward.koch@honeywell.com);

deane.burk@water.ca.gov (deane.burk@water.ca.gov); bboice02@yahoo.com (bboice02@yahoo.com); david.reed@sce.com (david.reed@sce.com); california@opower.com (california@opower.com); CChristensen@Strategen.com (CChristensen@Strategen.com); gthomas@ecoact.org (gthomas@ecoact.org); bernardo@braunlegal.com (bernardo@braunlegal.com); tglassey@certichron.com (tglassey@certichron.com); SDPatrick@SempraUtilities.com (SDPatrick@SempraUtilities.com); Clark.Pierce@us.landisgyr.com (Clark.Pierce@us.landisgyr.com); sephra.ninow@energycenter.org (sephra.ninow@energycenter.org); rwalther@pacbell.net (rwalther@pacbell.net); mrw@mrwassoc.com (mrw@mrwassoc.com); Huffman, Mark (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); blaising@braunlegal.com (blaising@braunlegal.com); klatt@energyattorney.com (klatt@energyattorney.com); kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com (kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com); JanMcFar@sonic.net (JanMcFar@sonic.net); mpf@stateside.com (mpf@stateside.com); martinhomec@gmail.com (martinhomec@gmail.com); Erin.Grizard@BloomEnergy.com (Erin.Grizard@BloomEnergy.com); snuller@ethree.com (snuller@ethree.com); ttutt@smud.org (ttutt@smud.org); peter.pearson@bves.com (peter.pearson@bves.com); michelle.d.grant@dynegy.com (michelle.d.grant@dynegy.com); smaye@nappartners.com (smaye@nappartners.com); mainspan@ecsgrid.com (mainspan@ecsgrid.com); mpieniasek@drenergyconsulting.com (mpieniasek@drenergyconsulting.com); sswaroop@mceCleanEnergy.org (sswaroop@mceCleanEnergy.org); JWaen@mceCleanEnergy.org (JWaen@mceCleanEnergy.org); dan.delurey@drsgcoalition.org (dan.delurey@drsgcoalition.org); tculley@kfwlaw.com (tculley@kfwlaw.com); sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com (sean.beatty@nrgenergy.com); regulatory@mceCleanEnergy.org (regulatory@mceCleanEnergy.org); jkeyes@kfwlaw.com (jkeyes@kfwlaw.com); mbruce@ecoact.org (mbruce@ecoact.org); gfishman@ecoact.org (gfishman@ecoact.org); janderson@viridityenergy.com (janderson@viridityenergy.com); janderson@viridityenergy.com (janderson@viridityenergy.com); sahm@clean-coalition.org (sahm@clean-coalition.org); pramod@ces-ltd.com (pramod@ces-ltd.com); rcounihan@enernoc.com (rcounihan@enernoc.com); joel.gamoran@c3energy.com (joel.gamoran@c3energy.com); Paul.Karr@TrilliantInc.com (Paul.Karr@TrilliantInc.com); elaine.s.kwei@pjc.com (elaine.s.kwei@pjc.com); klaughlin@viridityenergy.com (klaughlin@viridityenergy.com); admin@energycoaliton.org (admin@energycoaliton.org); nplanson@consumerpowerline.com (nplanson@consumerpowerline.com); sschare@summitblue.com (sschare@summitblue.com); sdebroff@rhoads-sinon.com (sdebroff@rhoads-sinon.com); barrettlarry@comcast.net (barrettlarry@comcast.net); kcooney@summitblue.com (kcooney@summitblue.com); apetersen@rhoads-sinon.com (apetersen@rhoads-sinon.com); miino@rhoads-sinon.com (miino@rhoads-sinon.com); joyce.leung@sce.com (joyce.leung@sce.com); dan.violette@navigantconsulting.com (dan.violette@navigantconsulting.com); emalone@synapse-energy.com (emalone@synapse-energy.com);

