BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Application of San Diego Gas & Electric Company (U 902-E) for a Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity For the Sunrise Powerlink Transmission Project Application 06-08-010 (Filed August 4, 2006) Application 05-12-014 (Filed December 14, 2005)

PROTEST OF THE CALIFORNIA STATE PARKS FOUNDATION

Sara Feldman
Southern California Director
California State Parks Foundation

California State Parks Foundation Southern California Office 714 West Olympic Blvd., Suite 717 Los Angeles, CA 90015

Telephone: 213.748.7458
Facsimile: 213.748.7495
E-mail: sara@calparks.org

Pursuant to Administrative Law Judge Steve Weissman's Ruling Setting Date for Prehearing Conference Statements and Extending Time for Filing Protests dated August 25, 2006, the California State Parks Foundation (the "Foundation") submits this timely Protest to the San Diego Gas & Electric Company's ("SDG&E") Amended Application for a Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity For the Sunrise Powerlink Transmission Project (the "Project"), for the following reasons:

1. <u>SDG&E's Application Proposes Expanding the Existing Easement Through Anza Borrego Desert State Park into Protected Wilderness Areas.</u>

The existing easement in Anza Borrego Desert State Park ("ABDSP") ranges from 24 to 100 feet in width. SDG&E requests an expansion of the easement to 150 feet. This proposed widening will encroach on Wilderness Areas designated by the State of California as protected from any development or disturbance. Wilderness Areas are particularly significant in value because they support protected habitat and species and therefore, by their very definition, are not meant for development, infrastructure or human habitation. Intruding into designated Wilderness Zones has never previously been allowed in California and would create significant negative

impacts for the ABDSP that cannot be adequately mitigated. The Foundation protests any proposed expansion into protected Wilderness Areas.

2. <u>Impacts to Habitat and Wildlife Will be Significant and Have Not Been Adequately</u> Analyzed.

SDG&E's application does not adequately analyze the extent or full impact of the Powerlink project on either habitat or wildlife. The application concedes that there is the potential for "significant impacts" to sensitive plant species, to raptors, reptile and amphibian species, avian species, small mammals, and Peninsular Bighorn Sheep. It dismisses a range of impacts to other species and plant communities as "less than significant," including impacts to wildlife corridors. The analysis does not adequately address migration patterns, wildlife corridor disruption, exotic, non-native species invasion impacts, permanent impact to sensitive and protected plant communities, the interdependence of habitat and wildlife, and a host of other issues. The Application focuses heavily on construction activities, and fails to fully address permanent impacts or mitigation. The Foundation protests this analysis as inadequate and insufficient.

3. <u>The Application Does Not Adequately Address Impacts to the Viewshed and</u>
Recreational Uses of ABDSP Created by the Proposed 130-foot Tall Lattice Poles.

The poles along the current easement are made of wood and are 40-50 feet tall and contain a single line. SDG&E proposes metal lattice poles that are more than double in height, carrying multiple, tiered lines. The visual and noise impact of these poles would be extremely significant for park visitors who are traveling through the park, and even more so to visitors camping there at Tamarisk Campground or elsewhere in the Park. Even SDG&E admits that of the 17 Key Observation Points identified in the Application, visual change would be moderate to high in at least 12 cases, and that visual impacts would be adverse to significant in 14 cases. The Application concedes that the larger poles would "conflict with the natural background of many recreational resources."

SDG&E dismisses the extreme nature of the visual impact by arguing that because fewer poles would be needed, they would be further apart and therefore less impactful. Moreover, they assert that visitors would become accustomed to the larger size-poles and therefore "over time, the presence of the larger line would be expected to become common to the visitor as the (existing small wooden poles have) been."

The Foundation emphatically disagrees with these assumptions and protests SDG&E's conclusions as to the impact of the proposed poles on the viewshed and recreational uses.

4. The Proposed Powerlink Lines Would Significantly Impact Protected Archeological and American Indian Sites and Cannot Be Adequately Mitigated.

According to its General Plan, ABDSP contains 4,322 archeologically and culturally sensitive sites; SDG&E has identified only 39 of these thousands of sites in its preferred alignment. SDG&E concedes that construction could significantly impact both known and previously unknown cultural resources, but asserts, without any evidentiary support, that said impacts can be limited through project design. The Foundation protests both the number of sites identified and, more importantly, the ability of SDG&E to adequately control and limit irreparable impacts to these historic, sacred archeologically and culturally sensitive sites.

5. <u>SDG&E Has Not Adequately Analyzed Alternatives to the Sunrise Powerlink Route</u> Through Anza Borrego Desert State Park.

In its Application, SDG&E failed to put forth any alternative route that did not run through Anza Borrego Desert State Park. Alternatives that avoided the ABDSP were eliminated prior to even being carried forward for public consideration. The Foundation strongly protests this failure on the part of SDG&E to adequately consider alternatives to running 23 miles of 130-foot tall lattice towers with multiple high voltage lines through protected State Park Lands and Wilderness Areas.

Dated: September 8, 2006

By: <u>/s/ Sara Feldman</u>
Sara Feldman

California State Parks Foundation Southern California Office 714 West Olympic Blvd., Suite 717 Los Angeles, CA 90015

Telephone: 213.748.7458
Facsimile: 213.748.7495
E-mail: sara@calparks.org

PROOF OF SERVICE

I declare that, pursuant to the California Public Utilities Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, I served the California State Parks Foundation's Protest upon all parties of record in A.06-08-010 by e-mail where available or by placing true copies in a sealed envelope with first-class postage prepaid and deposited in the United State mail.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on September 8, 2006, in Los Angeles, California.

/s/Sara Feldman

Sara Feldman

Service Lists

Appearance

THOMAS A. BURHENN
SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON
2244 WALNUT GROVE AVENUE
ROSEMEAD, CA 91770

DON WOOD SR.
PACIFIC ENERGY POLICY CENTER
4539 LEE AVENUE
LA MESA, CA 91941

SCOT MARTIN PO BOX 1549 BORREGO SPRINGS, CA 92004 DAVID LLOYD ATTORNEY AT LAW CABRILLO POWER I, LLC 4600 CARLSBAD BLVD. CARLSBAD, CA 92008

CONNIE BULL 24572 RUTHERFORD ROAD RAMONA, CA 92065 DIANE CONKLIN MUSSEY GRADE ROAD RAMONA, CA 92065

DIANE J. CONKLIN MUSSEY GRADE ROAD ALLIANCE PO BOX 683 RAMONA, CA 92065 ELIZABETH EDWARDS RAMONA VALLEY VINEYARD ASSOCIATION 26502 HIGHWAY 78 RAMONA, CA 92065

PAM WHALEN 24444 RUTHERFORD ROAD RAMONA, CA 92065 MARY ALDERN 36264 MONTEZUMA VALLEY ROAD RANCHITA, CA 92066

FREDERICK M. ORTLIEB
OFFICE OF CITY ATTORNEY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
1200 THIRD AVENUE, 11TH FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

HARVEY PAYNE RANCHO PENASQUITOS CONCERNED CITIZENS 600 W. BROADWAY, STE. 400 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101 MICHAEL SHAMES ATTORNEY AT LAW UTILITY CONSUMERS' ACTION NETWORK 3100 FIFTH AVENUE, SUITE B SAN DIEGO, CA 92103 PAUL BLACKBURN SIERRA CLUB, SAN DIEGO CHAPTER 3820 RAY STREET SAN DIEGO, CA 92104

KEVIN O'BEIRNE SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY 8330 CENTURY PARK COURT, CP32D SAN DIEGO, CA 92123 JOHN W. LESLIE ATTORNEY AT LAW LUCE, FORWARD, HAMILTON & SCRIPPS, LLP 11988 EL CAMINO REAL, SUITE 200 SAN DIEGO, CA 92130