policy@tendriline.com (policy@tendriline.com); stephen.baker@constellation.com (stephen.baker@constellation.com); jcohen@isd.lacounty.gov (jcohen@isd.lacounty.gov); mplante@bidgely.com (mplante@bidgely.com); SGeorge@nexant.com (SGeorge@nexant.com); jtauber@earthjustice.org (jtauber@earthjustice.org); rbinz@rbinz.com (rbinz@rbinz.com); jimk@ecsgrid.com (jimk@ecsgrid.com); marina@energyhub.net (marina@energyhub.net); pbeck@eliteenergysys.com (pbeck@eliteenergysys.com); nmurthy@wirelessglue.com (nmurthy@wirelessglue.com); updates@tolerableplanet.com (updates@tolerableplanet.com); Wu, Josephine (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=JWWd); tlong@turn.org (tlong@turn.org); Haertle, Steve (/O=PG&E/OU=CORPORATE/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=SRH1); RegRelCPUCCases (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=RegRelCPUCCases); rmccann@umich.edu (rmccann@umich.edu); lmh@eslawfirm.com (lmh@eslawfirm.com); sdhilton@stoel.com (sdhilton@stoel.com); joyw@mid.org (joyw@mid.org); Jennifer.Shigekawa@sce.com (Jennifer.Shigekawa@sce.com); steven@moss.net (steven@moss.net); eric@ethree.com (eric@ethree.com); clamasbabbini@comverge.com (clamasbabbini@comverge.com); mgo@goodinmacbride.com (mgo@goodinmacbride.com); filings@a-klaw.com (filings@a-klaw.com); JYamagata@SempraUtilities.com (JYamagata@SempraUtilities.com); mpa@a-klaw.com (mpa@a-klaw.com); dwood8@cox.net (dwood8@cox.net); larry.cope@sce.com (larry.cope@sce.com); pk@utilitycostmanagement.com (pk@utilitycostmanagement.com); cem@newsdata.com (cem@newsdata.com); msherida@energy.state.ca.us (msherida@energy.state.ca.us); aliddell@icfi.com (aliddell@icfi.com); alex.kang@itron.com (alex.kang@itron.com); case.admin@sce.com (case.admin@sce.com); Roberts, Thomas (thomas.roberts@cpuc.ca.gov); mgillette@enernoc.com (mgillette@enernoc.com); vwood@smud.org (vwood@smud.org); bcragg@goodinmacbride.com (bcragg@goodinmacbride.com); e-recipient@caiso.com (e-recipient@caiso.com); janreid@coastecon.com (janreid@coastecon.com); Middlekauff, Charles (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=CRMd); cmkehrrein@ems-ca.com (cmkehrrein@ems-ca.com); Huffman, Mark (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MRH2); jsanders@caiso.com (jsanders@caiso.com); rl@eslawfirm.com (rl@eslawfirm.com); abb@eslawfirm.com (abb@eslawfirm.com); jeffgray@dwt.com (jeffgray@dwt.com); rschmidt@bartlewells.com (rschmidt@bartlewells.com); kowalewskia@calpine.com (kowalewskia@calpine.com); maldridge@ecoact.org (maldridge@ecoact.org); steven@iepa.com (steven@iepa.com); barmackm@calpine.com (barmackm@calpine.com); saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov (saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov); dgrandy@caonsitegen.com (dgrandy@caonsitegen.com); CPUCCases@pge.com (CPUCCases@pge.com); kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com (kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com); lwhouse@innercite.com (lwhouse@innercite.com); karen@klindh.com (karen@klindh.com); SNelson@Sempra.com (SNelson@Sempra.com);

brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com (brian.theaker@nrgenergy.com); Service@spurr.org (Service@spurr.org); theresa.mueller@sfgov.org (theresa.mueller@sfgov.org); janet.combs@sce.com (janet.combs@sce.com); wrostov@earthjustice.org (wrostov@earthjustice.org); jack@casaraquel.com (jack@casaraquel.com); philm@scdenergy.com (philm@scdenergy.com); robertgex@dwt.com (robertgex@dwt.com); rafi.hassan@sig.com (rafi.hassan@sig.com); glbarbose@lbl.gov (glbarbose@lbl.gov); KKloberdanz@SempraUtilities.com (KKloberdanz@SempraUtilities.com); hvidstenj@kindermorgan.com (hvidstenj@kindermorgan.com); shawn\_cox@kindermorgan.com (shawn\_cox@kindermorgan.com); Gandesbery, Mary (Law) (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=MA/Gq); tderivi@scppa.org (tderivi@scppa.org); nguyen.quan@gswater.com (nguyen.quan@gswater.com); matt.vespa@SierraClub.org (matt.vespa@SierraClub.org); gayatri@jbsenergy.com (gayatri@jbsenergy.com); lnavarro@edf.org (lnavarro@edf.org); chris\_king@siemens.com (chris\_king@siemens.com); policy@efficiencycouncil.org (policy@efficiencycouncil.org); don@ucan.org (don@ucan.org); roger147@aol.com (roger147@aol.com); rogerv@mid.org (rogerv@mid.org); jderosa@ces-ltd.com (jderosa@ces-ltd.com); berlin@susieberlinlaw.com (berlin@susieberlinlaw.com); rvillarreal@earthjustice.org (rvillarreal@earthjustice.org); ames\_doug@yahoo.com (ames\_doug@yahoo.com); willem.fadrhonc@stem.com (willem.fadrhonc@stem.com); oliviapara@dwt.com (oliviapara@dwt.com); irene@igc.org (irene@igc.org); aadeyeye@earthjustice.org (aadeyeye@earthjustice.org); mharamati@opiniondynamics.com (mharamati@opiniondynamics.com); speesapati@earthjustice.org (speesapati@earthjustice.org); philha@astound.net (philha@astound.net); DBarker@semprautilities.com (DBarker@semprautilities.com); James.J.Hirsch@gmail.com (James.J.Hirsch@gmail.com); drothrock@cmta.net (drothrock@cmta.net); chinman@caiso.com (chinman@caiso.com); kjohnson@caiso.com (kjohnson@caiso.com); jgoodin@caiso.com (jgoodin@caiso.com); cara.goldenberg@grueneich.com (cara.goldenberg@grueneich.com); David.Weidberg@jci.com (David.Weidberg@jci.com); carl.silsbee@sce.com (carl.silsbee@sce.com); afaustino@semprautilities.com (afaustino@semprautilities.com); tomk@mid.org (tomk@mid.org); jshields@ssjid.com (jshields@ssjid.com); Dave.Hanna@itron.com (Dave.Hanna@itron.com); dcengel@fscgroup.com (dcengel@fscgroup.com); dwylie@aswengineering.com (dwylie@aswengineering.com); eric@strategyi.com (eric@strategyi.com); rdj@att.com (rdj@att.com); ka-wing.poon@sce.com (ka-wing.poon@sce.com); pmcleod@finsch.com (pmcleod@finsch.com); LDavidson@SempraUtilities.com (LDavidson@SempraUtilities.com); dhungerf@energy.state.ca.us (dhungerf@energy.state.ca.us); jskromer@gmail.com (jskromer@gmail.com); Dadras, Shada (/O=PG&E/OU=Corporate/cn=Recipients/cn=SxDh); janders@caiso.com (janders@caiso.com); ted@energy-solution.com (ted@energy-solution.com); David.Lowrey@sce.com (David.Lowrey@sce.com); smithmj@calpine.com (smithmj@calpine.com); cpjoe@gepllc.com (cpjoe@gepllc.com); kmkiener@cox.net (kmkiener@cox.net); ja\_boothe@yahoo.com