JOETTA MIHALOVICH 11705 ALDERCREST POINT SAN DIEGO, CA 92131 DAVID HOGAN CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY PO BOX 7745 SAN DIEGO, CA 92167

CARRIE DOWNEY HORTON KNOX CARTER & FOOTE 895 BROADWAY ELCENTRO, CA 92243 PATRICIA C. SCHNIER 14575 FLATHEAD RD. APPLE VALLEY, CA 92307

BILLY BLATTNER
SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY
601 VAN NESS AVENUE, SUITE 2060
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

MICHEL PETER FLORIO ATTORNEY AT LAW THE UTILITY REFORM NETWORK (TURN) 711 VAN NESS AVENUE, SUITE 350 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

OSA L. WOLFF ATTORNEY AT LAW SHUTE, MIHALY & WEINBERGER, LLC 396 HAYES STREET SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

REGINA DEANGELIS
CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
LEGAL DIVISION
ROOM 4107
505 VAN NESS AVENUE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

RORY COX 311 CALIFORNIA STREET, SUITE 650 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104 NORMAN J. FURUTA FEDERAL EXECUTIVE AGENCIES 10TH FLOOR, MS 1021A 333 MARKET STREET SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105-2195

505 SANSOME STREET, SUITE 900

GOODIN MACBRIDE SQUERI RITCHIE & DAY

NORMAN J. FURUTA FEDERAL EXECUTIVE AGENCIES 10TH FLOOR, MS 1021A

333 MARKET STREET SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105-2195

DAVID KATES
DAVID MARK AND COMPANY
3510 UNOCAL PLACE, SUITE 200
SANTA ROSA, CA 95403-5571

JAMES H. CALDWELL JR. PPM ENERGY, INC. 1650 E NAPA STREET SONOMA, CA 95476

SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94111

BRIAN T. CRAGG

ATTORNEY AT LAW

JEDEDIAH J. GIBSON ATTORNEY AT LAW ELLISON, SCHNEIDER & HARRIS LLP 2015 H STREET SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

Information Only

CLAY E. FABER
SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA GAS COMPANY
555 WEST FIFTH STREET, GT-14E7
LOS ANGELES, CA 90013

KELLY FULLER PO BOX 1993 ALPINE, CA 91903 CASE ADMINISTRATION
SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON COMPANY
ROOM 370
2244 WALNUT GROVE AVENUE
ROSEMEAD, CA 91770

MATTHEW JUMPER SAN DIEGO INTERFAITH HOUSING FOUNDATION 7956 LESTER AVE LEMON GROVE, CA 91945 REBECCA PEARL
POLICY ADVOCATE, CLEAN BAY CAMPAIGN
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH COALITION
401 MILE OF CARS WAY, STE. 310
NATIONAL CITY, CA 91950

MICHAEL L. WELLS
CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENTOF
PARKS&RECREATION
200 PALM CANYON DRIVE
BORREGO SPRINGS, CA 92004

TOM GORTON BORREGO SUN PO BOX 249 BORREGO SPRINGS, CA 92004 BOB & MARGARET BARELMANN 6510 FRANCISCAN ROAD CARLSBAD, CA 92011

DAVE DOWNEY NORTH COUNTY TIMES 207 E. PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE ESCONDIDO, CA 92025 PAT/ALBERT BIANEZ 1223 ARMSTRONG CIRCLE ESCONDIDO, CA 92027

WALLY BESUDEN
PRESIDENT
SPANGLER PEAK RANCH, INC
PO BOX 1959
ESCONDIDO, CA 92033

GREG SCHUETT PO BOX 1108 JULIAN, CA 92036

LAUREL GRANQUIST PO BOX 2486 JULIAN, CA 92036 JOHN RAIFSNIDER PO BOX 121 JULIAN, CA 92036-0121

PAUL RIDGWAY 3027 LAKEVIEW DR. PO BOX 1435 JULIAN, CA 92036-1435 CAROLYN A. DORROH RAMONA COMMUNITY PLANNING GROUP 17235 VOORHES LANE RAMONA, CA 92065 CHRISTOPHER P. JEFFERS 24566 DEL AMO ROAD RAMONA, CA 92065 LARA LOPEZ 16828 OPEN VIEW RD RAMONA, CA 92065