(ja\_booth@yahoo.com); steven@sfpower.org (steven@sfpower.org); garwacrd@sce.com (garwacrd@sce.com); mark.s.martinez@sce.com (mark.s.martinez@sce.com); jeff@jbsenergy.com (jeff@jbsenergy.com); andrea.horwatt@sce.com (andrea.horwatt@sce.com); KSmith2@SempraUtilities.com (KSmith2@SempraUtilities.com); opatterson@opiniondynamics.com (opatterson@opiniondynamics.com); kmeeusen@caiso.com (kmeeusen@caiso.com); rafferty@gmail.com (rafferty@gmail.com); cpuc-r1309011@olivineinc.com (cpuc-r1309011@olivineinc.com); dmccoord@hotmail.com (dmccoord@hotmail.com); Karen@HerterEnergy.com (Karen@HerterEnergy.com); igecils@opiniondynamics.com (igecils@opiniondynamics.com); toguin@lightsailenergy.com (toguin@lightsailenergy.com); Peck, David B. (david.peck@cpuc.ca.gov); Villarreal, Christopher (christopher.villarreal@cpuc.ca.gov); Fortune, Hazlyn (hazlyn.fortune@cpuc.ca.gov); jholmes@emil.com (jholmes@emil.com); Ouyang, Ke Hao (kehao.ouyang@cpuc.ca.gov); Lee, Rebecca Tsai-Wei (rebecca.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); Caron, Jennifer (jennifer.caron@cpuc.ca.gov); claufenb@energy.state.ca.us (claufenb@energy.state.ca.us); Marks, Jaclyn (jaclyn.marks@cpuc.ca.gov); mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com (mary.wiencke@pacificorp.com); Franz, Damon A. (damon.franz@cpuc.ca.gov); wmc@a-klaw.com (wmc@a-klaw.com); Como, Joe (joe.como@cpuc.ca.gov); Brooks, Donald J. (donald.brooks@cpuc.ca.gov); jack@casaraquel.com (jack@casaraquel.com); Dorman, Elizabeth (elizabeth.dorman@cpuc.ca.gov); Kao, Valerie (valerie.kao@cpuc.ca.gov); Flagg, Michaela (Michaela.Flagg@cpuc.ca.gov); Kito, Michele (michele.kito@cpuc.ca.gov); Barcic, Nathan (Nathan.Barcic@cpuc.ca.gov); Lee, Audrey (audrey.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); Lee, Audrey (audrey.lee@cpuc.ca.gov); Chaset, Nicolas L. (nicolas.chaset@cpuc.ca.gov); agassner@enbala.com (agassner@enbala.com); Gupta, Alope (aloke.gupta@cpuc.ca.gov); Clay, Christopher (christopher.clay@cpuc.ca.gov); Li, Xian M. (Xian.Li@cpuc.ca.gov); Gannon, Jaime Rose (JaimeRose.Gannon@cpuc.ca.gov); Liang-Uejio, Scarlett (scarlett.liang-uejio@cpuc.ca.gov); Gubman, Joanna (Joanna.Gubman@cpuc.ca.gov); McMahon, Rachel (Rachel.McMahon@cpuc.ca.gov); McMahon, Rachel (Rachel.McMahon@cpuc.ca.gov); Ciupagea, Radu (radu.ciupagea@cpuc.ca.gov); everitt@ecobee.com (everitt@ecobee.com); Buch, Daniel (Daniel.Buch@cpuc.ca.gov); Chow, Dorris (dorris.chow@cpuc.ca.gov); Gokhale, Sudheer K. (sudheer.gokhale@cpuc.ca.gov); tylerb@poweritsolutions.com (tylerb@poweritsolutions.com); bschuman@pacific-crest.com (bschuman@pacific-crest.com); Nataloni, Pamela (pamela.nataloni@cpuc.ca.gov); Gruending, Paula (paula.gruending@cpuc.ca.gov); Sullivan, Timothy J. (timothy.sullivan@cpuc.ca.gov); Kaneshiro, Bruce (bruce.kaneshiro@cpuc.ca.gov); Blumer, Werner M. (werner.blumer@cpuc.ca.gov); Peterson, Rachel A. (rachel.peterson@cpuc.ca.gov); Crisostomo, Noel (noel.crisostomo@cpuc.ca.gov); Edwards, Russell (Russell.Edwards@cpuc.ca.gov); Erickson, John "David" (john.erickson@cpuc.ca.gov)

Cc:

Bcc:

Subject: R.13-09-011: TURN List of Facts in Dispute

To Parties in R.13-09-011:

As directed by the April 2, 2014 Ruling, as modified by ALJ Hymes in her email Ruling of May 16, 2014, TURN serves parties with a list of "facts in dispute." The list is attached and reproduced below. TURN notes that most of these issues represent either factual contentions, or contentions including both fact and policy.

- Incremental benefit of bidding DR into CAISO markets
  - o Does it impact RA credits due to DR
  - o Does it impact wholesale energy prices
    - How does bidding differ from current LSE manual notification of planned DR activation
    - What would be the marginal price bid by DR providers
    - In how many hours do wholesale prices exceed the NBT trigger prices
    - What is the magnitude of the shortcomings of manual notification as described by the CAISO
  - How is location transparency impacted by registration/bidding
  - How is forecasting accuracy impacted
  - Incremental cost of bidding DR into CAISO markets
  - o Range of direct costs to DRP participants: telemetry and metering
  - o Impact of indirect cost of disaggregation by LAP and LSE on DRP participants
  - o Range of costs to IOU ratepayers: Are PG&E's forecast incremental costs (for IT and systems) for bidding DR into CAISO markets reasonable; are they representative of other IOU costs
  - o How did PG&E account for PeakChoice costs; Was accounting for one-time costs proper; Did PG&E develop systems for bidding PDR that can be utilized on an ongoing basis

- DRAM

- o Selection/valuation of three different products (flexible, system, local capacity) using price metric with single price cap
- o Computation of bid cap