MARY KAY FERWALT 24569 DEL AMO ROAD RAMONA, CA 92065 MAUREEN ROBERTSON EDITOR RAMONA SENTINEL 611 MAIN STREET RAMONA, CA 92065

PHILLIP &ELIANE BREEDLOVE 1804 CEDAR STREET RAMONA, CA 92065 CAROLYN MORROW GOLIGHTLY FARMS 36255 GRAPEVINE CANYON ROAD RANCHITA, CA 92066

JOSEPH RAUH RANCHITA REALTY 37554 MONTEZUMA VALLEY RD RANCHITA, CA 92066 STEVE/CAROLYN ESPOSITO 37784 MONTEZUMA VALLEY ROAD RANCHITA, CA 92066

GLENDA KIMMERLY PO BOX 305 SANTA YSABEL, CA 92070 DAN PERKINS ENERGY SMART HOMES 983 PHILLIPS ST. VISTA, CA 92083

KARL HIGGINS PRESIDENT HIGGINS & ASSOCIATES 1517 ROMA DRIVE VISTA, CA 92083 WILLIE M. GATERS 1295 EAST VISTA WAY VISTA, CA 92084 E. GREGORY BARNES ATTORNEY AT LAW SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY 101 ASH STREET, HQ 13D SAN DIEGO, CA 92101 DONALD C. LIDDELL ATTORNEY AT LAW DOUGLASS & LIDDELL 2928 2ND AVENUE SAN DIEGO, CA 92103

JIM BELL 4862 VOLTAIRE ST. SAN DIEGO, CA 92107 EPIC INTERN EPIC/USD SCHOOL OF LAW 5998 ALCALA PARK SAN DIEGO, CA 92110

SCOTT J. ANDERS RESEARCH/ADMINISTRATIVE CENTER UNIVERSITY OF SAN DIEGO - LAW 5998 ALCALA PARK SAN DIEGO, CA 92110 CRAIG ROSE THE SAN DIEGO UNION TRIBUNE PO BOX 120191S SAN DIEGO, CA 92112-0191

ABBAS M. ABED
ELECTRIC AND GAS PROCUREMENT
SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC
8315 CENTURY PARK COURT,CP21D
SAN DIEGO, CA 92123

CENTRAL FILES SAN DIEGO GAS & ELECTRIC 8330 CENTURY PARK COURT, CP31E SAN DIEGO, CA 92123

JENNIFER PORTER
POLICY ANALYST
DIEGO REGIONAL ENERGY OFFICE
8520 TECH WAY SUITE 110
SAN DIEGO, CA 92123

TOM BLAIR ENERGY ADMINISTRATOR CITY OF SAN DIEGO 9601 RIDGEHAVEN COURT, SUITE 120 SAN DIEGO, CA 92123-1636

EILEEN BIRD 12430 DORMOUSE ROAD SAN DIEGO, CA 92129 DIANE I. FELLMAN ATTORNEY AT LAW FPL ENERGY, LLC 234 VAN NESS AVENUE SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102 SHERIDAN PAUKER SHUTE, MIHALY & WEINBERGER LLP 396 HAYES STREET SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102 JUSTIN AUGUSTINE
THE CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY
1095 MARKET ST., SUITE 511
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94103

AARON QUINTANAR
RATE PAYERS FOR AFFORDABLE CLEAN
ENERGY
311 CALIFORNIA STREET, STE 650
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104

JASON YAN
PACIFIC GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY

77 BEALE STREET, MAIL CODE B13L SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

MICHAEL S. PORTER
PACIFIC GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY
77 BEALE ST., MAIL CODE 13L RM 1318
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

CALIFORNIA ENERGY MARKETS 517-B POTRERO AVENUE SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94110

CALIFORNIA ENERGY MARKETS 517 - B POTRERO AVENUE SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94110 RICHARD W. RAUSHENBUSH ATTORNEY AT LAW LATHAM & WATKINS LLP 505 MONTGOMERY STREET, SUITE 2000 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94111

DAVID T. KRASKA ATTORNEY AT LAW PACIFIC GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY PO BOX 7442 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94120 J.A. SAVAGE CALIFORNIA ENERGY CIRCUIT 3006 SHEFFIELD AVE OAKLAND, CA 94602

MRW & ASSOCIATES, INC. 1999 HARRISON STREET, SUITE 1440 OAKLAND, CA 94612 LEGAL & REGULATORY DEPARTMENT CALIFORNIA ISO 151 BLUE RAVINE ROAD FOLSOM, CA 95630 ANDREW B. BROWN ATTORNEY AT LAW ELLISON, SCHNEIDER & HARRIS, LLP 2015 H STREET SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

AUDRA HARTMANN REGIOINAL DIRECTOR, GOV'T AFFAIRS LS POWER GENERATION 980 NINTH STREET, SUITE 1420 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

BRADY TORGAN CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF PARK&RECREATION 1416 9TH STREET, ROOM 1404-06 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

KEVIN WOODRUFF WOODRUFF EXPERT SERVICES, INC. 1100 K STREET, SUITE 204 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

G. ALAN COMNES CABRILLO POWER I LLC 3934 SE ASH STREET PORTLAND, OR 97214

State Service

MARCUS NIXON CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION PUBLIC ADVISOR OFFICE 320 WEST 4TH STREET SUITE 500 LOS ANGELES, CA 90013

AARON J. JOHNSON CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION ORA - ADMINISTRATIVE BRANCH **ROOM 4202 505 VAN NESS AVENUE** SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

BILLIE C. BLANCHARD CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION TRANSMISSION PERMITTING & RELIABILITY BR RATEMAKING BRANCH AREA 4-A **505 VAN NESS AVENUE** SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

KEITH D WHITE CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION AREA 4-A **505 VAN NESS AVENUE** SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

ROBERT ELLIOTT CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION TRANSMISSION PERMITTING & RELIABILITY BR ELECTRICITY RESOURCES & PRICING BRANCH AREA 4-A **505 VAN NESS AVENUE** SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

SCOTT CAUCHOIS CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION **ROOM 4209 505 VAN NESS AVENUE** SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

SCOTT LOGAN
CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
ELECTRICITY RESOURCES & PRICING BRANCH
ROOM 4209
505 VAN NESS AVENUE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

STEVEN A. WEISSMAN
CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
DIVISION OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES
ROOM 5107
505 VAN NESS AVENUE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

TERRIE D. PROSPER
CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
EXECUTIVE DIVISION
ROOM 5301
505 VAN NESS AVENUE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

TRACI BONE
CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
LEGAL DIVISION
ROOM 5206
505 VAN NESS AVENUE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-3214

SUSAN LEE ASPEN ENVIRONMENTAL GROUP 235 MONTGOMERY STREET, SUITE 935 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104 CLARE LAUFENBERG CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION 1516 NINTH STREET, MS 46 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

MARC PRYOR CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION 1516 9TH ST, MS 20 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814 THOMAS FLYNN
CALIF PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
ENERGY RESOURCES BRANCH
770 L STREET, SUITE 1050
SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

JUDY GRAU
CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
1516 NINTH STREET MS-46
SACRAMENTO, CA 95814-5512
SACRAMENTO, CA 95826

TOM MURPHY
VP., SACRAMENTO OPERATIONS
ASPEN ENVIRONMENTAL GROUP
8801 FOLSOM BLVD., SUITE 290